Editor's Preface

Michael L. Dorn

University of Kentucky

DOI: https://doi.org/10.13023/DISCLOSURE.05.01

Follow this and additional works at: https://uknowledge.uky.edu/disclosure

Part of the Arts and Humanities Commons, and the Social and Behavioral Sciences Commons

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial 4.0 License.

Recommended Citation

DOI: https://doi.org/10.13023/DISCLOSURE.05.01
Available at: https://uknowledge.uky.edu/disclosure/vol5/iss1/1

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Social Theory at UKnowledge. It has been accepted for inclusion in disclosure: A Journal of Social Theory by an authorized editor of UKnowledge. For more information, please contact UKnowledge@lsv.uky.edu.
a journal of social theory

articles
Thomas Strong on instrumental reason and the Artificial Heart Experiment
Dianne Rothleider on the social contract for Hobbes and Irigaray
Bryan Crable on 'Method' as the embodiment of reason

interviews
Hubert Dreyfus on the nonreflective rationality of ethical expertise
Timothy Mitchell on 'the Economy,' and postOrientalist research
Russell Berman on cultural theory and intellectual politics

poetry
Michael Caufield, Beth Harris, Carol Denson

book reviews by Susan Mains, Christine James, Arnold Farr
artwork by Chris Huestis, Paula Aguilera
disClosure is a journal of social theory published at the University of Kentucky. Funding for this issue was generously provided by the UK College of Arts and Sciences, the Student Government Association, and the Vice President for Research and Graduate Studies. Editorial advice and support was provided by faculty at UK.

Editorial Collective
Hugh Bartling
Christopher Ciocchetti
Michael L. Dorn
Owen Dwyer
Susan Dwyer
Arnold Farr
Mary Gilmartin
John Grimes
Moya Hallstein
Christine James
John Paul Jones, III
Katherine Jones
Jennifer Kopf
Cecil Lawson
Victoria Liardet
Debra Lundberg
Susan Mains
Tina Mangieri
Robert Morris
Peter Mortensen
Wolfgang Natter
Jennifer Philpot
E. Jeffrey Popke
Theodore Schatzki
Robert Shields
Caedmon Staddon

Head Editor, issue #5: Michael L. Dorn
Production Editor: Robert Morris
Copyright © 1996; ISSN 1055-6133

Publication Coordinators: Trisha Smith, UK FACTS Center; Cathy Hatfield, UK Publishing Services
Cover Design: Michael Dorn, Susan Mains, Katherine Jones, Chris Huestis
“Apple Doctors” © Chris Huestis

Subscription information:
One year:
$20 - Libraries and Institutions
$6 - Individuals
Three years:
$50 - Libraries and Institutions
$15 - Individuals

disClosure: a journal of social theory
c/o Department of Philosophy
University of Kentucky
Lexington, KY 40506-0027
(606) 257-6035
E-mail: disClose@ukcc.uky.edu

Editorial Board
Benjamin Agger, Sociology, State University of New York-Buffalo
James Boon, Anthropology, Princeton University
Matthew Edney, Geography, State University of New York-Binghamton
Nancy Fraser, Philosophy, Northwestern University
Cynthia Freeland, Philosophy, University of Houston
Sander Gilman, German/Psychology, University of Chicago
Derek Gregory, Geography, University of British Columbia
Peter-Uwe Hohendahl, German Studies, Cornell University
Anton Kaes, German, University of California-Berkeley
Douglas Kellner, Philosophy, University of Texas-Austin
Dominick LaCapra, History, Cornell University
Maggie McFadden, Women's Studies, Appalachian State University
Michael Palmer, Poet, San Francisco, California
Marjorie Perloff, Comparative Literature, Stanford University
Nancy Scheper-Hughes, Anthropology, University of California-Berkeley
Barney Warf, Geography, Florida State University
Samuel Weber, English, University of California-Los Angeles
Jim Winders, History, Appalachian State University
Irving Zeitlin, Sociology, University of Toronto
Greetings from the Bluegrass!

On behalf of the *disClosure* editorial collective, I would like to welcome you to our fifth issue, organized around the theme *REASON INCorporated*. What, you ask, could we possibly mean by this hybridized topic? This theme suggests four sets of concerns:

First, consider the Reason industry. How has an Enlightenment conception of Reason come to be accepted as a worldwide standard? What are the conditions of success for the cognitivist world view? How is 'disembodied' reason reproduced and reinscribed in the flesh of the world? Upon what textual politics does it establish hegemony, and how can this hegemony be reread or disarticulated?

Second, what do we then understand as the embodiment—the "incorporation"—of Reason? Body as machine, body as phallus, body as disposable rocket. How does the body of senses and pleasures become bounded and territorialized? What are the possibilities of deterritorialization? Is disembodied cognition in any way essential to human activity? Does the body have its own memory, its own agency? Is fragmentation of the bodily hierarchy a sign of decay, or a sign of expertise?

Third, how do dichotomous ways of knowing get mapped onto the Reason/Nonreason divide? Under what historico-geographic conditions and around which sets of material practices do the Oriental and the Occidental become naturalized categories? Or male and female? Gay and straight? White and Black? How is the Man of Reason reproduced, and how can his identity be reconceptualized?

Fourth, what is the institutional imperative in recent attempts to save a notion of rationality? What is at stake in the debate over the nature of 'Enlightenment'? How has a Cartesian understanding of 'method' come to limit the domain of rationality? What is meant by 'rigor' when one gives up on the existence of universal standards and truths? How can we speak of 'rationality' in different cultural environments?

While these questions extend far beyond the ability of a single volume to answer, they highlight a domain of research though which each of our contributors navigates. Their responses are grouped in three sections and a postscript. Each section contains an original essay, a review essay on recent publications on the topic, and an interview conducted by members of our editorial collective with a visitor brought to the University of Kentucky campus by the Committee on Social Theory. Poetry, photography and painting are also integrated into each of the sections. The work of Paula Aguilera and Chris Huestis, Michael Caufield, Beth Harris...
and Carol Denson address our theme at, perhaps, a more immediate or intuitive level. Art and poetry have been a constant with the journal since issue #1 and we are particularly proud of the way this group links with and extends the arguments of our more ‘analytic’ contributions.

The three original essays are superb meditations on the theme. Thomas Strong’s “Plastic heart, black box, iron cage” explores the technological imperative behind the research and testing of the first artificial heart. Strong follows a detailed historical narrative of the events leading up to and following the implantation of the plastic pump in Barney Clark’s chest with a critique of Bruno Latour’s actor-network theory of scientific production. This essay asks important questions about the cultural politics of modern medical technology and the limitations of Donna Haraway’s ‘cyborg’ hypothesis.

Discussions of human society and interaction are consistently framed in terms of bodily metaphors. Dianne Rothleder takes these metaphors seriously in her readings of Thomas Hobbes and Luce Irigaray. In contrast with Hobbes’ patriarchal myth of the bounded and defended state that must stifle Man’s truly destructive nature, Irigaray posits a feminine mythology based on reciprocity. Her symbolic order is not one of lack (of penis, of phallus) but of connection, taking into account the fact that we all retain the vestical reminder of umbilical connection with our mothers. In the end, Rothleder hopes that the ‘Law of the Mother’ will lead to the ‘end of killing.’

Perhaps the commonly accepted definition of rationality is dependent upon overly constrained understandings of ‘method.’ Bryan Crable argues that a traditional definition of method—as a path to a particular destination, with rules established in advance, and separate from the individual who applies them—actually prevents the researcher from fully engaging her site of study. In contrast to the conception of method as source of legitimacy, Crable, following the lead of Michel de Certeau and Calvin Schrag, raises the possibility of basing reason and method in the activities of everyday life.

This point is also made in the first of our three interviews. Topics as abstract as moral development, Hubert Dreyfus suggests, can be fruitfully read as embodied skills. Professor Dreyfus has spent much of his academic career challenging the cognitivist understandings of human intelligence and skill acquisition that fuel research in artificial intelligence (AI). In the disClosure interview, he considers the merits of applying the model of skill development laid out with his brother Stuart Dreyfus in their 1986 book Mind over Machine: the power of human intuition in the era of the computer to the area of moral development. Professor Dreyfus also takes the opportunity explain the challenge posed to AI researchers by the fact that we are utterly dependent upon our bodies in coming to any understanding of the world around us.

Reason as held up since the Enlightenment depends upon a whole series of dichotomous terms. In the book Colonizing Egypt, Timothy Mitchell asked how, during the nineteenth century, a nation-state now known as Egypt was forged under sets of conditions imposed by European colonial powers. Not content to deconstruct the colonial mind, Mitchell used the insights of Foucault, Heidegger, and Derrida to show how the very distinction between the ‘represented’ and the ‘Real’ was enframed through practices of urban design, sanitary reform and Orientalist exhibition. In his disClosure interview, Professor Mitchell discusses his most recent research on the early twentieth century fabrication of a free-floating mechanism contiguous with the nation-space known as ‘the economy.’ He then extends his critique to historical analytics of modernism/postmodernism advanced by Frederic Jameson.

We are mistaken if we take all critiques of Enlightenment Reason to be cut from the same cloth. In his disClosure interview, Russell Berman provides an extended critique of contemporary Cultural Studies, a new field which has grown tremendously over the past decade. Asking Cultural Studies to take its own rhetoric seriously, Berman decries the current of ‘political correctness’ that every excursion into the margins, borderlands and subaltern terrains is meaningful and equally significant. Professor Berman maintains that the search for meaning on the margins has taken place alongside a conspicuous neglect of conditions in the center.

The interests of the different members of our editorial collective are ecumenical and trans-disciplinary, as can be seen in the contributions of our book reviewers. This issue’s book review essays consider in depth recently published interrogations of Reason’s articulation with national identities, gender dichotomies and poststructuralist philosophy. Think of these reviews as guides through the perils of print capitalism, illuminating new tools for thinking and acting differently in today’s society.

Always on the lookout for a reason to celebrate, (and too impatient to wait for our fiftieth), we have dubbed this fifth issue of disClosure our GOLD ISSUE. We owe a tremendous debt of gratitude to all those who have served on the editorial collective during their graduate years and moved on to other locales. We also thank those...
of you who have supported us with subscriptions and served on our editorial board. You all are invited to share in this celebration. Spread the word that *disClosure* is cool and here for the long haul, offering an outlet for artistic and academic work that pushes disciplinary and genre boundaries while remaining alert and engaged in recent currents in political and social theory. Please share this copy of *disClosure* with friends and colleagues. Order us for your favorite libraries and bookstores. Our fervent hope is that these word of mouth encounters will expand the editorial collective's emancipatory project.

At this point I would like to acknowledge the efforts of several corporate entities and individuals who assisted the work of the editorial collective over the year. For permission to reproduce images, I thank the University of Minnesota Press (publisher of the book *Bodily Regimes*), Chris Huestis and Paula Aguilera. For help in reviewing manuscripts I would like to thank John Pickles, Clelia Anderson, Yolanda Estes, and Ted Schatzki. We would not have been able to go to press without the timely financial support of the UK Student Government Association and the production assistance of Patricia Smith at the UK FACTS Center and Cathy Hatfield at UK Publishing. My hat goes off to Robert Morris who took on the difficult role of production editor for this issue, and to Katherine Jones, Susan Mains and Hugh Bartling for assistance in the last days. Finally, a large amount of the credit for *disClosure*'s success must go to the journal's four faculty advisors: Ted Schatzki, Wolfgang Natter, John Paul Jones and Peter Mortensen. Their enthusiasm has nurtured and inspired the *disClosure* collective through these first five years.

Mike Dom
Head Editor, Issue Five

---

**Issue Five: REASON INCOrporated**

**PART ONE: NONREFLECTIVE RATIONALITY AND CYBORG BODY POLITICS**

- Becoming skilled in doing what's appropriate: The nonreflective rationality of ethical expertise  
  *an interview with Hubert Dreyfus*  
  Page 3
- Isaac Newton died a virgin  
  *poetry by Michael Caufield*  
  Page 27
- Plastic heart, black box, iron cage: Instrumental rationality and the Artificial Heart Experiment  
  *essay by Thomas Strong*  
  Page 29
- Representing bounded bodies  
  *review essay by Susan Mains*  
  Page 56

**PART TWO: "AS IF THE WORLD WERE SPLIT IN TWO:" CONTESTING DUALISMS**

- The end of killing, the law of the Mother, and the non-exclusionary Other  
  *essay by Dianne Rothleder*  
  Page 63
- Reconceptualizing masculinity  
  *review essay by Christine James*  
  Page 74
- The faggot's claim to name, or deconstructing the breeding game  
  *poetry by Beth Harris*  
  Page 84
- The represented and the 'real:' Economy, postmodernity and postOrientalist research  
  *an interview with Timothy Mitchell*  
  Page 87

**PART THREE: SAVING RATIONALITY BY LISTENING TO ITS CRITICS?**

- Method as the embodiment of reason  
  *essay by Bryan Crable*  
  Page 107
- Cultch  
  *poetry by Carol Denson*  
  Page 125
- Theory and rationality: Extending the Foucault/Habermas debate  
  *review essay by Arnold Farr*  
  Page 127
- Cultural theory and intellectual politics  
  *interview with Russell Berman*  
  Page 139

**POSTSCRIPT**

- I was just getting started when  
  *poetry by Michael Caufield*  
  Page 156
Artistic Credits

Artist and activist Chris Huestis has cast a discerning eye over the urban-political landscape of late capitalist America while living in Philadelphia, New York City and Lexington, KY. He is currently involved with his friend Marvin Jones in producing the monthly Lexington newspaper Town Meeting.—(606) 266-1872. Of the image featured on our cover, "Apple Doctors," Chris Huestis says, "This is part of a series of paintings I have gone back to from time to time dealing with vegetable-headed people, bureaucrats. The series was inspired by Oswald Spengler's Decline of the West. The idea for Apple Doctors came from watching a television commercial for doctors forming an insurance company in Lexington."

This issue also features the photography of Paula Aguilera, a graduate student in film studies at Emerson College, Boston, MA—(617) 867-0965. Her work is featured in various Boston-area publications and we are happy to introduce it to disClosure's international readership. Paula Aguilera generally chooses not to title her works, but one special image, featured on page 125, is called Wings.

Wings and other photography first appearing on pages 62, 105, and 155, © Paula Aguilera, 1996. Apple Doctors (Cover and p. 27), Show Horse (p. ii), and Tomato Spaceman (p. 1), © 1996, Chris Huestis. Images appearing on pages 59 and 60 are courtesy of University of Minnesota Press, © 1995.

Document proofs for Issue 5 of disClosure were printed on a Lexmark Optra Lxi+ printer.