2015

The Scottish Pipe Band in North America: Tradition, Transformation, and Transnational Identity

Erin F. Walker
University of Kentucky, ewalk@uky.edu

Click here to let us know how access to this document benefits you.

Recommended Citation
https://uknowledge.uky.edu/music_etds/45

This Doctoral Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Music at UKnowledge. It has been accepted for inclusion in Theses and Dissertations--Music by an authorized administrator of UKnowledge. For more information, please contact UKnowledge@lsv.uky.edu.
STUDENT AGREEMENT:

I represent that my thesis or dissertation and abstract are my original work. Proper attribution has been given to all outside sources. I understand that I am solely responsible for obtaining any needed copyright permissions. I have obtained needed written permission statement(s) from the owner(s) of each third-party copyrighted matter to be included in my work, allowing electronic distribution (if such use is not permitted by the fair use doctrine) which will be submitted to UKnowledge as Additional File.

I hereby grant to The University of Kentucky and its agents the irrevocable, non-exclusive, and royalty-free license to archive and make accessible my work in whole or in part in all forms of media, now or hereafter known. I agree that the document mentioned above may be made available immediately for worldwide access unless an embargo applies.

I retain all other ownership rights to the copyright of my work. I also retain the right to use in future works (such as articles or books) all or part of my work. I understand that I am free to register the copyright to my work.

REVIEW, APPROVAL AND ACCEPTANCE

The document mentioned above has been reviewed and accepted by the student’s advisor, on behalf of the advisory committee, and by the Director of Graduate Studies (DGS), on behalf of the program; we verify that this is the final, approved version of the student’s thesis including all changes required by the advisory committee. The undersigned agree to abide by the statements above.

   Erin F. Walker, Student
   Diana Hallman, Major Professor
   David Sogin, Director of Graduate Studies
THE SCOTTISH PIPE BAND IN NORTH AMERICA: TRADITION, TRANSFORMATION, AND TRANSNATIONAL IDENTITY

DISSertation

A document submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Musicology/Ethnomusicology in the College of Fine Arts at the University of Kentucky

By
Erin Walker

Director: Diana Hallman, Associate Professor of Music

Lexington, Kentucky

2015

Copyright © Erin Walker 2015
ABSTRACT OF DISSERTATION

THE SCOTTISH PIPE BAND IN NORTH AMERICA: TRADITION, TRANSFORMATION, AND TRANSNATIONAL IDENTITY

For Scots and non-Scots alike, the sounds of the bagpipes and the pipe band serve as a cultural metaphor for Scottish identity: the skirl of the pipes, the crisp sound of the snare drums, and the unique lilt of the music conjure an imagined Scotland of fierce, kilted clansmen and rugged, picturesque Highland scenery. This nearly global association appears to have been constructed on a series of transformations of cultural practices within Scotland itself, as well as throughout greater Britain and the lands of the Scottish diaspora, that began with the early “kiltophiles” in the late eighteenth century. Then, in the nineteenth century, its appeal was rendered greater by the romanticization of the Highlander in British literature, Queen Victoria’s affinity for summer holidays at Balmoral Castle, expanded pipe band use in the British Army, and the formation of Scottish heritage societies embracing Highland dress, music, and sport. The turn of the twentieth century saw the pipe band move beyond military spheres to serve a range of civic and social purposes within Scotland, and throughout the subsequent hundred-plus year period, pipe bands as community musical ensembles have spread throughout the lands of the Scottish diaspora and other areas of the globe.

Although there were and are a range of organizations, practices, and trends that offer insight into cultural developments within Scotland and the Scottish diaspora, the primary goal of this dissertation is to study the role of the pipe band in the construction and transformation of Scottish identity through an examination of the meanings, values, and musical practices that are built into ideas of "Scottishness" from the mid-nineteenth through the twenty-first century in the British Isles and North America. In its consideration of late twentieth- to twenty-first-century North American pipe bands, it will cast special light on selected bands of the Southeast and Ohio Valley regions, using two ensembles, the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums and the Knoxville Pipes and Drums, and one Highland festival, the Scotland County Highland Games, as case studies of present-day practices, but also as windows into identity formation within and through bands of the past.

KEYWORDS: Pipe band, Bagpipes, Scottishness, Identity, Diaspora

Erin Walker
Student’s Signature
July 22, 2015
Date
THE SCOTTISH PIPE BAND IN NORTH AMERICA: TRADITION, TRANSFORMATION, AND TRANSNATIONAL IDENTITY

By

Erin Walker

Diana Hallman
Director of Dissertation

David Sogin
Director of Graduate Studies

July 22, 2015
Date
DEDICATION

This dissertation is dedicated to my grandmother, Cleo Crooks MacArt, who has been cheering for me to finish it for years.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This document could not have been completed without the support of my family, friends, colleagues, and professors, and without the members of the Kentucky United Pipes & Drums and the Knoxville Pipes & Drums. I greatly appreciate the guidance of the director of this project, Diana Hallman, and the huge number of hours she spent reading and editing on a tight deadline. I would like to thank the other members of my doctoral committee, Ron Pen, Donna Kwon, Lance Brunner, Kevin Holm-Hudson, and James Norton, and my outside reader, Allan Richards, for their insight and direction. I am deeply grateful to my husband, Andy Bliss, my parents, Jim and Sally Walker, and my mother-in-law, Dianne Bliss, for their assistance and patience throughout the writing process.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgments...........................................................................................................iii

List of Figures....................................................................................................................iv

Chapter One: Introduction..............................................................................................1
  1.1 Overview and Objectives.........................................................................................1
  1.2 Central Questions and Limitations........................................................................10
  1.3 Theoretical Framework and Terminology............................................................17
  1.4 Overview of Source Literature.............................................................................23
  1.5 Methodology.........................................................................................................29
  1.6 Outline of Chapters..............................................................................................32

Chapter Two: Patterns of Scottish Identity Creation and Cultural Retention in Scotland and Throughout the Lands of the Scottish Diaspora........................................38
  2.1 Introduction...........................................................................................................38
  2.2 Origins and Early Manifestations of Scottish Identity Construction................41
  2.3 Reasons for and Patterns of Emigration to North America...............................53
  2.4 The Growth and Proliferation of Scottish Culture, and Appropriation of Scottish Identity, in North America.................................................................57
  2.5 Conclusion...........................................................................................................65

Chapter Three: A Brief History of the Pipe Band, its Instruments, and their Relationship to Scottish Identity........................................................................................................69
  3.1 Introduction...........................................................................................................69
  3.2 History of the Bagpipes.........................................................................................70
  3.3 The Late Eighteenth- and Early Nineteenth-Century Proliferation of the Bagpipes....................................................................................................................78
  3.4 The Foundation and Standardization of Military Pipe Bands.............................87
  3.5 The Formation of Civilian Pipe Bands.................................................................96
  3.6 Conclusion...........................................................................................................101

Chapter Four: Contemporary Pipe Bands: Tradition and Identity Creation Through Instrumentation, Repertoire, and Dress........................................................................103
  4.1 Introduction...........................................................................................................103
  4.2 Sections of the Ensemble......................................................................................104
  4.3 Pipe Band Repertoire...........................................................................................117
  4.4 Significant and Symbolic Songs in the Pipe Band Repertoire............................130
  4.5 Dress....................................................................................................................136
  4.6 Conclusion...........................................................................................................140
Chapter Five: Ethnographic Case Studies of the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums and the Knoxville Pipes and Drums

5.1 Introduction

5.2 History and Operational Overview of the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums and the Knoxville Pipes and Drums

5.3 Characteristics of KUPD and KPD Members

5.4 Methods of Learning and Rehearsal Structures in KUPD and KPD

5.5 Contexts and Venues of Performance

5.6 Conclusion

Chapter Six: An Ethnographic Case Study of the 2014 Scotland County Highland Games

6.1 Introduction

6.2 About the Scotland County Highland Games

6.3 Massed Band Performances at Opening and Closing Ceremonies

6.4 Solo and ensemble competitions

6.5 Elements of Heritage Tourism at the Scotland County Games

6.6 Conclusion

Chapter Seven: Conclusion

7.1 Introduction

7.2 The Historic Role of the Bagpipes and the Pipe Band in the Creation, Reinforcement and Retention of Identity

7.3 Production and Consumption of Culture and Identity in Contemporary Civilian Pipe Bands

7.4 Larger Connections; Avenues for Future Research

7.5 Epilogue

Notes

Bibliography

Vita
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure
2.1 Piper to the Laird of Grant.................................................................45
3.1 Croatian diplar......................................................................................71
3.2 Pig bagpiper, Ripon Cathedral..........................................................72
3.3 “Cumh Na Peahair: The Sister’s Lament”..........................................85
3.4 John Macdonald, 72nd Highlanders.................................................90
3.5 Massed pipe bands, fifteenth Division, British Army..........................94
3.6 Govan Burgh Police Pipe Band, 1890s.................................................96
4.1 “Highland Laddie”.............................................................................106
4.2 Drones and drone cords......................................................................108
4.3 Scottish snare drum...........................................................................109
4.4 “Clan MacRae Society Pipe Band”.....................................................113
4.5 Bass drum............................................................................................114
4.6 Tenor drum flourishing........................................................................116
4.7 Urlar and first two variations for “MacCrimmon Will Never Return”....120
4.8 Doublings for “MacCrimmon Will Never Return”...............................120
4.9 “Scottish snap, “Balmoral Highlanders”............................................127
4.10 “The Reel of Tulloch”.......................................................................129
4.11 “Scotland the Brave”..........................................................132
4.12 Kentucky tartan and Clan Fleming kilt pin.......................................139
6.1 Massed band “chips”.......................................................................190
6.2 Competition circle formation..............................................................194
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

1.1 Overview and Objectives

There is perhaps no musical image of Scotland more universally recognized than that of the pipe band, an ensemble consisting of bagpipes,\textsuperscript{1} snare drums,\textsuperscript{2} tenor drums, and a bass drum. The skirl of the pipes, the crisp sound of the snare drums, and the unique lilt of the music serve as a cultural metaphor for an imagined Scotland, conjuring, for many listeners, the stereotypical image of a fierce, kilted clansman in a rugged, picturesque Highland setting. Beginning with the early “kiltophiles”\textsuperscript{3} in the late eighteenth century, this association is not one that formed simply and without modifications of meaning, but one that was constructed through a series of transformations of cultural practices within Scotland itself, as well as throughout greater Britain and the lands of the Scottish diaspora.\textsuperscript{4} Contributing factors to the shaping of this symbol of Scottishness include the development of the Highland regiments in and recruitment of pipers for the British Army during the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century; the romanticization of the Highlander in British literature, particularly in the works of Sir Walter Scott (1771-1832); the formation of Scottish heritage societies embracing Highland traditions; and the affinity of the Hanoverian monarchy\textsuperscript{5} for Highland arts, dress, and sport.

Central to the significance of the pipe band are the Great Highland bagpipes, which have long been associated with the power to awaken courage, kinship, and strength of spirit in warring troops, and to lament the dead in battle. From the fourteenth to eighteenth centuries, many clan chiefs had a personal piper whose duties ranged from
accompanying social dances to playing airs designed to celebrate the glory of the chief and rally clan warriors; in a sense, the piper shaped and projected a sense of identity for the clan.\(^6\) In the late eighteenth century, the British military started to incorporate bagpipes into its Scottish regiments, and in the nineteenth century, the development of full British Army pipe ensembles, including snare drummers and bass drummers, expanded the ensemble’s role beyond the Highlands as the groups accompanied troops into battle during the Crimean War (1853-1856) and the Second Boer War (1899-1902).\(^7\) Scotland’s oldest military pipe bands include the Black Watch and the Scots Guards, formed during the 1850s, and the Pipes and Drums of the London Scottish, formed in 1860. In North America, the first army pipe bands were associated with Canadian regiments and include the 48th Highlanders (from Ottawa, Ontario) and the Argyll and Sutherland Highlanders (from Hamilton, Ontario), formed in 1892\(^8\) and 1903\(^9\) respectively.

Inspired by military pipe bands, civilian piping and drumming ensembles began to develop near the turn of the twentieth century with the founding of police and fire brigade bands in Scottish urban centers.\(^10\) Among the earliest civilian pipe bands were the Govan Burgh Police Pipe Band and the Edinburgh City Police Pipe Band, both of which were established in the 1880s. Like their counterparts in Scotland, many early North American pipe bands—such as the Vancouver Police Pipe Band, formed in 1914—also had an affiliation with police and fire departments, since so many policemen and firemen were of Scottish or Irish heritage.\(^11\) Other early groups, such as the Caledonian Kiltie Band from Holyoke, Massachusetts, which was formed in 1910,\(^12\) and the Clan MacAlpine
Pipe Band, formed in 1912 in Rockford, Illinois, were strictly community bands and were not affiliated with military or police ensembles.

Throughout the twentieth and twenty-first centuries, pipe bands have continued to form in all corners of North America, as evidenced by the fact that there are three separate American regulating bodies in the Alliance of North American Pipe Band Associations (ANAPBA). In the United States, the regional pipe band associations include the Eastern United States Pipe Band Association (EUSPBA; formed in 1964), consisting of at least 150 bands from Maine to Florida to Kentucky; the Midwest Pipe Band Association (MWPBA; also formed in 1964), comprising 45 bands in Illinois, Minnesota, Ohio, Wisconsin, Kansas, Oklahoma, Nebraska, Missouri, and Iowa; and the Western United States Pipe Band Association (WUSPBA; established in 1963), which includes more than 60 piping and drumming ensembles from Colorado to California. There are also seven regional pipe band associations in Canada that are part of the ANAPBA.

In Kentucky, the oldest pipe band is the Louisville Pipe Band, established in the mid-1970s; other Kentucky bands include the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums, established in 2003, and the William Sutherland Reid Pipe Band, established in 1975 as the Lexington Pipe Band (the group changed its name to honor its founder in 1993). Many of the pipe bands in neighboring states were founded in the 1980s or 1990s, such as the Knoxville Pipes and Drums and the Nashville Pipes and Drums. Today, there are several dozen piping and drumming ensembles in the area.
A study of the pipe band and its significance as an emblem of Scottish identity in North America, including portions of the American Southeast and Ohio Valley regions, must be framed within the context of the Scottish diaspora, during which the retention and transformation of Scottish cultural practices,\(^{19}\) including those of the pipe band, occurred throughout nearly three centuries of emigration. Between the 1770s and the early 1900s, hundreds of thousands of emigrants streamed from Scotland around the world, with the largest number ending up in North America. Reasons for this exodus included the forcible expulsion of Highland residents during the Highland Clearances,\(^{20}\) the suppression of Scottish identity following the Jacobite risings, and a long period of widespread famine in northern Scotland. The promise of owning land, with no rent and without the powerful control of landlords within a restrictive system, along with affordable travel and the appeal of a freer society, also attracted many Scottish emigrants to North America.\(^{21}\) With especially large pockets of settlers choosing to make new lives in the eastern regions of the United States and Canada, the Scottish pioneers’ extensive network of family and friends helped them renegotiate cultural ties to their homeland.

Within North America, a number of geographic regions received particularly large groups of Scottish immigrants, resulting in a distinctive flourishing of Scottish music and culture. These areas are primarily centered in the eastern regions of Canada (Nova Scotia, Newfoundland, New Brunswick, and Ontario) and the United States (the Carolinas, Virginia, Appalachia, and New England). However, Scottish immigrants settled in nearly all corners of North America, and the wide geographic distribution of pipe bands
throughout Canada and the United States exemplifies the thorough dissemination of Scottish culture throughout the continent as a result of the Scottish diaspora.

According to Robin Cohen, the common characteristics of a diaspora include:

dispersal from an original homeland, often traumatically, to two or more foreign regions; a collective memory and myth about the homeland, including its location, history, suffering and achievements; an idealization of the real or imagined ancestral home; a strong ethnic group consciousness sustained over a long time and based on a sense of distinctiveness; [and] a sense of empathy and co-responsibility with co-ethnic members in other countries of settlement even where home has become more vestigial.22

The Scottish diaspora exemplifies all of these characteristics: dire circumstances in their homeland triggered the global dispersion of Scots, and after arriving in their new lands, the nostalgia of emigrated Scots for the old country caused them to perpetuate, as a group, the mythologized version of Scotland that had begun to form in the late eighteenth century.

This mythologizing and nostalgic imagining thrived within St. Andrews clubs, Scottish societies, and clan organizations, which began to sponsor ceilidhs23 and Highland festivals24 in North America in the 1820s, though the Scottish heritage movement did not experience its greatest expansion until the mid-twentieth century. After World War II, many Americans experienced renewed interest in their ancestral lands, perhaps in their search for a more “meaningful community” through ethnic or cultural distinction.25 According to anthropologist Celeste Ray, the surge of Scottish-American identity after World War II was partly associated with regional and ethnic distinctions that reemerged in the 1950s as many American “experienced renewed interest in ‘the old countries’; as second- and third-generation immigrants began reasserting identities that
distinguished them from ‘the white norm’; and as the nation began to explore the extension of civil rights to all Americans.” Ray’s remarks imply that perhaps, as African Americans during the Civil Rights Era were encouraged to explore and celebrate their African heritage, members of the white, Anglo-Saxon, Protestant cultures in the United States came to perceive themselves as lacking an ethnic identity—the result, perhaps, of too much homogenization. Some scholars take this idea further, arguing that claiming Celtic ethnicity is itself an implicit appeal to white privilege. The possible relationship between whiteness and Celtic (or Scottish) identity purported by these scholars, or, in contrast, the idea of Celtic identity as a counter to Anglo-Saxon heritage (as discussed in Grady McWhiney’s Cracker Culture), raise complex, intriguing sociological questions deserving of further study, but an exploration of their potential connections to the pipe band lies outside the purpose and focus of this dissertation.

During the 1960s and ’70s, folk revivals provided new performance contexts for Scottish traditional music, with additional folk clubs and festivals being created in Scotland and in the lands of the diaspora. The Traditional Music and Song Association of Scotland (TMSA) was organized in 1966 with the intent of promoting Scottish traditional music at festivals, ceilidhs, seisiuns, concerts, and competitions. According to the Scottish Music Handbook, the feis movement of the 1980s is likewise related to a greater quest to honor Scottish traditions and has resulted in a greater participation in the traditional Gaelic arts. The word “feis” means festival, and these public performances and competitions expanded rapidly during the 1980s, starting in the Highlands and
Islands as *Feisean nan Gaidheal* (“Highland Festivals”) and spreading throughout Scotland, through much of Britain, and to the lands of the Scottish diaspora.\(^{32}\)

Although there were and are a range of organizations, practices, and trends that offer insight into cultural developments within Scotland and the Scottish diaspora, the primary goal of this study is to examine the hypothesis that, though varied practices and appropriations over several centuries, the pipe band has played an important role in the construction and transformation of Scottish identity. The pipe band, though renowned for its long-reaching cultural symbolism and unique sound as the quintessentially Scottish musical ensemble, tends to be overlooked in academic studies; there are few dissertations or scholarly articles related to this historically significant group, its sociocultural uses, or its music.\(^{33}\) Currently no work has been published that either ties the pipe band to cultural transmission or transformation in diasporic or post-diasporic\(^{34}\) communities in North America, or analyzes the multiple layers of social, historical, and musical meanings that the pipe band embodies.

Built on new primary research in the National Archives of Scotland, as well as consultation of untapped secondary sources, this dissertation will offer a historical overview of the pipe band of the Scottish past as prelude to its later history in North America. In its consideration of late twentieth- to twenty-first-century North American pipe bands, it will cast special light on selected bands of the Southeast and Ohio Valley regions, using them as case studies of present-day practices, but also as windows into identity formation within and through bands of the past. At the center of the study is the pipe band’s role in cultural identity production and its part in the creation and retention of
tradition in members of diasporic and post-diasporic communities in North America. In sharpening the focus on present-day practices, the music of the pipe band is also examined, with an aim to seek connections to pre-diaspora traditions, and also to determine new developments. The dissertation will consider approaches to and contemporary methods of transmitting and learning the music, the types of pieces performed by civilian bands compared to those played by earlier military ensembles, structures and arrangements of performance sets, melodic and rhythmic characteristics, and the typical roles of the different instruments in a pipe band.

The case studies of existing bands are centered on the practices of two pipe bands in the Southeast and Ohio Valley regions: the Kentucky United Pipes & Drums (KUPD), formed in 2003, and the Knoxville Pipes & Drums (KPD), formed in 1991. As a performing member of these groups, I have conducted ethnographic research during eight years of rehearsals, competitions, and performances, including participation in more than 20 regional Highland games festivals such as the Scotland County Highland Games, the center of the ethnographic study in Chapter Six. My activities as a participant observer inform my study and are at the center of my discussion about Scottishness and the negotiation of individual and communal identity in the pipe band of the present day.

Within this dissertation, I will explore several interconnected processes of identity formation. It may seem that these types of identity are at odds with one another, and sometimes they are. However, through my primary research and ethnographic case studies, I will discuss how they ultimately co-exist. My study centers on the sense of Scottish identity coming both from within the pipe band itself, through the heritage
affiliations of the participants, and outside the pipe band, in the appropriation and perpetuation of this ensemble as a symbol of Scottishness. As such, this dissertation examines ways that the pipe band has functioned as a tool of cultural transmission throughout the Scottish diaspora in North America, and ways that it continues to function as a medium for the retention and modification of Scottish traditions. Through a historical exploration of the meanings, values, and musical practices that are built into concepts of “Scottishness” in pre-diasporic Britain, and from the late eighteenth century to the present in North America, I will trace the important associations and signs of Scottish identity that became attached to the pipe band as it emerged. Moreover, through case studies of two current civilian pipe bands in the Southeast and Ohio Valley regions of the United States, the Kentucky United Pipes & Drums and the Knoxville Pipes & Drums, along with an ethnography of the Scotland County Highland Games, I will illustrate how the pipe band’s performance rituals can both connect with and transform the traditions, ideologies, and history of post-diasporic groups who are of Scottish heritage or who have embraced a Scottish identity.

I will also examine the collective group identity shared by practitioners of Scottish piping and drumming. I assert that in the case of pipe bands, shared attachments between individuals in the ensembles, and shared practices among groups, create binding senses of identity. As Simon Frith states in *Performing Rites*, “Music constructs our sense of identity through the experiences it offers of the body, time and sociability, experiences which enable us to place ourselves in imaginative cultural narratives.” In a pipe band, these imaginative cultural narratives include the direct experiences of performance during
band rehearsals, parades, and Highland games; details of the narratives include representative repertoire, as well as elements of material culture, such as band uniforms. Through such experiences, many pipe bands, including KUPD and KPD, serve to fulfill a quest for a type of communal engagement in their members, similar to British anthropologist Victor Turner’s idea of *communitas*—the intense sense of togetherness that is often connected to performance rituals that take place “outside” society.\(^{36}\)

Finally, I will consider the sense of personal identity that individual pipers and drummers derive from participating in the pipe band subculture, its own small scene within the “superculture,” or the overarching musical culture of greater society.\(^{37}\) Within the pipe band subculture, there are some performers whose primary reason for participation is not the shared sense of Scottishness, or the collective group unity, fostered by playing in a piping and drumming ensemble. For these practitioners, the driving force behind their membership is performing the music and competing in Highland festivals; they derive a sense of confidence and identity from mastering an “exotic” type of music that few people perform proficiently or knowledgeably.

### 1.2 Central Questions and Limitations

Though this dissertation includes an overview of the pipe band’s history and importance in pre-nineteenth century Scotland, and the causes and ramifications of the early waves of Scottish emigration, the ethnographic portions of the document focus on the current period and state of the pipe band. The historical discussions about Scottish cultural identity consider the changing contexts and trends that affected it, including the “tartanization” practices of the early “kiltophiles,” and possible connections to exotic,
fanciful views of Highland culture; these discussions begin with Queen Victoria’s reign (1837-1901) and continue to the present time. The central discourse concerning the retention and renegotiation of this cultural identity through pipe band practices in diasporic and post-diasporic communities focuses on the ensemble’s sociocultural uses and associations in North America, starting with the flourishing of non-military bands from the 1880s to the present and including musical-cultural interactions that continued between groups in North America and those in Great Britain.

In my study of the pipe band, I have investigated many characteristics of bands, including membership, recruitment practices, types of performances, typical repertoire, band leadership structure, methods of learning, and rehearsal schedules, using the Kentucky United Pipes & Drums and Knoxville Pipes & Drums as models. In examining these aspects, I maintain that KUPD and KPD are typical bands, illustrative not only as examples of bands from the Southeast and Ohio Valley regions, but as representative ensembles from North America. This assertion is based on years of personal experience in the pipe band scene, as well as extensive online research and interviews of individual band members. Most pipe bands maintain ties to Scotland through compliance with musical competitive standards set by governing associations such as the Eastern United States Pipe Band Association, and connections can be made through the regulations that control all bands and the associations that promote uniformity of practice, dress, and repertoire. There are more than 415 bands listed in the member directories of the ten North American pipe band associations, and from a sampling of 60 of these bands’ websites, many of them appear similar to Kentucky United and Knoxville in terms of
participants, rehearsal schedules, and stated missions: ensembles of 10-20 bagpipers and 5-10 drummers who rehearse once a week for several hours and whose intention is to promote Scottish music and culture. (Despite their overarching similarities in purpose, dress, performance occasions, and repertoire, each pipe band across North America, including these two groups, will of course have unique qualities: regional variations often dictate details of repertoire, membership concentration, rehearsal schedule, and dress).

Although this dissertation centers on the construction and transmission of identity related to a particular cultural group through the practices of a specific ensemble, it raises far-reaching questions concerning the nature of both group and individual identity, as well as the ways in which identity functions and is recognized within and outside a distinct cultural group. Participation in the pipe band, for many, illustrates the statement made by social scientist and globalization specialist Arjun Appadurai that, “all group sentiments that involve a strong sense of group identity, of we-ness, draw on those attachments that bind small, intimate collectivities, usually those based on kinship or its extensions.”38 Through examining the cultural microcosm of the Scottish pipe band, we gain insight into the broader relationship between cultural identity and music performance.

Today, what is celebrated as Scottish identity in North America as well as in Scotland itself is based predominantly on imagery and themes of the Highlands. Stereotypical representations of Scots range from dress (tartan patterns, kilts, Glengarry hats, sporran pouches, ghillie brogue shoes, the sgian dubh dagger) to sentimental tunes (“Scotland the Brave,” “Highland Laddie,” “Flowers of the Forest”) to instruments (the
Great Highland bagpipes, the Scottish smallpipes, the distinctive-sounding Scottish snare drums, the visually-appealing Scottish tenor drums. Constructed through years of associations with rituals and other practices often driven by nostalgia, the stereotyped representation is now perceived as traditional, and across North America, Scottish-Americans of Lowland, Highland, and Scots-Irish ancestry use the material culture and imagery of Highland Scots to celebrate their ethnic identity.39

“Scots-Irish” is a term that refers to the North American descendants of Ulster Scots (Scottish Protestants who migrated to Northern Ireland in the seventeenth century). It was first employed during the American Revolution to distinguish Ulster Scots, who supported the Patriot cause, from Highland Scots, who were mostly Loyalists. Nearly a century later, the term increased in popularity to differentiate the Protestant Ulster Scots from more recent immigrants, the poorer and predominantly Catholic “Famine Irish.”41 The Scots-Irish migrated in large numbers to the colonies, especially the Carolinas, Tennessee, Virginia, Pennsylvania, and Kentucky, in the eighteenth century. According to anthropologist Celeste Ray, they brought with them “the folktales, ballads, farming strategies and some of the vernacular architectural traditions that would come to characterize the Southern Appalachian region.”42 The Scots-Irish were also associated with the character traits of familial loyalty, self-reliance, and sometimes, extreme mistrust of governmental and legal authority.

The Scots-Irish are a specific population group with a distinct cultural heritage and traditions, but at contemporary heritage celebrations, such as Highland games, the distinctiveness of this ethnic group is often elided. Warren Hofstra notes that some
scholars believe this is because the cultural identity of the Scots-Irish was “never sufficiently strong to resist the force of Americanization” and that they “were lost in the rising middle class of nineteenth-century America.” Other scholars argue the opposite: they believe that the Scots-Irish character was so compelling that it evolved into the core of modern American identity.

Few ancestors of the Scots-Irish, or the Lowlanders, were actually tied to clans, tartans, bagpipes, Gaelic poetry, or any other of the stereotypical emblems of Scottishness. Yet according to Celeste Ray, this “blending of traditions that ancestors would find anathema is not uncommon in heritage celebrations generally. Especially in the age of multiculturalism, we gloss gaps and fuzzy edges of our cultural knowledge in a willingness to embrace an inclusive heritage.” What she means is that in the present these ancestral lines are blurry: it is the material culture of the Highlanders that has become representative as Scottish in heritage celebrations today, even in festivals celebrating Lowland or Scots-Irish settlers. For example, the Dandridge Scots-Irish Festival in Dandridge, Tennessee, was established to celebrate Scots-Irish heritage of the area, yet it features a pipe band competition, clan tents, and a tartan parade; the festival’s website states, “an essential part of the Dandridge Scots-Irish Festival is the participation of the Highland Clan societies and Heritage organizations.” This quotation speaks to the omnipresence of the mythologized sense of Scottish identity first popularized by Highlandism in the nineteenth century—one that represents a fusing of Highland and Gaelic elements—that is often appropriated by those with Lowland or Scots-Irish roots. Perhaps it is because the Lowlanders and Scots-Irish—though they brought folklore,
musical and architectural traditions—did not “bring a material culture as distinctly representative of their identity as the Highlanders’ unique fabrics and style of dress.” The concept of “Scottishness” that I reference in this dissertation was constructed mainly of Highland and Gaelic elements, fused together and fashioned over several centuries of mythologizing. In North America, this representation is commonly communicated in visible and audible fashions via clan societies, Scottish associations, Highland dress, bagpipes, and pipe bands.

In other transformations of Scottish heritage in North America, “Scottishness” has become intertwined with “Celticness,” and the pipe band’s instruments and repertoire are sometimes used to symbolize a pan-Celtic identity. Since the 1970s, “Celtic” in music has been used in a general sense (and as such to avoid more specific national designations) to reference not only Scottish music but also music from Ireland, Wales, Cornwall, Brittany, Galicia, Cape Breton, the Isle of Man, and Nova Scotia. According to Timothy Taylor in the book *Global Pop: World Music, World Markets*, the word “Celtic” is “sufficiently vague that almost any white American could claim to have some Celtic ancestry.” Perhaps this broad appeal explains why, in the latter part of the twentieth century, the output of record companies and musical tastes of consumers show such a significant interest in all styles of Celtic music. Since *Billboard* started its world music charts in 1990, many of the highest-selling albums (by groups such as the Chieftains, Seven Nations, Gaelic Storm, Clannad, and Capercaillie, among many others) have been categorized within the broad genre referred to as “Celtic music.” These Celtic recordings included the soundtracks for “Riverdance,” “The Lord of the Dance,” *Dancing at
Lughnasa, and Titanic, as well as performers such as Celtic Woman, Gaelic Storm, the Afro-Celt Sound System, the Dropkick Murphys, and the Chieftains, among many others. In 1990, Suzanne Hannema, the product manager for Real World in the United States, was quoted as saying, “If it isn't Celtic or the Gipsy Kings, it's very hard to get on the Billboard World Music charts.” It is likely that this rise in interest in Celtic culture has, by extension, caused more widespread participation in traditional Scottish music, dance, food, language, and sport. While the popularity of the Scottish pipe band today is almost certainly tied to this surge of interest in Celtic culture, this dissertation will focus discussion on the creation and manifestation of “Scottishness,” rather than on the broader idea of “Celticness,” though, when applicable, it will include brief discourses about a greater Celtic identity that includes influences from Irish, Scottish, and Welsh cultures, among others.

Manifestations of Scottish culture investigated in this dissertation include those that are perceived as historically authentic, based on material and documentary evidence, and others that are deemed less authentic, from inaccurate clan histories to the symbolic associations of Scottish tunes, instruments, and Highland dress mentioned above. An exploration of authentic vs. inauthentic, or invented, aspects of cultural identity and traditions will be pivotal in this dissertation, and relevant to other studies of identity formation and transformation. Questions of value in regards to these distinctions will be raised: is a practice developed as an invented tradition of less merit than one with clearer links to a recognized tradition? Can traditions and invented traditions ultimately serve the same social or cultural purposes in the creation or transformation of identity? These
questions, among others relevant to identity construction, have been actively considered in recent anthropological, sociological, and musicological studies by authors such as Celeste Ray, Paul Basu, Hugh Trevor-Roper, among others, but this dissertation reconsiders them in light of the tradition of the pipe band and its transformation in particular regions in North America from the mid-nineteenth century to the present. In answering these questions, I do not mean to cast a negative light on the cultural importance of these traditions, whether authentic or inauthentic, but rather to examine the pipe band’s role as an important part of the process of shaping history, culture, and ethnic identity.

Many elements and factors go into the complex notion and creation of ethnic, cultural, and national identity. This dissertation will not attempt to study all areas of Scottish culture and music, such as religion, literature, poetry, song tradition, fiddling, and hymns. Instead, it offers introductory suggestions of various elements and practices that have meshed within Scottish traditions, concentrating on the pipe band, its practices, and its repertoire as key symbols and phenomena of identity construction and transformation.

1.3 Theoretical Framework and Terminology

This study of the pipe band as a mechanism of cultural transmission investigates its development into a transnationally popular ensemble that has allowed many performers (and listeners) to reaffirm and reconstitute a post-diasporic cultural identity. Since identity plays a major part in this dissertation, it is essential to first make clear what is meant by the term. According to Stuart Hall, identity is “a collective shared history
among individuals affiliated by race or ethnicity that is considered to be fixed or stable.” The article by scholars Daniel and Jonathan Boyarin entitled, “Diaspora: Generation and the Ground of Jewish Identity,” supports Hall’s definition, but goes beyond a racial or ethnic basis, and in it, the authors assert that group identity has been constructed traditionally in two ways: as the product of a common genealogical origin and as produced by a common geographical origin. Former president of the Canadian Ethnic Studies Association, Wsevolod Isajiw, takes this idea a bit further, stating that identity is not only a shared history, but a shared set of practices. According to Isajiw, “identity can be conceived as a phenomenon indicated by the attributes and behavior patterns which derive from membership in a cultural group.” Isajiw notes that a person’s individual identity is derived from two intertwined types of behavior patterns: internal and external. By internal aspects, Isajiw refers to images, ideas, attitudes and feelings. Externally-created identity includes “cultural behavior patterns (i.e. speaking an ethnic language, practicing cultural traditions etc.), participation in cultural networks (i.e., family and friendship), participation in cultural institutional organizations, participation in cultural associational organizations (such as clubs, societies etc.), and participation in functions sponsored by or held by cultural organizations (concerts, performances, lectures, dances and so forth).”

In the typical pipe band in the American Southeast and Ohio Valley Regions, many of the participants share a similar genealogical background through their family ties to Scotland, so Hall’s definitions about collective shared history and ethnicity certainly apply, as does the Boyarins’ thread of genealogical origin. Not all of the members in the
bands, though, are Scottish, and part of what unites them is their geographical origin (or, where they currently live), also noted by the Boyarins. Aspects of Isajiw’s definitions of internally- and externally-created identity are reflected in the band members’ perceptions of Scottishness, derived through their participation in the cultural networks surrounding pipe band competitions and performances.

National identity, or nationhood, is a concept that plays a central role in the discourses of Scottishness. The question of nationhood was a common one in the nineteenth century, a period during which “[t]he status of all minorities…turned into an issue of widespread concern to writers, philosophers, and statesmen who sought to reconfigure a medieval society of orders into pluralistic nations governed according to modern ideas of progress.” The concern with the “status of all minorities,” had been partially reflected in the Enlightenment period’s Primitivist philosophy, which became fashionable through Europe during the mid-to-late eighteenth century, and which helped elevate the status of the Highlander to that of the prototypical “noble savage.” During this period, Enlightenment values, postcolonial environments, and reactions to the French and American Revolutions led to what has been described as the “self-consciousness of nations.” The ideas of nation and nationality began to shift with the boundaries of nations, as “a variety of peoples and culture [were] not simply mixed but blurred and sometimes erased.” Concepts such as alienation, ethnic outsider status, and split national identities came to the forefront of societal discussions.

The five points of nationality identified by Anthony Smith include common myths and memories, common mass culture, a historic territory and homeland, common legal
rights, and a common economy.\textsuperscript{58} Certainly one aspect of nationality or “nationhood” is related to geographical borders, as Smith notes, but nationhood is a concept that encompasses a broad spectrum of linguistic, ethnic, religious, cultural and historical perceptions. As such, nations are not only matters of territorial boundaries, but also forms of collective imagining.\textsuperscript{59} According to historian Murray Pittock, “too much emphasis is laid on ‘contractual’ nations with [their] constitutional and documentary formats, and too little on collectivist culturalist nationalism, which identifies its chosen people-nation as unique, and possessed of unique qualities.”\textsuperscript{60} Cultural theorists Andrew Milner and Jeff Browitt support Pittock’s view: “Nations are often understood as political, geographical or even biological phenomena, but there is an obvious sense in which they are primarily cultural.”\textsuperscript{61} Richard Taruskin references a similar concept of nationhood—as an individual's imagined perception of belonging—in his discussion of a new concept of German nationalism, inspired by Hegelian ideals, in Music of the Nineteenth Century: “…Germanness was henceforth no longer to be sought in folklore. One showed oneself a German not ethnically but spiritually, by putting oneself in humanity’s vanguard.”\textsuperscript{62}

These concepts of nationhood, which inform the sense of Scottish identity presented in this study, are different from the strict idea of “nation” and the related concept of “nationalism,” at least as the terms are commonly used in music history. In music history, the term “nationalism” is frequently tied to the nineteenth century; it specifically “refers to nineteenth-century movements, most notably in Russia, Bohemia, and Scandinavia, that sought to end foreign domination and musical incorporations from Germany and Italy; movements that encouraged the native composers’ use of folk
idioms.”63 My investigations of Scottish identity and nationhood involve what might be aligned with a culturally-based national spirit, rather than with a musical nationalism defined strictly by political or geographic borders.

In diasporic communities, where feelings of displacement naturally factor into national identity, individuals select elements of their cultural past to serve as symbols of their ethnic identity. The homeland is remembered with fondness or longing but perhaps not always entirely correctly, and over time, members of the displaced population group might create a new version of their cultural identity. Therefore, for diasporic communities in particular, I think it is important to consider identity as somewhat malleable and non-static. There are several scholars whose work has been a guiding point on the evolution of identity. According to David McCrone, “the fluidity and plurality of identities is part and parcel of the postmodern condition.”64 Genevieve Mari, in her thesis “When the Pipers Play: Identity Politics and Scottishness,” restates McCrone’s ideas in claiming that “identity is not something that once was created and subsequently has become fixed and fundamentalised, on the contrary, it is something that is always changing, contextual, relational, and shifting.”65 In a similar vein, Fredrik Barth believes the concept of identity within ethnic groups governs social life, but often undergoes some cultural evolution over time.66 Transmitting identity and culture in a diasporic group also includes experiencing new things and adding them to the old. As Edward M. Bruner states, “cultural transmission is not simply just a replication of an old original, a mechanical transfer of the cultural heritage from generation to generation…Culture is alive, context sensitive, and emergent.”67 Scottish Americans today might be considered, then, as interpreting the
evolving sense of Scottish identity passed from the initial diasporic generation to the post-diasporic ones; though the post-diasporic generations are of American nationality by birth, elements of the Scottish culture, real or imagined, permeate into their cultural perception and help to shape their ethnic identity.

A discussion of authenticity must factor into the analysis of the diasporic preservation of any type of ethnic identity, and Robin Cohen’s notions of collective memory and myth, as well as the idealization of a real or imagined ancestral home, are crucial to understanding the ideas of tradition and invented tradition that permeate nearly all contemporary discussions of Scottish identity. This dissertation will investigate many aspects of Scottishness that are considered “invented” traditions, as well as those believed to be “authentic.” An invented tradition is a tradition that appears or claims to be ancient and authentic, but is actually quite recent or artificial in origin. The concept of invented tradition is one that has been investigated by many scholars, most notably perhaps by Hugh Trevor-Roper, Eric Hobsbawm and other contributors to their 1983 book The Invention of Tradition. In this work, the authors note that societal pressures sometimes precipitate the formation of new cultural practices in the form of invented traditions, described as “a set of practices, normally governed by overtly or tacitly accepted rules and of a ritual or symbolic nature, which seek to inculcate certain values and norms of behaviour by repetition, which automatically implies continuity with the past.” Invented traditions tend to manifest themselves through material objects; in Scotland and the lands of the diaspora, this manifestation became evident in the nineteenth century in the nostalgic imagery (kilts, tartans, lone bagpipers on misty mountains, and so forth)
fostered by Highland societies and Caledonian clubs, the tartan industry, the British
monarchy, and period authors. Their fixation on the Highland Scots was represented by
terms such as “kiltophiles,” “Highlandism,” and “tartanry,” thus amplifying the newly
bred Scottish identity. Though the idea of invented culture or “created tradition” is not a
new idea, or one that is particular to Scotland, it cannot be ignored and will figure
prominently in the discussions of Scottish music and culture in Chapter Two of this
dissertation.

1.4 Overview of Source Literature

In presenting the history of Scottish emigration, the work of Angela McCarthy,
including *A Global Clan: Scottish Migrant Networks and Identities Since the Eighteenth
Century* and *Personal Narratives of Irish and Scottish Migration, 1921-65,* is
significant and enlightening. Though McCarthy’s work seldom mentions music, her
description of Scottish immigrant experiences is very helpful. Other scholars who look at
Exodus to Canada,* and Marjory Harper, with her work, *Adventurers and Exiles: The
Great Scottish Exodus.* Campey’s specific discussions centering on St. Andrew’s
Societies in places like Antigonish County, Nova Scotia, convey the eighteenth-century
immigrants’ need to establish cultural networks in their new lands. Gordon Donaldson’s
*The Scots Overseas* describes the reasons for and patterns of emigration to the United
States, Canada, Australia, New Zealand, and South Africa. Warren W. Hofstra’s *Ulster to
America: The Scots-Irish Migration Experience, 1680-1830* details the waves of Scots-
Irish immigration to the Eastern seaboard of the United States.
While studying Scottish cultural transmission, I consulted numerous publications related to Scottish cultural transmission, including those about Celtic music and the general term “Celticism,” under which the idea of “Scottishness” is sometimes categorized. Since there are multiple Celtic regions in the world, a number of studies that dealt with the manufacturing of “Celticism” in different regions were consulted to see if it paralleled the sense of Scottish identity in this research. The most relevant of these documents was Lisa Davenport Jenkins’s Ph.D. dissertation, “Celtic Connections: ‘Celticism’ in Scottish Music.” This work discusses Celtic history and the forerunners of the Celtic vogue, stressing the relationship of the global pop music industry with modern folk revivals. Her dissertation concludes with an ethnographic study of the Celtic Connections Festival in Glasgow, founded in 1994. Though it is a thorough document, there is almost no mention of the pipe band in the work, even though there are typically a few pipe bands featured in the Festival each year—Davenport Jenkins’s focus is more within the pop music arena. It was useful, however, as a framework for an ethnographic study of Scottish music.

Other cultural studies of music helped frame the discussion of establishing cultural identity through musical performance, especially in immigrant communities. Mirjana Lausevic’s “A Different Village: International Folk Dance and Balkan Music and Dance in the United States” about Americans of both Balkan and non-Balkan origin performing Balkan music and dance was very helpful as a model of this type of study, as was Charles Michael Elavsky’s “Producing “Local” Repertoire: Czech Identity, Pop Music, and the Global Music Industry.” Four more studies framed similar questions of

Two of Celeste Ray’s books in particular, Highland Heritage: Scottish Americans in the American South,82 and Transatlantic Scots,83 are valuable in helping to establish concepts of Scottish cultural identity. They consider the concept of transnational identification and sense of place constructed by both performers and audience members at Highland games. Ray posits that these people speak about Scotland with nostalgia, even though they are nine or more generations removed from the immigration experience and may have never been to Scotland.84 Though Ray’s work is encompassing and important, her publications include only a cursory examination of the role of the pipe band in the Scottish cultural transmission in relation to a focus on people’s overall experiences at southern Highland festivals as a means of connecting with their heritage. Paul Basu’s Highland Homecomings: Genealogy and Heritage Tourism in the Scottish Diaspora85 is a great study of the establishment of Scottish identity through family histories, clan societies, and heritage tourism, a type of tourism oriented toward investigating cultural origins. Though not centered on music, it was useful for his approach to diasporic identity and invented traditions. Several theses and dissertations were also helpful for their discussions of Scottish identity construction: Kenneth Michael

Though few of the works mentioned above deal with the pipe band, there are indeed several dissertations and theses that have discussed regionally specific areas of pipe band performance. These publications include Grant Lawrence Kerr’s “Scottish Pipe Bands in Winnipeg: A Study of Ethnic Voluntary Associations” and Sarah Loten’s “The Aesthetics of Solo Bagpipe Music at The Glengarry Highland Games.” Kerr’s document takes an anthropological approach to studying the pipe band scene in Winnipeg, and also touches on the history of the instruments in a pipe band, as well as some of the revitalization of Scottish culture that began occurring toward the end of the twentieth century. However, it focuses intently on the contributions of specific performers that he interviewed, and makes no larger connections to Scottish identity. Loten’s work is not really about the pipe band as a whole: she discusses piobaireachd and the lighter ceol beag repertoire for the bagpipes, but does not mention cultural associations or even piping and drumming ensembles—as the title indicates, her interest centers on solo piping performance only. Victoria Campbell’s Ph.D. dissertation, “Pipe Band Competitions at Scottish Highland Games: Sound Aesthetics, Performance, and
Judging,” is the best ethnographic study of the pipe band available to date. Her focus is on the pipe band scene in the American Northwest, with ethnographic discussion centering on a few Highland games events in the state of Washington. Though, like Kerr’s dissertation, it lacks broader connections to the pipe band’s role in fulfilling a quest for ethnic identity, it provides a good framework for an ethnomusicological investigation of the pipe band. “When the Pipers Play: Identity Politics and Scottishness,” by Genevieve Mari, discusses Scottish identity and how it manifests itself in the bagpipers at the National Piping Centre in Glasgow. Finally, Mats D. Hermansson’s, “From Icon to Identity: Scottish Piping and Drumming in Scandinavia,” focuses on the pipe band scene in Scandinavia at the turn of the twenty-first century, and was also useful for referencing the manifestations of Scottish identity transplanted in Scandinavia.

Nearly all of the above publications, when referring to the bagpipes and the pipe band, cite passages from one of seven or eight authorities on the bagpipes. Francis M. Collinson’s Bagpipe, Fiddle, and Harp, The National and Traditional Music of Scotland, and The Bagpipe: The History of a Musical Instrument are oft-referenced sources on the history of the pipes. Roderick Cannon’s The Highland Bagpipe and its Music, another useful work, discusses army and civilian use of the bagpipes. William Donaldson’s The Highland Pipe and Scottish Society 1750-1950: Transmission, Change and the Concept of Tradition touches more on the cultural importance of the bagpipes. This book covers the role of eighteenth-century Highland Societies in establishing the first piping competitions and the importance of the bagpipes in the nineteenth-century
Highland revival. The Canadian expert on bagpiping, John Gibson, has several notable publications including *Old and New World Highland Bagpiping* and *Traditional Gaelic Bagpiping, 1745-1945*. Gibson’s work includes very detailed discussions of ancient clan pipers in the Scottish Highlands and also of more modern pipers in the eastern provinces of Canada, detailing performance history including roles in battle, ceremonies, dance accompaniment, and Highland festivals. There is, however, little orientation toward cultural identity research in Gibson’s work. Hugh Cheape’s *Bagpipes* is an excellent study of the bagpipes’ role as Scotland’s national instrument, and their development throughout history. Barry Shears’s *Dance to the Piper* is about the piping tradition in Nova Scotia and Cape Breton, and includes discussions of immigration, New World traditions, and army piping ensembles. Finally, Joshua Dickson’s *The Highland Bagpipe* is a collection of contributions from authors such as Cheape, Shears, and Ian MacInnes, whose M.Litt. thesis, “The Highland Bagpipe: the Impact of the Highland Societies of London and Scotland, 1781-1844,” from the University of Edinburgh is another useful reference. Though these authors thoroughly present the history of the bagpipes, their discussion of the history of the pipe band is usually extremely brief, moving directly from its military use in the mid-nineteenth century to its late-twentieth-century incarnation. Cannon, Donaldson, and Gibson all mention that there are no publications that detail the pipe band’s nineteenth-century evolution, and as I previously mentioned, there are few that even address its twentieth-century developments.

There were no published studies that specifically dealt with the pipe band and its importance in establishing Scottish national identification in post-diasporic North
American communities. The lack of research on the pipe band’s contemporary history also points to the significance of the present study.

1.5 Methodology

In considering aspects of the pipe band’s complicated, changing role in identity production, my methodological process has included both musicological and ethnographical approaches. In the musicological sphere, primary historical research was conducted in various archives and libraries such as the Scottish National Archives in Edinburgh, the National Piping Centre in Glasgow, the Library of Congress, the Performing Arts Division of the New York Public Library, and in databases and archives of Canadian, Scottish, English, and American newspapers in order to shed further light on the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth century transition from the military pipe band to police and fire department bands and other civilian ensembles. As such, I newly assessed and evaluated historical details, enhancing and moving beyond previous discussions of the pipe band’s history and cultural functions.

In addition, my study draws upon personal experiences within several North American communities with strong Scottish ties, but more particularly built on ethnographic research that I conducted in two particular communities in Kentucky and Tennessee. Though I briefly lived in Canada as a child, and though I conducted interviews and research in Ontario and Nova Scotia during the summers of 2008 and 2009, much of my personal exposure to the contemporary performing scene in the North American Scottish pipe band is through my participation as a snare drummer in the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums from 2006 to 2012 and the Knoxville Pipes and
Drums in 2014 and 2015. Thus, my activities as a participant observer, including interviews, performance analyses, and Highland festivals, have centered on my activities with KUPD and KPD and interaction with other bands at competitions in the American Southeast.

I have been a performing member of the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums and the Knoxville Pipes and Drums for eight years collectively, and each of these bands of approximately 15-30 people seems an appropriate subset of people to study: mostly non-professional musicians, many with Scottish or Scots-Irish ancestry, nearly all looking for a sense of community or wanting to strengthen ties to their cultural background. (In my own family background, four of my great-great-grandparents immigrated from Scotland, and four family surnames—MacArt, Fleming, Crooks, and Walker—are historically tied to septs\textsuperscript{109} of large Scottish clans.) Since the southeastern United States includes the largest community of Scottish settlers in the United States, and since there are many Scottish cultural events still in the South today, Kentucky and Tennessee offered the ideal locales to conduct research as a participant observer. As such, my experience has allowed me to study performance practice, visit performance venues, and conduct interviews, using Kentucky United and the Knoxville Pipes and Drums as representative North American pipe bands.

Eight years as a participant observer in the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums and Knoxville Pipes and Drums revealed much about band structure, rehearsal settings, competition requirements, and the members themselves. To investigate the current workings of a pipe band, including the roles of the various instruments, the contributions
and personal views of participants, and the methods of learning repertoire, several different approaches were necessary. I conducted surveys and interviews with the members of KUPD and KPD, and I also interviewed well-known side drummers Tom Foote, of the 78th Fraser Highlanders Toronto and the Toronto Police Pipe Band, and Doug Stronach, also of the Toronto Police Pipe Band, about pipe band history and stylistic evolution. I tried to give a balanced orientation for the study, seeking perspective both from an emic approach, as a performer myself, and an etic position, as an academic conducting an ethnography. It is likely that, as a performer involved in the network I study, some of the cultural understanding in my research may reflect the “observer paradox” noted by scholars of social anthropology, though I attempted to be as unbiased as possible in the collection and analysis of data.110

I also conducted research into other Highland games directories, pipe band directories, pipe band websites, event programs, the Royal Scottish Pipe Band Association’s online news archives, and in Canadian, Scottish, and American newspapers. For further education on technical matters for the instruments, I consulted a few instruction books that were indispensable for understanding the function of the band and its different instruments. These included The Scottish Pipe Band Association Tutor and Text Book,111 Doug Stronach’s Pipe Band Snare Drum Tutor,112 The Alex Duthart Book of Pipe Band Snare Drum Compositions,113 and R.W. Lerwick’s The Pipe Major’s Handbook: A Complete Operator’s Manual for the Scottish Pipe Band.114
1.6 Outline of Chapters

**Chapter One: Introduction**

The first chapter presents the thesis of my study: understanding the pipe band as a mechanism of cultural transmission, centering specifically on its impact on the Scottish diaspora in North America. I discuss the scope and methodology of my research, and orient the reader with a brief background on the Scottish diaspora, the pipe band, and how the pipe band’s performance rituals provide a link to the traditions, ideologies, and history of a post-diasporic group of people. I center my study with a review of existing literature (both primary and secondary sources) relevant to the topic, including the dominant discourses on Celticism, tartanization, Scottishness, cultural transmission, and performing identity, and I outline the theoretical and methodological framework that I used to conduct my research and organize my study, touching on the limitations and framework of my fieldwork and my experiences as a participant observer, as well as the significance of my study.

**Chapter Two: Patterns of Scottish Identity Creation and Cultural Retention in Scotland and Throughout the Lands of the Scottish Diaspora**

Chapter Two presents a survey of the patterns of Scottish immigration to North America. Here I discuss reasons for immigration, including the Highland Clearances, the failed Jacobite risings, the famine in the Highlands, cheap transatlantic travel, and the offer of freehold land in North America. I incorporate demographic studies of where the early Scottish immigrants were centered, where the largest pockets moved, where the most influential immigrant communities were, and where people retained the strongest...
cultural, linguistic, and musical ties to Scotland. This chapter includes a brief discussion of the East Coast of Canada (specifically Cape Breton Island, Nova Scotia, and Newfoundland) and large immigrant centers in the southeastern United States. I also touch on the musical traditions that were retained among these communities.

Chapter Two centers on the sense of Scottish identity that was retained in the new immigrant communities and was further manifested by attempts to reclaim self and identity. This segment commences with a discussion of the early “kiltophiles” back in Scotland: those Scots who, after the post-Jacobite outlawing of the Gaelic language, the clan tartans, and the bagpipes as emblems of war in 1745, deliberately began to embrace them as national symbols of Scottish independence. The romanticization of the Highlander in eighteenth- and nineteenth-century literature and poetry (including that of Sir Walter Scott and Robert Burns), Queen Victoria’s affinity for summer holidays at Balmoral Castle, James Macpherson’s translation of the ancient poetry of Ossian, the formation of the Traditional Music and Song Association of Scotland, the Royal Scottish Country Dance Society, the Strathspey and Reel Societies, and the Accordion and Fiddle Clubs increased the popularity of the Highland arts and Gaelic culture in Scotland. In post-diasporic North America, St. Andrews Societies and clan heritage organizations began hosting ceilidhs and Highland games, festivals through which they could cultivate aspects of a post-diasporic identity that focused on the material expressions of Highland culture, such as Highland athletic competitions, dances, musical performances, and food.115
Chapter Three: Historical Overview of the Pipe Band, its Instruments, and their Relationship to Scottish Identity

After Chapter Two establishes the progression of immigration and the concepts and origins of Scottish identity, Chapter Three begins the discussion of the pipe band and its history as an identity signifier, with emphasis on the history of the bagpipes. Literary and artistic references to the bagpipes in Scotland are present in clan history beginning with Clans Menzies and McDonald, each of whom claim to have used bagpipes in battle since at least 1314. The bagpipes were a symbolic instrument for many of the warring Scottish clans starting in the 1300s; pipers would lead battle charges and often played until either the battle ended or they were killed. This chapter will also cover the contributions made by the MacCrimmon Clan on the Isle of Skye, which established a world-renowned piping academy to teach piobaireachd with an oral system of vocables called canntaireachd, and the formation of the Black Watch Regiment and other Highland regiments in the British Army.

This chapter includes the results of primary research on the transition of the pipe band from a military ensemble to a group associated with police and fire brigades to a completely civilian band, considering also the aspects of Scottish identity retained, embedded, and transformed in the functions of the pipe band. The chapter concludes with a discussion of the emerging subculture of today’s pipe band scene: the establishment of the Royal Scottish Pipe Band Association, and the spread of bands around the world.

Chapter Four: Contemporary Performance Practice and Music of the Pipe Band

Chapter Four includes discussions of today’s civilian pipe band and all aspects of
“performing Scottishness,” from the symbolism of band uniforms to the identity creation fostered by the repertoire and instruments. Subjects considered include the construction and playing technique of bagpipes, side drum, tenor drum, and bass drum; the geographic concentration of pipe bands; and Highland dress. In this chapter, I also examine the traditional repertoire of the bagpipes and the pipe band, which falls into one of three categories. These include: 1) Ceol Mor or Piobaireachd—the “Great Music:” salutes, laments, incitements to battle, and theme and variations; 2) Ceol Meadhonach—the “Middle Music:” slow airs; and 3) Ceol Beag—the “Little Music,” which consists of marches and dances such as reels, strathspeys, jigs, and hornpipes. The music played by full pipe bands is generally selected from the latter two categories. I incorporate examples of sheet music to aid in discussions about musical form, ornamentation, and phrasing. I also investigate significant and symbolic pieces in the pipe band repertory, such as “Scotland the Brave” and “Amazing Grace,” and how the history and usage of the tunes has cemented their status as identity signifiers in the pipe band subculture.

**Chapter Five: Ethnographic Case Studies of Kentucky United Pipes and Drums and Knoxville Pipe Band**

Chapter Five investigates the dynamics of acculturation in the pipe band, and how the ensemble both reinforces and creates new aspects of tradition and identity. It draws upon interviews and surveys taken with 25 pipers and drummers during my years as a participant observer in the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums and the Knoxville Pipes and Drums. In this chapter, case studies of the two bands will illuminate the ways in which the ensembles serve as transmitters of Scottish identity. These case studies will
also demonstrate how shared attachments and shared practices among piping and drumming ensembles create senses of group and self identity. Through explorations of how the bands operate during rehearsals and performances, how the performers interact with one another and with their heritage, and how band members learn and transmit repertoire, I show that modern civilian pipe bands exist for purposes of enjoyment, communal activity, and competition. In this chapter, I also explore the performance occasions for pipe bands, which include parades, funerals, concerts, and Highland games.

Chapter Six: An Ethnographic Case Study of the 2014 Scotland County Highland Games

Chapter Six presents a detailed ethnography of the 2014 Scotland County Highland Games, held in Laurinburg in Scotland County, North Carolina, as experienced through my participation as a member of the Knoxville Pipes and Drums. Highland games are occasions in which—through pipe band performances, tartan parades, and dancing and athletics competitions—the central themes of Scottish heritage are dramatized and participants come together through enactments of collective identity. They are also places where pipers and drummers find individual identity through their participation in the piping and drumming subculture. Chapter Six will use the Scotland County Games to illustrate how a Highland festival can act as a narrative of cultural identity for pipe band participants and audiences, and how the rituals of performance at the festival can reflect the various layers of group, individual and cultural identity in the pipe band subculture.
Chapter Seven:

Chapter Seven assesses the changing forces and shifts of cultural meaning and their importance in the various layers of identity within the pipe band, particularly highlighting transformations of the late twentieth century and underscoring aspects of continuity and change in traditions, both real and invented, from the nineteenth to early twentieth century. It synthesizes the central arguments that serve as foundation to the previous chapters, focusing on the ethnic symbolism and transmission of culture created by the pipe band in North America. Within lands of the Scottish diaspora, the retention and transformation of Scottish cultural and musical practices and ensembles—including the pipe band—occurred throughout nearly three centuries of emigration, and this chapter reiterates the role of the pipe band in the construction and transformation of Scottish identity within North America. It also includes links between the past and present, as well as ideas about performing and maintaining identity through music-making. As a conclusion, it clarifies the findings of the dissertation concerning the nature of both group and individual identity on the micro and macro level, relating my study of the pipe band as a tool of cultural transmission in the North American Scottish diaspora to general ways in which identity functions and is recognized within and outside cultural groups in society.

Copyright © Erin Walker 2015

37
CHAPTER TWO: PATTERNS OF SCOTTISH IDENTITY CREATION AND CULTURAL RETENTION IN SCOTLAND AND THROUGHOUT THE LANDS OF THE SCOTTISH DIASPORA

2.1 Introduction

The eighteenth century was a time of great change in Scotland. In 1707, the second Act of Union joined Scotland and England into a single, united kingdom called “Great Britain.” Shortly thereafter, the second Jacobite Rising occurred. The Jacobite Risings were a series of rebellions staged by the supporters of King James VII of Scotland (II of England) after he, a Catholic Stuart, was deposed from the throne in 1688. After his unseating, Parliament granted joint rule to James’s daughter Mary and her husband, William of Orange, both of whom were Protestants. James and the other Catholic Stuarts were exiled and James’s followers—many of whom were Highlanders who thought parliamentary interference with the throne succession was illegal—were called Jacobites. In 1702, Mary and William’s reigns were followed by that of James’s other daughter, Anne, who remained in power until her death in 1714; upon her death, the closest Protestant heir was a German relative from the House of Hanover who became George I in 1715. Determined to upend the Hanoverian monarchs and supersede King George I with James VI’s son, James Francis Edward Stuart, known by his enemies as the “Old Pretender,” the Jacobites staged their first major rebellion in 1715. Though this uprising failed, the Jacobites continued to stage protests with the aid of clans such as the MacDonalds, Camerons, Ogilvies, and MacGregors, led by Robert Roy MacGregor. Tensions continued to mount until 1745, when the Jacobites launched their greatest
attempt to restore the throne to the Stuart king in exile. Called “the Second Jacobite Rising” or “the Forty-Five,” this effort was led by the Old Pretender’s son, Charles Edward Stuart. Charles, also known as “Bonnie Prince Charlie” and the “Young Pretender,” had been born in Rome in 1720, and had spent most of his childhood in Rome and Bologna. In 1745, though, he secretly traveled to Scotland to rally his Jacobite supporters. The mass quantity of clan members on his side allowed Charlie and the Jacobites to take Edinburgh and win a number of battles, but they were finally crushed at the Battle of Culloden in April of 1746 by a much-larger English army, and the quelling of the final Jacobite Rising was complete.

Following the defeat at Culloden, the British wanted to suppress any vestiges of rebellious Jacobite activity in the Highlands. They policed the Highlands with the aid of anti-Jacobite clans such as the Campbells, and in 1746, they passed a series of laws designed to subvert Highland culture and make the area more secure for the king’s government. These included the Tenures Abolition Act c. 50, the Disarming Act 19 Geo. 2, c.39, and the Heritable Jurisdictions Act. Because of their Jacobite connections, the carrying of firearms was banned in the Highlands, as was the wearing of Highland dress (kilt, plaid, tartan) and the speaking of the Gaelic language. Though the Acts did not specifically mention bagpipes, their association with the Risings and the martial traditions of the clans meant that piping was as good as forbidden as well. James Reid, a bagpiper in the Ogilvy regiment, was arrested for piping for the Jacobite cause, though he was a musician who was not carrying arms. Originally, the jury advised the court to show him mercy, but later, they concluded “that any person who joined any set
of people engaged in open rebellion, though they did not bear arms, were yet guilty of High Treason; that no regiments ever marched without musical instruments, such as drums, trumpets or the like; and that a Highland regiment never marched without a piper, and therefore his bagpipe in the eyes of the law, was an instrument of war.”¹²⁵ The verdict in this case illustrates the extent to which the bagpipes had come to symbolize Scottishness, which, during and after the Jacobite rebellions, enabled the instrument to be used as a symbol of rebellion and protest for the cause of Scottish independence.

Unfortunately for the British, this outlawing actually prompted Scots Highlanders, as well as many Lowlanders, to begin embracing the Highland arts and material culture as national symbols of Scottish independence. Considered the early “kiltophiles,” these Scots and their ideas were bolstered by the increasing popularity of Highland culture not only in Scotland, but throughout greater Britain as well. The romanticization of the Highlander in nineteenth-century British literature, Queen Victoria’s affinity for summer holidays at Balmoral Castle, James Macpherson’s translation of the ancient poetry of Ossian, and the formation of the Traditional Music and Song Association of Scotland, the Royal Scottish Country Dance Society, the Strathspey and Reel Societies, and the Accordion and Fiddle Clubs increased the popularity of the Highland arts and Gaelic culture. Thus, after the uprising of the “Forty-Five,” the lore of the defeated Jacobites became a symbol of Scottish independence, and the cultural symbols of the minority Highlanders were adopted by the nation at large. In this way, the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries cultivated a national identity that focused on the material expressions
of Highland culture which had been outlawed as symbols of treachery for 40 years following the Battle of Culloden.

### 2.2 Origins and Early Manifestations of Scottish Identity Construction

The Highlands of Scotland, which produced the elements that have become emblematic of Scottish culture as a whole—clans, tartan, kilts, bagpipes, heavy athletics,\(^{126}\) and the Gaelic language—consist of the mountainous northern and western regions of the nation. Sometimes this area is also referred to as “the Highlands and Islands” when speakers are also including the islands of Orkney, Shetland, and the Hebrides. (The Lowlands, then, include all other areas of Scotland, encompassing the southern and eastern parts of the country along with the cities of Glasgow and Edinburgh.)

The Highlands of Scotland are famously known for the clan system, which began during the medieval period in Scotland.\(^{127}\) The word “clan” is derived from the Gaelic *clanna*, meaning “children.”\(^ {128}\) This was a hierarchical system in which chieftains ran their estates and surrounding fiefdoms. Historically, a clan was made up of everyone who lived on the chief's territory, or on the lands of those who owed allegiance to the chief. The view that all people in a clan were related to the chief is a myth, as many clansmen took on the chief's surname in order to receive protection, and food, or to show solidarity—not necessarily to show kinship. The clan system is important in this dissertation because of its influence on bagpiping traditions, which will be discussed further in Chapter Three.
Since the late eighteenth century, the Highlands have also been known for the production of tartan. Tartan is a multi-colored check-and-stripe pattern made of different-colored woven yarns. It is made of a fabric called a plaid, and the specific arrangement of each tartan’s stripes is called a “sett” because the manner in which the yarn pieces are spaced “sets” the color sequence for the tartan. Prior to the creation of the kilt, tartan was worn as a belted plaid that hung below the knees; leftover fabric could be worn over the shoulders as a cape or left to hang down the back of the skirt. The belted plaid was held in place by a leather belt worn around the waist, and the skirt of the plaid could be tied between the legs to form breeches. Because of the size of the belted plaid, it could be used as a garment by day and a blanket by night—it was most commonly worn by the lower class, so this dual usage certainly would have been an advantage.129

The earliest known tartan, called the Falkirk tartan, dates to the third century.130 It seems that the varying tartan patterns were historically associated with disparate geographical regions, and color and sett variations depended on use of the fabric or availability of certain dyes. In Martin Martin’s *A Description of the Western Isles of Scotland*, published in 1716, he notes that, “Every Isle differs from each other in their Fancy of making Plaids, as to the Stripes in Breadth, and Colours. This Humour is as different thro’ the main Land of the Highlands, insofar that they who have seen those Places, is able at the first view of a Man’s Plaid, to guess the place of his Residence.”131 In general reference today, though, it is a common misconception that tartan designs have always corresponded to clan names and membership. Since the Scottish clans each came from a specific geographic area, it is possible that people made the false assumption that
the regional tartan differences were due to alignment with certain clans instead of merely to geographically-based variations in tartan. Tartan patterns aligning with specific clan names, though, were unknown prior to the middle part of the eighteenth century. Today, by contrast, every clan has at least one associated tartan, and some have multiple tartans or setts, including “modern,” “ancient,” “dress,” and “hunting.” The patterns are easy enough to commission that non-clan tartan usage is also popular. 34 of the 50 American states, as well as 630 other companies, schools, universities, fire departments, military organizations, pipe bands, and Highland festivals throughout the lands of the Scottish diaspora have their own official tartans as well.

As evidenced by travelers’ journals, government papers, historical documents, and paintings, tartan and plaid have been in regular use since at least the early seventeenth century. In the National Records of Scotland, there are a number of documents dating back to this period that mention one or the other. A title bond by Andrew Munro from December 14, 1615, requests a delivery of “ane fine new quhyit plaid” before May 1, 1616. In the papers of the Menzies family of Weem, Scotland, there is an account of expenses to buy tartan in 1622. The Seafield Papers from the 1640s include a letter from Katherine Grant to her mother, requesting either mixed cloth or tartan for her son’s pension. In the Campbell family papers, there is a precept from 1675 charging the head of the Lochdochart estate to buy “a gude ordinarie plaid to Donald Roy McIntyre mypyper.” Later Campbell family papers tracking spending on December 22, 1684 include disbursements for “a Highland plaid to Dougal Campbell at London £12 scots, also a short coat of blue cloth, fine tartan for trews and hose, a dirk knife and sheath to it,
a powderhorn and belt, a bonnet and 9 ells ribbon to the plaid and coat, a belt and purse, two pairs cut out Lorn brogues, a targe and a broadsword.” These documents are just a few of the seventeenth-century sources referencing tartan and/or plaid that are held in the National Archives of Scotland in Edinburgh.

The kilt, on the other hand, is a slightly more recent item of clothing. The kilt is a pleated knee-length garment that features the tartan pattern; today it is considered the most iconic item of Highland dress. According to Hugh Trevor-Roper, the kilt or philibeg (“small kilt”) originated in 1725 or 1726 with an English Quaker by the name of Thomas Rawlinson. Rawlinson owned an iron works plant in Glengarry where many Highlanders were employed. He had his tailor alter the traditional Highland dress to make it more suitable for the activities of his workmen; on his request, the skirt became separated from the plaid and the pleats were sewn into the garment. In Trevor-Roper’s words, Rawlinson’s initiative brought the Highlander "out of the heather and into the factory."

Though Trevor-Roper is a well-respected scholar, any claims that Rawlinson was solely responsible for inventing the kilt are not entirely correct, for there are documented instances of its use prior to Rawlinson’s emergence on the scene. In the National Gallery of Scotland, there is a painting of Lord Mungo Murray by John Michael Wright from around 1683, and it shows the Lord wearing a very kilt-like garment—a belted plaid that has pleats and has been shortened to knee length. Also, the National Museum of Scotland has a 1714 oil painting by Richard Waitt entitled, Piper to the Laird of Grant, that clearly shows a Highland piper, William Cumming, holding his pipes and wearing a knee-length, pleated tartan garment and matching tartan hose. Cumming’s high social
status is reflected by his tartan, elaborate jacket, and the pipe banner detailing his chief’s coat of arms.

While Rawlinson could not have been solely responsible for inventing the kilt, since the two paintings clearly pre-date his workers’ use of the garment by ten and forty years, respectively, his factory’s use did help promote it. Twenty years later, as a matter of fact, it was so popular among the clans that it was considered a signature garment worn by members of Bonnie Prince Charlie’s army. By August of 1745, as the Jacobites started marching toward Edinburgh, mustering support on the way from many of the Highland clans, Prince Charlie’s army had adopted elements of Highland dress in their uniforms as a symbol of the Jacobite cause. In James Ray’s 1752 book *A Compleat History of the Rebellion*, he mentions a number of times that the Jacobite soldiers wore plaid and other
“Highland cloaths.” He also mentions that the Young Pretender wore a “Highland garb of fine silk Tartan” and that when stationed in Glasgow the rebel troops began to furnish themselves with “Broad-cloth, Tartan, Shoes, Stockings, and Bonnets.” Indeed, a fragment from what is purported to be Prince Charlie’s tartan is found in the Scottish National archives. This item consists of an envelope marked, “A Relic of the 45. Piece of Tartan from the Plaid of ‘Prince Charlie.’ Left with the Lady Mackintosh at Moy Hall, Invernesshire, J Mathison.” According to the Archives staff, dyes on the tartan and handwriting on the envelope are authentic for the period. This use of the kilt and tartan in the final Jacobite rising of 1745-1746 set the stage for its later sentimentalized status as an iconic representation of the material culture of all Scots.

Along with kilts and tartan, music also helped to produce a new national consciousness during the Jacobite risings. There is a very large body of Jacobite songs in Gaelic, as many of the great Gaelic poets of the eighteenth century were Jacobite supporters who composed songs to popularize their cause. Jacobite composers during this period include Duncan Bàn MacIntyre, William Ross and Alexander MacDonald, who was present when Charles Edward Stuart raised the Jacobite flag at Glenfinnan. The Great Highland bagpipes were seen as an emblem of Jacobitism starting in this period (though many of the pipes of the eighteenth century were slightly different from those of the modern era, commonly featuring two drones instead of three), and they were utilized to rally the Jacobite troops in battles. When Bonnie Prince Charlie headed to Scotland to attempt to claim the British throne for the house of Stuart, he had a Highland bagpiper on board, illustrating that he likely felt the pipes had a symbolic role in stirring emotions for
the Jacobite cause. Many of the Highland clan leaders brought along their bagpipers to play in the Jacobite army, and there is a good deal of evidence of this practice, such as the correspondence of January 1746 from Governor George Grant, Fort George, to Ludovick Grant, stating that there are, “[o]nly 74 men in the company without piper or drummer… you may judge ho[w] far the clan will be afronted.” The Piping Centre in Glasgow has on display the “Culloden pipes,” a set of pipes with two drones played by a man from Argyll who served in the Jacobite army in 1745-46. And according to William Donaldson, after the battle of Prestonpans, the rebel army marched into Edinburgh with 100 pipers playing “The King Shall Enjoy his Own Again,” which was a Jacobite air.

Though the final Jacobite rising ended at the battle of Culloden in April of 1746—only nine months after it started—its effects on the perceptions of Scottish identity were long-reaching. Both Lowland and Highland Scots started wearing tartan, speaking more Gaelic, and embracing the bagpipes as national symbols of Scottish identity as means of protesting the British government’s passage of the Tenures Abolition Act, the Disarming Act, and the Heritable Jurisdictions Act. Within the next 30 years, though, Jacobitism became a cultural force rather than a political one: by the 1770s, the British, who so recently had feared and despised the Highlanders, and who had attempted to suppress any vestiges of Jacobite activities in the Highlands, were establishing organizations to help promote elements of this new national Scottish consciousness. According to cultural historian Murray Pittock, “only when Jacobitism subsided into defeat could the marks of Scottish patriotic difference (plaid, pipes and so on) become picturesque and indeed fictionalized synecdoches for national peculiarities.”
One of the earliest organizations that promoted this newly-celebrated sense of Scottishness was the Highland Society of London, founded in 1778. The goal of the Society was to encourage the preservation of Highland traditions and to repeal the Act of Proscription, which forbade the wearing of Highland dress. (The Society succeeded and in 1782 the Act was repealed.) The Society also formed a collection of “certified” tartans (led by two of its members, the MacPhersons), published the Gaelic translation of Ossian (likewise associated with the MacPhersons), and, in a conscious attempt to preserve the Highland arts, began to hold piping competitions in 1781 at Falkirk Tryst in Central Scotland. These competitions were early precursors of the popular piping and pipe band competitions of today. Neil MacLean, a piper from Glasgow, began competing in the first piping competitions run by the Society in 1781, and having won first prize in 1783, he was invited to be the first full-time piper to the Society for an annual wage of 12 guineas and a complete set of Highland dress.\footnote{Music played by bagpipers, especially \textit{pibroch},\footnote{helped evoke a sense of place at the Highland Society’s meetings, and the Society’s sponsorship of piping competitions brought more pressure to standardize the instrument and its music. Among the Society’s papers stored in the Scottish National Archives is a circumstantial account, dated October 22, 1783, of the exhibition on the Great Highland pipes in Dunn's Assembly Rooms in Edinburgh. According to this document, 12 pipers played that evening, including “John McArthur[,] the only surviving professor of the ancient College of Dunvagan, now grocer in Edinburgh.”\footnote{Duncan Ban, a soldier in the City Guard, recited a poem in Gaelic, and “some of the pipers demonstrated Highland dancing, and then all twelve walked round St. Andrew's Square}} helped evoke a sense of place at the Highland Society’s meetings, and the Society’s sponsorship of piping competitions brought more pressure to standardize the instrument and its music. Among the Society’s papers stored in the Scottish National Archives is a circumstantial account, dated October 22, 1783, of the exhibition on the Great Highland pipes in Dunn's Assembly Rooms in Edinburgh. According to this document, 12 pipers played that evening, including “John McArthur[,] the only surviving professor of the ancient College of Dunvagan, now grocer in Edinburgh.”\footnote{Duncan Ban, a soldier in the City Guard, recited a poem in Gaelic, and “some of the pipers demonstrated Highland dancing, and then all twelve walked round St. Andrew's Square}
playing Clanranald's March, and adjourned for dinner.” To further encourage traditional music and sport, the Society sponsored Highland games such as St. Fillans and the Braemar Gathering, founded in 1819 and 1832 respectively. During the subsequent century, the artistic activities sponsored by the Highland Society of London eventually helped pave the way for the formation of the Traditional Music and Song Association of Scotland, the Royal Scottish Country Dance Society, the Scottish Strathspey and Reel Societies, the Accordion and Fiddle Clubs, and the Royal Scottish Pipe Band Association.

The nostalgic image of Scotland that began during and after the Risings further manifested itself in music and literature in the final decades of the eighteenth century. According to the “Education Scotland” website:

Far more Jacobite songs were written many years after the warfare of 1689 and the Risings of 1715, 1719 and 1745, when the political cause had died. By 1780 to be pro-Jacobite was not revolutionary, but was a rather right-wing and romantic hankering after the old ways…many of the newer songs were sentimental and backward-looking.

Indeed, the song “The Garb of Old Gaul,” a tune written in the 1760s, celebrates Highland soldiers in the Seven Years’ War (1756-63) and mentions some of these exalted images, including “the heath-covered mountains of Scotia,” “our loud-sounding pipe bears the true martial strain,” “So do we the old Scottish valor retain.”

In the late eighteenth century, with the backing of the Highland Society of London, James Macpherson (1736-1796) published his “translation” of the ancient Gaelic poetry of Ossian. Despite the fact that Macpherson fabricated Ossian’s original epic document that he had allegedly translated, and despite his numerous contemporary
doubters, *The Works of Ossian* attracted many people to Highland life and Gaelic culture.163

During the same period, celebrated Scottish poet Robert Burns (1759-1796) inspired national pride in historical battle-related poems such as “Scots Wha Hae,” composed silly odes to Highland food in “Address to a Haggis,” and waxed sentimental about mountainous Scottish scenery in “My Heart’s in the Highlands.” Burns’s contributions as “Scotland’s Favorite Son” are celebrated each year on January 25, with “Burns Suppers” held by Scottish societies to celebrate the poet’s birthday. These suppers are common in both Scotland and the lands of the diaspora, and they consist of a bagpiper “piping in the haggis” (playing his pipes while the haggis—a traditional Highland dish made of the liver, heart, and lungs of a sheep—is served), an overview of Burns’ life and poetry, and the singing of “Old Lang Syne.”

Macpherson and Burns’s younger contemporary, Sir Walter Scott, also projected a nostalgic literary vision of the Highlands that attracted the wider British public. Published between 1814 and 1832, Scott’s Waverley novels were a series of more than two dozen historical novels that referenced Highland history and folklore, promoting sometimes-fanciful visions of the region, including the alignment of tartans with specific clans. *Waverley* (1814) was the first novel in the series, and the fact that it centered its plot around the Jacobite Rising of 1745 certainly must have sparked the imagination of the British public about Scottish history. *Rob Roy* (1817), about the 1715 Rising, even included fragments of Scots Gaelic in its tale of Rob Roy MacGregor.164 Sir Walter Scott
claims a kind of “ethnographic authority” in his writings on the Highlands, particularly
in passages such as this in the General Preface to the Waverley novels:

My early recollections of the Highland scenery and customs made so favourable
an impression in the poem called the Lady of the Lake, that I was induced to think
of attempting something of the same kind in prose. I had been a good deal in the
Highlands at a time when they were much less accessible and much less visited
than they have been of late years, and was acquainted with many of the old
warriors of 1745, who were, like most veterans, easily induced to fight their
battles over again for the benefit of a willing listener like myself. It naturally
occurred to me that the ancient traditions and high spirit of a people who, living in
a civilised age and country, retained so strong a tincture of manners belonging to
an early period of society, must afford a subject favourable for romance, if it
should not prove a curious tale marred in the telling.

Scott and Macpherson’s writings during this period reflect elements of Primitivist
philosophy, popular in Europe during the mid-to-late eighteenth century. The proponents
of Primitivism believed that indigenous populations were superior to modern humans,
and they idealized what they considered as simple and unsophisticated folk cultures.
Their dedication to the preservation and transmission of the past provided a “cultural
counterweight” to the modernization and rationalization of Enlightenment society.
Celticism (including the romanticized Highlander) was, according to Murray Pittock, “in
the main stream of a Primitivism which saw an antiquarian colonization of the British
periphery through the collection and codification of a much-despised but now appreciated
cultural heritage, bowdlerized by the collectors in such a manner as to challenge neither
the ruling sentiments nor politics of Britain.” The increasingly exoticized image of the
Highlands depicted in the work of writers such as Macpherson and Scott helped
popularize the Enlightenment view of the primitive Highlander as a noble savage. This
romanticizing was another phase—following the British Army’s appropriations—in the
deflation of the rebel symbolism of the bagpipes and the Highlander. Essentially, the once-feared Highlander was rendered devoid of all threat.

Along with Scott, Macpherson, Burns, and the Highland Society, probably the other most influential purveyor of the reinvented Scottish culture—i.e., Highlandism—was the British monarchy. In 1822, the Hanoverian monarch King George IV became the first reigning British king to visit Scotland since the seventeenth century (his visit was planned by none other than Sir Walter Scott). Harriet Scott, a member of the Scottish nobility (and no relation to Sir Walter Scott), described the king’s Highland dress in the last of a series of several letters to her daughter Anne about his visit in August 1822. On August 17, she wrote, “His Majesty wore the Royal Tartan Highland Dress with Buff coloured Trousers like flesh to imitate His Royal Knees, and little Tartan bits of stockings, like other Highlanders, half up his Legs, and he looked very well, only a little huffle buffle by all accounts.”170

George IV’s willingness to embrace Highland culture helped pave the way for Queen Victoria’s interest, and she became possibly the most influential of all of the kiltophiles in the nineteenth century. Queen Victoria’s earliest documented visit to the Highlands was with Prince Albert in 1842.171 The queen, who had Stuart blood, was so taken with Highland culture that she wrote of Scotland, “There is…no country where historical traditions are preserved with such fidelity, or to the same extent. Every spot is connected with some interesting historical fact, and with most of those Sir Walter Scott’s accurate descriptions have made us familiar.”172 The queen also commissioned a tartan interior for Balmoral Castle, joined the church of Scotland, and spent summer holidays
there. Prince Albert even designed a Balmoral tartan, which was based on the Royal Stuart tartan, but using a darker gray to represent the Grampian mountain range in the Highlands.¹⁷³

The British monarchy’s love of Scottish music, fashion, and landscapes led many members of the nobility to rush to purchase country estates in the picturesque setting of the Highlands, prompting huge changes in the area’s systems of land management and societal structure. Eric Hobsbawm suggests in *The Invention of Tradition* that we should expect the manipulation of tradition to occur more frequently when “a rapid transformation of society weakens or destroys the social patterns for which ‘old’ traditions had been designed.”¹⁷⁴ As I will illustrate in section 2.3, the end of the Jacobite rebellions and the subsequent anti-Jacobite laws, as well as the later Highland Clearances, destroyed the former social order of the clan system in the Highlands of Scotland. At a time when many Scots were emigrating to new lands, and those at home were fighting an uphill battle against economic decline, people of Scottish descent clung to emblems of Scottishness at a time when everything around them was changing.

2.3 Reasons for and Patterns of Emigration to North America

In the 1700s, large numbers of emigrants began leaving Scotland for North America, Australia, and other locations. There were a series of reasons that gave rise to the exodus: the failed Jacobite Risings, the Highland Clearances, the famine in the Highlands, the offer of freehold land in North America, and the availability of cheap transatlantic travel.
The first catalyst of the steady stream of departure was the Jacobite Risings. Though the Jacobite supporters did not emigrate from Scotland expressly because they were defeated at Culloden, the failed Jacobite Risings did set in motion major changes in the economic, political, and social layout in the Highlands, and these changes did stimulate the first upsurge in emigration from the region.

After Culloden, many of the clan chiefs who had supported the Jacobites lost their judicial powers through the Heritable Jurisdictions Act, which gave the right of final say in their domain to the crown. This Act reduced their power a great deal, and henceforth, instead of having their clansmen living on their land as tacksmen, they decided to introduce large-scale commercial farming of sheep and pasturing of deer. To make room for the agricultural and sporting land, the chiefs forced tens of thousands of their former tenants to vacate. This mass eviction is referred to as the Highland Clearances, and it led to overwhelming poverty and created a permanent change in the system of land-holding and farming practices in the Highlands. Ironically, the clan chiefs who are so celebrated in Scottish lore actually helped to cause ruin to the region’s traditional practices. During the Clearances, several hundred thousand people left the Highlands in search of a better life elsewhere.

Those who stayed in the Highlands were forced to change how they made a living. In desperation, some people began to grow potatoes. Others moved to the seashore to collect and process kelp for factories, though the kelp industry eventually declined, causing still another tide of emigration. Many Highlanders were barely surviving, with peat being the only fuel to keep warm. Cholera and typhoid ran rampant. Thus many
Highlanders began to emigrate to the industrial cities of the Scottish Lowlands, and to Canada, Australia, and the United States. In the decade between 1763 and 1773 alone, over 20,000 people left the Highlands. Fortunately, transatlantic travel was fairly inexpensive, and they were also attracted to the possibility of owning their own land in North America (owning land in Scotland was impossible, and it was very expensive to rent it). This prospect of economic independence was attractive to farmers, but also to industrial workers who welcomed the atmosphere of a more egalitarian society in America.

Almost as soon as the first waves of emigrants began packing, emigrant recruiting agencies who were tied to land associations, steamer companies, and railway groups began cropping up. These recruiting agencies published guidebooks written for the working-class emigrant market. Though some were written by British nationals who had never even been to America, they lured many people to emigrate with detailed descriptions of the colonies.

The ensuing mass immigration to North America was centered on the east coasts of Canada and the United States. Highlanders were the largest ethnic group to arrive in North America from Britain between 1775 and 1815. In the United States, the greatest number of immigrants (approximately 12,000 people) came to the Cape Fear valley in eastern North Carolina, including Flora MacDonald (1722-1790), famous in Scotland for aiding Bonnie Prince Charlie in his escape from the British. In Canada, the first group of Scottish Highlanders to arrive directly in Nova Scotia came in 1773. By 1815 there were an estimated 15,000 Scots in Canada, many of whom were Gaelic speakers.
In contrast to the Highlanders’ huge emigration numbers in the eighteenth century, only around 7,000 Lowland Scots moved to the colonies during this time, which was approximately 2% of all emigrants of any nationality. Later, though, most of the Scots who emigrated were actually Lowlanders. Malcolm Gray believes that Lowlanders were a less obvious part of the Scottish emigration surge because of the dispersed fashion in which they left Scotland: “Relationships within the groups they formed and links between emigrants and the relatives and neighbors they left behind were probably looser than those of Scots who migrated in groups.” Angela McCarthy, visiting professor of the Scottish Centre for Diaspora Studies at the University of Edinburgh, draws a similar conclusion: “The Lowlanders who did not share the Highlanders’ “vision of kin-based racial solidarity” were “often integrated more easily and imperceptibly into their new environment.”

Another large group of immigrants were Ulster Scots, also called the Scots-Irish: descendants of the Lowland Scots who had settled in Northern Ireland in the seventeenth century thanks to land grants from King James VI of Scotland (I of England). They migrated in large numbers to the colonies, especially the Carolinas, Tennessee, Virginia, and Kentucky, in the eighteenth century. Besides the English and the Germans, during this time the Scots-Irish were the largest ethnic group to come to the New World: by 1776 there were an estimated 250,000 of them in the colonies, about a tenth of the population.
2.4 The Growth and Proliferation of Scottish Culture, and Appropriation of Scottish Identity, in North America

By 1914, Scotland had sent more than two million emigrants to non-European destinations. Of these emigrants, 44% went to the United States, 28% to Canada, and 25% to Australia and New Zealand. By definition, this mass emigration is referred to as a diaspora.

In *Theorizing Diaspora: A Reader*, Jana Evans Braziel and Anita Mannur state that, “Diaspora encompasses the parameters of geography, national identity, and belonging.” This view echoes Robin Cohen’s description of a diaspora (as quoted in Chapter 1), which includes among the common characteristics of a diaspora the following elements: traumatic dispersal from an original homeland, a collective memory and myth and history about and idealization of the homeland, and a strong ethnic group consciousness sustained over a long time and based on a sense of distinctiveness. Cultural practices are fundamental in the creation, maintenance, and reinforcement of both individual and group identities in diasporic communities. In the case of the Scottish diaspora, as in many dispersions, once the immigrants began to settle in their new communities, feelings of nostalgia led the immigrants in both Canada and the United States to search for a shared identity in their new communities. In order to maintain a sense of connection to their homeland, they tried to create gathering places, such as Scottish societies, to meet people from their old counties or cities or to make new friends with similar interests. Many of the societies’ activities were based on the constructed sense of Scottishness originating from the romanticization of Highland and Gaelic traditions.
culture. In essence, the Scots who were members of these groups, many of whom likely had no ancestral or geographical ties to the Highlands based on the immigration percentages listed above, were renegotiating the links to their diasporic identity by commemorating their ancestors with the material culture, music, and traditions of Highland Scots.

Sometimes disparagingly called “kiltophiles,” the members of these heritage societies tried to visibly and audibly convey Scottishness “via clans, societies, pipes, kilts, and dancing. It was then a colorful and noisy expression of their cultural identity, thus heightening Scottish visibility.” In Canada, the North British Society of Halifax, which assembled in 1768, was one of the first of these heritage societies, and was open to “persons of Scottish relationship by descent, marriage or affiliation.” In 1818, the Highland Society of Canada was formed “to celebrate and preserve the language, martial spirit, dress, music, and antiquities of the ancient Caledonians.” St. John and Fredricton both formed St. Andrew’s Societies (named after the Patron Saint of Scotland, and celebrating St. Andrew’s Night on November 30) in the early nineteenth century, designed to give “pecuniary relief to such natives of Scotland and their descendants as may have fallen into distress,” promote “a taste for Scottish music and literature,” and “act as a social club for local business men.” Montreal had a St. Andrew’s Society as well, which held its first “St. Andrew Ball” on December 2, 1816. The Montreal Herald described the scene thus:

The dancing commenced about seven o'clock and continued with great spirit till after midnight, when the company to the number of about 130, sat down to a sumptuous and elegant supper. The supper room was handsomely decorated,
having at the upper end a transparency of glass lit behind by candles representing
St Andrew at full length. The supper was lavish: a pyramid of quail, a suckling
pig l'Italienne and a boar's head. The entry of the Haggis was a central feature.
After supper the dancing continued with much vivacity till five o’clock.197

A number of the societies were founded by successful Scots to promote Scottish
culture and give funds to needy countrymen. These included the women’s organization,
the Daughters of Scotia, its affiliate for men, Clan MacNeill, and the unisex Order of the
Scottish Clans.198 Early on, many of the organizations were centered on the east coast of
Canada, where the immigrants had first settled. But gradually these immigrants and their
descendants had moved across the country. Retired affiliates of the Black Watch
organized dances in Canada, especially in Toronto. Even cities as far from the
immigration source as Winnipeg and Calgary had Scottish societies by the 1880s. The
“Canadian Boat Song,” which first appeared in the mid-1800s, gives evidence of the
strength of the Canadian connection to a mythical Scotland at this time, with idealized
descriptors of an ancestral homeland evident in phrases such as “misty island…the blood
is strong, the heart is Highland…we are exiles from our fathers’ land.”

From the lone shieling of the misty island
Mountains divide us, and the waste of seas —
Yet still the blood is strong, the heart is Highland,
And we in dreams behold the Hebrides:
Fair these broad meads — these hoary woods are grand;
But we are exiles from our fathers' land.

We ne'er shall tread the fancy-haunted valley,
Where 'tween the dark hills creeps the small clear stream,
In arms around the patriarch banner rally,
Nor see the moon on royal tombstones gleam:
Fair these broad meads — these hoary woods are grand;
But we are exiles from our fathers' land.
When the bold kindred, in the time long-vanish'd,
Conquer'd the soil and fortified the keep, —
No seer foretold the children would be banish'd,
That a degenerate Lord might boast his sheep:
Fair these broad meads — these hoary woods are grand;
But we are exiles from our fathers' land.

Come foreign rage — let Discord burst in slaughter!
O then for clansman true, and stern claymore —
The hearts that would have given their blood like water,
Beat heavily beyond the Atlantic roar
Fair these broad meads — these hoary woods are grand;
But we are exiles from our fathers' land.¹⁹⁹

In the United States, as in Canada, some of the earliest heritage societies were St. Andrew's Societies founded to give aid to struggling Scots: the Scots Charitable Society of Boston was organized in 1657, the Charleston Society of Saint Andrew was formed in 1729, and in 1749, the Saint Andrew's Society of Philadelphia was established by 25 Scottish residents to give relief to the poor.²⁰⁰ In 1756, the Saint Andrew's Society of the State of New York was founded as a charitable organization,²⁰¹ and in Lexington, Kentucky, the Caledonian Society was formed in 1798.²⁰² The Daughters of Scotia and the Order of the Scottish Clans are two other well-known Scottish societies in the United States. Throughout the Scottish diaspora, branches of the Highland Society of London, for example, were formed in Glasgow (1780), Madras (1814), Bombay (1822), Nova Scotia (1838), Prince Edward Island (1838), and Melbourne (1864).²⁰³

During the latter half of the twentieth century, participating in individual clan societies—such as Clan Drummond, Clan Sutherland, Clan MacNeil, and Clan Campbell—became popular with Americans and Canadians of Scottish descent. In fact, according
to Angela McCarthy, by the end of the twentieth century, clan societies held larger memberships than any other Scottish heritage society. McCarthy believes the popularity of clan societies stems from that fact that they treat members like a family; they “celebrate kinship at a time when actual kin links seem to be breaking down--employment demands and divorce separate nuclear family and also contribute to geographical distance between grandparents and grandkids. In the losing of ties to your traditional family you can create new ones to your ancestry and familial line by meeting a new ‘extended family’ in your clan.”

Besides the Highland societies, another means of fostering Highland material culture was the establishment of Highland games during the mid-nineteenth century. Highland games are found both in Scotland and in the lands of the diaspora, and are outdoor festivals that celebrate Scottish culture with displays and/or sales of food, clothes, clans, tartan, history books, and genealogical maps. They also include competitions in piping and drumming, dancing, and Scottish heavy athletics.

One of the earliest Highland games, as mentioned earlier, was the Strathfillan Games, held at St. Fillans, Scotland, for the first time in 1819. The Strathfillan Games included athletic contests and trials of strength as well as solo piping competitions (no pipe band ensemble contents) in both *piobaireachd* and light music (reels, strathspeys, and quicksteps). In *The Highlands and Islands: A Nineteenth-Century Tour*, John Eddowes Bowman, an English naturalist and banker, states that, on July 22, 1825, in the parish of Killin, he and his traveling partner,
found from a printed handbill, nailed on the porch of the little winn at Dalmally, that the Games of the Highland Society are to be celebrated this year at St Fillans. As the subject of this paper was new to us, my friend Dovaston, with some compunctious visitings of nature, contrived to get possession of it; and as it gives a copious account of the efforts of the Highlanders to preserve and perpetrate their ancient language and customs, I will give a condensed compendium of it, as it is very diffuse. St Fillan’s Highland Society Games, The seventh annual meeting will be held at the village of St Fillans, Perthshire on the 30th August next. The office bearers and Committee to meet early, to make arrangement of the Games. The other members to be fully attired in the Highland Garb, and march to the arena of Games. Boys in Highland costume, will be allowed to walk in the rear of the procession, and have superintendents and two Pipers appointed to them. Among the Prizes offered for competition are the following; 1 To the best player of Pibrochs on the Great Highland Bagpipe, - A handsome full-mounted Pipe. 2nd. To the second best Do. A silver mourned Dirk. 3rd. To the third best, Ossians Powems in Gaelic. 4th. To the best player of old Highland Reels on Do. a handsome brass mounted Dirk. 5th. to the best Dancer, etc....a Philibeg, throwing.

Another early games, the Braemar Gathering, began in 1832. It was attended by Queen Victoria in 1848 and was almost certainly an inspiration for her love of the Highlands.

Not only do the Highland games have a long history in Scotland; this tradition is nearly two hundred years old in the other countries of the Scottish diaspora, including the United States and Canada. In 1836, the Highland Society of New York held its first sportive meeting, a precursor to Highland games with piping and dancing and a parade of clansmen. The Boston Caledonian Club established its games in 1857, as did New York City. In the years leading up to the American Civil War, the Philadelphia and Newark Caledonian Clubs also held games. The Caledonian Club of San Francisco inaugurated their games on Thanksgiving Day in 1866. In 1855 in Canada, the Montreal Caledonian Society coordinated the first-ever Montreal Highland Games, and in 1856, the Embro Highland Games were held for the first time in Zorra Township in
Ontario.\textsuperscript{211} The Glengarry Caledonian Society organized its first Highland games in 1858, a precursor to the massive Glengarry Highland Games held today in Maxville, Ontario.\textsuperscript{212} During this period, athletes such as James Fleming and Donald Dinnie toured the Highland games circuits throughout the world and helped popularized the games further—Dinnie was a celebrity and toured extensively throughout the United States during his lifetime, and his touring is an indication of how popular the Highland games had become.

In Antigonish County, Nova Scotia, and on Cape Breton Island, hundreds of inhabitants spoke only Gaelic up through the turn of the twentieth century. This area became the site of a massive Highland games tradition. The Antigonish Highland Society was founded in 1861, and in 1863, sponsored the first of what have since become annual Highland games although such events were held on an informal basis long before this.\textsuperscript{213} Events included foot races, piping, the Highland Fling competition, as well as traditional Scottish heavy events. According to the Antigonish Highland Games website, “In the late 1860’s [sic], when the 78\textsuperscript{th} Highlanders were garrisoning at the Citadel in Halifax, they travelled to Antigonish to take part in the Highland games and, as such, were the first pipe band to ever participate.”\textsuperscript{214}

In 1893, even the Chicago World’s Fair celebrated Scottish identity. \textit{The New York Times} of March 6, 1893, contained an article, “Caledonian Games at the Fair,” stating that events would be held in August in Chicago during the World’s Fair and would be governed by the North American United Caledonian Association. Events included the hammer toss, the stone throw, the caber toss, the high jump, the hurdles, several races, a tug of war, a standing high jump and a Highland dress competition.\textsuperscript{215}
Highland games festivals continued to proliferate throughout the twentieth and early twenty-first centuries. By 1994, Kinmor Music’s *The A.B.C. of Highland Dancing & Games Directory* listed 148 annual Highland games in Scotland, and 158 throughout the rest of the world, 129 of which are in North America. In Scotland, the Highland games season is from May through September, but in warmer climates, the period for the events runs throughout the full calendar year. In the United States, for example, the earliest games is in Orlando in January, and the last one is in South Carolina in December. In the northern hemisphere, the busiest time of year for Highland festivals is in June, July, and August. In its “Highland Games in Scotland” section, *The A.B.C. of Highland Dancing & Games Directory* lists six Highland games in May, 34 in June, 60 in July, 45 in August, and four in September. The high season for games is fairly similar in the United States and Canada, though in these countries, June is proportionally busier than that in Scotland: in April there are 10 Highland games in the United States and Canada, in May there are 14, there are 25 in June, 26 in July, 17 in August, 19 in September, and 18 Highland games in October. In Australia and New Zealand, however, the busiest time for games appears to be during December and January. Most Highland festivals are held on weekends, though there are a few on weekdays.

Highland games and gatherings are “temporary physical expressions of an ‘imagined’ unity,” where the central themes of Scottish heritage are enacted through massed bagpipe band performances, parades of tartans, and dancing and athletic competitions. For North Americans, these sites are places where Scottish Canadians and Americans can assemble and rediscover their roots, or experience what it is to be
Scottish without actually setting foot in Scotland. Highland festivals such as the Scotland County Highland Games, which is the focus of the ethnography in Chapter Six, are a collective act of “remembrance” through ritual, dress, song, and discussion of clan and family histories. The production of traditional music, sport, and dress has led folklorist W.F.H. Nicholaisen to define the Highland games as a folk tradition "because there is continuity and repetition in their production, consumption, and performance.”

2.5 Conclusion

Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger would argue that the extant material culture that represents Scottish identity today is comprised entirely of invented traditions: icons of an imaginary Scottish nation that resides in a social landscape constructed and derived through literature, heritage societies, musical performances, Highland games, and a highly lucrative tourist industry. The perception of Scottishness that came out of the nineteenth century was indeed a romanticized one, founded partially on distortion and dishonesty. James Macpherson claimed to have translated the work of Ossian, yet this was a fabrication. Primitivist leanings in the work of authors such as Sir Walter Scott advanced the view of the Highlander as a “noble savage.” The “Sobieski Stuarts,” a pair of brothers posing as descendants of the royal Stuart line, did unscrupulously market their 1842 book of tartans, *Vestiarium Scoticum* [“Scottish Clothing”]: *from the Manuscript formerly in the Library of the Scots College at Douay*, as a reproduction of an ancient manuscript. The brothers were not really Stuarts, and the manuscript was fake, but wearing tartan became the height of fashion in England and Scotland, and textile mills produced large amounts of the fabric, adding specialized forms like hunting and “dress”
settts to existing clan settts. Clans obligingly adopted them when very little evidence of historical accuracy existed, and many modern-day clan tartans are even derived from the patterns and colors displayed in the manual.

Yet there are aspects that Hobsbawm and Ranger would call “invented” tradition that—though they may have shifted meaning over time—are certainly based on actual practices. Hugh Trevor-Roper and Hobsbawm claim that the kilt was an imagined national dress conjured up by an Englishman (Rawlinson) in the eighteenth century. The kilt was popularized and adapted during this period, but, as demonstrated earlier in this chapter, there are paintings and written accounts that show it was around long well before then, flourishing particularly during the Jacobite period. Continental images and accounts of tartan worn by Scots date back thousands of years, as the Falkirk tartan demonstrates. Modern Highland games commemorate the feats of strength and athletic activities that have been practiced in the Highlands for nearly 1000 years, although the pageantry and specific clan tartans associated with them are modern inventions.223

Even the Great Highland bagpipes are not exempt from sensationalized name-calling in the “invented tradition” camp. In 2008, Hugh Cheape’s book Bagpipes: A National Collection of a National Treasure claimed the Great Highland bagpipes were invented by two pipe makers in Edinburgh, Hugh Robertson and Donald MacDonald. Cheape wrote, "The written and received history of the great Highland bagpipe reflects in many of its parts the triumph of sentiment over fact...an orthodoxy has emerged from surprisingly modest origins in the first half of the nineteenth century and it was elaborated by repetition, speculation and guesswork in the second.”224 This caused a stir
in the British media, spawning articles in *The Telegraph* and *The Guardian* newspapers that implied the entire history of the Scottish bagpipes had been invented. Yet as detailed earlier in this chapter, and as is demonstrated by the rest of Cheape’s work, the bagpipes have been in Scotland for nearly one thousand years. It is true that the modern, three-drone form of the Great Highland bagpipes is only several centuries old (though the three-drone model was certainly in existence by 1714, as shown in *Piper to the Laird of Grant*) but almost any modern instrument (piano, snare drum, oboe, and tuba, to name a few) has certainly experienced a great bit of evolution throughout its history. Tradition, after all, is a dynamic concept, rather than a fixed one.

Other scholars find fault in parts of the idea of “inventing” traditions. Murray Pittock chastises the concept of invented tradition because of its “concomitant idea that a mass of people can accept a fraud perpetrated by a publicist of a creative artist as part of their own identity.”²²⁵ According to Pittock, useful as the concepts of imagining or inventing a nation or tradition may be, “adopting them without interrogation places too much power in the hands of creative writers and the impact of created narratives, and too little on the lived experience and shared traditions of national communities.”²²⁶ Essentially, there are real elements woven into the “inventions,” and we should not consider Scotland simply a product of idealization and mythologization. Paul Basu also makes an excellent comment pointing to a similar conclusion in his book *Highland Homecomings*: “Just as Said notes that ‘it would be wrong to conclude that the Orient was essentially an idea, or a creation with no corresponding reality,’ so it would be naive to suggest that Scotland was simply a construction of the romantic imagination; after all,
each of the motifs of Highlandism—‘bens and glens, the lone shilling in the misty island, purple heather, kilted clansmen, battles long ago, an ancient and beautiful language, claymore and bagpipes and Bonny Prince Charlie’—actually exist or existed. The material reality of the region has been affected by its discursive representation.” In other words, Basu believes that Highland elements have been adopted and accepted as legitimate and continuous traditions so frequently over time, that even the exaggerated representations have now become veritable traditions in their own right.

Although the symbols, icons, and practices constituting Scottish identity today may not all be authentic or unchanged from original Scottish practices, in our consideration of the bagpipes and pipe bands in the next four chapters, what is important is that the performers within the ensembles, as well as members of the public, equate them with Scottish identity. Parades, festivals, concerts, band rehearsals, holidays, and Highland games are the occasions when this reinvention of tradition takes place, when a ‘simulated’ Scotland comes to life, representing—in an exaggerated way—a popular mindset that exists among many people, especially outside Scotland. The next four chapters will give further suggestions of the transformation of Scottish identity through changing practices and contexts of piping and drumming ensembles, starting with Chapter Three’s historical overview of the bagpipes and the pipe band.
CHAPTER THREE: A BRIEF HISTORY OF THE PIPE BAND, ITS INSTRUMENTS, AND THEIR RELATIONSHIP TO SCOTTISH IDENTITY

3.1 Introduction

Bagpipes are aerophones that produce sound from a bag inflated either by a mouth tube or a bellows. Typically they consist of a bag, at least one drone pipe, and a double reed melody pipe, called a chanter, which is typically made of wood, cane, bone, ivory or metal, and is played by the fingers covering and uncovering a series of holes. Though Scotland’s Great Highland Bagpipes are unique in several ways (timbre, number of drones, the performers’ upright stature, repertoire, history) there are many types of bagpipes around the world, among them the uilleann or “elbow” pipes from Ireland, the musette de cour from France, the Northumbrian smallpipes, the Croatian diplar, the Galician gaita, and the Hungarian duda. They vary in size, number of drone pipes, reed construction, chanter technique, bag material, and of course, the timbre of the instrument’s sound.

An understanding of the bagpipes and their historical significance is essential to the study of the construction and transformation of Scottish identity in the pipe band. This chapter begins with a discussion of the history of the bagpipes, and how they are integral to Scottish traditions and ideologies both in Scotland and throughout the lands of the diaspora. I will address the bagpipes’ presence in Scottish clan history, the contributions made by the renowned MacCrimmon piping academy, and the bagpipes’ use in the Scottish regiments of the British Army. I will also consider the history of the drums, which were added to the pipe band in the nineteenth century. To help construct the
discourse of the pipe band and its history as a signifier of Scottish identity, Chapter Three will include the results of my primary research on the transition of the pipe band from a military ensemble to a civilian group. It will conclude with a discussion of the Royal Scottish Pipe Band Association and the geographic distribution of modern pipe bands.

### 3.2 History of the Bagpipes

Most scholars concur that bagpipes likely originated in the Middle East, though there are some who claim that the bagpipes came from further east in Central Asia.\(^{229}\) Sculptures of bagpipes dating from 1500 B.C. have been found at Panopolis in Egypt,\(^{230}\) and by the time of the Roman Empire (the first through fifth century AD), pipes were played by shepherds as well as the Roman infantry.\(^{231}\) In 100 AD, Roman historian Suetonius wrote that Emperor Nero played the *utricularis*, a pipe and leather bag that appears to have been an ancestor of the modern bagpipes. This account is corroborated by Dion Chrysostomos, a Greek historian from the same period, who wrote of Nero playing the pipe by his lips and tucking a skin beneath his armpits.\(^{232}\) Modern scholars such as Hugh Cheape, though, assert that there has perhaps been some mistranslation, and that the actual similarity of these instruments to bagpipes may be exaggerated.

Regardless, the bagpipes were unquestionably present in the British Isles by the tenth century. They were a universal folk instrument in medieval Europe, particularly among herdsman whose goats and sheep often supplied the hides from which bagpipes were made.\(^{233}\) Most bagpipes of this period probably had conical chanters, single long drones, short blowpipes and skin bags, like the Croatian *diplar* shown below,\(^{234}\) but as folk wind instruments they took many forms and possessed a wealth and variety of
Based on the historical record, it seems that the instrument was in use in Ireland before Scotland. There is a representation of a bagpiper on the high cross at Clonmacnoise in Ireland that dates to approximately 900 B.C., and the deeds of Christ Church Cathedral in Dublin mention a person named “Geoffrey the Piper” in 1206. It must have been played in Wales during this period, too: in 1100, the Welsh king organized the Eisteddfod at Caerwys, and there is documentation that he gave a silver pipe prize to the winner of a competition for Irish bagpipe playing.

One of the earliest literary references to bagpipes in Europe is from Spain. Several different types of bagpipes are illustrated in the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*, manuscripts featuring poetry and musical settings from late thirteenth-century Galicia. In this collection, there are a number of images of bagpipes that depict the instrument with varying designs. Geoffrey Chaucer’s late-fourteenth-century work *The Canterbury Tales* is another early literary work that references the bagpipes. Chaucer named the bagpipes as the instrument played by the Miller in the stories. In the general prologue to the tales, Chaucer wrote of the Miller on lines 567 and 568, “A baggepipe wel coude he blowe and sowne, / And therwithal he broghte us out of towne.”

During the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries, the bagpipes continued to be played throughout Europe. There is a carving of a bear playing the bagpipes on one of the
misericords in Henry VII’s chapel at Westminster, and in 1515, Henry VIII (1491-1547) commissioned a suit of armor, now called the “Silvered and Engraved” armor, that features an engraving of a piper. Around this same time, Albrecht Dürer (1471-1528) completed his etching called “The Piper,” which shows a man playing a two-droned set of pipes while leaning against a tree. In 1581, Vincenzo Galilei (c. 1520-1591) illustrated the importance the bagpipes had achieved in Ireland: “The Bagpipe is much used by the Irish. To its sounds, this unconquered, fierce, and warlike people march their armies, and are encouraged to feats of valor. With it they also carry their dead to the grave, making such a mournful sound, as to force the bystander to weep.”

In Scotland itself, iconographic representations of the bagpipes date from the thirteenth century. The stone carvings in Rosslyn Chapel in Midlothian depict angels playing the single-drone bagpipes to celebrate Christ’s birth. fourteenth-century Melrose Abbey, reputed to be the burial place of Robert the Bruce’s heart, has a bagpipe-playing “gargoyle” on its roof—this gargoyle is actually a stone carving of a pig playing the pipes. The image in Figure 3.2 shows another pig bagpiper, this time from a fifteenth-century misericord in Ripon Cathedral in Yorkshire, England. Hugh Cheape states

Figure 3.2: Pig bagpiper, Ripon Cathedral.
that during this period, it was common in manuscripts and on stone and wood figures in churches and monasteries for angels, monkeys, rabbits, and pigs to be depicted playing bagpipes.248

Literary and artistic references to the bagpipes in Scotland are present in clan history beginning with Clans Menzies and MacDonald, each of whom claim to have used bagpipes in battle since Robert the Bruce’s defeat of the English in the Battle of Bannockburn in 1314.249 Pipers were prominent members of the clan’s social hierarchy: the clan chief’s personal piper represented the clan’s glory. His role was to rally the clan and celebrate the chief; metaphorically, the powerful and voluminous sound of the pipes represented leadership, power, and the domination of a masculine, patrilineal society. In this way, the bagpipes were a symbolic instrument for many of the warring Scottish clans starting in the 1300s; pipers led battle charges and often played until either the battle ended or they were killed. Their performance was supposed to awaken clan pride, strength, and endurance of soul in the fighters, which made them feel invincible on the battlefield.

A number of ancient ceol mor, or “great music,” compositions illustrate this symbolic connection to historical battles. These include MacRaes’ March, written in 1477 about a skirmish between the MacRae, MacKenzie, and MacDonald clans; Killychrist, the war tune of the MacDonnells of Glengarry;250 The Campbells Are Coming, a legendary pibroch played in battle by the Campbell family pipers; Craigillachy, the gathering tune of Clan Grant; and The Clan MacFarlane Pibroch, which rallied that family in their homeland on the banks of Loch Lomond.
Probably the most famous ancient *ceol mor*, or “great music,” composition that shows the bagpipes’ importance in Highland battles is the “Pibroch of Donuil Dubh” (“Black Donald’s Pibroch”). *Pibroch* is a complex type of bagpipe solo comprised of variations on a theme; scholars believe “Black Donald’s Pibroch” originates from an air composed at the Battle of Inverlochy in the mid-fifteenth-century.\textsuperscript{251} It was further immortalized by Sir Walter Scott, who composed a poem based on the *pibroch* entitled “The Gathering Song of Donald the Black.” The following two stanzas begin Scott’s poem:

\begin{verbatim}
Pibroch of Donuil Dhu         Come from deep glen, and
Pibroch of Donuil            From mountain so rocky;
Wake thy wild voice anew;     The war-pipe and pennon
Summon Clan Conuil!          Are at Inverlocky.
Come away, come away         Come every hill-plaid, and
Hark to the summons!         True heart that wears one,
Come in your war-array;      Come every steel blade, and
Gentles and commons.         Strong hand that bears one.\textsuperscript{252}
\end{verbatim}

Other *pibrochs* illustrate the use of pipes to mourn the fallen, serving as a precursor to the modern-day presence of solo pipers or pipe bands at service funerals. These laments include *MacCrimmon’s Lament*, written to commemorate fallen piper Donald Ban MacCrimmon, hereditary piper to Clan MacLeod, who was killed during the Jacobite Rising in 1745, and *MacIntosh’s Lament*, which tells the tale of a MacIntosh chief killed on his wedding day around 1550. There are many other laments in the Mackay manuscripts; among them are *Captain Donald Mackenzie’s Lament*, *Captain McDougall’s Lament*, *Roy Mackenzie’s Lament*, *The Company’s Lament*, *Daughter’s Lament*, *The Duke of Perth’s Lament*, and *Lady Anapool’s Lament*.\textsuperscript{253}
Some of the best-known *pibrochs* demonstrate the allegiances of pipers to their clans. *A Cholla Mo Run* and *Duntroon’s Salute* both tell the 1644 story about the bravery of a piper who was captured by an enemy platoon. Overhearing the enemy’s battle plans, he piped symbolic warning notes on his bagpipes, resulting unfortunately in his murder but in the retreat and salvation of his clan.\textsuperscript{254}

The bagpipes’ most significant developments occurred in the sixteenth century with the contributions of the MacCrimmon family. The MacCrimmons, hereditary pipers to Clan MacLeod, established a world-renowned piping academy at Dunvegan Castle on the Isle of Skye, where clan chiefs would send their pipers for instruction. In the Scottish National Archives, there is a 1675 precept by the lord of Glenurchye (Glenorchy) to John Campbell of Inneryaldies, referencing bagpiping instruction. It requests that John Campbell give “Donald Roy, piper, £40 scots to learn his trade & giv him four pund Scots to buy him cloaths.”\textsuperscript{255} Another disbursement made by the Campbell family references instruction from the MacCrimmons (spelled “McCrooman” in the original document) in its receipt for “a plaid to little Johnny McIntyre the piper, for tartan for his breeches and hose, sent with Johnny McIntyre the piper to be given to McCrooman, piper in the Isles, paid to Quintilian McCraingie, McLean's piper, for one complete year's prentice fee, for the little piper before he was sent to McCrooman.”\textsuperscript{256}

The MacCrimmons did not teach *ceol beag* (light music for entertainment);\textsuperscript{257} they focused on instructing pipers how to play the grand style of *pibroc* with an oral system of non-lexical vocables\textsuperscript{258} called *canntaireachd*.\textsuperscript{259} In *canntaireachd*, the teacher sings the tune using a system of vocables, consisting of combinations of vowels that
represent the melody notes, and consonants representing the grace notes and embellishments.

The MacCrimmons are not the only celebrated piping family in Scottish history. A display in the museum of the National Piping Centre in Glasgow showcases a map of Scotland that illustrates locations where the playing of bagpipes flourished in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. In the northwest Islands, where bagpipers enjoyed a high social status and some of the piping families even established schools or colleges of piping, a few families, such as the MacArthurs and the Mackays (and, of course, the MacCrimmons), dominated the art. Other well-known piping families included the MacGregors and MacIntyres in the southwest/south central region and the Rankins in the southwest Islands.260

In the Highlands and Islands in particular, these piping dynasties established patterns of service to generations of clan chieftains. Bagpipers Alexander, William, and John Cumming were the most celebrated of a seven-generation Cumming piping dynasty under the patronage of the lords of Grant. William Cumming, who was employed as a piper to Alexander, lord of Grant, in Freuchie, Strathspey during the late seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries, is featured in one of the most famous paintings of a bagpiper: Richard Waitt’s Piper to the Laird of Grant, depicted in Figure 2.1. The repertoire, function, and performance practice of the MacCrimmons and other celebrated piping families helped mold the Highland piping of subsequent centuries, and it is difficult to diminish the sentiment of instructional traditions being handed down over generations. Mats Hermansson states, “By the mid-eighteenth century, their music and performance
practice had developed as a prestigious genre with a highly intricate style of playing on a voluminous imposing instrument strongly associated with political power and warfare.”

In the Lowlands of southeastern Scotland, where the clan system was less prominent, there was not much patronage for bagpipers. Pipers played in the royal court for the nobility and when towns grew and flourished beginning in the fifteenth century, they were employed as official musicians in the Scottish burghs. Often accompanied by a drummer, either minstrel pipers or fifers sounded reveille at 4 am and curfew at 8 pm, and were responsible for performing at all ceremonial occasions, pageants, horse races, fairs, festivals, weddings, and processions. In the Scottish Archives I discovered a petition to the magistrates and town council of Perth by John Jackson, town piper, for restoration of his weekly pension, which had ceased in March 1690 when the garrison had stopped him “doing his dewtie in goeing about the towne evening and morning with the pype.” In the Archives I also found a petition of John McGrigor, from September 1790, which points out that “his father had the honour of marching and playing the bagpipes before the men appointed to guard and keep the peace in the several fairs held in Kenmore, at 2s 6d [two shillings and six pence] each time; … but the present groundofficer refuses to employ him on grounds that he can appoint any piper he likes to play at the Kenmore market, …and then at the last July fair [the] petitioner was called to play but only given 12s [12 shillings] each fair day.” The custom of employing town pipers continued until the nineteenth century, though it seems that there were a number of unemployed minstrel pipers wandering the Scottish lands during this period as well—
traveling pipers warranted mention in the anti-vagrancy laws of Edinburgh (1560) and Glasgow (1574). These laws called all minstrels vagrant—including "pipers, fiddlers, and minstrells"—who were not in the direct service of lords of parliament or the burghs.

Since the Jacobite cause was supported by most of the large clans (except the Campbells, Sutherlands, and Sinclairs, who sided with the British), the bagpipes’ association with clan traditions and identity helped to make the instrument an emblem of Scottish national spirit, and pipers were used by the Jacobites to rally troops in battles. After the Jacobite rebellion was suppressed and the Disarming Act was passed, many Scots, both Lowlanders and Highlanders alike, deliberately embraced the wearing of Highland dress, speaking the Gaelic language, and playing of the Great Highland bagpipes as symbols of Scottish pride. When these symbols of Highland material culture began to represent a national Scottish identity, the popularity of the bagpipes increased significantly.

3.3 The Late Eighteenth- and Early Nineteenth-Century Proliferation of the Bagpipes

After the failed Jacobite Risings and the Highland Clearances, the previous clan-based social system in the Highlands collapsed. One way that many Highlanders were able to continue their Highland customs, and also escape poverty, was by joining the British Army’s new Highland regiments (after each Highlander had sworn allegiance to serve King George III, of course). The tight-knit regimental structure may also have been an appealing substitute for clannish Highland traditions. The soldiers in Highland regiments received three meals a day, and they were permitted to wear kilts, play pipes,
speak Gaelic, and bear arms (none of which Highlanders were allowed to do outside the army from 1746 until the Disarming Act was repealed in 1782).

The first Highland regiment that had been established by the British Army was the Black Watch, formed in 1739 as a means of keeping the Scottish Highlanders under surveillance in the tense years prior to the “Forty-Five.” Populated by the members of anti-Jacobite clans such as the Campbells, the regiment was known as the “Black Watch” because of the dark tartan worn by its troops; this was distinctively different from the red coats of the British Army. Many of the British Army’s new Highland recruits after 1746, contrastingly, came from clans once sympathetic to the Jacobite cause. Any lingering post-Jacobite resentment on the part of both the British and the Highlanders appears to have settled quickly, paving the way for Highlanders to join the British Army without much fear of confrontation. On the part of the Highlanders, there is no documentation that there was any attempt, by Charles Edward Stuart or any other member of the Stuart line, to restore the family’s position in the monarchy after the final Jacobite rising ended in 1746. Nor is there any evidence of subversiveness of subtext in the Highland regiments’ symbols of Scottishness (tartan, kilts, songs, bagpipes). Likewise, within the British military and government, the change in perception of and attitude toward the Highlanders appears to have been made in a short time span. In 1751, just six years after the suppression of the final Jacobite Rising, Lord Barrington, the British Secretary of War, is quoted as saying, “I am for having always in our army as many Scottish soldiers as possible…they are generally more hardy and less mutinous; and of all Scottish
soldiers, I should choose to have and keep in our army as many Highlanders as possible.”

From the mid-eighteenth century onward, Scotland played a large role in providing military manpower for Britain. As the likelihood of renewed Jacobite activity faded, Highland troops were increasingly recruited to fight Britain’s enemies abroad; in a sense, the waning military and juridical power of the clan chiefs was transferred to the Highland soldier, officer, and regiment as they became central figures in the power apparatus of the expanding British empire. Indeed, David McCrone writes: “[T]he raising of Highland regiments after 1745 was a master-stroke by the British state in incorporating the symbols of its enemies into its own identity.” Between 1756 and 1815, about 48,300 men from the Highlands and Islands served in 23 Line and 26 Fencible regiments. The injection of military money also had a significant effect on the Highland and Island economy, as very often a soldier’s only economic hope was the army pay he could send home to his family.

With more than 50,000 men recruited from the Highlands and Islands in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, Highland soldiers and musicians had a powerful cultural and political effect on the British Army throughout Britain’s wars of empire and the ensuing years. When the Black Watch stormed Fort Ticonderoga in New York in 1758, the bagpipers led the charge and continued to pipe, even as nearly two-thirds of the Highland regiment fell. During the Franco-British Battle of Quebec in 1760, legend has it that when the pipers of the Fraser Highlanders stopped piping during the enemy’s attack, the Highland troops lost a significant amount of ground. In desperation, the
commanders pleaded with the pipers to resume playing. When they did, the Fraser Highlanders regained territory and the French troops fled. Pipers even played during the Siege of the Alamo in San Antonio in 1836, where John McGregor, a Scotsman who had emigrated to Nagodoches, piped and was eventually killed when the Alamo was overcome.²⁷²

Thanks to the bagpipes’ strong association with political power and warfare, Highland pipers found new patronage within the growing British Army. In Scotland’s National Archives, National Museum, and National Piping Centre, there is a plethora of archival and material evidence of the bagpipes’ presence in the late eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century British Army. In the National Scottish Museum’s collections is a set of chamber bagpipes played by the personal piper to Colonel Archibald Montgomerie, who raised one of the earliest Highland regiments in 1757. In the Archives, I unearthed a letter dated February 1778, from John Campbell of Croft Head to Captain Mackenzie Humberston in Edinburgh, in which he speaks of the recruiting of a piper and acquiring of bagpipes: “I have received a lieutenancy and beating order in Lord Seaforth's regiment. I have made good progress recruiting and am soon to have quota…Have recruited the most excellent piper, for whom I could have received much money from some of the Highland regiments, and wish to clothe him and purchase pipes at expense of regiment.”²⁷³ And the National Piping Centre possesses a set of bagpipes played in the Battle of Waterloo in 1815, as well as chanters from pipes used during the Anglo-Egyptian War in 1801.

The late-eighteenth-century significance of the bagpipes is evident in period
publications. In 1785, Scottish author James Boswell noted how the bagpipes affected him in his *Journal of a Tour to the Hebrides with Samuel Johnson*, “The very…sound of a bagpipe, will stir my blood, and fill me with a mixture of melancholy and respect for courage; with pity for an unfortunate and superstitious regard for antiquity, and thoughtless inclination to war; in short, with a crowd of sensations with which sober rationality has nothing to do.”

John Eddowes Bowman writes on Wednesday, July 20, 1825, of a bagpiper playing familiar Scottish tunes on board the *Marion Steam Packet*, a ship from Glasgow.

We inclined towards the eastern shore, sailing through the narrow strait…where we saw…the pass of Bulamaha, this tract was formerly held by the formidable Clan of the MacGregors, which under the celebrated Rob Roy was the terror of the whole country… The bagpiper on board our vessel was playing some Jacobite tunes and Gathering pibrochs; and we could not help peopling the neighbouring glens and mountains in our imaginations, with hundreds of kilted Highlanders, whose common practice it was […] to rush down from their retired dwellings to the appointed place of rendezvous, to pillage and slaughter any hostile clan…

Bowman’s account clearly points to an Englishman’s association of the bagpipes’ historical ties to Highland violence and rebelliousness: an example of primitivist leanings, perhaps? Sir Walter Scott also writes of the bagpipes’ ties to war, but he links the instrument to a variety of social functions as well: “The Great Highland Bagpipe is the instrument for war, for marriage, in funeral processions, and for other great occasions, the smaller being that whereon dancing tunes were played.”

In the mid-eighteenth century, the art of playing the Highland bagpipes evolved from an oral tradition into one learned with the help of printed books and manuscripts. Published initially with Scottish collections of song and fiddle music, these early
printings marked a new patronage for the art of playing the Great Highland Bagpipe, as well the beginnings of the competition system. The first known book on Highland pipe music and piobaireachd was compiled by Joseph MacDonald, born in 1739. Though the volume was not published until 1803, it was said to have been written in 1760 during a journey to India, where MacDonald was heading to join the East India Company. The compilation details terminology and grace note fingerings, and contains excerpts of a number of period ceol mor pieces, as well as a drawing of a Highland piper playing a three-droned pipe and wearing Highland garb. The National Piping Centre has printer’s plates with pipe music engravings on them from the nineteenth century. Another early collection of tunes in full bagpipe notation was by the Skye bagpipe maker, soldier, and performer Donald MacDonald (1767-1840; no relation to Joseph MacDonald), who published A Collection of Ancient Martial Music of Caledonia Called Piobaireachd in 1819. The book’s preface includes a note from MacDonald, which states,

The object of this Publication is to supply a desideratum in our Pipe Music, which has hitherto had no written Record, but, at once to facilitate the attempts of students upon the Great Highland Bag-pipe, and to accommodate its Music to almost all other instruments, such as the Organ, Piano-forte, Violin, and Flute. In the progress of this undertaking, the Publisher has been encouraged by a Prize from the Highland Society of Scotland, as being the first who had succeeded in setting the piobaireachd to Music.

A lead alloy printing plate for page 98 of this book, engraved by Walker and Anderson of Edinburgh, is held in the National Museum of Scotland. The plate is engraved with the tune “Cumhadh Dubh Shomhairle: A Doleful Lament for the Death of Samuel, a Celebrated Piper” and is the first-ever printed record of pibroch in staff notation.
this period and may have even traveled the world with their owners; Roderick Cannon possesses a copy of *A Collection of Ancient Piobaireachd or Highland Pipe Music* belonging to piper John MacRa, who was stationed in India with the Royal Scots during the 1820s, and who took his pipes with him on his travels.\textsuperscript{282}

In another publication from the same period, MacDonald claims that the bagpipes are the only national instrument in Europe:

> Strangers may sneer at the pains taken to preserve this wild instrument, because their ears have only been accustomed to the gay measures of the violin and ‘lascivious pleasing of the lute’; but it has claims and recommendations that may silence even their prejudices. The Bag-pipe is, perhaps, the only national instrument in Europe. Every other is peculiar to many countries, but the Bag-pipe to Scotland alone.\textsuperscript{283} There in the banquet-hall and in the house of mourning it has alike prevailed. It has animated her warriors in battle, and welcomed them back after their toils, to the homes of their love, and the hills of their nativity. Its strains were the first sounded on the ears of infancy, and they are the last to be forgotten in the wanderings of age.\textsuperscript{284}

MacDonald’s statement that the bagpipes are “the only national instrument in Europe” represents one of the earliest published claims of a particular Scottish association with the instrument, and, as such, contributed to the public perception of Scottishness and the bagpipes’ role in constructing it. Further collections later in this century include contributions from William Gunn and David Glen, whose *Collection of Highland Bagpipe Music in 17 Parts* was published between 1876 and 1911.

Angus Mackay (1813-59) was probably the most notable bagpiper and tune compiler during the nineteenth century. His father, John Mackay, was an orphan herdboy sent for tutelage to the MacCrimmons and Mackays, the famous piping instructors in Gareloch.\textsuperscript{285} Angus won prizes for his piping at the Highland Society’s competitions and
was a noted composer of pipe music, publishing a collection of *piobaireachd* in 1838 as well as a volume of reels and strathspeys—light music for dancing. His 1838 book *A Collection of Ancient Piobaireachd or Highland Pipe Music* is sometimes called the “piper’s bible,” and, with 61 tunes, was the largest and most comprehensive of early printed collections. Each printed composition in Mackay’s collection included the traditional legend that went along with it, and, as shown in the subtitle of the piece below, spared none of the gory details of the tales. For the inscription to “Cumh Na Peahair: The Sister’s Lament,” Mackay writes, “Allister Machonnuil Ghlaish, a chief of the MacDonalds of Keppoch, was cruelly murdered in his own house with his brother a youth of 16 at the instigation of the next in succession. Their sister, frantic with grief, expired at their side, swallowing their blood. The air was composed on this melancholy event.”

![Figure 3.3: “Cumh Na Peahair: The Sister’s Lament”](image)
Mackay’s most famous contribution to piping, though, came in 1843, when he became the first personal Piper to the Sovereign. According to the official website of the British monarchy, Queen Victoria’s earliest documented exposure to bagpipe music was in 1842, when she and Prince Albert visited the Highlands for the first time. They stayed at Taymouth Castle with the Marquess of Breadalbane, who had his own personal piper. Queen Victoria was much taken with the idea, writing to her mother: “We have heard nothing but bagpipes since we have been in the beautiful Highlands and I have become so fond of it [sic] that I mean to have a Piper, who can if you like it, pipe every night at Frogmore.”

Thus Angus Mackay became the first official royal piper, serving as a representative shift from the historical clan patronage of pipers to an encouragement coming from the landed classes and the British monarchy. He performed regularly after breakfast, at balls and for other special occasions, sometimes playing classical ceol mor such as “Black Donald’s Pibroch,” but more frequently playing the reels, strathspeys, marches, and popular songs that comprise ceol beag.

Sadly, Mackay’s services ended in 1854 because of mental illness. As recorded in his doctor’s case notes, his most common delusion was that he was married to Queen Victoria and that Prince Albert had “defrauded him of his rights.” MacKay was replaced by Pipe Major William Ross (1823-1891) who had served in the 42nd Royal Highland Regiment, the Black Watch. Ross served as Queen Victoria’s piper from 1854 to 1891. Again, according to the British Monarchy website: “In a memorandum of 1854, the Piper's duties were clearly indicated and included taking his turn of duty with the footman in the garden in the morning, waiting at dinner if required and receiving visitors.
to dinner. In those days there was often more than one piper. When Queen Victoria died at Osborne on the Isle of Wight in January 1901, two personal pipers took part in the first stage of her funeral procession. All successive monarchs since Queen Victoria have retained the services of an official royal piper.  

In the mid-1850s, Queen Victoria’s enthusiasm for all things related to the Highlands provoked the War Office to decide that each Highland regiment (the 42nd, 71st, 72nd, 73rd, 74th, 78th, 79th, 92nd and 93rd) in the British Army would be allowed five pipers and a Pipe Major, all paid by the Army. Their use in the British Army, along with the dissemination of bagpipe tunes in published collections of the nineteenth century, allowed the bagpipes to flourish in British and British-influenced culture. From mid-century, their presence in the pipe band begins.

3.4 The Foundation and Standardization of Military Pipe Bands

The incorporation of drums into Scottish military ensembles, which occurred as early as the eighteenth century, strengthened the enduring associations of these instruments as symbols of military authority and power in many Western and non-Western traditions. Side drums were likely introduced into the British military pipe band in emulation of the fifteenth-century Swiss fife and drum bands; they incorporated Swiss beatings, sticking ideas (hand patterns), and rudimental practices into the retreat marches played by the pipers. British Army pipe bands, however, did not normally include the tenor or bass drums of today’s pipe bands.

Drums were an important means of communication in the British Army; by the mid-eighteenth century, all tactical functions and evolutions were regulated by means of a
well-understood and well-rehearsed system of rhythms and beatings. Snares were in general use by the beginning of the eighteenth century, during which the tone of the drum was raised to make a crisper sound. David Murray notes that drummers “usually enlisted as boys because the sticks…required supple wrists and strong arms, and because the number and complexity of the beatings and signals demanded instant recall and quick reaction.” Before they played with bagpipers, drummers were most commonly paired with fifers in the Highland militias, but by the early nineteenth century, they were certainly also playing with pipers. One early reference to pipers and drummers playing as a group is from a Regimental Order by the 93rd Highlanders in 1805, which states that drummers do not play when the Regiment marches in open columns, but the pipers may play.

Though recruitment of bagpipers and drummers by the British Army had begun more than a half century earlier, pipers and pipe bands were not officially recognized until the 1854 War Office order. The military pipe band then evolved through performances of regimental music, as corresponding numbers of drummers were added to the ensembles. Some of the earliest British Army pipe bands included the Black Watch and the Scots Guards, formed sometime during the 1850s or early 1860s, and the Pipes and Drums of the London Scottish, formed in 1860. The earliest military pipe bands in Canadian regiments included the Black Watch of Canada, 48th Highlanders (from Ottawa, Ontario), and the Argyll and Sutherland Highlanders (from Hamilton, Ontario), formed in 1871, 1891 and 1903 respectively.
During the Crimean War, the Second Boer War, and World Wars I and II, the pipes and drums of the British Army pipe bands were used to amass the army’s troops, to command a charge, or to enact a retreat. They also played during the morning roll call, assembly of troops, and the tattoo\(^2\) at bedtime.\(^0\) Specific tunes that the pipe bands played had particular meanings as well. In the Crimean and Boer Wars, for example, when “Highland Laddie” was played, it signaled to the troops to either line up during roll call, or to begin marching, but if the troops instead heard “Scotland the Brave,” it meant they could stay in their tents because of bad weather or other adverse circumstances.\(^1\)

The tempos of the ensemble’s tunes aligned with different styles of marching: quick step, at 108 paces per minute, was used when the troops formed a line and by small parties on good roads;\(^2\) the quickest step was 120 paces per minute and occurred during a direction change. (In most armies today, 120 paces per minute is considered a normal marching speed, and is the drill pace of the British Army, though Highland regiments typically march more slowly at 112 paces per minute.)\(^3\)

The Highlander and his bagpipes were a good subject for the camera lens during the Crimean War, one of the earliest wars photographed. In Figure 3.4 below is a photo of Pipe Major John Macdonald of the 72nd Highlanders from the Crimean War, taken
sometime between 1854 and 1856 by photographers Joseph Cundall and Robert Howlett.\textsuperscript{304} When film was invented in the 1890s, an early reel of silent footage documented the Gordon Highlanders preparing to leave Britain for the Second Boer War in 1899 or 1900. This reel clearly reveals several lines of more than twenty marching pipers and at least three snare drummers.\textsuperscript{305} The documentary \textit{Great Highland Pipe, Instrument of War, Part 3: When the Pipers Play} contains battle footage of the Gordon Highlanders from that same period. In this second short film clip, the soldiers, shown in a battle charge, are accompanied by a company of pipers and drummers.\textsuperscript{306} These films illustrate the degree to which martial traditions, the pipes, and the British empire were bound together. When a television interviewer asked George Ives, who in the mid-1990s at 111 years old was the last surviving veteran of the Second Boer War (1899-1902), what kept him going during battle, Ives recalled the emotions evoked by the pipe music, saying, “When I heard the sound of the pipes I felt as if I could go through anything.”\textsuperscript{307}

Similar feelings have been documented from other Scottish soldiers, proving that the bagpipes had a great effect on the morale of the Scottish regiments by expressing a commonality of “home” among them. During the Battle of the Somme in July 1916,
Harry Lunan, a piper in the Gordon Highlanders, was on the front line. According to Lunan, whenever the captain gave the order to advance, the pipers “blew up the pipes and the men followed them.” Armed only with his bagpipes, Lunan led the charge into enemy fire. Interviewed when he was 98 years old and the last surviving bagpiper from World War I, Lunan stated, “I just played whatever came into my head, but I was worried about tripping on the uneven ground, which interrupted my playing. The enemy fire was murderous, the men were falling all around me. I was lucky to survive. Hearing the pipes gave the troops courage.”

During World War I, bagpipers like Harry Lunan often marched up and down in the trenches, calling the troops to action. Even when gunfire overwhelmed the sound of his song, just the sight of the piper playing was symbolic and motivating. For this reason, pipers were targeted by the enemy. The most famous Scottish soldier in World War I was Daniel Laidlaw, who was awarded a Victoria Cross, Britain’s highest military honor, for continuing to pipe “Blue Bonnets Are Over the Border” after being targeted and wounded during the Battle of Loos in September 1915. The song is the regimental march of the Scottish Borderers, an infantry in the Scottish division of the British Army. Laidlaw felt compelled to play despite his injury in order to maintain the troops’ morale during the fighting. It was a risky endeavor: of the 200 bagpipers who played during that battle, 50 were killed.

The Scots regiments in the British Army held similar casualty proportions during World War I. Of the 557,000 Scots who enlisted in all services, 26.4 percent lost their lives, compared with an average death rate of 11.8 percent for the rest of the British Army.
between 1914 and 1918. This disproportionate number of Scotsmen killed in World War I, plus a centuries-old reputation for fighting on the front lines of the British Army, has led some Scots to question whether British Army commanders historically viewed the Scots as expendable. A pro-Scottish-independence op-ed piece in an April 2012 issue of the *Caledonian Mercury* stated opinions of this nature. Murray Pittock takes this idea a bit further; he believes there are connections between the British Army’s historical use of Scots in the front line, and the imperial subtext of the Primitivist movement. According to Pittock, whose quotation has similar implications to David McCrone’s statement about the British Army’s absorption of the icons of its enemies into its own identity: “The primitivist message of nostalgic Celticism had always had an imperial subtext: that the bravery of the ‘wild Highlander’, once undisciplined in its noble savagery, could now be formed and tamed into a formidable fighting machine in the cause of Empire. The controlled use of the Celt’s primitive ferocity in these conditions was a necessary part of his improvement and serviceability.”

Imperialist appropriation or not, the fierceness of the Highland fighters and their bagpipers earned the nickname “the ladies from Hell,” in reference to their kilts and determined battle demeanor. They well deserved this respect: overall, more than 2,500 pipers served, and more than half of those were killed or wounded. In fact, the image of the Scottish piper was so omnipresent during this time that two German war medals from this time depict Scottish bagpipers. One, from 1915, depicts a Scottish skeleton piper playing in front of troops. The second, made in 1916, shows a Scottish piper with a large, trailing pipe banner, which reads, in German: “English Bulletin: A German
Victory at Sea.” (The front of the coin depicts praise for the sinking of the R.M.S. Lusitania in 1915.)

Bagpipers during World War I had other functions besides leading battle charges. They played over the graves of fallen soldiers, reflecting a popular use of pipes since the time of the clans. Their service playing made the graveside lament “The Flowers of the Forest” the most-heard tune of the war, and this usage of the song resulted in a permanent connotation shift. Before the war, the song was listed as a “slow march” in many of the nineteenth-century bagpipe music collections such as David Glen’s Collection of Highland Bagpipe Music, Peter Henderson's Tutor for the Bagpipe and Collection of Sheet Music, and William Ross’s Ross’s Collection of Pipe Music, to name a few. Very shortly after the war, when Pipe Major A.R. MacLeod published his MacLeod’s Tutor for the Highland Bagpipe, he set the tempo for “Flowers of the Forest” as a “funeral march,” instead of as a “slow march.” This reflects the ubiquitous usage of the song in that manner during the war. Even today, army piping units such as the Calgary Highlanders list it as the standard lament played at remembrance services, funerals, and associated functions.

Massed pipe bands, conglomerated ensembles formed of the pipe bands of each of the Highland regiments, were used to celebrate festive events, as shown in the photo in Figure 3.5. On May 13, 1917, the fifteenth Division of the British Army’s horse show in Liencourt, France, included a massed pipe band celebration with 232 pipers and
The widespread use of piping in World War I led the army piping committee to publish *The Army Manual of Bagpipe Tunes and Drum Beatings*, a standardized selection of the better-known and more popular pipe tunes of the war and immediate post-war period, in 1934. Though most tunes were still taught by ear by the pipe major (who learned to read music at army piping class), with other pipers picking them up by rote and by watching his fingers, the piping committee wanted to create a reference volume so that pipe bands in tattoo\textsuperscript{323} could select the tunes and beatings in advance from the manual and all the pipers and drummers would learn the same version of the music.\textsuperscript{324} Another manual, *The Standard Settings of Pipe Music of the Seaforth Highlanders*, was published in 1936, after the players found the drum scores from 1934 too easy, prompting revision

Figure 3.5: Massed pipe bands, Fifteenth Division, British Army.
This second volume also included the duty tunes played by the regiment, which were also used by civilian bands as well as the armies.

Because the pipe bands in most British Army regiments were front-line combat units, women were—and still are—prohibited from being members in those bands (in many countries women do not serve in the "combat arms" such as the infantry, artillery, and cavalry). In the 1940s, there was a non-combat, all-female pipe band in the Canadian Women's Army Corps; called the CWAC Pipe Band, it consisted of 27 drummers and pipers who toured Canada and Europe, to “improve public perception of women in the military and encourage more women to join the forces.” It was deactivated in 1946 after the conclusion of World War II.

During World War II and other armed conflicts in the latter half of the twentieth century, bagpipers continued to be regarded as emblems of national spirit by Scottish troops. Today there are pipe bands in all of the Scottish regiments of the British Army, and many Canadian regiments. There are also pipe bands in certain battalions of the United States Army, the New Zealand Army, the Indian Army, and the Australian Army.

The popularity of regimental pipe bands like those in the British Army was instrumental in the emergence and formation of civilian pipe bands, which began in Scottish urban centers with the nineteenth-century incorporation of piping and drumming ensembles into police and fire brigade bands. These initial bands, primarily composed of current and former soldiers, were modeled on military bands, but in addition to the traditional parade and regimental music, the civilian pipers and corps of drums also played ceol beag for entertainment.
3.5 The Formation of Civilian Pipe Bands

According to the January 2010 issue of *Piping World* magazine, the oldest non-army pipe bands in Scotland are the Govan Burgh (shown in Figure 3.6)\(^{328}\) and Edinburgh City Police Pipe Bands, both formed in the 1880s, along with Colinton & Currie (established in 1887, and the earliest band without any police, fire department, or army connections); Wallacestone and District, formed in 1887; and Langholm, founded in 1889.\(^{329}\) The Stonehouse Pipe Band, another well-known ensemble, first performed in 1899, and Shotts and Dykehead Caledonia, one of the best-known bands today, formed in 1910.\(^{330}\) In Canada, the Sons of Scotland, established in 1896, appears to be the oldest civilian pipe band, followed by the Ingersoll Pipe Band, formed in 1910, and the Vancouver Police Band, inaugurated in 1914.\(^{331}\) Other significant early pipe bands include the Royal Caledonian Society Band in Australia (1894); the City of Dunedin band in New Zealand (1898); Accrington (1885) and Eastbourne Scottish (1898), both from England; St. Laurence O’Toole from Ireland (1910); and in the United States, the Caledonian Kiltie Band from Holyoke, Massachusetts (1910)\(^{332}\) and the Clan MacAlpine Pipe Band from Rockford, Illinois (1912).

![Figure 3.6: Govan Burgh Police Pipe Band, 1890s.](image)
Starting in the 1880s, the first informal pipe band competitions in Scotland—promoted by the Glasgow Rangers Football Club—were held. The Wallacestone and District Pipe Band's website refers to the ensemble being "regular winners at the Bathgate Horticultural Society contest" by 1903, implying the existence of both a contest and enough bands to compete in it by this time. Wallacestone also won the "British Championship held at Waverly Market in Edinburgh in 1905." The Cowal Highland Games in Dunoon, Scotland, however, is credited with being the oldest venue in which pipe band competitions have been continuously held. In 1897, the Cowal Committee introduced competitions for military pipe bands, and less than a decade later, added a competition for civilian bands.

Paralleling the importance of piping and drumming ensembles in the Boer War and World War I, the number of groups multiplied in the first decades of the twentieth century, even with the casualties of World War I and the Spanish flu. By 1930, there were so many bands that Pipe Major William Sloan of Glasgow’s MacLean Pipe Band, on his way home from the Cowal Gathering, suggested forming an association of pipe bands. Later that year, the Royal Scottish Pipe Band Association (RSPBA) was founded, with its aims and objectives being: “to promote and encourage the culture and advancement of Pipe Band Music internationally, and to sponsor a Pipe Band College; to create and maintain a bond of fellowship with all Pipe Band personnel throughout the world without discrimination as to colour, race, nationality, ethnic or national origins; to devise and operate a proper system of Pipe Band Contest Rules; and to organise the World,
Despite the RSPBA’s policy of non-discrimination, the power structures of early
civilian pipe bands were modeled on the historically male-dominated clan and army
traditions, and therefore women pipers and drummers were not allowed in most civilian
bands until the 1970s. During the mid-twentieth century, it seems that most civilian
women pipers played in all-female bands, such as those listed below:

- Vancouver Ladies Pipe Band (founded in Vancouver, British Columbia in 1927)
- Dagenham Girl Pipers (established in London in 1930)
- Rose Fletcher Pipe Band (formed in 1935 in Manchester, England)
- Inverness Ladies Pipe Band (formed in 1947 in Inverness, Scotland)
- McLean Ladies Pipe Band (formed in 1947 in Dundee, Scotland)
- Heather-Belle Ladies Pipe Band (founded in 1951 in Winnipeg, Manitoba)
- Burnaby Ladies Pipe Band (formed in 1967 in Burnaby, British Columbia)
- Deeside Ladies Pipe Band (founded in Deeside, Scotland; date unknown)

By the 1980s, however, most civilian bands seem to have been populated by both
men and women, the result of a gradual integration starting in the 1960s and 1970s.
Undoubtedly, further consideration of women in the pipe band community would yield
rich material, but, since my case studies in Chapter Five include two pipe bands that were
founded when gender integration was no longer an issue, I focus instead on the non-
gender-focused imagery of identities present in most pipe bands today.

The other aspects of the RSPBA’s mission statement were true from the outset:
within a decade RSPBA affiliates had founded the College of Piping in Glasgow,
published the first of several College Piping Tutor books, established Piping Times
magazine, and formulated standard contest regulations for the World Championships and
other competitions held throughout the world. Today, the RSPBA has over 400 member bands in the UK alone, with numerous other affiliated ensembles throughout the world. There are six branches of the RSPBA in the United Kingdom, two in Australia, seven in Canada, one each in Ireland, Germany, the Netherlands, New Zealand, South Africa, and Switzerland, and four in the United States (with geographic branches in the Midwestern, Southern, Western and Eastern United States). Here is a list of the current branches of the RSPBA:

**RSPBA**
- London & South of England Branch
- Lothian & Borders Branch
- North East England Branch
- North West England Branch
- Northern Ireland Branch
- North of Scotland Branch
- Glasgow West of Scotland
- Ayr, Dumfries, and Galloway Branch
- Dundee, Perth, and Angus

**Australia**
- Australian Pipe Band Association
- New South Wales Pipe Band Association
- Western Australia
- Northern Territory
- Queensland
- South Australia
- Victoria
- Tasmania

**Canada**
- Alberta Society of Pipers & Drummers
- Alliance of North American Pipe Band Associations
- Atlantic Canada Pipe Band Association
- Piper's And Pipe Band Society of Ontario
- Midwest Pipe Band Association
- Prairie Pipe Band Association of Manitoba
- Saskatchewan Pipe Band Association
British Columbia Piper's Association

**Ireland**
Irish Pipe Band Association

**Germany**
Bagpipe Association of Germany

**Netherlands**
Netherlands Pipe Band Association

**New Zealand**
Royal New Zealand Pipe Band Association

**Scandinavia**
The Pipe Band Association of Scandinavia

**South Africa**
Pipe Band Association of South Africa

**Switzerland**
Pipe Band Association of Switzerland
Scottish Pipe Band Association of South America

**United States**
Alliance of North American Pipe Band Associations
Eastern United States Pipe Band Association
Midwest Pipe Band Association
Western United States Pipe Band Association

In the United States, pipe bands are active in all fifty states, performing outdoors even in places as seemingly unlikely as Central Alaska. Every competing band in the United States must be a member of one of the Alliance of North American Pipe Band Associations’ branches, and must follow the rules established by the RSPBA. In Kentucky, for example, competing bands are required to be members of the Eastern United States Pipe Band Association, which itself has more than 150 registered bands. There are two competing pipe bands in the Commonwealth: the Louisville Pipe Band and
Kentucky United Pipes & Drums (KUPD). Certainly the number of existing pipe bands is even larger than this: non-competing bands are not required to register, and in Lexington alone, there are two non-competing and therefore unregistered bands: William Sutherland Reid Pipes & Drums, and General Michael Collins Memorial Pipe Band. It is also quite common for bands to form, then take a break, then re-form, then dissolve again, such as the Danville Pipe Band in central Kentucky.

3.6 Conclusion

Alan Merriam believed that a significant task of ethnomusicologists is to find out what music does for people, and how it does it.342 The bagpipes, a universal folk instrument present in Scotland since at least the fourteenth century, have played an important and symbolic role throughout Scotland’s history. Town pipers were used for communication, and bagpipers served a variety of functions—ceremonial, aesthetic, entertainment, and communicative—in the Highland clans. Bagpipers were so revered by clan leaders that chiefs paid for their pipers to learn from the MacCrimmon family of instructors. In clan warfare, bagpipers rallied men on the battlefield, and correspondingly, in the eighteenth century when Highland soldiers were recruited into the British Army, their pipers came with them. The Highland pipes, though restricted in Scotland from 1746 to 1782, were essentially appropriated by the British Army as a symbol of its authority and power, and became the most recognizable marching instrument in the Army’s ranks. Nostalgic tunes such as “Blue Bonnets are Over the Border” invigorated soldiers, provoking a physical response during combat, while such songs as “Highland Laddie” communicated specific troop actions. Finally, bagpipe laments laid slain
members of the regiments to rest, invoking emotional expression in grieving family and friends as they had in the Highlands during centuries of clan warfare.

As chronicled in eighteenth- and nineteenth-century literature, and as documented in the Scottish National Archives, Museum, and Piping Centre, bagpiping had an impact on society beyond the military, contributing to the preservation of elements of Highland culture and traditions in centuries to come. Printed music collections and piping manuals made the bagpipes more widely accessible and led to better-trained pipers, thus inspiring a proliferation of civilian piping and drumming ensembles in Scotland, greater Britain, and the lands of the diaspora. The Pipe Band World Championships, as well as Highland games and festivals, catalyzed the interaction of competition meetings among bands, which in turn inspired the formation of the Royal Scottish Pipe Band Association. The RSPBA now has branches throughout the world, and promotes and encourages the advancement of pipe band music, and bonds of fellowship, among hundreds of international piping and drumming ensembles. The member bands of the RSPBA function as largely civilian groups, in which performers and audiences find aesthetic enjoyment, connections to heritage, and the spirit of competition.

Chapter Four will illustrate how the modern pipe band’s performance rituals and material culture draw upon the military and civilian traditions of the ensemble’s past while shaping new senses of Scottish identity among participants and audiences.
CHAPTER FOUR: CONTEMPORARY PIPE BANDS: TRADITION AND
IDENTITY CREATION THROUGH INSTRUMENTATION, REPERTOIRE, AND
DRESS

4.1 Introduction

While paying homage to their roots in the traditional contexts of Highland clan
society and the British army, the civilian piping and drumming ensembles of today are
part of a living, evolving subculture. Subcultures are small groups that differentiate
themselves from the larger culture to which they belong, or, as Mark Slobin describes,
“small units within big music cultures.” Slobin points out that subcultures must
continuously re-evaluate themselves, as “over time, new perspectives cause a reordering
of group priorities, a changed understanding of what is authentic.”

In a similar way, the pipe bands of today simultaneously reflect tradition while
adapting to new contexts in a changing world. The musicians in modern Scottish pipe
bands have an important status as bearers and interpreters of Scottish cultural identity, as
purveyors of the accrued symbolism of pipe band music and practices, derived from
centuries of tradition as well as processes of change. Patterns of culture and identity
creation are evident in standard instrumentation (the make-up of the ensemble, but also
instrument construction and playing techniques of the bagpipes, side drum, tenor drum,
and bass drum), dress (kilts, Glengarry hats, sporrans, ghillie brogue shoes), and
repertoire (types of pieces as well as the symbolic associations of specific compositions).
Through an investigation of these areas, Chapter Four will illustrate how the performance
rituals and material culture of late twentieth and early twenty-first century North
American bands can create a shared sense of Scottish cultural identity through new mediations with an imagined Scottish past and modified “retellings” of the cultural narratives of the ensemble, in part through the forging of a strong group identity within pipe band subcultures.

4.2 Sections of the Ensemble

A typical Scottish pipe band of today consists of two sections: the pipes and the drums. Reflecting the ensemble’s military history and ranking designations, the contemporary civilian pipe band is led by a pipe major, often assisted by a pipe sergeant, who is second in command. The pipe major is considered the band’s primary authority in both musical and non-musical matters, and he directs the ensemble during rehearsals and performances. The military-style hierarchy continues within each section, with the drum section—consisting of at least two snare/side drummers, one tenor drummer, and one bass drummer—being led by a drum sergeant, who serves as a liaison (both verbally and musically) between the drummers and the pipers. Most pipe bands also appoint a drum major, who is responsible for marching in the front of the ensemble, executing basic drill movements, and giving commands during parades, massed band ceremonies, and other performances. The drum major also typically assists with deportment and dress, making sure the band members’ ties are straight, hats are uniformly tilted, and marching patterns are crisp. He can be a musician from the band, or even a non-musician, as long as he has a working knowledge of band repertoire and basic time signatures.

In a competition band, the pipe section is required to have at least four performers besides the pipe major, though it is more common to have between six and ten. (For a
balanced sound, the ratio of three pipers for each side drummer is considered ideal.) The bagpipers create the representative melodic and harmonic material in a pipe band, and they play their instruments by blowing air into the bag through a blowpipe fitted with a mouthpiece and a valve. The blowpipe on a set of Great Highland bagpipes is long, allowing the bag to be held under a performer’s left arm and making it possible for the piper to stand upright. (Blowpipes in other bagpiping traditions are often shorter, and “the bag may be held in front of the body, leading to a crouching position unlike the upright, military bearing of the Scots piper.”) The air moves from the blowpipe into the bag, which today is generally made of a synthetic material such as Gore-Tex (before the mid-1900s, the bag would have been made of sheepskin or cowhide). The air is then channeled through to the chanter, which produces a bright, sharp sound due to its conical bore and double reed. It has seven finger holes and one thumb hole, as well as an unstopped double vent-hole at the bottom.

Highland pipers tune to what is called “their A.” This "A" is not 440 Hz, as is common in many Western musical traditions, but has crept up to the point where in competition circles, it is often between 470 and 480 Hz. (This means the “A” is actually higher than a Bb, which is 466.16Hz). According to New Zealand Pipeband, pipers think of the scale of the chanter as consisting of the notes in the octave between low A and high A with an extra low G below low A. The notes are named low G, low A, B, C, D, E, F, high G, and high A. However, if one plays these notes on a piano, one will not hear a scale resembling the chanter scale, even if one transposes up to B♭. This is because the sizes of the steps between some notes are incorrect. The note we call 'C' is really closer to C#, and the note named 'F' is really closer to F#. Since traditional pipe music doesn't use non-sharp C and F, they don't bother to indicate the sharp signs, but the music could be written with a D key-signature (containing C# & F#) to avoid confusing non-pipers.
The resulting pitch series of A, B, C#, D, E, F#, G, and A is a major scale with a flat 7th degree, or an A mixolydian mode.

One of the distinctive characteristics of the Great Highland bagpipes is the continuous sound of the chanter, due to the unstopped airflow from the bag. Since the chanter is never silent, there are no real pauses between notes, and the instrument’s loudness, another signature element, cannot be varied. This uninterrupted chanter sound and volume signified militarism and dominance throughout history, and still makes a palpable impact on listeners in parades and Highland games today. Pipers work around the idiosyncrasies of continuous sound and unchangeable volume as much as possible by using grace notes and embellishments (called “birls,” “doublings,” “shakes,” “throws” and “grips”)\textsuperscript{348} to separate, articulate, and accentuate the melody notes. “Grace notes are essential to divide two successive melody notes of the same pitch, and are also commonly played on the downbeat notes of the melody to mark out the rhythm.”\textsuperscript{349} Examples of these embellishments are shown in Figure 4.1 in the excerpt of “Highland Laddie,” a traditional march that communicated roll call to British troops during the Crimean and Boer Wars, and which retained popularity (yet without the specificity in meaning) during the transition from military to civilian bands.

Figure 4.1: “Highland Laddie”
Generally all of the pipers in a band play the melody in unison, which, especially considering the embellishments, can be quite complex and difficult to execute. Because of the emphasis on unison playing as an aesthetic ideal, there is no extemporization of ornaments, as might be included in other traditions, such as fiddling: in piping, they are always written out, as has been common practice since the earliest printed pipe music collections. This may reflect the influence of the military and a corresponding sense of precision and order; it may also reflect the general musical principle that in a larger group where there are often eight or more performers playing the melody, collective improvisation is more difficult to include. Occasionally a bagpipe score will include two-part harmony in either thirds or fifths; playing this part is referred to as “playing seconds” (denoting that the performers are the second on a part, not that they are playing the interval of a second). In this case, two-thirds of the pipers will play the melody and one-third will play the harmony part.

Modern Highland pipes have evolved from their traditional two-drone ancestors, reflecting a heightened complexity of construction common in many instruments of the modern era. Today, they have three drones—two tenor drones and one bass drone—which produce a “series of chords which are heard to full effect only in the slower types of music like the slow airs and the opening theme and variations of the great music.” The two tenor drones are tuned an octave below the low A of the chanter, and the bass
drone, almost double the length of the tenor drones, is tuned two octaves below it. Inside each of the drones is a tubular reed, which is highly susceptible to moisture and to temperature, and can cause the pipes to go out of tune easily. When playing, the piper drapes and fans the drones over his left shoulder; they are held at equal distances by decorative pipe cords, ending in tassels (as shown in Figure 4.2).\textsuperscript{351}

There are many different manufacturers of Great Highland bagpipes, as well as a wide range of materials that construct them. To purchase a new set of pipes, musicians can expect to pay between $800 and $2000. Modern chanters are made of African blackwood, cocus, or—much different from past centuries—synthetic polypenco. When purchased separately, chanters are typically priced around $200, and for the uniformity of sound required in the competition arena, many pipe bands of today choose matching chanters. Established manufacturers of bagpipes and chanters include Dunbar, R.G. Hardie & Peter Henderson, Gibson, McCallum, Naill, Shepherd, and Warnock.\textsuperscript{352} Often pipe bands will provide their members with chanters: for example, the Knoxville Pipes and Drums provides McCallum or Gibson chanters for all entering pipers, but the band expects the pipers to purchase their own set of Great Highland Bagpipes, a black bag cover, and white drone tassels.\textsuperscript{353}
The percussion section of a pipe band consists of two sub-sections: the snares, also known as side drums, and the midsection. Pipe bands must have at least two snare drummers and one bass drummer to be permitted to compete; more commonly there are between three and ten snare drummers, while a full midsection consists of one to four tenor drummers and one bass drummer.

The “Scottish snare drum” is a marching instrument, and as such, it is normally worn on a metal carrier that goes over the shoulders, as opposed to being set up in the concert style on a stand. Today’s drumheads, which were originally made of animal skin, are made of a synthetic fabric called Kevlar and are tuned by a set of sixteen lugs around the head. The tuning is extremely tight, producing a very high-pitched sound. The drumheads are 14 inches in diameter and the drum shell is usually 12 inches deep, as opposed to a concert snare drum, which is between 5 and 6.5 inches in depth. Premier Drum Company is the most popular manufacturer of pipe band drums, though Pearl Corporation in the United States produces a fair number of pipe band drums as well. Pricing for a Scottish snare drum usually runs between $500 and $1000. One significant difference between Scottish snare drums and other snare drums is that Scottish drums have an extra set of snares under the top head in addition to the first set of snares under the bottom head; this extra set of snares produces a crisper sound that blends well with the sound of the pipes.

Figure 4.3: Scottish snare drum.
Historically the drums in Scottish pipe bands have been tilted slightly down to the right; this angle made it easier to walk without the drummers bumping both knees on the bottom of the instrument. To adapt to the tilted drum, the left hand of Scottish side drummers is typically held sideways, as if holding a glass of water, instead of having the palm face down as it would in concert-style drumming or mallet playing. The back of the stick is slid under the thumb and the middle rests on the ring finger. This manner of holding the drumstick is similar to American traditional grip, except the thumb in Scottish drumming is placed on top of the stick as the gripping point, while the other fingers fall to the side. Drummers in Scottish drumming joke that they have an “opposable left thumb” since the thumb exerts primary control over the stick. To make the stroke, the wrist moves straight up and down, though the arm comes into play in slow passages or for visual effects, and the fingers are used for additional thumb support in faster, more intricate passages. There is some regional variation in hand position, however. Tom Foote, a snare drummer who has played with a number of Canadian Grade One pipe bands, and who now teaches at St. Andrews University in Laurinburg, North Carolina, offers details about diverse practices:

Some of the books that I have talk a little bit about technique. For a while, it was a little bit more of a drum and bugle technique. The one that we’re using now with lots of finger control on the right hand and with the thumb over the top of the left stick has been in use at least for the last two generations anyway. Technique was taught from individual to individual. It wasn’t like there was a book about specifically how to hold the stick. If you look at Field Marshal Montgomery [pipe band from Northern Ireland] half of them play right hand traditional and left hand matched [instead of left hand traditional and right hand matched]. Personally I’m
always looking for ways to change my hands so I don’t mess them up by playing on this thing.357

Present-day Scottish snare drum sticks are slightly different from American concert sticks as well. They are more tapered to give greater weight to the back of the stick, and are lighter than traditional concert sticks even though they are thicker and have a bigger bead at the tip. Performers in drum sections in a pipe band usually purchase their sticks in one large batch so they can ensure that all of the sticks are adequately matched for weight and pitch.

The parts that the drummers play in Scottish pipe bands are unique for several reasons. Because the music has a distinctly swung “triplet feel,” many combinations of dotted-eighth and sixteenth notes are swung instead of being played straight, and all written music must be adapted to fit into a triplet pulse. This discrepancy between notated and performed rhythms sometimes causes misunderstandings when players are interpreting music, particularly if the drummers come from a concert percussion background and do not understand yet how to execute a triplet lilt that is not expressly notated in the sheet music.

Pipe band snare music is also distinctive because stickings (hand patterns) are notated with the left hand written below the one-line musical staff and the right hand written above it. According to Alan Chatto,

the late Drum Major John Seton, of the Glasgow Police and the 93rd Highlanders pipe bands, must be credited with introducing and then establishing pipe band drum notation in Scotland…in 1924, John Seton combined with Pipe Major Willie Gray to publish the ‘Collection of Highland Bagpipe Music and Drum Settings…’ In the Seton Tutor the Snare Drum score notation is shown in the "C" space of the
Treble Clef, with stems turned up wards. The Bass Drum part is shown in the "A" space with the stems turned down.\textsuperscript{358}

This method of above-and-below-the-line drum notation allowed students and professionals alike to judge more quickly whether the left or right stick was supposed to play each note during a passage. The foreword of \textit{The Scottish Pipe Band Association Tutor and Text Book} states: “Many young drummers will find the method of writing drum scores above and below the line a most helpful guide in overcoming elementary technical misunderstandings regarding hand movements. This is purely an expedient with no pitch reference.”\textsuperscript{359} Though it took me personally a little time to adjust to the above-and-below-the-line notation, I now find it as easy to read as conventional snare drum notation—plus, it saves performers the time of writing in stickings for difficult passages, because they are already shown.

Side drummers in pipe bands play standard snare drum rudiments—basic combinations of rhythmic patterns and stickings that pop up in all genres of drum scores—but they are re-formatted to fit the cadence of Scottish pipe band music. According to \textit{The Scottish Pipe Band Association Tutor and Text Book}, “the flam, drag and ruff should enhance the percussion accompaniment in a similar manner to the gracings on the pipes and should on no account detract from or interrupt the smooth rhythmic flow or progress.”\textsuperscript{360} Drum scores are often composed by the lead drum sergeant, who manipulates the rudiments so they complement the pipe scores. Tom Foote comments,

Most people have taken the traditional rudiment groupings and Scottish-ized them. Rudimental play is rudimental play whether you’re doing it as a rock drummer or DCI player. For me I’ll go over the standard rudiments and show how
they relate into the Scottish style. Obviously the dead stick drag rudiment is unique and you can apply it to any flam rudiment from the 40 standard ones.

Some of the standard rudiments, as well as the unique swing feeling and above-and-below-the-line sticking patterns present in pipe band drum scores, can be seen in the “March Clan MacRae Society Pipe Band” score excerpt in Figure 4.4. In this example, all ruffs or drags (first shown in measure 4, second sixteenth note of beat two, and next shown in measure 5, last sixteenth note) are played as dead stick drags, as Tom Foote describes above. The “quick five” is another rudiment that emphasizes the lilting cadence of Scottish music. Shown in measure 24 on the second sixteenth note of beat two, it is five-stroke roll played in a quick triplet rhythm. Notated triplet patterns can be seen in some measures of the composition (measures 1, 5, 10, 14, etc.), but there are also certain measures that are notated as straight sixteenth note and thirty-second note patterns but are intended to be played with an overarching triplet rhythm (measures 7, 15, and 19, to name a few).

Figure 4.4: “Clan MacRae Society Pipe Band”
By the mid-1950s, Alex Duthart (1925-1986) of the Shotts and Dykehead Caledonia Pipe Band was considered the foremost innovator in pipe band snare drumming. A respected teacher and performer, Duthart envisioned a style of side drumming with greater rhythmic complexity, rather than strictly following the melody line of the pipes as before.\textsuperscript{363}

Besides the snares, the midsection of the drum corps typically consists of a group of tenor drummers and a bass drummer, as noted above. The bass drummer in a pipe band is responsible for keeping the pulse of the band—he is always placed in the center of the circle during competition so that everyone can hear him and watch his sticks. His drum is the largest and deepest-pitched instrument in the band and the performer usually plays fairly non-syncopated parts that are built on a basic beat of quarter notes or eighth notes. To add depth and dynamics to the melody, the bass drummer will vary the strengths of the beats, using, for example, a strong-weak-medium-weak pattern in 4/4 time. The bass drum is usually tuned to a Bb, one octave below the bass drone of the bagpipes.

The pipe band bass drum is played with fluffy mallets (see Figure 4.5), which are similar to those used on the tenor drum. Since the drum is double-headed, the bass drummer plays with one mallet placed on either side of the drum (one mallet for the head on the right, one mallet for the head on the left). Prominent bass drummers in the twentieth century have included Mike Cole (the Windsor

![Figure 4.5: Bass drum.](image)
Police Pipe Band from Windsor, Ontario) and Duncan Gibson (Clan MacFarlane Pipe Band of St. Catharine’s, Ontario).

The tenor drum appeared in military bands in the early nineteenth century and was added to pipe bands around the turn of the twentieth century. The music played by tenor drummers supplies accents and dynamic interest to pipe band scores, but rhythmically it is relatively simple in contrast to the patterns played by snare drummers. Its simplicity allows the tenor drummers to flourish their sticks in addition to striking their drumheads—they are the only visual showmen in a pipe band. As Tyler Fry writes, “‘Flourishing’ is the twirling of sticks designed to bring together the melodic motion of the melody and the rhythmic feel of the snare drum.” The arm movement and flourishing patterns played by tenor drummers reflect the time signature and dynamic markings in the pipe and drum scores. If the ensemble is playing at a fortissimo level, for example, the tenor drummers will flourish above their heads. If the band is playing quietly, or tapering the end of a phrase, then the tenor players will flourish close to their drumheads. Tenor drummers often play and swing in unison or in sequential flows, looking at times almost like conductors as they move their arms in the time signature of the music. Careful thought is given as to which drums are to play at which times, as the drums are also tuned to complement the pipes: usually in an inverted Bb major chord, since the A of the pipes sounds almost at a Bb. Some ensembles use as many as five or six tenor drummers, who make available an array of individual pitches.

Tenor drummers play with matched grip, meaning that they hold their mallets with both palms facing the floor instead of the traditional grip (with the left hand turned
sideways) favored by snare drummers. Tenor mallet shafts are much shorter and thinner than those on snare sticks. They have fluffy ends that are traditionally made of lamb’s wool. To twirl the sticks, tenor drummers tie on the flourish cords, which are fastened to the end of the mallet shafts, and weave them around their fingers, starting from the fifth finger. All flourishing is done from the standpoint that there is an imaginary line coming down the center of the body, and every movement must be symmetrical on both sides of the center line. The photo in Figure 4.6 below shows one of Kentucky United’s tenor drummers, Becca Johnson, in mid-flourish.³⁶⁶

Before the latter part of the twentieth century, tenor drummers were primarily “swinging tenors,” who would rarely strike the drums. Today, however, the drummers strike the heads more frequently in between flourishing patterns, representing a distinct change in style and function. Tyler Fry, a tenor drummer from Shotts and Dykehead who has made an enterprise of TyFry sticks, apparel, and drum accessories and teaches...
workshops all over the world, is helping to revolutionize the flourishing patterns traditionally done by tenor drummers and is also making their drum beating patterns much more rhythmically challenging as well. Tom Foote believes that, with the help of musicians like Tyler Fry, “tenor drumming is the only part of pipe band drumming that continues to change...in the last ten years it’s gone from only visual stuff to sound as well.”

He adds, “In band competitions the ensemble judges listen [to the sound of the drums and the rhythms] but don’t judge at all on flourishing—the only requirement is they [the players] have to flourish! There are a lot of people like myself that would like the requirements to be more rounded. Watch the different tenor corps for the different personas—each corps has its own unique character. I really think there’s going to be a push for bands to be a little freer.”

Like the “different personas” that Tom Foote believes distinguish each tenor corps from the next, the tuning, number of participants, pipe and drum scores, and repertoire choice help to differentiate one pipe band from one another, even considering the groups’ overarching similarities as part of the pipe band subculture. These elements factor into the ensemble’s identity; pride in a band’s collective sound helps solidify the sense of belonging that results from each individual in the group recognizing his or her part in creating a musical unity, and in being part of something bigger than him or herself.

4.3 Pipe Band Repertoire

Senses of cultural and group identity are fostered in piping and drumming circles all over the world, transmitted and symbolized by the music the ensembles play. Their repertoire is not merely reflective of personal preference; it is, as John Blacking notes, an
expression of “cognitive, physical and social processes” that molds the shared values and experiences of a culture. In alignment with this view, Claudia Helena Azevedo Alvarenga depicts repertoire and “musical production” as conduits of cultural expression in “Social Hegemonic Representations of ‘Being Brazilian’ in the Popular Repertoire:”

In this perspective, repertoire…is a musical channel of expression, by combining sounds (rhythm, melody, timbre, harmony) and textual language; and by exposing beliefs, influences and conflicts around which the groups meet and mobilize. Musical productions concentrate group cultural expression, in which artists synthesize the ethos of the group.

The repertoire of the pipe band, performed for competitions, parades, and concerts, serves as a symbolic core of the group, and, with its unique characteristics and rich history, affirms a sense of Scottishness for those (especially those of Scottish ancestry) who play in the ensemble.

The traditional repertoire of the bagpipes falls into three categories. These are Ceol Mor, or the “Great Music,” which includes salutes, gathering tunes, laments, incitements to battle, and theme and variations sets; Ceol Meadhonach, or the “Middle Music,” which encompasses slow airs and song airs, and Ceol Beag, or the “Little Music,” which consists of marches and dances such as reels, strathspeys, jigs, and hornpipes. The music played by full pipe bands is generally selected from the latter two categories.

Ceol Mor, or pibroch, is the most structured form of bagpipe music. Pibroch means “piping” or “what the piper does” from the root words piob “pipe” and piobaire “piper.” It refers to a repertory of extended and complex tunes, dating mainly to the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries—which commemorate clan gatherings and battles,
salute clan chieftains, and lament the deaths of leading men. *Pibroch* is nearly always played by solo pipers, since it was traditionally performed in this way; for this reason (and because the tempo variations and phrasing interpretations would be difficult to synchronize in a large ensemble), it is not common repertoire for the full pipe band. However, because of its historical relevance to the formation of Scottish identity, and the fact that *pibroch* is a central part of performances and competitions for solo pipers today, a discussion of Scottish music and identity cannot be complete without at least a brief investigation of *pibroch*.

*Pibroch* was developed in the fifteenth century by the MacCrimmons at Dunvegan castle and reflects to a great degree the patterns of Gaelic speech. According to George Emmerson, “*Pibroch* or *piobaireachd* in Gaelic is an instrumental art form tracing its lineage to early Celtic harp tradition;” it is also related to a later movement of *ceol mor* played on the fiddle.³⁷² Piping experts estimate that there are upwards of 300 different *pibroch* tunes extant today.³⁷³ *Pibroch* is performed in theme and variations consisting of a theme called the *urlar* (which means “ground” or “floor”), which has eight phrases with four stressings in each phrase.³⁷⁴ After being played once, the *urlar* is then followed by a series of variations that typically get more difficult and embellished as the piece goes on. *Pibroch* performances conclude with a restatement of the *urlar*. The sheet music in Figure 4.7 below shows the *urlar*, then the first two variations, and finally, in Figure 4.8, the doublings for the *pibroch* “MacCrimmon Will Never Return,” excerpted from a 1975 reprint of General C.S. Thomason's *Ceol Mor* book, originally published in 1896.
Pibroch was historically taught through canntaireachd, a system in which the teacher sings the tune using a series of vocables, consisting of combinations of vowels that represent the melody notes, and consonant combinations representing the grace notes and embellishments. According to George Emmerson,

> Other than the bagpipes, the human voice is the only other musical medium that is capable of accurately conveying the nuances of a piobaireachd tune—its emotion and shading—with the requisite power and subtlety. For this reason, the canntaireachd tradition continues to be handed down from teacher to piper, to this very day. Around the middle of the eighteenth century, canntaireachd lost its rigid standardization; nowadays, each individual teacher or school is likely to employ their own method, system, and collection of vocables.³⁷⁵

Figure 4.7: Urlar and first two variations for “MacCrimmon Will Never Return.”

Figure 4.8: Doublings for “MacCrimmon Will Never Return.”
*Pibroch* is performed by solo pipers for formal events and at competitions, but, as mentioned earlier, is very seldom played by full pipe bands (though top bands will occasionally perform *pibroch* as a way to show off precise unison interpretation). Most of the *pibrochs* performed today are extant works from several centuries ago; very few new *pibrochs* are still being composed. Considering the number of bagpipers around the world today, it is probably correct to state that the laments, salutes, and gathering tunes that comprise the *ceol mor* repertoire are performed even more commonly today, than they were during the periods in which they were written.

Rather than *pibroch*, most of the music played by pipe bands in the twenty-first century is either *Ceol Meadhonach* or *Ceol Beag*: song airs or traditional “small music” such as marches, folk tunes, and dances. Ross DeAeth, a piper with Kentucky United, claims, “Well tuned and well played light music (not Piobreached [sic]!) seems to be the overriding criteria with just about every successful performance.”\(^\text{376}\) Competitions for light music were introduced at Highland games in the 1820s, and thereafter, pipers started to compose and arrange light music that used more intricate gracing and more complicated melodies.\(^\text{377}\) The disciplined army tradition, “in conjunction with increasing constraints imposed on pipers in piping competitions[,] further shaped a strict performance practice of an already formal style, making the music more standardised, also supported by the writing of pipe music in staff notation.”\(^\text{378}\) Therefore, unlike *pibroch* repertoire, which—at least in written form—has remained largely unchanged over the past few centuries, light music has experienced a good deal of evolution, mostly in the difficulty of the music being composed and arranged. New works are constantly
being written, not only by musicians residing in Scotland, but by pipers and drummers who perform in pipe bands all over the world. Because these tunes are commonly quite short (typically two parts, in an AABB form with each part repeated), oftentimes pipe bands play light music in sets. Like pibroch, there is almost no improvisation in light music performance, and certainly never in competition (full band or solo).

Marches are the most common type of Ceol Beag played by pipe bands. Tied both to the martial traditions of the clan bagpipers, and later, to the pipe and drum ensembles that led Scottish regiments, marches are typically 32 bars long, and as such, are often played in “march sets” of two, three, or four marches, or in “MSRs,” which are three-piece groupings of a march, strathspey, and reel. According to Roderick Cannon, “marching is of course the raison d’être of the band, and the simpler 2/4 and 6/8 quickstep [marches] may well have been played in bands from the earliest days of organised playing.” The time signatures 3/4 and 4/4 are also common in pipe band marches, with 3/4 marches traditionally being designated “retreat marches” designed to be played when calling back the troops. Despite the British Army’s marching tempo typically being around 116 beats per minute (bpm), civilian pipe bands usually play marches at approximately 80 bpm.

Unity in repertoire is evident, particularly in march selection, among the pipe bands I studied. I conducted a web-based sampling of 17 bands, including the Knoxville Pipes and Drums and Kentucky United Pipes and Drums, six other bands from the Southeast (Florida, North Carolina, South Carolina, Tennessee, Georgia), five bands from the Midwest (two Chicago bands, Twin Cities, St. Louis), one Canadian band (Ontario),
one Norwegian band (Bergen) and two Australian bands (Perth and Victoria). In terms of repertoire, the lists of tunes on many of the bands’ websites are very similar to the competition medleys, parade sets, and concert pieces that KUPD and KPD perform. The Chicago Celtic Pipe Band, for example, specifies nine tunes on its repertoire list that KUPD also plays, including “Green Hills of Tyrol,” “The Minstrel Boy,” “The Rowan Tree,” and “Wings.” The Clan Farquharson Pipe Band also plays “Green Hills” and “Rowan Tree,” and shares additional selections with KUPD such as “The Battle of Waterloo” and “Flett from Flotta.” The Utah Pipe Band shares even more favorites with KUPD: “Minstrel Boy,” “We’re No ‘Awa Tae Bide ‘Awa,” “Bells of Dunblane,” “Highland Cathedral,” and “When the Battle’s O’er.” (Every single repertoire list that I consulted also designated “Scotland the Brave” in the band’s catalog of music.) Below are the results, listing the most popular marches of each type among these ensembles:

**Slow marches**
“Scots Wha’ Hae,” or “Bruce’s Address to the Troops at Bannockburn” (2 bands)
“Bells of Dunblane” (4 bands)
“Mist Covered Mountains” (3 bands)

**2/4 Marches**
“The Brown Haired Maiden” (11 bands),
“The High Road to Gairloch” (11 bands),
“Highland Laddie” (7 bands)
“Teribus” (5 bands)

**6/8 marches**
“Bonnie Dundee” (12 bands),
“The Steam Boat” (8 bands),
“The Atholl Highlanders” (6 bands), and
“A Hundred Pipers” (4 bands)

**3/4 marches**
“Green Hills of Tyrol” (13 bands)
“When the Battle’s O’er” (13 bands)
“Barren Rocks of Aden” (7 bands)
“Balmoral Highlanders” (6 bands)

4/4 marches
“Scotland the Brave” (17 bands)
“Rowan Tree” (13 bands)
“Wings” (12 bands)
“Murdo’s Wedding” (9 bands)

Besides marches, pipe bands also play hornpipes, the dance from the British Isles that is commonly thought to have originated with British sailors. George S. Emmerson calls the hornpipe “kind of a limping gait of a rhythm under the time signature of 3/2 or later 6/4,” but common-time hornpipes are also prevalent. Indeed, in traditional Scottish country dance, the hornpipe is typically in a slow 4/4 meter, and is danced in partner-based figures. In competitive Highland solo dance, common at Highland games, the hornpipe is performed as a soft-shoe style with many leaping and silent foot-tapping embellishments (unlike in Irish dance, in which the hornpipe is typically done in hardshoes and the embellishments from the dancer are audibly rhythmic). Pipe bands often include hornpipes in medley sets, in combination with a reel. Common hornpipes include “The Red Fox,” “Mason’s Apron,” “The Black Bear,” and the well-known “The Sailor’s Hornpipe.”

The jig is another type of piece included in pipe band medley sets. The jig is not regarded as a characteristic Scottish dance rhythm, though many jigs are certainly Scottish in origin and one dance form is commonly described as "Scottish-jig" in eighteenth-century music publications. Scottish pipe bands often play jigs when performing for “Celtic” or Irish events, such as St. Patrick’s Day, when many pipe bands
use their “Irish repertoire.” For example, the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums marches in the Lexington St. Patrick’s Day parade and plays at Irish pubs in Lexington and Richmond, Kentucky; in these performances, the band’s “Irish set” includes Scottish jigs such as “Rockin’ the Baby” and Irish jigs such as “The Irish Washerwoman,” along with nostalgic non-jig tunes associated with “Irishness,” such as “The Rakes of Mallow,” “Londonderry Air,” and “Danny Boy.”

Certainly the performance of Irish repertoire by the Scottish pipe band, such as the “Irish set” played by KUPD, showcases a crossover repertoire between the pipe band, “Celtic rock” bands, and traditional Irish ensembles, and therefore ties into the pan-Celtic identity noted in Chapter One. This enveloping pan-Celtic identity has been shaped by what Mark Slobin terms as a “superculture,” or “the overarching culture everyone shares in multi group societies.”385 In other words, American popular culture has created an overarching perception of Celtic identity that has absorbed many individual subcultures, including that of the Scottish pipe band. When KUPD performs its “Irish set” on Great Highland bagpipes, the pipe band subculture is interacting with the superculture: the pipers and drummers are appropriating, and perpetuating, the sense of pan-Celtic identity promoted by American popular culture.

Whether Scottish or Irish in origin, all jigs are in compound duple, triple, or quadruple meter. Most often, jigs are played in 6/8 time. The pitches in double jigs are played on all six of the eighth notes, while single jigs have more occurrences of quarter note-eighth note skipping rhythms. There are also slip jigs, which are in 9/8 time, and slides, which are fast 12/8 jigs. Examples of popular pipe band jigs, as revealed through
web research and through notes taken at Highland games, include “Atholl Highlanders,”
“Barbara’s Jig,” “Rockin’ the Baby,” “Tripping Up the Stairs,” and “The Jiggernaut.”

Besides the march, the strathspey is probably the most traditionally Scottish of the
tune types associated with a pipe band. Named for the *strath* or valley of the Highlands’
Spey River, the strathspey started as a folk dance commonly done in both the Highlands
of Scotland and is now the name of both the set dance and the style of music.\(^{386}\) Also
referred to as the “Scottish measure,” a strathspey is a common-time dance tune with
emphasis on the first three beats of the bar; the fourth beat typically functions as a pickup
to the next measure.\(^{387}\)

Strathspeys have a distinctive lilt due to the large number of dotted rhythms in the
structure of the music. In fact, one of the uniquely Scottish musical characteristics present
in the repertoire of the pipe band stems from the strathspey. Known as the “Scottish
snap,” it is an accented short note followed by a longer note, or a “dot-cut” rhythm. Many
scholars believe that both the Scottish snap and the grace note embellishments found in
pipe music are the product of Gaelic vocal inflections, giving the style a distinctive
Scottish character and identity.\(^{388}\) A good example of the Scottish snap can be found in
Figure 4.9 in “The Balmoral Highlanders;” in measures one, three, five, nine, eleven, and
thirteen, the Scottish snap appears in the thirty-second note/dotted-sixteenth rhythm on
the third sixteenth note of beat one. It also appears in bars seven and fifteen on the thirty-
second note/dotted-sixteenth rhythm on the first sixteenth note of the measure.
The strathspey was actually made famous by fiddlers rather than bagpipers; the tune type came to prominence through the work of mid-eighteenth-century fiddlers Niel and Nathaniel Gow, Robert Mackintosh, William Marshall, and Captain Simon Fraser of Knockie. The contributions of late-nineteenth-century fiddler and dancer James Scott Skinner, known as the king of the strathspey, are also celebrated. William C. Honeyman, another noted Scottish fiddler, published his *Strathspey, Reel, and Hornpipe Tutor* in 1898, and states that only bagpipes and fiddle are suited to play strathspeys, as “strathspeys and reels played on the pianoforte are ridiculous” and “a flute only slobbers them.” Despite the fact that fiddlers helped to popularize strathspeys, because they were originally written for Scottish bagpipes and then adapted, they contain many unidiomatic passages (such as consecutive fifths) for the fiddle.

Among the most popular strathspeys played by contemporary pipe bands are “King George IV,” “Molly Connell,” “Captain Colin Campbell,” “Cambeltown Kiltie Ball,” and “Mac an Irish.” Typically strathspeys are only 16 bars long, in AABB form, being

![Figure 4.9: Scottish snap, “Balmoral Highlanders.”](image_url)
constructed of two eight-bar sections without repeats, and for this reason, they are often played as part an MSR set.

Strathspeys have long been referred to as “strathspey reels” because they were often played in combination with a reel; the two tune types have a similar tempo and can be used for the same dances. (In fact, the first anthology to include the strathspey in the title was *Thirty-Seven New Reels and Strathspeys* by Daniel Dow [1732-83].) According to the *Scottish Fiddle Music Index*, which contains a compilation of 11,000 tunes from 1700 through the late twentieth century, collected in twelve British libraries, strathspeys and reels can be played one after the other with no sense of incongruity. In the late nineteenth century, this arrangement of tunes was popular enough that groups of fiddlers formed strathspey and reel societies throughout Scotland; one hundred years later; these societies had also spread throughout the lands of the Scottish diaspora.

The reel, though likely Scottish in origin, is equally widespread in Scottish and Irish traditional music. The word “reel” likely derives from either the Anglo-Saxon “rull,” which means “whirl,” or the Norse Gaelic “ruidhle,” which means “dance.” Reels are quick quadruple or duple meter dances that, according to Scott Skinner, should be played “crisp and birly like a weel-gaun wheelie” (briskly, like a well-oiled wheel). Reels in Ireland are often played with a swinging rhythm, but in Scotland they are usually played more evenly, with emphasis on beats one and three. Famous Scottish reels include “Lexy McAskill,” “The Kilt is My Delight,” “The Drunken Piper,” “The High Road to Linton,” and the “Reel of Tulloch,” shown in Figure 4.10.
As with other light music pieces, reels tend to be played in sets due to the short length of each of the tunes (commonly eight, sixteen, or, at the longest, thirty-two measures) in the group. It can be difficult for beginning pipers or drummers to tell the difference between these types of tunes, and there are some interesting tutorials on the web that provide instruction on these genres, such as this exchange from “The Session,” an online community dedicated to traditional Irish music. In response to the post “How to tell the difference between reels, jigs, and hornpipes [sic],” on February 8, 2008, instructional comments included these four below.

From poster Mrs. Lonal Dunny:

“try fittin these phrases into the tunes your [sic] playing
reel--> Black'n'decker
double jig--> rashers and sausages/wrigleys chewing gum
slip jig-->have no more rashers and sausages
hornpipe-->try saying the "mary had a little lamb" rhyme...it should have quite a bouncy jumpy feel...the way our teacher taught the other people in the class was to see if it made you want to swing your arms..if it does then its a hornpipe...if it doesnt feel right then its a reel!
hope that helps. :)”
From commenter sbhikes:

“Seems to me that hornpipes have a lot of triplets and arpeggios in them.”

From commenter Will Evans:

“Its the 'feel' I might suggest Hornpipes are a mix between a 4/4 and a 12/8 rhythm...... Swung with a strong emphasis on 1 DAAH dum da didaly dum da. .......”

And from poster Pirate-Fiddler:

“It's the time signature that makes the difference
Reels 4/4
Jigs 6/8
Slip Jigs 9/8
Hornpipes 4/4 but played slower than reels”

When considering the representative pibroch, cool meadhonach, marches, hornpipes, jigs, strathspeys and reels played by pipers and pipe bands, it is important not to overlook the fact that there are several pieces which, in the late twentieth and early twenty-first centuries, are so strongly associated with the pipe band that they have transcended the subculture and are recognized even by many people in the superculture. These include “Scotland the Brave” and “Amazing Grace.”

4.4 Significant and Symbolic Songs in the Pipe Band Repertoire

In the repertoire analysis I conducted, there were two works that were included on the repertoire list of every single group: “Scotland the Brave” and “Amazing Grace.” “Scotland the Brave” is not particularly old, though the tune dates back to at least the 1890s: it is included in Keith Norman MacDonald’s The Gesto Collection of Highland Music, published in 1895, under the title “Scotland For Ever.” Approximately thirty years later, the tune was being played under the title “Scotland the Brave” by solo pipers,
if not also by pipe bands: the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland possesses a digitized 1927 recording of Pipe Major James Robertson’s solo performance of the work.\textsuperscript{401} The lyrics to the song were not written until 1951, when Cliff Hanley penned them for a Christmas musical review;\textsuperscript{402} the text includes lines such as “Hear, hear the pipes are calling/Loudly and proudly down through the glen/Here where the hills are sleeping/Now feel the blood a leaping/High as the spirits of the old Highland men.” This new text conjured up romantic images of the Highlands in the minds of its listeners, and allowed them to create an “imaginative cultural narrative,” as described by Simon Frith.\textsuperscript{403} Considering the nostalgic impact created by the linking of the familiar nineteenth-century tune with Hanley’s nostalgically powerful words, it is not surprising that during the latter half of the twentieth century, “Scotland the Brave” became popular enough among the Scots people to be adopted as an unofficial national anthem.

In the pipe band subculture, “Scotland the Brave” is a 4/4 march that is often performed in march sets, both parade and competition, and is nearly always included as one of the tunes played during massed band ceremonies at Highland games. Of the twenty or so Highland games I have attended throughout the Southeast, I do not recall any that did not request “Scotland the Brave” during the massed band ceremonies at either the beginning or the ending of the games. Gene Smarte, a piper in the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums, has also found that it is a favorite of Kentucky audiences: “Familiar tunes such as ‘Scotland the Brave’ seem to work well [in performance] because the audiences can sing/hum along.”\textsuperscript{404} Shown in Figure 4.11, “Scotland the Brave” features piping’s typical grace notes and embellishments on every quarter note pulse. This
version of the tune comes from the Eastern United States Pipe Band Association’s website, which posts standard pipe settings of the most common pieces played by massed bands at Highland games.

![Image of Scotland The Brave](image)

Figure 4.11: “Scotland the Brave.”

In great contrast to the rousing, heroic “Scotland the Brave” is another well-known tune played by pipe bands: “Amazing Grace.” As previously discussed, the bagpipes and pipe band have long been known for performing at funerals and other remembrance occasions; in the notes to *The Lady of the Lake*, first published in 1810, Sir Walter Scott mentions that in the Highlands, the “wild expression of lamentation poured forth by the mourners over the body of a departed friend,” has “for some years past been superseded at funerals by the use of the bagpipe.”

Many *pibroch* laments could be cited as examples of the bagpipes’ mournful use, as could *ceol meadhonach* compositions such as “Flowers of the Forest;” today, however, “Amazing Grace” has superseded all *pibrochs* and *cool meadhonach* pieces in this arena.
It is ironic that, as one of the two most famous pieces associated with the Great Highland bagpipes and pipe band today (the other being “Scotland the Brave,” of course), “Amazing Grace” is not Scottish. The lyrics were written as a hymn in 1772 by English preacher and slave trader (and later abolitionist) John Newton. In the mid-1830s, the lyrics for Newton’s hymn were merged with the melody from “New Britain,” and included in William Walker’s *The Southern Harmony and Musical Companion* (1835). This was the one of the first tune books to become widely popular in the Deep South and one of the first shape-note books to be sold nationally. Following its publication, “Amazing Grace” became a standard hymn in the United States, and many Americans of all races grew up singing it in church.

Considering its popularity today, one might assume that “Amazing Grace” has a long history in the pipe band repertoire. Yet it is not included in the more than 7,000 pipe settings from 37 pre-1950 bagpipe tutors and music collections compiled by CeolSean.net, a comprehensive collaboration between piping scholar Steve Scaife, McGillvray Piping Partnerships, Dr. William Donaldson, the Carnegie Trust, the National Library of Scotland, and the Open University in Scotland. Clearly then, “Amazing Grace” was not popularized in pipe band repertoire until after 1950; how, then, did “Amazing Grace” go from a tune that was not associated with the bagpipes to an omnipresent one, in such a short time?

According to Steven Turner, author of *Amazing Grace: The Story of America’s Most Beloved Song*, the growth in recordings of “Amazing Grace” began with Judy Collins’s 1970 version of the tune, which reached #5 on the United Kingdom charts and
#15 on the American charts. The following year, the Royal Scots Dragoon Guards released an album entitled *Farewell to the Greys*. Included on that album was an arrangement of “Amazing Grace” by Pipe Major James Pryde, MBE. Pryde, who had been a member of Shotts and Dykehead Caledonia Pipes and Drums when they won the World Pipe Band Championships for the first time in 1948, was the Pipe Major of the Royal Scots Greys in the 1970s, and was inspired by Collins’s recording. Pryde, who died in 2009, discussed his contributions to this album in an excerpt from the post “Memories of an Army Piper” on the website of the Pryde of East Lothian grade 4 pipe band:

…one of my pipers asked me to listen to a song being sung on the radio. It was Amazing Grace, and we agreed it would be a tune suitable to play on the Pipes, so we wrote it down there and then in pipe music…in no time at all, it became a favourite with the men in the Regiment…We made our last record “Farewell to the Greys” with “Amazing Grace” on it, and as one of the pipers who brought the tune to my attention was taking over from me, as Pipe major of the new regiment, I let him play the solo part, and I played a solo on the reverse side, ‘Going Home’ from Dvorak’s New World Symphony. I was a civilian when it entered the charts, and I was delighted with its’ [sic] success. They sold a million copies of the record. Both the regiment and War Office made an awful lot of money out of it I received a cheque from the Regiment for £100. The rest Gentlemen is history!!

This RCA recording ended up charting higher than Collins’s version of the song: it went to #11 in America and #1 in the UK, and the album on which the tune featured – *Farewell to the Greys*—sold over 6 million copies. The Royal Scots Dragoon Guards’ recording features “Amazing Grace” played once by a solo piper, and on the downbeat of the last measure of the first playing of the melody, the other pipers strike in their drones.
and the brass band enters. The full ensemble plays the melody twice through, and then the solo piper plays through the melody one more time before the recording concludes. According to the newspaper *The Scotsman*, “Pryde’s version was dramatic and inspired and maximised the strong emotional undercurrent of the music.” Indeed, reading the YouTube comments for this recording, which features a streaming performance from the original 45, one can see that it created a powerful impression on many people. Comments posted below this video on YouTube include, “This was the U.K.’s biggest selling single of 1972.” “This is the best version sounding fine on vinyl scratches and all, just how I remember it.” “I remember when this single came out in 1972. It was in the american top 40 for a long time! I was a child then and it gave me goose bumps every time it came on our radio station. Thank you.” Thereafter, this recording stuck in the minds of the public, and “Amazing Grace” is now one of the most-recognized tunes played by pipe bands today. Even though it is not a Scottish song, many people associate “Amazing Grace” with the most popular recording of the tune, made by the Great Highland bagpipers of a Scottish regiment. As such, the tune has been appropriated by pipers and pipe bands since the 1970s, and it has become inextricably connected to the Highland bagpipe for the pipe band audience in many parts of the world. This is an example of the piping subculture first making an impression within the American superculture, and then the perceptions of the American superculture in turn re-shaping the subculture, with constant requests for the tune in pipe band performances at funerals, concerts, and during Highland games (it would be hard to imagine a Highland games not including it in the imaginative cultural narrative of Scottish identity). Barb Willard, a bagpiper with the
Kentucky United Pipes and Drums, comments, “I have to say that Amazing Grace always brings tears to my eyes. Hearing that tune performed by 300 pipers in mass bands on a huge open field, just sends shivers down my spine.”

4.5 Dress

The enactment of performance rituals in the pipe band, including those discussed in sections 4.3 and 4.4, relies on elements of material culture. As a prominent means by which individuals identify with their ethnicity, physical objects associated with a culture are the "embodiment of the culture concept, its extensive historical lineage, and the evocation of human behavior and belief." A flag, an emblem or a uniform can symbolize a certain organization or group, thereby also symbolizing its ideology and values. One of these material culture elements is dress, which can act as an identity emblem for or of a group; individuals wearing similar folk costumes identify with one another as being members of the same group. Highland folk costume—along with food, instruments, flags and other items of heritage tourism—can be viewed as such a symbol used to identify oneself as Scottish or Scottish-American. Combined with the sound of the pipe band, an iconic representation of Scottish culture, the pipers’ and drummers’ habiliment conveys a powerful image that is appropriated by the public. A representation of Scottish identity, and the vestiges of its military associations, emerges from the visual and aural imagery that is taking place. According to Kentucky United piper Keith Goins, “There is just something about the entire show, from our Scottish dress, to the sound of the pipes and the precision of the drum line, it’s just all so impressive. You really feel a
part of something much bigger than yourself, like you could just stand up and march right off to battle or something.”

In performances (parades, competitions, concerts, and so forth), the members of pipe bands clothe themselves in full Highland dress, adapted from many of the features of dress worn starting in the Highlands for centuries. The outfit consists of a kilt, kilt belt, pressed dress shirt (short sleeved or long sleeved, depending on the season), a matching coat or vest, a band tie, a Glengarry or Balmoral hat, ghillie brogue shoes, kilt flashes, and kilt hose. They wear a sporran, or pouch, on a chain in front of their kilt; this functions essentially like pockets or like a purse. Many performers also wear ornamental badges on their hats, or kilt pins at the bottom of their kilts, that display a family crest or band symbol. They also often wear a **sgain dubh** dagger tucked in their kilt hose.

Though most of the elements involved in a modern pipe band uniform have authentic associations with the Highlands, the manner in which many of them are worn has shifted over the years, especially regarding traditional gender roles; this is evident in the iconography of pipe bands. The kilt, for example, was historically solely a masculine garment, and still is not worn by women today, except by those in pipe bands and athletics competitions. The sporran, a pouch strapped around the waist of Highland men for centuries, was used for two purposes: to carry things, and to protect the groin area of its wearer. Today, women in pipe bands wear sporrans, and, like the men in the band, use their sporrans essentially as purses: to carry car keys, cell phones, money, and other necessary items. The **sgain dubh** dagger was used to men to kill small game, cut meat, and, if necessary, fight an adversary; as such, it was not traditionally associated with
women. Women in pipe bands today, though, tuck *sgain dubhs* into their right socks to match their male counterparts. It could perhaps be said that by wearing and employing these masculine garments, the women in pipe bands are partially acting out male roles; at the very least, their appropriation of these items shows gender recontextualization.

Though many of the members in a North American pipe band are of Scottish descent, they do not wear the tartans of their own clans or septs while playing with the pipe band; their kilt is made of whichever tartan the band has selected as its official tartan. This represents a shift in tradition, as originally tartans were aligned with geographic locations and later were associated predominantly with familial clan-based designations. In most circumstances, the band chooses a specific tartan to wear based on patronage of a clan society, or a consensus vote on the colors in the sett of a tartan. Many groups wear clan tartans, such as the Erin Street Pipe Band, whose members sport the Black Stewart tartan,\(^{420}\) and the Schenectady Pipe Band, which cites its kilt pattern as the Clan Maclean ancient tartan.\(^{421}\) The Knoxville Pipes and Drums wears the Clan Mackenzie ancient tartan because another band was selling its kilts at a discounted rate, though of course for KPD to choose a particular kilt because it was affordable illustrates the extent to which tartans have become disassociated with place, tribe, or family ties. Other bands wear state tartans, such as the St. Andrews Pipe Band of Vermont,\(^{422}\) and the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums, whose members wear the Kentucky tartan, created to symbolize the state for the Glasgow (KY) Highland Games in 2001 (see Figure 4.14, in which the Kentucky tartan is shown adorned with the author’s “Clan Fleming” kilt pin).
Still others wear national tartans, such as the Harp and Thistle Pipe Band, whose members wear the Irish national tartan.\textsuperscript{423}

Figure 4.12: Kentucky tartan and Clan Fleming kilt pin.

In another reminder of the pipe band’s military roots, the formal dress leader in modern civilian piping and drumming ensembles is called the quartermaster; he or she is responsible for the inventory of all band-owned equipment and uniforms. The Knoxville Pipes and Drums’ by-laws state that the quartermaster “shall be in charge of the disbursement of all property of the Band and shall keep items not actively in use by the membership in his/her possession; shall maintain, repair, replace and procure all items or property in conjunction with the treasurer upon approval by the board; and shall maintain a written inventory of all property, including the purchase price or value of each class of items.”\textsuperscript{424}
4.6 Conclusion

Social scientist and globalization specialist Arjun Appadurai states, “all group sentiments that involve a strong sense of group identity, of we-ness, draw on those attachments that bind small, intimate collectivities, usually those based on kinship or its extensions.” In the case of the Scottish pipe band, shared attachments within individuals in a group, and shared practices among bands, have been creating binding senses of identity for many years. In the pipe band’s repertoire, for example, the types of pieces that are the most associated with “Scottishness” are marches, strathspeys, and reels, for to the musical, cultural, and historical reasons mentioned throughout section 4.3. Yet identities can shift, and even the pieces in this celebrated repertoire have changed in implication and meaning over the years (“Highland Laddie,” for example). In some cases, elements of tradition and identity have drastically changed or newly emerged, reflecting changes in either the subculture itself, or the overarching super culture (as seen with the appropriation of “Amazing Grace,” as well as the performance of “Irish sets”).

Aspects that promote the immediate experience of collective identity in the pipe band range from dress (tartan patterns, kilts, Glengarry hats, sporran pouches, ghillie brogue shoes, the sgain dubh dagger) to nostalgic tunes (“Scotland the Brave,”“Flowers of the Forest”) to instruments and performance practice (the Great Highland bagpipes, the lilting reels and jigs, the Scottish snap). Chapter Five will provide a closer examination of these details, revealed through case studies of the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums and the Knoxville Pipes and Drums.
CHAPTER FIVE: ETHNOGRAPHIC CASE STUDIES OF THE KENTUCKY UNITED PIPES AND DRUMS AND THE KNOXVILLE PIPES AND DRUMS

5.1 Introduction

Consideration of the ways in which present-day Scottish pipe bands retain and reinterpret past traditions and practices within new contexts can be deepened by looking at these ensembles “in action” and “from within,” so to speak. Although part of a worldwide pipe band subculture governed by the RSPBA, individual pipe bands function as small communities or worlds with their own traditions, uniforms, and emblems. In this chapter, case studies of two bands, the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums and the Knoxville Pipes and Drums, will offer close-up views of these particular groups as “bearers and interpreters of Scottish identity,” but will also clarify the ways that shared attachments and shared practices among piping and drumming ensembles help to create binding senses of group identity.

The Kentucky United Pipes and Drums and the Knoxville Pipes and Drums are recreational bands. They have essentially dropped the military and service functions of the past, but they have held onto, altered, and enlarged upon some of the recreational functions of early bands. As such, I present details on how they exist for purposes of entertainment, communal activity, and competition, along with the discussions of Scottish identity. Based on research that I conducted as a member of both bands—i.e., as a participant-observer—from 2007 to 2012, as well as in 2014 and 2015, this chapter will illuminate the continuation as well as adaptation of tradition and identity markers through a study of the development, pedagogy, and performance activities of these ensembles. It
delves into the structure and membership of the two groups (with comparisons to other contemporary pipe bands) and investigates their mission statements, operating procedures, leadership structure, recruitment practices, and rehearsal and performance schedules. Drawing upon my interviews with 25 KUPD and KPD band members, as well as surveys of their piping and drumming experiences and background, this study also profiles the musical and ancestral background of individual members and questions why they joined a pipe band, what they like about being in the band, how they interact with one another, and whether their participation connects to a sense of Scottishness. In examining these aspects, and drawing connections with other groups investigated during this period of study, I contend that KUPD and KPD are typical piping and drumming groups, representative not only of ensembles from Kentucky and Tennessee, but of present-day pipe bands in North America.

My first thought of joining a pipe band came in 2006: while I was working on a DMA in percussion performance at the University of Kentucky (UK) in Lexington, Kentucky, I noticed several Kentucky United Pipes and Drums posters in UK’s Fine Arts Building. The posters advertised an upcoming open house for the band, held at Central Christian Church, around six blocks from the Fine Arts Building. As far as I remember, I did not attend the open house with the intention of joining the group; I primarily wanted to watch the concert portion of the evening, having enjoyed pipe band music since I was a toddler. Yet after I heard the band play several tunes, and after Rick Clayburn, KUPD’s lead tip, spent fifteen minutes showing me the unique drum scores and the Scottish
rudiments in them, I was hooked. I promptly joined the ensemble, was outfitted with a kilt, and played my first competition within six months.

From the spring of 2007 until the spring of 2012, I attended rehearsals, parades, concerts, and Highland games as a participant observer in the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums. All rehearsals, and many of the parade and concert performances, were in Lexington, Kentucky, but participation in Highland games included trips to Glasgow, Kentucky (the Glasgow Highland Games); Carrollton, Kentucky (Kentucky Scottish Weekend); Eminence, Kentucky (the Central Kentucky Celtic Festival and Highland Games); Gatlinburg, Tennessee (the Gatlinburg Scottish Festival and Highland Games); and Atlanta, Georgia (the Stone Mountain Highland Games). After moving to Knoxville, Tennessee, I joined the Knoxvillle Pipes and Drums (I had met several of their members through other musical activities, and the band was actively recruiting me). Similar to my first experiences with KUPD, I was immediately “kilted,” and I played my first competition within several months. As a participant observer in the Knoxville band, I have attended weekly rehearsals in Maryville, Tennessee, performed in several concerts in Knoxville, and competed in Highland games in Maryville, Tennessee (the Smoky Mountain Highland Games); Greenville, South Carolina (the Greenville Highland Games); and Laurinburg, South Carolina (the Scotland County Highland Games).

5.2 History and Operational Overview of the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums and the Knoxville Pipes and Drums

The Kentucky United Pipes and Drums (KUPD) of Lexington, Kentucky, was founded in 2003. It was established by the fractioning of the William Sutherland Reid
Pipes and Drums, described by a former member as a “very relaxed easy going pleasure band [that] at present does not compete in competitions but participate[s] in all the parades and several gigs through the year.” It is common for pipe bands to split into factions, and sometimes even to dissolve, when members’ musical needs are not being met, or when individuals in the ensemble are not getting along. In this case, a half-dozen pipers and drummers in the William Sutherland Reid Pipes and Drums were frustrated with the ensemble’s lack of competitive drive—the group was primarily a parade band that did not rehearse often. Wanting another outlet in which they would be more musically challenged, several performers—including Barry Miller, Rick Clayburn, Will Young, Tom Hall, Ross DeAeth, and Keith Goins—decided to form a new band. Thus, the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums was established and incorporated.

Since its inception in 2003, KUPD has held non-profit status as a 501(c)(3) organization. As such, its stated mission is “to further the Celtic arts and traditions by demonstrations in public performances and specifically, to teach Highland Bagpiping and Scottish style pipe band drumming and to furnish appropriate equipment and clothing for such teaching and performances.” This mission is fairly typical of other pipe bands I have encountered over the years. The Cincinnati Caledonian Pipes and Drums, for example, describes its mission as an effort “to preserve and promote appreciation of Scottish heritage through Highland Piping and Drumming.” The Flint Scottish Pipe Band’s mission, similarly, is to “introduce the tradition of the Highland Band to communities through performance in parades, competitions and special events.”
Kentucky United’s bylaws state that the active members of the group (those who are up-to-date in paying their band dues) will hold yearly elections to determine the following officers: president, vice president, secretary, treasurer, pipe major, pipe sergeant, and drum sergeant. Upon the group’s founding in 2003, Barry Miller was recruited to be the first KUPD president; the other officers included tenor drummer Vicky Goodloe as vice president, Will Young as pipe major, Ross DeAeth as pipe sergeant, Rick Clayburn as drum sergeant and treasurer, and Connie Clayburn, Rick’s wife, as secretary. Many of these officers retained their positions for a number of years after the band’s founding (the bylaws do not state any limits on terms), especially Rick Clayburn, who has remained the band’s treasurer since its inception. In recent years, Tom Hall has replaced Barry Miller as president, Maria Roberts has taken over as pipe major, Keith Goins has succeeded Ross DeAeth as pipe sergeant, Barbara Willard took Connie Clayburn’s place as the band’s secretary, and Gene Smarte became the quartermaster and vice president. For a time, KUPD had a drum major, Lance Dahl, who also played bass drum in the group, but he has taken a leave of absence and now that position remains unfilled. Kentucky United’s website is maintained by Angela Young, Will Young’s wife; she is also a tenor drummer in the ensemble.

One hundred seventy miles south of Lexington, the Knoxville Pipes and Drums (KPD) had already been in existence for twelve years at the time that Kentucky United was incorporated. Under the direction of Tom Gordon, who would later become the Knoxville band's first pipe major, KPD evolved from the regular meetings of three pipers starting in 1991. By 1993, the group had attracted a large enough roster of pipers and
drummers to form a full pipe band. At first, KPD operated under the parent agency of the Knoxville Scottish Society, which was established in 1986, and through which many of the musicians in the KPD first became associated with one another; KPD did not achieve separate 501(c)(3) non-profit status until 2007. The stated mission of Knoxville Pipes and Drums closely corresponds to that of Kentucky United: “to foster and promote Scottish bagpiping and drumming, and the related Celtic arts, within our community.”

Similar to the administrative structure of KUPD, the Knoxville Pipes and Drums’ seven elected officers also constitute its board of directors: a president, treasurer, secretary, pipe major, drum sergeant, quartermaster, and business manager. These officers and board members are elected at the Annual General Meeting (known as the AGM) in November for a term of one year. Unlike other nonprofit boards, there is no requirement that the board meet periodically, since most matters are voted on during band practice or via email. (The board has final say on band business, but the entire membership has voting rights.) Since the band's founding under Pipe Major Tom Gordon, pipe majors have included the late Bob Pennington, Don Cain, and Andrew Payzant. KPD is currently under the direction of Pipe Major Tracy Wilson, whose term began in January of 2015; other officers include board president Beth Morgan, treasurer Warren Mays, drum sergeant Ashley Holt, quartermaster Kurt Taylor, secretary Angela Wilson, and band manager John Rose. The website is maintained by piper Vince Ayub.

Both KUPD and KPD are nonprofit organizations, and financial matters for the two ensembles are fairly standard for nonprofits. Both bands accept donations, have sponsors (often local companies that employ one or more of the band members), and earn
money by playing in parades and concerts. At Highland games, they receive travel reimbursements for performances during opening and closing ceremonies, and they can win prize money for placing in the top three groups during the games’ pipe band competitions. Since both ensembles are strictly voluntary organizations, individual band members do not receive payment for performing; when KUPD or KPD receives compensation for a show, all of the money earned goes into the ensembles’ respective coffers. KPD does not charge membership dues of its pipers and drummers, but KUPD has membership dues of $25 per year, though with a typical membership of only 20-30 people, these dues do not raise a large amount of money.

Band funds for the two ensembles are often spent for similar purposes. These include providing members partial reimbursements for travel; paying for elements of Highland dress such as kilts, jackets, or vests; partially subsidizing instrument purchases or repairs; paying for food at Highland games; commissioning composers and/or arrangers to write music for the ensemble; and providing workshop-style specialized instruction from visiting piping and drumming experts.

5.3 Characteristics of KUPD and KPD Members

By and large, the membership rosters for KUPD and KPD, as well as other competition pipe bands that I have researched in the Southeast and Ohio Valley, contain between 25 and 40 members. Cincinnati Caledonian has about 25 members, the Louisville Pipe Band has approximately 40 members, the Jamestown Pipes and Drums of Virginia has 26 members, the John Mohr Mackintosh Pipe Band of Atlanta has 24 members, the MacGillivray Pipe Band of Thunder Bay, Ontario, one of the oldest pipe
bands with continuous service in North America, has 29 playing members. In my investigation of the pipe bands in Kentucky and Tennessee, I have made a rough estimation of the number of individuals who are or have been practicing members of Scottish pipe band in this area. KUPD currently totals around 30 members and the non-competing William Sutherland Reid band in Lexington has around 15 members. Verbal accounts of KUPD members and online sources such as the Eastern United States Pipe Band Association website suggest that there are currently no other piping and drumming organizations in the state besides these two groups and the Louisville Pipe Band (formed in the mid-1970s). Therefore, it seems that the total number of active pipe band performers in Kentucky bands is between 80 and 100, an exceedingly small percentage of Kentucky’s population, which was calculated as 4,339,349 residents in the 2010 census.

Tennessee contains a larger number of pipe bands than Kentucky does. It counts among its ensembles the City of Chattanooga Pipe Band, the Knoxville Pipes and Drums, the Nashville Pipes and Drums, the Tennessee Scots Pipe Band (from Nashville), the seventeenth Lancers Pipe Band (also from Nashville), and the Wolf River Pipe Band, hailing from Germantown, near Memphis. Based on appearances of these bands in Highland games as well as information on their websites, each band has approximately 30 members, making a total of 180 or so pipe band performers in Tennessee. Though this number is larger than the total participants in Kentucky ensembles, compared to Tennessee’s total population of 6,346,275 in 2010, it is still a negligible percentage of the total number of residents of the state.
At Highland games that I attended in Tennessee, Georgia, South Carolina, and Kentucky during the research period, most pipe bands had between 25% and 33% female participants. The female to male ratio is typically approximately the same in KUPD: during my time in the band, the group had five female drummers and three female pipers, which amounted to a male to female ratio of about 3:1; compared to Lexington’s 2010 census percentage of 50.9% women, this number is low. In the Knoxville Pipes and Drums, three snare drummers out of five are female, and all four tenor drummers are women, as is the bass drummer. Of the pipers, five of the 14 are women. The band, as a whole, has 11 female members out of the 23 competing members, or 47.5%; comparatively, the city of Knoxville was 52% female in the 2010 census. The only other band I recall seeing in my years of competition and traveling with such a high percentage of female members was the Louisville Pipe Band.

The presence of women in these pipe bands represents a continuation, but deviation from, the twentieth-century phenomena of creating separate all-women pipe bands (1940s to 1960s) or adding women to the formerly all-male ensemble (momentarily during World War II, but increasingly from the 1980s). Female participation is one of the distinguishing features of a modern recreational pipe band, for military pipe bands did not permit women into their ensembles throughout several centuries. The British Army pipe bands, as mentioned in Chapter Three, did not allow women—and still do not allow women—to participate because the groups were and are designated as combat units. Most civilian bands, likely because of the Army tradition,
were also all-male until the 1970s, the decade during which the ensembles began to integrate.

None of the female pipers or drummers whom I interviewed were playing in pipe bands before the 1980s, when ensembles began to consist of players of both genders. Because this mixed gender practice gradually has become standard in recreational bands, none of the KUPD or KPD female members mentioned the historical “male dominance” of the ensemble in interviews or conversations. However, the fact that present-day civilian bands typically contain between one-third and one-half female members is of course a significant change from the military and masculine-imbued heritage of the pipe band. This shift reflects the dynamics of acculturation: a process of cultural change has taken place within the pipe band subculture as it moves from its military past into the civilian realm, and as it reflects elements of change in the superculture, such as gender equality. Though the present-day British Army pipe bands are still all-male, it is possible, since the United States Army removed the ban on women serving in combat roles in 2013, that the British Army will follow suit. In that case, military bands such as the Pipes and Drums of the Royal Scots Borderers will likely also include female performers in its future ranks.

The members in the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums have an average age in their mid-40s, which is typical of the other pipe bands encountered during the period of research. As in many other civilian bands, this average is drawn from a wide range of ages: KUPD includes preteens all the way up to octogenarians. Danny Roberts, whose mother Maria is the pipe major of Kentucky United, drums with the band in parades and
he is seven years old. (The youngest competition drummers I have seen appeared to be around 10 or 11). On the upper end of the age spectrum, KUPD has a piper who is over 80, and several in their seventies, though one of the septuagenarians does not play with the band often. Three members of KUPD are in their sixties, making the percentage of KUPD members over 65 approximately 15%, compared to Lexington’s 11.3% census percentage. Six other KUPD members are in their fifties, three are in their thirties, two are in their forties, two are in their teens, and two are in their twenties. The Knoxville Pipe Band’s age spread is comparable to KUPD’s: in KPD, there are two members over the age of seventy, two in their sixties, seven in their fifties, four in their forties, three in their thirties, two in their twenties, and five in their teens.

There are a good number of people who have been with the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums since its inception in 2003, but there has also been a large number of recent additions in the last two years. The average length of participation in the group is around five years, as revealed in members’ survey responses. Many of the performers in KUPD have also played with other pipe bands at one time or another—most commonly the William Sutherland Reid Pipe Band of Lexington (the ensemble from which KUPD was formed), the Louisville Pipe Band, the Cincinnati Caledonian Pipes and Drums, and the Mad Anthony Wayne Pipe Band (also from Cincinnati). A few band members, such as bagpipers Gene Smarte, Kevin Hale, and Bruce Downie, have played in piping and drumming ensembles as far away as California and Nova Scotia. Have these brought other practices to KPD and KUPD?
Since the Knoxville Pipes and Drums has been active for longer than KUPD, the average length of membership of its pipers and drummers is significantly higher than that of the players in KUPD. In KPD, there are at least four members who have been in the group for more than 20 years, including Kay Irwin and Chris Riedl. For most of the performers I spoke to, the Knoxville Pipes and Drums is their first pipe band, though a few members, including Beth Morgan and Chris Riedl, had played with pipe bands in other states (Morgan in Pennsylvania and Virginia, and Riedl in Connecticut) prior to their joining KPD. Andrew Payzant, Knoxville’s pipe major until 2015, grew up outside of Halifax, Nova Scotia, so he learned to play there. Interestingly, no one that I interviewed had played in other bands in Tennessee—perhaps because Knoxville is further from other nearby major cities (two and a half hours from Nashville and the same from Atlanta) than Lexington is (one hour from Louisville, one and a half hours from Cincinnati).

Because KUPD and KPD are voluntary organizations, there must be intensive recruiting and training programs to keep the ensembles going. Both groups recruit members through public performances, via their websites and Facebook page, and through the word-of-mouth advertising of family and friends. As previously mentioned, I joined KUPD because of a poster advertising an open house, and after I joined the snare line, I recruited a friend of mine, Becca Johnson, to join the tenor section. Anne Zielske, a firefighter in Georgetown, Kentucky, joined KUPD because she knew KUPD’s pipe major, Maria Roberts, from firefighting circles.
Family ties are strong in many pipe bands, including KUPD and KPD, perhaps indicating the impact of the patrilineal tradition of personal pipers for Highland clan chiefs and later for the British landed aristocracy. However, in modern piping and drumming ensembles, the ties are not only between fathers and children, but also between spouses, siblings, and mothers and children; this reflects the recreational status of present-day pipe band activities, in comparison with the military purposes of bands of the past. Attending pipe band rehearsals and performances gives family members a chance to spend time together and to create a shared sense of identity by participating in the same activity, enhancing their preexisting family bond. There is one married couple in KUPD, Will and Angela Young, and one married couple in KPD, Tracy and Angela Wilson. KUPD has one father-son pair: Rick Clayburn recruited his son, Jesse Short, to start pipes as a teenager. KUPD also has one mother-son pair: Maria Roberts’s son Danny, the seven-year-old who is drumming with KUPD in parades, started attending KUPD rehearsals as a toddler. In the Knoxville Pipes and Drums, there are two sets of teenage sisters, and one of the band’s tenor drummers, Haley Mays, joined after watching her brother play snare drum in the ensemble for years. Haley’s father, Warren, is also involved with KPD as the band’s drum major. He states, “My son started playing snare for KP&D. The band needed a decent Drum Major and I was asked to try it. I accepted as it gave my son and I [sic] a shared activity.”

Connections to family and friends underscore one reason many members enjoy being in a pipe band: the feeling of being part of a community. KUPD bass drummer Lance Dahl said his favorite part of the band was the friendships he made with the other
musicians. KPD members Beth Morgan and Chris Riedl both said they valued above all
the camaraderie and friendship of others in the band. Barbara Willard voiced a deep
appreciation of being in KUPD:

the band members, their friendship, and encouragement. Their belief that
everyone can contribute and help make our band the best it can be! The simple joy
of our successes and learning to accept disappointment and come away with even
a more positive attitude.\textsuperscript{439}

Keith Goins had a similar response, but added that his love of competition was important
to him:

I enjoy the family atmosphere and how we always seem to pull together to play
the gig. I would like us to be more competitive but with the hectic lifestyles of all
the members that does not seem to be a reality at this time. But, it's still fun to
compete and I really enjoy the side events we do throughout the year.\textsuperscript{440}

Likewise, Tom Hall,\textsuperscript{441} Ross DeAeth,\textsuperscript{442} and Douglas Johnson\textsuperscript{443} all responded with some
variation of, “I love the camaraderie, the friendship and encouragement, as well as the
music and thrill of competing.”

Significant to the members’ participation in these bands, as well as their
cohesiveness, are shared cultural roots. Although all were born in the United States or
Canada, 80% of the members of Kentucky United Pipes and Drums have some sort of
Scottish heritage: 70% of them have Scottish ancestors on one or both sides of their
families, and another 10% mention Scots-Irish family connections. Reed Bagley, a KUPD
pipe student with Scottish ancestry, notes, “I became interested [in playing pipes] when
attending Scottish festivals with my family…[I] wanted to experience part of [my]
culture.”\textsuperscript{444} In the Knoxville Pipes and Drums, 78% of the people I interviewed about
ancestral connections have Scottish heritage (none mentioned Scots-Irish ancestry). Kay
Irwin, a piper in the Knoxville Pipes and Drums, cites her Scottish heritage as her reason for joining the band, and states that she “love[s] the ‘haunting’ sound of the bagpipes and drums. It is part of [my] heritage.”445 The percentage of Scottish Americans in KUPD and KPD is overwhelmingly more than in the American population at large. According to the United States Census Bureau, in the year 2000, more than nine million people claimed Scottish or Scots-Irish ancestry.446 At 4.9 million claimants, those with Scottish ancestry comprised 1.7 percent of America’s total population of 281,421,906; at 4.3 million, the Scots-Irish made up 1.5 percent of the total population.447

Judging by statements on the websites of a number of other pipe bands in the midwestern and southern regions, as well as the first and last names of their listed band members,448 many other piping and drumming ensembles appear to have an overwhelming population of members with Scottish descent (I found no pipe band website that specifically mentioned Scots-Irish ancestry in its members). The Cincinnati Caledonian Pipes & Drums notes that its group is a “concerted effort by individuals particularly of, but not limited to, Scottish descent wishing to preserve, perpetuate, promote, enjoy and share the heritage of Scottish Customs and traditions.”449 The Flint Scottish Pipe Band’s website states that the group was founded in 1916 “by Scottish Immigrants intent on preserving their Scottish Heritage through the music and dress of their homeland.”450 Several groups, including the Knoxville Pipes and Drums, the Iowa Scottish Pipes & Drums, and the Duluth Scottish Heritage Pipes & Drums, mention ties to local St. Andrews or Highland societies.
The band members of KUPD and KPD who have Scottish heritage seem to be particularly attracted to the quintessentially Scottish tunes and musical characteristics found in pipe band music. Several pipers from both KUPD and KPD note that they decided to join their bands particularly because they loved the sound of the music: Joe Jones, Tracy Wilson, Chris Riedl, Gene Smarte, and Kevin Hale. Jeanie Hilten of KPD declares that her favorite part of being in the band is, “Learning and performing in a variety of settings; sharing the music.” When asked about their favorite genre of music to play with the band, many cited MSRs (March, Strathspey, and Reel sets) as the most impactful of the styles of pipe band music: these are the tunes with the most overtly Scottish musical characteristics (the Scottish snap, the dance rhythms, the traditional march repertoire). The slow airs are also popular: Kay Irwin and Angela Wilson both love “Highland Cathedral,” which Angela selected as the tune to which she walked down the aisle at her wedding. Another person I spoke with, who has Scottish heritage, commented that he particularly enjoys pibroch because it has such a strong place in the culture of the pipes.

A few members of KUPD and KPD who have Scottish heritage noted in discussions with me that they were specifically attracted to the band because of the “free kilt” they would receive; in other words, they were attracted by the elements of Highland dress. A third commented drily, “how can you not be happy seeing men wearing skirts?” Keith Goins noted that he equally loved the Highland dress and the music: “While I was living in Dallas, Texas I attended the local Scottish day festival. I was very
impressed with not only the pipes and drums but the whole culture surrounding the games. I was hooked after that experience.”453

Not all members of pipe bands have Scottish heritage, though, and this fact prompts a few questions about what might attract non-Scots to participate in a type of music that is so heavily involved in the projection of Scottish identity. The work of both Mark Slobin and Mats Hermansson is quite illuminating regarding musical affinity, especially in relation to piping and drumming. Slobin discusses how musical subcultures (like the pipe band) are also “affinity groups,” or groups that are selected by individuals because of a strong interest in or attraction to what they do or represent.454 According to Slobin, an initial affinity to a group leads to a choice: the individual chooses to act on his or her affinity and becomes involved with the ensemble, which leads to a strong expressive bond, a sense of “belonging.”455 For the members of pipe bands, this affinity might come from a desire to explore their heritage, or, for those with no Scottish roots, perhaps from an unexplained magnetism solely to the sound of the pipes or drums. As noted by KUPD drummer Tom Hall, the “love of the music” prompted him to join the band; he has no Scottish roots and no particular interest in heritage tourism or celebrations.456 Slobin himself uses a pipe band example for his discussion of affinity: “Take the case of a student of mine who, after simply hearing a Highland bagpipe band outside her window, became so attracted to the music that she became a professional piper, not an easy task for a woman in the 1970s.”457

For those who have no heritage affiliation but a strong musical interest—like Tom Hall—the participation in a pipe band might also relate to a desire to use their musical
skills to interact with others; to help impart a group identity. Hermansson, author of "From Icon to Identity: Scottish Piping & Drumming in Scandinavia," takes Slobin’s ideas of affinity a step further, noting that for those players with less interest in the extramusical elements, the music and competitions are the central focus. In this sense, Hermansson notes, the whole genre of Scottish piping and drumming “could be seen as one big affinity group. In this context Highland dress and tartary acquire quite a different symbolic meaning. For pipers and drummers all over the world, the kilt is not predominantly a symbol of a Scottish heritage, but a sign of belonging to the musical genre of piping and drumming.” In this scenario, rather than portraying a cultural identity associated with Scottish nationality, the pipe band would represent a group identity, a sense of oneness that comes from being part of a small community of like-minded musicians.

Only a select few musicians manage to make playing in a pipe band a full-time career; most people pick up piping or drumming as a leisure pastime, though many take it more seriously than an average hobby because of the amount of practice involved, especially in a competing band. This recreational participation is true for nearly all of the performers in KUPD and KPD, most of whom have day jobs that do not involve music. Indeed, from conversations with them, it seems that many count their participation in the ensemble as a welcome separation from their work life. Douglas Johnson, a piper in KUPD, echoes this sentiment, “Music is a diversion from the pressures of my job.” And Tom Foote, a former drummer with the celebrated 78th Fraser Highlanders, states, “It’s hard to walk away from music, but as my main profession I have a license as a
dispensing optician. Only one of the musicians in Kentucky United, Barry Miller, has had a career in music: before his retirement he worked for Pearl Drums as a traveling representative and then for Hurst Music in Lexington). Other KUPD members are an insurance salesman, a plant engineer at a church, two firefighters, a few students, an optometrist, a biologist, and a retired professor. In the Knoxville Pipes and Drums, four people currently have careers in music: Tracy Wilson, who teaches elementary school music in Dandridge, Tennessee, Ashley Holt, who works at Lunsford’s Music and teaches high school percussionists in Knoxville, Shaun Scheutz, who teaches percussion at Pellissippi State Community College and works with high school drumlines, and this author. Other professions of the Knoxville members include: a retired nurse, a math teacher, two affiliates of the Oak Ridge National Laboratory, and a police officer.

Since most pipe band members do not cite music as part of their career, I was surprised to find out that a number of the members of KUPD have extensive musical backgrounds beyond performing with the pipe band. Nearly all of the bagpipers or side drummers I spoke to either played in school bands or orchestras growing up, or studied piano or guitar. Rick Clayburn and Tom Hall majored in music before embarking on their current careers in home improvement and manufacturing respectively. Another member, Douglas Johnson, spoke of a strong musical inheritance and home music-making:

My father's side of the family is musically inclined. They played organ, fiddle, mandolin, guitar and piano. Mom tells me that dances were held at her house on weekends and Dad's family provided the music. At the age of 10, I was given a guitar to keep for two months and was shown three cords [sic]. Having failed at guitar and envious of the "jam sessions" that I experienced every six weeks or so when the family gathered, I had an unresolved desire to play some musical instrument. At 29, I acquired a piano for my 9 year old daughter. I began lessons,
too. I progressed to the point of playing the first movement of "Moonlight Sonata" from memory but I could not sight read. Lessons for me were a luxury and if money was tight, my lessons were one of the first things to be sacrificed. I was never able to progress.462

Keith Goins started playing trumpet in grade school and continued it into high school and college; he still plays the instrument in church on holidays.463 Gene Smarte stated that he “played snare in a couple of drum and bugle corps. I also play five-string banjo, piano and can stumble along on guitar. I even made my own steel drum tenor pan (although it didn't really ever have a good tone; one of these days I might try again).”464

Barbara Willard, who learned piano as a child, recalled the fluctuations in her musical development:

Later I progressed and competed and passed my grade 10. Then other high school activities took away from my practise time on the piano and eventually I just stopped with the lessons and just played for fun. In the latter years of high school when no piano was available I took up the accordion and learned on my own and the organ followed that. Never had I been exposed to an instrument that one had to blow and blow!!!465

Likewise, in the Knoxville Pipes and Drums, all of the musicians that I interviewed about their musical backgrounds have either sung or played another instrument beyond bagpipes or drums. One, Jeanie Hilten, plays banjo and loves to perform Old Time and Celtic music. Chris Riedl states:

I failed with oboe, clarinet, drums, and guitar. Only the bagpipe was able to wrestle me into submission. Seriously, though - I have no natural talent for music. I had a poor sense of rhythm, no ear for pitch, and no understanding of what makes music work. I think the bagpipe was unusual enough that there was more acceptance of a slow learner. With traditional instruments, people picked up on my weaknesses very quickly, and I was dismissed quickly in any music education as one who just can't do it. Because there were so few bagpipes in East Tennessee, most people didn't know what they were supposed to sound like. Rather than being chastised for being so slow, I was praised for any progress I
made. Through years of trying to get it, I finally began to pick up on tempo, timing, expression, concepts which seemed much more natural to other musicians.

Though the members of KUPD and KPD come from many different backgrounds in terms of musical training, geographical origin, education, and career choice, they are not diverse in terms of race. Like most of the groups I have observed, they both have an extremely high percentage of Caucasian members, and, correspondingly, very few Hispanic, African American, Native American, or Asian pipers or drummers. Since the RSPBA’s policies—with which all registered pipe bands must comply—are of complete inclusion, and since I have never personally witnessed nor heard of any cases of discrimination among the pipe bands with which I have interacted in the Southeast or Ohio Valley, I infer that this lack of diversity represents an unintentional exclusion. Because many members of these ensembles have Scottish heritage (though of course there are some with no Scottish heritage), and since people with Scottish heritage are overwhelmingly Caucasian, perhaps potential participants of other cultural and/or racial backgrounds perceive the pipe band as more of a cultural activity than a musical endeavor, and do not join because they do not feel a cultural connection with the members of the group. The low percentage of participants of color, then, might perpetuate itself into a perennial barrier for African Americans who might initially be interested in playing in a pipe band, but who might not join because of a fear of alienation. Indeed, this perceived barrier is borne out in an 2004 Associated Press interview with first sergeant Dwayne Farr, an African American Marine known for playing the bagpipes while stationed in Fallujah, Iraq, during the Second Gulf War. Farr states that he was inspired to
learn to play the bagpipes when he saw another performer who didn't match the Scotsman stereotype: "I was at a funeral and I saw a Marine playing the bagpipes, and I thought, this isn't a big, burly, redheaded guy with a ponytail and a big stomach. He's a small Hispanic Marine. I said if he can learn to play the bagpipes, I can learn."\cite{467}

There are certainly exceptions to the fact that most people who participate in pipe bands, or in Scottish cultural events, are Caucasian. In North Carolina, which boasted the largest settlement of Scots-Gaelic-speaking Highlanders in the 1700s, there have been cultural interactions and racial intermixing between the Highlanders, the Native American population, and the African-American population for generations (a significant number of African Americans also claim Scots-Irish ancestry). The library of the University of North Carolina at Asheville includes a “Heritage of Black Highlanders” archive, which displays on its homepage a photo of a group of African American girls, dressed in Highland costume, who are Highland dancing in the 1940s at the UNC Asheville stadium.\cite{468} Interestingly, a notable challenge to the Great Highland Bagpipes’ identity came from the most famous African American bagpiper of the last century, Rufus Harley, though his unique identity twists did not appear to have longlasting effects on the profile of pipe bands. Harley was initially attracted to the instrument after watching the Black Watch perform at John Fitzgerald Kennedy’s funeral,\cite{469} but he stated that, by eschewing Scottish pipe band music and choosing to play jazz and blues on an instrument that had roots in the reed pipes of northern Africa, the bagpipes helped him “discover [his] identity by making [him] aware of [his] cultural heritage.”\cite{470} It is interesting to note that while Harley did claim to be performing an African identity instead of a Scottish one,
and while he did not play traditional marches, strathspeys, or reels, he did give a nod to the instrument’s Scottish history and iconography by wearing partial Highland dress in performance, often pairing a kilt and sporran with a dashiki and Nigerian kufi cap.\textsuperscript{471}

5.4 Methods of learning and rehearsal structures in KUPD and KPD

In the \textit{Pipe Major’s Handbook}, Rodney Lerwick advises that pipe bands field both a core competition group (comprised of the members who want to perfect their skills in a competitive unit) and a “big” band: a general function group which plays for parades and relaxed gigs and which allows “lazier and new members to relax, and less talented persons to participate.”\textsuperscript{472} Neither Knoxville nor Kentucky United has a separate “big” band like this, although there are a few members in each ensemble who tend to sit out during competitions and only play for more casual occasions like parades and holiday shows. In some years, both KPD and KUPD have simultaneously fielded a Grade Four and a Grade Five band; the Grade Four ensemble is made up of the more advanced players and the Grade Five consists of beginners and members who do not practice regularly.

Part of the stated mission of both KPD and KUPD is to provide free piping and drumming lessons to anyone who is interested. Chris Riedl of the Knoxville Pipes and Drums states, “at the formation of the band, it was important to me to provide an environment that would ensure that no child in Knoxville had to give up on the pipes as I almost did, simply because there was no one to practice or learn with.”\textsuperscript{473} The people who teach the free lessons do so voluntarily; in KUPD the instructors presently are Jesse Short and Malcolm MacGregor, both of whom play in the Grade Four band. Lessons in KPD
are taught by instructor Vince Ayub, who plays pipes with the Grade Five band; Shaun Scheutz of the Grade Four band teaches drum lessons. Those enrolled in lessons are expected to practice outside of their instructional period, though there is not a set amount of time recommended each day or week. Both groups offer the lessons before the start of regular rehearsal, and both advertise them on their websites. KUPD's website gives basic information about lesson times and emphasizes the simplicity of the process:

Beginning pipers and drummers meet at 6:00PM to 7:00PM on Tuesday nights before the regularly scheduled full band rehearsal…Please do not buy any practice materials until you've met with your instructor, who will help you select materials and sources of supply. Student membership dues are $25 per year, the same as band membership dues. That's all you need to do to get started! When you reach a certain level of proficiency and familiarity with the band's music, your instructor will arrange for an audition to demonstrate your abilities to join the band.474

A large number of bands besides KUPD and KPD, including the MacGillivray Pipe Band (Thunder Bay, Ontario), Minnesota Police Pipe Band (Minneapolis), Jamestown Pipes and Drums (Virginia), John Mohr Mackintosh Pipes and Drums (Atlanta), Nashville Pipes and Drums, and the Jacksonville Pipes & Drums (Florida), also give free lessons on bagpipes and snare, tenor, and bass drums in order to encourage more people to join the band.

These free lessons are an acknowledged impetus for recruitment; in conversation with the members of KUPD and KPD, I learned that many of them took advantage of the pre-rehearsal free formal instruction offered by the ensemble (only one cited having paid for piping instruction, which was in a different state). Several musicians I interviewed mentioned being specifically attracted by the offer of free lessons. These helped Douglas
Johnson, a piper in the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums, realize his musical desires and move past unsuccessful self-instruction:

I saw an advertisement for a chanter and music book saying "Learn to play the bagpipe". So for $25.00 I tried self-teaching and failed. [A local pipe band] then offered six free lessons and I took the opportunity. I was the only one to finish the six-lesson session and began paid lessons with the proctor. They got me a better chanter and allowed me to use a loaner set of bagpipes.475

Barbara Willard, another KUPD piper, remembers:

I saw an ad in the paper inviting people to come to a band practise and learn about piping. Your only obligation was to come and if interested spend $35.00 on a chanter and the lessons were free. What an opportunity and challenge! After the first exposure I was hooked, and determined to progress to the pipes.476

And Kevin Hale, also of KUPD, notes, “[I joined a pipe band because] I enjoy the sound of the pipes and my first pipe band offered to teach me for free.477

Musicians joining a pipe band for the first time usually start in private lessons for at least a year, then progress to the Grade Five band, and then, if their ability allows, on up to the Grade Four ensemble. Traditionally, as discussed in Chapter Three, pipe band music was taught by rote during lessons or ensemble rehearsals; according to Tom Foote, rote teaching was still common until around the 1960s, despite the fact that published instruction manuals and printed sheet music had existed since the nineteenth century. Currently, though, because many pipers and drummers have experience playing other instruments before joining a pipe band, most are able to read music even before they start playing in a pipe band, and their initial learning focuses more on instrumental technique rather than on music theory (though on rare occasions when there is a true musical beginner, the piping and drumming instructors do have to teach score reading along with
pipe or drum techniques; these players tend to take longer to progress to performance readiness). Still, there are some band members in both KUPD and KPD who claim to not read music very well; two of the KUPD drummers can only read drum notation and cannot read pitches. KUPD piper Douglas Johnson says:

I can figure out the notes, the timing, the key and recognize accidentals. But the process is as follows: 1) PANIC 2) place my fingers and figure out the progression of notes 3) try to figure the value of the notes 4) try to make a song of the sounds I'm making 5) have someone play it for me so I can hear what it should sound like. From that, I know the progression of notes, their value, and I can make music. Sheet music in front of me is only a "prompt" for my memory.478

When first starting to learn to play bagpipes, beginners typically spend about $75 for a practice chanter and $15 for an instruction book. When learning to play the pipes, or later when learning new tunes or practice quietly, a piper uses a practice chanter, which has a smaller plastic reed and lacks a bag and drone pipes and is much easier to manipulate than a full set of pipes. This chanter allows them to learn the basics of fingering and breath control without worrying about the added dimension of the bag. KUPD’s website describes its lessons to new pipers as follows: “You’ll learn breathing techniques, develop finger coordinations, and practice important rhythm and timing exercises as you progress. When you're ready for your pipes, you'll have experienced pipers available to guide you for your purchase, playing, tuning, and maintenance.”479 It often takes six months to a year on the practice chanter before new pipers are ready to tackle an actual set of Great Highland Bagpipes, and then another six to twelve months practicing on their pipes before they get to public-performance competency.
Because it is much easier to make an initial sound on a drum than on a set of bagpipes, beginning drummers typically take less time to be performance-ready than pipers do; the average is about one year, versus the two years it generally takes new pipers to be prepared to play in public. Lessons are given on practice pads rather than on drums, and both KUPD and KPD expect beginning drummers to buy their own sticks and a practice pad; these required materials total approximately $50.

Outside of learning their instruments from their bandmates, a number of the musicians in KUPD and KPD have sought expert teaching from outside instructors in piping and drumming workshops. Tracy Wilson, Angela Wilson, Kay Irwin, and Ross DeAeth have attended weeklong summer sessions at the North American Academy of Piping and Drumming in Valle Crucis, North Carolina. Chris Riedl attended the School of Scottish Arts in Banner Elk, North Carolina, to enhance his piping. Pipers and drummers from both bands have attended the Atlanta Piping Foundation’s piping and drumming workshops. Rick Clayburn is a regular enrollee at Winter Storm, a once-yearly weekend workshop in Kansas. Occasionally, to help relieve the fiscal expenses of band members traveling to one of these workshops, pipe bands will use accumulated band funds to fly in guest instructors to lead day- or weekend-long seminars. In February of 2015, for example, KPD brought in Bill Caudill, who led a piping workshop for all KPD band members at Dandridge Elementary School in Dandridge, Tennessee (chosen because pipe major Tracy Wilson teaches music there).

Though pipers and drummers in pipe bands are expected to learn and perfect their individual parts during personal practice sessions, pipe bands would not be successful if
they did not provide a structured time and location for regular ensemble rehearsals to take place. The Kentucky United Pipes and Drums and the Knoxville Pipes and Drums both meet one evening per week for two hours. Based on my online research, and on conversations with musicians from other bands, it seems that this weekly two-to-three hour evening rehearsal structure is the most common. The city of Rockford Pipe Band (Illinois), for example, meets every Tuesday night, just like KUPD, while others, such as Flint Scottish (Michigan), meet once a week on the weekends. The Jamestown Pipes and Drums rehearses on Thursday evenings.

The Kentucky United Pipes and Drums holds rehearsals at Central Christian Church in downtown Lexington; this venue was chosen because one of KUPD’s pipers, Malcolm MacGregor, is a longtime Central Christian member. KUPD does not pay the church for using the space for rehearsals, but at the end of each fiscal year, the ensemble makes a donation to the church to show its appreciation for the church’s support. It seems, from conversations and online research, that most pipe bands rehearse at public locations such as schools (Clan Gordon Pipe Band in Washington, Rampant Lion Pipe Band in New Jersey, the City of Chattanooga Pipe Band in Tennessee) or churches (KUPD, KPD, Cincinnati Caledonian, the Nashville Pipes and Drums, the Jamestown Pipes and Drums, the Savannah Pipes and Drums in Georgia, the St. Andrew Pipes and Drums of Kansas City). An isolated few hold rehearsals in odd locations: the Utah Pipe Band, for example, practices at a mortuary.480

During the five–year research period (2007-12) as a participant-observer in Kentucky United, the rehearsals were structured as follows:
6 pm: During this pre-rehearsal time, several band members give free lessons on pipes and drums; these sessions are typically attended by a rotating roster of between two and eight students.

7 pm: This is the beginning of the formal band rehearsal. Led by the drum sergeant, all drummers (snares, tenors, and basses) assemble in one room; led by the pipe major, all pipers meet in another room. Drummers run through rudiment exercises or massed band settings on practice pads during this period, and pipers play scales or tuning exercises on their chanters. Once each section has warmed up, the players begin learning new tunes or they focus on complicated sections of music (often found in the competition sets, but sometimes in concert tunes or parade sets) to work on mastering any technical and musical issues.

7:45 pm: Both pipers and drummers take a fifteen-minute break at the end of the first hours of rehearsal time. The drummers put away their practice pads and unpack their drums and carriers, and the pipers put away their practice chanters and unpack and tune their bagpipes.

8 pm: At this point in the evening, the full band rehearsal begins. The pipe and drum sections get together in one large room—or outdoors if the weather is nice—to practice “comp sets” (competition sets), concert tunes, and competition circle formation. The pipe major is responsible for running this portion of rehearsal; typically the band will play familiar music to warm up first (regular parade tunes or old comp sets), and will then progress to harder or newer music. During and leading up to the competition season, repetition is common during this portion of rehearsal, because the band is looking for
ensemble perfection in their MSR, March, or Medley set. Sometimes the group will spend weeks or months going over the same four minutes of music.

9 pm: Rehearsal ends promptly at 9 pm. Most KUPD members live in Lexington or in nearby communities such as Richmond or Versailles, so it is fairly common for five or ten of the band members to meet for a brief post-rehearsal hangout at a pizza parlor that is several blocks away from Central Christian Church.

Rehearsals with the Knoxville Pipes and Drums are very similar to those with Kentucky United. Like KUPD, KPD rehearses one night per week at a church where several of the band members attend services; they meet on Monday nights at Victory Baptist Church in Maryville, Tennessee, which is about 15 miles south of Knoxville. KPD is allowed to use Victory Baptist’s space for free, though, like KUPD, the Knoxville band makes yearly good-faith donations to the church to show appreciation for using its space. Free classes for new students are taught for an hour prior to the full KPD band rehearsal, which begins at 6:15 pm. As with KUPD, the sections rehearse separately for approximately the first hour of rehearsal; the KPD drum section, though, splits into snare and midsection units during this time, whereas all KUPD drummers typically meet together during this period. In 2015, Knoxville Pipes and Drums fields only a Grade Five band, so all of the ensemble’s pipers, snares, and midsection members are rehearsing together. (This procedure is different from the several previous years when the ensemble fielded both a Grade Four and Grade Five band; during the two-band year, the Grade Four and Five pipe sections, the Grade Four and Five snare sections, and the Grade Four and Five midsections would also practice separately for a portion of rehearsal.) At around
7 pm, both sections of the band take a break to put away practice pads and chanters, and
to unpack and tune drums and pipes. Pipe major Tracy Wilson runs the full-band portion
of rehearsal, which is structured like KUPD’s: the band first plays familiar music to warm
up, and then progresses to more difficult, or newer, tunes. When rehearsal ends at 8 pm, it
is rare for band members to meet for a post-rehearsal gathering, because most of the KPD
members travel longer distances to rehearsal than the KUPD members do. Though there
are a handful of KPD pipers and drummers who live in Maryville near where the band
rehearses, many come from Knoxville, which is about thirty minutes northeast; still
others come from Crossville (an hour and fifteen minutes from Maryville), Dandridge
(about an hour away), and Oak Ridge (forty-five minutes away).

The members of KUPD and KPD attend rehearsals, learn to read music, and
practice repertoire in a realm that is typically separate from other aspects of their daily
lives, and the collective experiences shared by members in a pipe band can serve, in part,
to fulfill a longing for a type of communal engagement, similar to British anthropologist
Victor Turner’s idea of *communitas*—the intense sense of togetherness that is often
connected to performance rituals that take place “outside” society.\(^{481}\) Drawing on the
ideas of French ethnologist Arnold van Gennep, Turner believes that rituals separate
specified members of a group from everyday life by placing them in a state of liminality,
as they operate during privileged spaces and spans of time. During the liminal stage of a
ritual, participants hover on the “threshold” of everyday life; they are in a momentary
state of disorientation between their regular means of structuring their time, identity, or
community, and a new method, established by the ritual. Post-ritual, the people return,
changed in some way, to mundane life.\textsuperscript{482} These phenomena of communal rituals are also illustrated in performances of KUPD and KPD in varied contexts and venues.

5.5 Contexts and venues of performance

The sense of group identity outside society in the pipe band scene is partially transmitted in the performance occasions for the ensembles. They perform in parades (often for “Celtic” holidays or celebrations), in concerts (in pubs, theaters, restaurants, and sometimes even concert halls; occasionally these concerts are with other touring “Celtic” musicians, such as the Chieftains or Gaelic Storm), for graduations, for weddings, and for funerals (which are typically either solo piper or one piper/one drummer occasions). The City of Dunedin Pipe Band from Dunedin, Florida, exemplifies this performance diversity. The group’s website advertises that the band “regularly performs in: parades, concerts, corporate events and conventions, golf tournaments, St. Patrick’s Day events, wedding ceremonies and receptions, parties, funerals, community events, Scottish/Irish cultural gatherings, Celtic festivities.”\textsuperscript{483}

A pipe band’s event calendar is generally year-round, minus a six-week break between Thanksgiving and the New Year; both the Knoxville Pipes and Drums and the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums follow this schedule. Enrollment of participants in these events is done online for the Knoxville Pipes and Drums through a special members-only page on the band’s website; KUPD members sign up for events on printed signup sheets during rehearsal. A typical season for the Knoxville Pipes and Drums is represented by the band’s 2015 lineup of events. This year, January for the Knoxville Pipes and Drums’ schedule includes a concert with Gaelic Storm,\textsuperscript{484} and some of the
pipers playing for “Burns Night” on January 25. The yearly calendar also includes two St. Patrick’s Day concerts at local restaurants and the “Parade of Nations” at Dollywood Theme Park (Sevierville, Tennessee) in March, the University of the Cumberlands (Williamsburg, Kentucky) graduation in April, all of the previously-listed competitions and Highland games between April and October, and the Dandridge Scots-Irish Festival in September. KUPD’s calendar includes St. Patrick's Day performances in a pub and in the St. Patrick's Day Parade in Lexington, all of the previously-listed competitions and Highland games between April and September, an Arbor Day performance at the University of Kentucky Arboretum in April, the University of Phoenix graduation in Louisville in June, the Danville Irish Festival in July, the Lexington and Georgetown Fire Prevention Parades in October, and the Kirking of the Tartans parade and concert at St. John’s Episcopal Church in Versailles, Kentucky, in November.

The “Kirking of the Tartans” is a Scottish-American tradition of celebrating Scottish ancestry with a tartan parade, a clan roll call, and pipe band music during a Sunday church service. (“Kirk” is the Gaelic word for “church.”) Popularized in the mid-twentieth century, it was originally tied to Presbyterian churches with large percentages of Scottish-American congregants, who wanted to underscore the Scottishness of American Presbyterian heritage with the performance of the pipes and drums and the wearing of the kilts during religious ritual. As often happens with traditions, it has expanded and evolved slightly over time, and is now celebrated by other denominations as well.
The performance calendars for individual pipers from KUPD and KPD, or small groups of pipers and a drummer or two, also include weddings and funerals. Typically the whole pipe band does not play during these performances because the large ensemble would be prohibitively loud, although the full Kentucky United Pipes and Drums did play a Scottish-themed wedding (including Highland dance, Gaelic blessings and poetry readings, the “piping of the haggis,” and full Highland dress for all parties involved, including the bride and groom) in Ashland, Kentucky, in 2011. At weddings, pipers function to project a personal identity of the bride and groom, as the music is used to glorify or draw attention to their Scottish heritage, in a similar manner to the way the powerful sound of the bagpipe in Highland society was used to strengthen the position of clan chief. The funeral requests are typically for the services of police officers, firemen, or men from the armed forces, though occasionally a family with a strong connection to their Scottish heritage will request pipers and drummers at civilian funerals. This tradition is likely related to the historical use of pipers in clan warfare, and in the British Army, to lament lost troops. In essence, the bagpipes are being used post-mortem to project the identity of the deceased. In both weddings and funerals, the performance of the pipe band contributes to the continuity and stability of Scottish culture and identity.

For parades, pipe bands typically play two or three rotating sets of music, separated by drum cadences and cued with drum roll-offs. Kentucky United, for example, performs three different “parade sets”: first, its “Scottish set,” which includes “Scotland the Brave,” “High Road to Gareloch,” and “The Old Rustic Bridge”; second, twice through the song “My Old Kentucky Home,” the state song of Kentucky; and, for St.
Patrick’s Day, the band plays its “Irish set,” which includes “The Rakes of Mallow” and “Gary Owen.” Most parades have a similar underlying structure: band members usually arrive, independently, about an hour before the parade’s scheduled step-off time. They tune their instruments and warm up as a group, and then take their place in the parade line. Street parades for KUPD and KPD may last anywhere from fifteen minutes to an hour, covering the distance of a few city blocks to a mile or more. At larger street parades, there might be several participating pipe bands, but, since the ensembles are typically spaced out through the parade, this schedule does not give different bands much of an opportunity to interact with one another, since the physical distance between them alone is an inhibitor to interaction.

Sometimes band members hang out together after a parade, especially if they are playing any gigs near where the parade ended. One year, for example, KUPD did a small “bar tour” in downtown Lexington following the St. Patrick’s Day parade; this consisted of visits to several local pubs as well as a performance on a small stage at the end of the parade. The immediate post-parade period, when members are still in uniform, tends to be a time when the group attracts a large amount of public attention, prompting interaction with the community. It can be a good time to informally demonstrate the instruments to interested parties, and therefore to conduct recruiting activities. It is also the time when band members most frequently receive the ever-popular query, “What’s under the kilt?”

Performances at restaurants or bars usually consist of two or three 15-20 minute sets of music. It is rare for pipe bands to stage full formal concerts, most likely because
the instruments are quite loud and are historically played outdoors. I have been present at only one indoor pipe band concert in eight years as a participant observer. Sometimes touring “Celtic” music groups will feature local pipe bands while they are in town; the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums, for example, played several songs to open a Chieftains\textsuperscript{485} concert at the Singlelary Center for the Arts, and also played a few tunes with the band during the show. KPD played with Gaelic Storm in both 2014 and 2015; it performed a few pieces to open the show and then played on one set of tunes with Gaelic Storm during the formal part of the concert.

In my experience, both KUPD and KPD are typically well received by audiences during parades and concerts. At KPD’s recent performance with Gaelic Storm, the band received a standing ovation after playing only two tunes to open the show. In conversations with audience members after parades and gigs, it seems that they respond well for a variety of reasons: some appreciate the novelty of the instruments and uniforms, others feel connections to their ethnic heritage, some demonstrate appreciation for the synchronicity of the band’s performance, and others feel attachment to the repertoire. When asked what impressions she has heard from audiences over the years, Barbara Willard’s opinion is that there are two types of audiences: “For the non piping audience I believe it is such a rarity that it draws them out or friends have coaxed them to come. The educated pipe audience just wants to hear the best, in order to either improve themselves, learn or simply enjoy!”\textsuperscript{486} In less common cases, the people who watch KUPD or KPD perform may be disinterested, or even hostile; though I have never
witnessed animosity at a concert, competition, or parade, a Maryville resident did call the police with a noise complaint during a recent outdoor KPD rehearsal.

Probably the most important time in a pipe band’s season is “comp season” (competition season), experienced through Highland games. For most bands in the Southeast and Ohio Valley regions, the competition season extends from April or May through October; the earliest 2015 games for the Knoxville Pipes and Drums is the Loch Norman Highland Games in Huntersville, North Carolina, scheduled for April 18. Kentucky United’s earliest 2015 games will be the Smoky Mountain Scottish Festival and Games in Maryville, Tennessee, on May 16. The latest competition for KPD this year will be the Stone Mountain Highland Games, scheduled for October 17, 2015; KUPD’s latest competition of 2015 will be the Central Kentucky Celtic Festival and Highland Games on September 19. Both bands begin gearing up for comp season in January.

KPD’s competition schedule for most years includes the following games: in April, the Loch Norman Highland Games (Huntersville, North Carolina); in May, the Smoky Mountain Scottish Festival and Games (Maryville, Tennessee), the Greenville Highland Games (Greenville, South Carolina), and the Glasgow Highland Games (Glasgow, Kentucky); in June, the Ohio Scottish Games (Wellington, Ohio); and in October, the Scotland County Highland Games (in Laurinburg, North Carolina, and which will feature prominently in the ethnography in Chapter Six) and the Stone Mountain Highland Games (Atlanta, Georgia). KUPD typically has a lighter competition schedule, which includes either the Smoky Mountain Scottish Festival and Games or the Glasgow Highland Games.
in May, the Central Kentucky Celtic Festival and Highland Games in September, and occasionally the Stone Mountain Highland Games in October.

5.6 Conclusion

In this chapter, I have described varied communal activities of the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums and the Knoxville Pipes and Drums as well as perceptions of individual members in these groups, from the perspective of a participant observer. Individual differences among the pipers and drummers in these ensembles are as great as among any group: band members come from different backgrounds with a wide variance in age, social class, musical training, length of time in the band, level of education, political and religious views, and so on. Yet within these case studies, a number of unifying characteristics also emerged.

First, KUPD and KPD foster connections to Scottish identity in many of their members. Most of the performers in KUPD and KPD claim partial or full Scottish descent. For pipers like Kay Irwin and Reed Bagley, playing in the pipe band helps them search for their roots; it represents a tradition, or an ethnic identity that brings them closer to their ancestral homeland. Other performers, such as Tom Hall, are particularly attracted to the intrinsic attributes of Scottish music; many of my consultants mentioned they specifically connect to the rich melodies, the rhythmic lilt, and the pipe band’s unique repertoire, such as “Scotland the Brave,” “Green Hills of Tyrol,” and “Amazing Grace.” Certainly the elements of Scottishness in the band’s Highland dress, as well as their performances at Highland games such as Scotland County, and parades such as the Kirking of the Tartan, have particular cultural significance to these band members.
Second, both the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums, as well as the Knoxville Pipes and Drums, were founded with the purposes of furthering Scottish music through performance and teaching, and this is evident in many aspects of the groups. Music-making as a form of enjoyment and challenge is part of the draw of participating in a pipe band: the pipers and drummers delight in constantly trying to improve their playing. Through the tradition of offering free lessons, pipe bands like KUPD and KPD are able to connect with, and recruit, many newcomers to Scottish music. Though there has been some evolution in learning patterns, and oral traditions such as *cantairreachd* have largely been replaced by sheet music, the connections between instructors and students are still palpable: from my interviews with many bandmates, including Barbara Willard, I sense that learning a new instrument, mastering a tune, and connecting with musicians with similar interests, are rewarding experiences.

Third, the integrative function of the bands is important: participation in these ensembles creates and/or strengthens bonds between individuals, uniting them in a collective experience. They are all participating in the genre of piping and drumming, and the tradition of the way the bands are run shows how closely this genre aligns, even across state lines. Like many pipe bands, both KUPD and KPD are nonprofit 501(c)(3) organizations, and have comparable leadership structures, bylaws, and missions. Both groups select their all-volunteer band roster to make up the officers of the board, both hold yearly elections for the board positions of pipe major, drum sergeant, president, vice president, secretary, treasurer, and quartermaster. Each band also raises money through donations and performance stipends, though KUPD charges its band members dues while
KPD does not. The band members in each group, largely, have extensive musical backgrounds outside of the pipe band, even if the large percentage of participants do not have careers in music, and an appreciation for the sense of community created through making music together as family and friends came up frequently in my conversations with the members of KUPD and KPD, including Kevin Hale and Beth Morgan. The year-round schedule for rehearsals, concerts, and parades strengthen ties between the pipers and drummers, and, in a sense, regularly bring them together as a group apart.

The case studies of the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums and the Knoxville Pipes and Drums reveal common themes of identity and tradition that are present in many contemporary pipe bands. As the demand for pipers and drummers in the clans and in warfare went out of fashion, the performance and competition traditions of Highland games created an “everlasting arena for piping and drumming.” Chapter Six will include a detailed ethnography of one such Highland games: the Scotland County Highland Games, held in Laurinburg in Scotland County, North Carolina.
CHAPTER SIX: AN ETHNOGRAPHIC CASE STUDY OF THE 2014 SCOTLAND COUNTY HIGHLAND GAMES

6.1 Introduction

The continuity of Scottish traditions and the reshaping of new senses of Scottish identity through the modern recreational pipe band depend greatly on the solidification of the ensemble’s collective identity, as the previous chapter has argued. The melding of each member’s individual needs and sensibilities, from specific sociocultural stances to purely musical or recreational desires for participation, takes place through the routines and rituals of rehearsals and performances, as well as social interactions among the group. Perhaps the most significant activity that strengthens the ensemble’s social cohesiveness as it reinforces the sense of the band’s Scottishness is the ritual of the Highland games. These gatherings are places where—through massed pipe band performances, parades of tartans, and Highland dancing and Scottish heavy athletics competitions—the central themes of Scottish heritage are dramatized. Frank Manning underscores this idea: “It is very apparent that ritual festivals are about identity, whether personal or social, and they are the context and the process of creating links between people in the community or a culture, as well as between the community or culture and the wider national and cultural environment.” The music of the Highland games ritual, drawing on historically important repertoire as well as new crossover repertoire such as “Amazing Grace,” plays an important role in the transforming and blending of the band’s cultural and group identities.
A ritual such as the Highland games can have an effect on the formation and negotiation of cultural identity even after it is over. In his work, Manning notes that after a ritual is over, the celebrants eventually return to the wider society, with cultural resources that they may use to resist external influences or, alternatively, to negotiate and compete on behalf of their cultural interests. Therefore, the intensified ritual strengthens its constituents in their inherited culture and identity. As mentioned in Chapter Five, identity derived from ritual celebrations that are separate from society is also a central topic in the work of Victor Turner. Turner concentrates on what happens when feelings of togetherness and belonging are established by performances that take place “outside” society, in *communitas*. The fact that Turner designates these group identity-producing rituals as taking place “outside” society is important, because it reflects how the establishment of group identity can also mark a feeling of dissociation. This concept is also touched on in the work of Swedish ethnomusicologist Dan Lundberg, who states: “while a [group] symbol indicates belonging, it also marks dissociation. By signalling ‘us’, we single out ‘the others’.”

This idea of separation from society—a sort of “us” versus “them” perception in ritual performance—is present in many subcultures, including that of the pipe band. In creating a sense of community and cultural identity during Highland games performances, rehearsals, concerts, and parades, the pipers and drummers distance themselves from anyone who is not a part of their immediate pipe band subculture. Whether consciously or unconsciously, they are “othering,” or placing outside their circle, those who do not “fit in” by being participants in the same events. In some ways,
“othering” performed by the members of pipe band might signify an act of opposition to those not participating in their subculture, but the idea of the “other” could also represent a reason that certain pipers or drummers became involved in the activity to begin with: an attraction to an “exotic” activity, something new and different that not everyone can participate in; a momentary experience as a heritage tourist in a cultural group different from one’s own.

In examining the multiple senses and layers of group identity and cultural identity manifested in pipe band performances during ritual performances, this chapter will highlight a specific Highland games festival—the 2014 Scotland County Highland Games, as experienced as a member of the Knoxville Pipes and Drums—and will illustrate how that event reflected a narrative of Scottish identity for pipe band participants and audiences.

6.2 About the Scotland County Highland Games

The Scotland County Games were held approximately seven hours (by car) southeast of Knoxville in Laurinburg, Scotland County, North Carolina, on Saturday, October 4, 2014. The area was settled by Highland Scots in the eighteenth century, and today, the region celebrates this heritage in many ways, including on the city’s government and genealogical websites, which highlights the region’s “Scottishness” with plaid visuals and photos from Highland festivals. Laurinburg is also home to St. Andrews University, formerly called St. Andrews Presbyterian College, which is known for its strong ties to the Highlanders who settled in the area. The university boasts a Scottish Heritage Center and an award-winning pipe band, and states on its website that
the “Scottish Heritage Center and the St. Andrews Pipe Band are logical extensions of the College’s Scottish Heritage. It is also the home of the...well-known National Public Radio program ‘The Thistle and Shamrock’ [which celebrates all types of Celtic music].”

The Scotland County Games are held in the tradition of celebrated early Highland games events, such as the Braemar Gathering and the St. Fillans Highland Society Games, both begun in the early nineteenth century. As such, the Scotland County Games is a large outdoor festival that celebrates Scottish culture with artistic performances, cultural displays, and the sale of food, clothes, and other gifts. Like most contemporary Highland games, the Scotland County event includes competitions in Scottish heavy athletics, solo piping, drumming, and dancing, and—unlike the earliest Highland games festivals in the nineteenth century—full pipe band ensemble contests.

Attendees at the 2014 Scotland County Games included members of Knoxville’s Grade Four and Grade Five bands, who drove from the Knoxville area the evening before the beginning of the Games on Saturday morning. Many of the performers brought their families with them, while some of the others carpooled with one another and came without their spouses or children. The band used its accumulated funds to pay for hotel rooms around two miles from the competition site, though the participants had to pay for their own gas to get from Knoxville to Laurinburg. After most of the band members had arrived on Friday night, there was an informal gathering in the hotel room of some of the senior members of the band, where several bottles of Scotch were passed around and everyone chatted about the next day’s competition and the pipe band world in general.
(none of the minors were invited). I am not certain whether Scotch is always the drink of choice for the members who brought it, or whether it was a deliberate selection of a Scottish beverage made to toast the opening of the weekend Highland festival, to “get into character,” so to speak. However, the choice of a symbolic Scottish drink on this occasion suggests a conscious informal decision that resonates with the more formal choice of the band’s tartan and other material symbols.

Although many Highland games are held in parks or on college campuses, the Scotland County Games is held on the grounds of the John Blue Home and Historical Complex in Laurinburg. This site contains the 19th-century John Blue Home and “several other historic Scottish-American homesteads as well as a working antebellum cotton gin, and a general store.” The competing pipe bands were allowed to set up their band tents directly on the grounds, resulting in a visual onslaught of Scottish imagery for any spectator who drove by the Blue Complex.

The schedule for the Saturday events was as follows:

8:00 a.m. Field Open to the General Public
8:30 a.m. Check-in for Solo Piping, Drumming, Dancing and Athletics
9:00 a.m. Competitions in Solo Piping, Drumming, and Scottish Athletic Events
9:00 a.m. Highland Dancing Competition
10:15 a.m. Sheep Dog Demonstration
10:45 a.m. Assembly for Opening Ceremonies
11:00 a.m. Opening Ceremonies featuring Massed Pipe Bands and Parade of Tartans
11:45 a.m. Competitions in Solo Piping, Drumming, and Athletics
12:00-4 p.m. Simultaneous events: Entertainment Stage, featuring Rathkelter, Stirling Bridge, and Thistledown Tinkers; Scottish Athletic Competitions; Clan Tents; Children’s Games; Pipe Band Competition
1:30 p.m. Sheep Dog Demonstration
2:00 p.m. Pipe Band Competition
4:30 p.m. Closing Ceremonies and Awards Presentations
5:00-8:00 p.m Ceilidh on the Games field with performances by Rathkeltar, Stirling Bridge, Thistledown Tinkers, and the Saint Andrews University Pipe Band.\textsuperscript{495}

Visiting pipe bands like the Knoxville Pipes and Drums were only officially involved in the festivities on Saturday, but for those participants and audience members truly interested in Scottish heritage tourism, the Highland Games weekend also included Scottish identity-themed events on Friday and Sunday. These occasions included a single malt Scotch whisky tasting at Laurinburg’s Storytelling Arts Center, a clan reception, a solo piping recital, and a Kirkin’ of the Tartans Worship Service at Old Laurel Hill Presbyterian Church, founded by immigrants from the Highlands in 1797.\textsuperscript{496}

6.3 Massed band performances at opening and closing ceremonies

Though activities at Highland games begin early in the morning, the festivals are not typically declared “officially open” until the opening ceremonies, which take place at around 10 or 11 am, sometimes concurrently with solo competitions for piping, drumming, athletics, and dancing. These ceremonies feature remarks from a games representative as well as a massed pipe band performance, which includes the collective participation of every pipe band competing in one of the day’s competitions.

Some players in KPD and KUPD dislike participating in massed band events, as they remove focus from practice sessions and require band members to show up earlier at the games. Some organizers of Highland games, recognizing that certain bands will try to avoid participating in the massed band ceremonies, have resorted to withholding travel and prize money if a band fails to show up for massed bands; the Smoky Mountain
Scottish Festival and Games, for example, advertises that “to be eligible for travel assistance, [pipe] bands must participate with a full roster in both massed band events on Saturday.”\textsuperscript{497}

Naturally, this reluctance to participate by some pipers and drummers brings up an interesting dichotomy: if the massed band performances represent—with the use of traditional pipe band repertoire, Highland dress, the clan salute, and other Scottish symbols—the “most Scottish” part of Highland games, should not the members of the pipe bands, especially those with Scottish heritage, wish to participate? What is the essential purpose of a Highland games, if not to nurture a pan-Scottish sense of community and identity?

As discussed in Chapter Five, for many pipers and drummers, their sense of identity may come more from an affinity for “the whole genre of Scottish piping and drumming,”\textsuperscript{498} rather than from the collective enactment of Scottish heritage. For these performers, the most important part of a Highland Games festival is competitively driven: the solo and ensemble competitions are their main source of motivation in attending. As viewed from the perspective of Turner, these performances act as “reflexive” processes, through which the performer “reveals himself to himself”—either “through acting or enactment” or “through observing and/or participating.”\textsuperscript{499} The pipers and drummers who are primarily motivated by competition, then, may form their personal identities as pipe band performers through the “enactment” of music that requires dedication, practice, and collaboration with others, rather than on the “enactment” of Scottishness attached to the genre. However, the pipe band identities of the “music enacters” and the “cultural
enacters” merge in the massed band performances of the Highland games, as in all other activities of the ensemble. In this way, the culture surrounding the pipe band can be understood as a by-product of the fusion of musically driven and ethnically oriented identities of pipe band members as well as the cumulative, shared experiences of individual members that create a sense of “we-ness” or group identity.

Even if the identity of an individual member or collection of members within the pipe band depends more strongly on the musical and competitive elements of the Highland games and other performances, rather than the aspiration to play a part in the cultural narrative as presented during a Highland games, it cannot be held entirely separate from it. By participating in a ritual festival, these performers are routinely given a group identity as Scottish, by audience members, festival organizers, and other musicians. Frank Manning emphasizes that, “the role of each ritual festival is as a text about its community’s cultural internal social relations and its identity vis-a-vis the outside world.” The significance of the identity-creating interaction between the pipe band “community” and the “outside world” especially plays out in the massed band performances at the opening and closing ceremonies, which represent, for audience members as well as performers, the power of the pipe to galvanize an entire community. This interactive “text' or narrative of identity is also created through the solo and ensemble piping and drumming competitions, which serve, in part, to preserve a centuries-old style of music. The music of these ceremonies and competitions, in its embodiment of accumulated meanings and symbols, acts as a conduit for transmitting a
fused cultural identity that signifies Scottishness to many of its players and audience members.

For full pipe bands, the “official” opening of the 2014 Scotland County Highland Games began at 10:45 a.m., when all of the competition piping and drumming groups lined up their members single file beside the other bands outside an open grassy area approximately half the size of a football field. When the opening ceremony started at 11 a.m., the massed bands marched onto the field, playing the tunes “Scotland the Brave,” “Brown-Haired Maiden,” and “Green Hills of Tyrol.” All three pieces are popular choices in massed band performances, and “Scotland the Brave” in particular is a key tune in the representation of Scottish identity by the pipe band. The bands then stopped, the drum major declared, “At Rest,” and they dismounted drums and pipes but maintained their rank and file positions as the opening ceremony began. A representative from Clan Graham made welcoming remarks, a performer sang the “Star-Spangled Banner,” and some announcements about the games schedule and the attending clans were made. Then, before marching off the field, the massed bands played “Amazing Grace” in the classic solo-ensemble-solo fashion popularized by the Royal Scots Dragoon Guards in 1971.

To learn the music for massed band ceremonies, pipers often download standard settings of popular tunes (“Scotland the Brave,” “Amazing Grace,” “High Road to Gareloch,” and “Green Hills of Tyrol,” to name a few) from one of the pipe band association websites, or, if they do not have access to a computer, they photocopy the printed music of other members of the band. Drummers are also able to access standard “massed band settings” in the same fashion. These drum parts are arranged by meter:
there is a 2/4 massed band setting, a 3/4 setting, a 4/4 setting, and a 6/8 setting, each of which is used for every single tune in that meter, no matter what the pipe melody sounds like. In these universal massed band settings, the lead snare drummer in a band plays each four-bar phrase in a sort of “call-and-response” fashion with the other drummers in his band. Each time, the “lead tip” plays the first two bars of a line and then the other drummers join him in unison on the third and fourth bar. This staggering is referred to as playing “chips” parts (in the 6/8 massed band setting in Figure 6.1, the chips parts are shown with brackets; this is typically how chips are written in all pipe band snare music). The second time through each eight-bar phrase, all of the drummers play the full eight bars, not just the chips.

![Figure 6.1: Massed band “chips.”](image)

The massed band performances are one of the most impressive artistic aspects of a Highland games, and seem, based on my impressions of the audiences, to be attended by most of the visitors to the festivals. Certainly the grandness of the spectacle attracts these visitors, but likely a portion of the attending crowd is drawn by the Highland
material paraphernalia, the extraordinary sound of the music, the emblematic tunes and
instruments, and the military formations. In consideration of Turner’s ideas about identity
processes, certain audience members could be seeking or forming identity through their
observation of the performance. Hermansson emphasizes this type of identity process, as
he specifically describes the act of observing a pipe band as a “narcissitic process” in
which the onlooker identifies with, and even imagines himself to be, a marginal, exotic
“other” that is the piper or drummer:

As the presumptive pipe band enthusiast is struck by the impact of the powerful
sound and sight of the pipes and drums, a dialectic, narcissistic process takes
place within him. The onlooker is impressed by the pipe band, visualizes himself
as a piper or drummer identifying himself with the Other, with that power in front
of him. He imagines himself in his mind to be the Other that makes this impact on
him. In the case of Scottish piping and drumming, the Other is not only
conspicuously colorful and exotic with an impressing powerful sound. Through
its iconic identity, it also carries connotations to power, militarism and romantic
tradition. A desire to be part of or belong to this powerful Other is aroused in the
onlooker. A desire to have that power over others, and maybe also to find security
or even confidence within the seemingly stable untouchable tradition.502

The audience for the opening massed band ceremony at the Scotland County
Highland Games enthusiastically cheered, and many spectators took photos or videos
during the performance. Once all the events were completed at the Scotland County
Games, including the Highland dancing and heavy athletics, the massed bands played as
part of the closing ceremony at 4:30 pm; this performance included a set of “retreat
marches,” or marches in 3/4 time, to signify the end of the day’s activities. These marches
were employed in a similar fashion to the way they were first used by pipe bands in the
nineteenth-century British army: to enact a retreat among the troops.
6.4 Solo and ensemble competitions

Following the opening ceremony at the Scotland County Games, each band returned to its tent, and, since this was the period leading up to the band competitions, performers tuned their instruments and practiced their parts, or talked amongst themselves. This was also a period of heightened nervousness because it was prior to the comps. Immediately before their scheduled competition appearance, the pipe bands all ran through their competition tunes one final time before walking as a unit to the “on deck circle” near the competition circle. As is usual, there was approximately a three-to-five minute wait between the bands as the judges tallied their marks.

Bands are divided into five grades according to proficiency, with Grade One being the highest. (KPD and KUPD each have a Grade Five band and a Grade Four band; this is typical of larger cities that have enough interest to separate the more experienced players who are in the higher grades and the less experienced who are in the lower ones.) These categories have no age restriction. There are also novice and juvenile bands in which all members must be under eighteen, though these are much more common in Scotland than anywhere else (no juvenile bands competed in the 20-plus Highland Games in which I have participated in the Southeast). Grading and eligibility are overseen by the RSPBA, and bands apply for downgrading or upgrading based on performances in prior years. Bands in Grade Four and above must compete in two events: the March, Strathspey & Reel (MSR) event, and the Medley event, which consists of a short selection of music in varying styles and time signatures, chosen and arranged by the band. Competitors in Grade Five play only a Quick March set, which typically consists of three tunes.
The pipe band competitions at the Scotland County Games in 2014 included seven Grade Five bands: the Greater Richmond Pipes & Drums, the Jamestown Pipes & Drums, the John Mohr MacKintosh Pipes & Drums, the Knoxville Pipes & Drums, the North Atlanta Pipes & Drums, the Palmetto Pipes & Drums, and the Wake & District Pipes & Drums. There were seven Grade Four bands (three of which also fielded Grade Fives): the City of Chattanooga Pipe Band, the City of Greenville Pipes & Drums, the Jamestown Pipes & Drums, the Knoxville Pipes & Drums, the Loch Norman Pipe Band, the North Carolina State University Pipes & Drums, and the Wake & District Pipes & Drums. Lastly, there were two Grade Three bands: the Greater Richmond Pipes & Drums, and the St. Andrew's University Pipe Band.

Like the repertoire and competition structure, the regulated manner in which pipe bands perform is a unifying factor for the groups, and harkens back to the military origins of the ensemble, even though civilian bands are part of an entirely recreational subculture. The titles of the pipe major, drum major, and drum sergeant, the style of giving commands during performance, and the fact that the pipe band’s presence in the British army codified the manner in which ensembles dress in uniform, utilize repertoire, and march in rank and file lines, could give the impression that even contemporary recreational pipe bands are “playing military,” in a sense.

During a pipe band performance, the pipe major, as the leader of the ensemble, is responsible for conducting the band by tapping his foot (the tap is typically a full lifting of the foot, not just a raising of the toes with the heel left on the ground). The formation and coordination of a pipe band appears to be universal, whether the group is a Grade
Five band performing at the Scotland County Highland Games, or whether the band is in a Grade One ensemble competition at the Worlds in Scotland (the Worlds are streamed online through the BBC, so watching remotely is easy). To give the most well-balanced sound, the bagpipers, side drummers, and tenor players stand in a circle or semi-circle formation in ensemble competition. There are about six feet, or two arm's lengths, between each of the performers. The bass drummer stands in the middle of the circle, though he is positioned just off-center so that all of the pipers can see one another. Since the bass drummer is the first line of communication between the pipe major and the band, he must be able to see the pipe major, because he follows the pipe major’s foot commands for tempo control. The photo in Figure 6.2 shows the formation of a competition circle, though performed by the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums rather than the Knoxville Pipes and Drums at the Scotland County Games; one of the judges can be seen in the bottom left of the frame.503
To start a piece, the pipe major begins tapping his foot to communicate tempo to the ensemble, and then he gives the verbal command, “Band, to the ready,” followed by the phrase “Quick, march” (no matter whether the piece is a march or not). Both phrases are pronounced in a staccato fashion and are spoken in the quarter-note pulse of the tune to be played. After the word “march,” the drummers play the rolloff, which is two dotted-half-note drum rolls, each followed by a quarter rest. On the start of the second roll (or the downbeat of bar two), the pipers strike in their drones, and then on beat three of that bar, they bring in their chanter before starting the pickups to the tune.

Aesthetically, piping judges are looking for a “clear, voluminous, well-tuned chanter sound, as well as a solid backing of perfectly-in-tune drones.”\textsuperscript{504} Since most pipe band competitions are held outdoors, tuning is not an easy task, as bagpipes are very sensitive to temperature and humidity. Besides tuning, pipers are also graded on accuracy of rhythms and pitches, as well as unison execution, expression, attacks, and cutoffs. Drum judges, like piping judges, score the percussion section on tuning, rhythmic accuracy, and unison playing, but drummers are also rated on the cleanliness of their rolloffs and how well their drum score fits the piping (this aspect of performance is known as the “ensemble”).\textsuperscript{505}

After performing their competition pieces, some bands march off the field with taps to stay in step; others “play out” of the circle, meaning that they play a non-competition tune while reforming their rank and file lines and exiting the competition area. When Kentucky United exits the competition circle, for example, they often play “My Old Kentucky Home” (the state song of Kentucky); the Knoxville Pipes and Drums,
on the other hand, uses “Rocky Top” (the unofficial fight song of the University of Tennessee, Knoxville) for such occasions. Tunes such as “My Old Kentucky Home” and “Rocky Top” help strengthen the ensembles’ connection to their audiences as well as distinguish the bands from one another; since their ceol beag repertoire is often quite similar, performing a regionally-specific popular song gives each band the opportunity to project its own unique sense of American regional identity, along with the Scottish cultural identity and the group identity derived from being part of the piping and drumming subculture.

For every piper and drummer present in a competition band, there is pressure to perform well, and many of the KPD members were nervous before entering the competition circle last October. First, as countless hours of practice time have been spent attempting to perfect a set of tunes, no one band member wants to make a mistake and jeopardize the overall band’s performance, or play poorly in front of the members of his band or those of the other bands who are watching. Second, if the band does not place, it will not receive prize money. In the case of Scotland County, the Grade Five band in the Knoxville Pipes and Drums thought its performance went well. The Grade Four group, unfortunately, was not happy with the ensemble’s tuning or execution; many players also believed that nerves had played a part in their poor performance. After their appearances in the band competitions, many of the players went back to the band’s tent to relax; others stayed to watch the performances of the other bands. The results of the judges’ marks were that the Knoxville Pipes and Drums’ Grade Four band did not place; the Grade Five band, on the other hand, took first place. As is typical at all pipe band competitions, the
members of KPD who stayed overnight discussed the judges’ marks during a somewhat ritualized passing around of the scorecards. Each scorecard is divided into a number of categories, as discussed in Chapter Four; the week after a competition, these grading sheets are often scanned and emailed out to the competition band members by the pipe major.506

Besides the pipe band competition at the Scotland County Highland Games, there were solo competitions in both piping and drumming. Though solo drummers may only compete in the light music category, solo pipers are able to receive awards for their performance of both *pibroch* and *ceol beag*, in the spirit of the historical piping competitions that have taken place since the eighteenth century. Most members of twenty-first century competition bands like KPD participate in solo competitions at least once during their playing careers as a quasi-rite of passage. In solo bagpipe and snare drum competitions, which usually begin in the morning at a Highland Games, and which started at 8 am during the Scotland County Games, light music pipe solos are accompanied by a drummer, but *pibroch* is played unaccompanied; all drum solos, Grade Four and above, are accompanied by a piper. Guidelines for the accompaniment of solo competitors are given on the Eastern United States Pipe Band Association’s website, which states that, “Each snare drumming competitor in grade 4 or higher will be accompanied by a minimum of one (1) and a maximum of two (2) pipers obtained by the competitor, or in the absence of accompaniment, a piping recording may be substituted. It is the responsibility of the competitor to provide the music and tape recorder. Each snare
drumming competitor's performance is evaluated as follows: 1) Rolls 2) Tone 3) Tempo 4) Execution 5) Rhythm and Expression 6) Quality and Variety 7) Blend.**507**

At Laurinburg, about half of the KPD members competed solo; several of them won medals for their performances. Those members who carpooled with soloists who needed to arrive early, but who were not competing themselves, practiced or strolled around in the morning to watch the solo piping and drumming competitions or to view the Highland dancing and the Scottish athletics, which occurred concurrently with the solo piping and drumming events. Some used this time to visit other band tents and socialize with musicians they had met at other Highland games events or during workshops. They also had the option of visiting booths selling food, beer, pipe band gear, and Scottish textiles.

6.5 Elements of Scottish heritage tourism at the Scotland County Games

Heritage tourism is travel undertaken in order to “experience the places, artifacts and activities” that represent the “stories and people of the past.”**508** Heritage tourism is not limiting; an individual does not need to possess a specific ancestry to experience the cultural history of a certain region of the world. Highland festivals like the Scotland County Highland Games are examples of heritage tourism, not only for those whose ancestors were Scottish, but also to anyone who is interested in Scottish music, dance, food, history, or athletics.

Many aspects of heritage tourism at the Scotland County Highland Games tell the story of Scottish identity for the audiences and participants alike. Naturally the sounds of the pipers and drummers tuning, warming up, and performing permeated the air
throughout the day, and conjured an aural impression of the Highlands through the unique sounds of the instruments and their associated repertoire. Visually the identity representations were derived from booths selling food, drink, pipe band gear, historical trinkets, and Scottish textiles. The dress of the Games participants and paying attendees, many of whom were wearing varying costumes of tartan, also served as representations of Scottishness. The Highland dancers were easily identifiable because they wore intricate vests, jackets, and dance-specific costumes that included kilts, shawls, slips, peasant blouses, aprons, halter-tops, stockings, and dance shoes. Most of the athletes wore a kilt, kilt hose, athletic shoes, and a t-shirt (often with the sleeves cut off) designating a sponsor. The pipe band performers, as discussed earlier, wore band-specific uniforms of kilts, kilt hose, flashes, *ghillie brogue* shoes, sporran, dress shirt, band tie, Glengarry hat, and vest. Female athletes and female pipers and drummers wore virtually the same outfits as their male counterparts, moving away from the historical “maleness” of both the heavy athletics tradition and the piping and drumming circuit.

The spectators were dressed in a wide variety of outfits: some in regular summer clothes, some in normal clothes but with one or two added “Scottish” elements (for example, a kilt-like plaid skirt on a woman, or man wearing a t-shirt with a clan crest on it), some men wearing Utilikilts (a brand of kilts designed to be more functional, with the addition of deep pockets and breathable fabric), and some women wearing “Highland Renaissance wench” costumes: full velvet skirts, velvet aprons, revealing peasant blouses, and a tartan sash. For the patrons who dressed in costume at the Scotland County Games, historical authenticity was probably not a primary goal; most of those who were
dressed partially or fully in costume wore costumes or fashion accessories that reinforced stereotypes of Scottishness (plaid, argyle, *Braveheart* t-shirts, and so forth). It might even be apropos to call some of the fully-costumed attendants “cosplayers,” since they were, in essence, role playing by wearing costumes designed to represent the theme or idea of Scottishness.

In Laurinburg, there were plenty of options for men, women, and children to be cultural tourists. The open field where the massed band performances and athletic competitions took place was surrounded on all sides by tents and vendor stands selling a range of Scottish goods, including various clan items: badges, tartans, kilt pins, stickers, flasks, books, and scarves. There were also kilts for men, women, children, and even babies, along with bagpipes, sheet music for pipes and drums, kilt belts, kilt hose, sporrans, *sgian dubh* daggers, and Glengarry hats. As discussed earlier in this dissertation, in some transformations of Scottish heritage in North America, “Scottishness” has become intertwined with “Celticness.” This intermingling was evident at the Scotland County Highland Games (as it is at many Highland festivals), during which vendors sold Celtic clothing, jewelry, decor, musical recordings, and books about Celtic folklore and arts.

Those desiring to take a culinary tour of Scotland during the Games had a wide variety of options available. Along with typical fair food, such as hot dogs, burgers, ice cream, and fried desserts, food trucks and stalls sold haggis, Irn-Bru (an orange soda popular in Scotland), Scottish meat pastries called bridies, and, in an inclusion of wider
traditions from the British Isles, fish and chips, shepherd’s pie, cottage pie, and bangers and mash.

The Scotland County Games are fairly small, so beyond shopping, eating, and watching athletic and artistic performances, attendees were only able to watch the herding demonstrations of sheep dogs that are popular at many Highland games. At some of the larger Highland festivals such as the Stone Mountain Highland Games in Georgia and the Greenville Scottish Games in South Carolina, Scottish cultural tourism also includes displays of Scottish fiddling and Scottish country dancing. At larger events such as these, Scottish cultural history is sometimes melded with medieval lore, and there are demonstrations of falconry, metalworking, axe and knife throwing, and even fencing and jousting.

Besides vendors and food stalls, there were also clan tents around the perimeter of the performance field. At the Scotland Highland Games in 2014, the featured clan, or the “honor clan,” was Clan Graham; this explains why the representative from that group made the opening remarks at the Scotland County Games (the “honor clan” rotates each year from among the clans who typically send representatives to the festival). There were 36 clan organizations who had booths at the Laurinburg Games, as well as eight St. Andrews Societies and Scottish heritage organizations; this number of groups is typical of the Highland games I have attended. Each clan booth displayed at least one variety of clan tartan, and each was staffed by a man or a woman (or a small group) clad in Highland dress, ready to discuss clan and surname histories with interested parties. Because being able to align oneself with a clan offers a similar feeling of group identity
to the *communitas* fostered by participation in a pipe band, these booths seem to be popular stops for many visitors at Highland games. Some clan stalls were also selling merchandise (clan magnets, postcards of castles, plaid stuffed animals). All of the clans present at the Scotland County Highland Games marched in the parade of tartans during the opening ceremony, supplementing the sense of Scottish identity projected by the pipe band instruments and repertoire.

6.6 Conclusion

For North Americans of Scottish descent, Highland festivals like the Scotland County Highland Games are places where they can rediscover their roots, or experience what it is to be Scottish without actually setting foot in Scotland. As Frank Manning highlights, “traditional ritual festivals constitute, symbolically, a way of recalling the origins—whether mystical or historical—of the cultural group or community of people. The importance of history and its enactment and re-enactment in the ritual seems to be an especially important element in creating identity.” At Highland games, the clan and heritage organizations, the Scottish dancers and athletes, and the unison performances of traditional songs such as “Highland Laddie” unite all participants and audiences in a sense of Scottish identity.

In particular, participating in the ritual massed band performances and pipe band competitions at Highland games serve to unite pipers and drummers in an enactment of Scottishness. These intense rituals are occasions when cultural identity can be created and maintained, and also feelings of self-awareness and participation in common experiences reaffirmed. For these musicians, perhaps the embodied representation of Scottishness at a
Highland Games like the Scotland County Highland Games is the most important element; perhaps the highlight is the self or group identity that is derived from musical performance in the subculture of piping and drumming.

Through a detailed exploration of the 2014 Scotland County Highland Games, Chapter Six has illustrated how the modern pipe band’s performance rituals and material culture act as a vehicle for cultural identity creation. Chapter Seven will revisit these ideas, and will tie them to those advanced in Chapters One through Five.
CHAPTER SEVEN: CONCLUSION

7.1 Introduction

This dissertation set out to examine the pipe band’s role in the production of cultural identity and tradition throughout the Scottish diaspora in North America. Built on new primary research as well as consultation of untapped secondary sources, it offered a historical overview of the Great Highland bagpipes and pipe bands of the Scottish past as prelude to their later impact in North America from the nineteenth century to the present. It employed the case studies of two pipe bands, the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums and the Knoxville Pipes and Drums, providing a detailed study of the two ensembles as bearers and interpreters of Scottishness. It also utilized an ethnography of the Scotland County Highland Games to reveal how cultural and communal identity are present in the performance occasions of piping and drumming groups.

Perhaps the most difficult and intriguing aspects of this study centered on questions of identity: not only the recognition of varied types of identity represented in the pipe band of the past and present, but the consideration of ways that cultural, national, communal, and individual identities have interacted and intersected in the history and practices of this ensemble. Important in this exploration has been the attempt to understand the nature of identity construction, not as a fixed phenomenon, but as a dynamic process. Although the emphases on “process” emerged more clearly in the chapters devoted to the contemporary civilian or recreational pipe band in North America, the active shaping of Scottish identity through the historical pipe band’s long
history of accumulated symbols and repertoire, could certainly be viewed as a historical process of identity formation.

7.2 The Historic Role of the Bagpipes and the Pipe Band in the Creation, Reinforcement and Retention of Identity

As demonstrated in this dissertation, the Great Highland bagpipes and the pipe band played a key role in creating, reinforcing, and retaining tradition and identity throughout history, both in Scotland and the lands of the Scottish diaspora. Though bagpipes are a universal folk instrument, for centuries they have had a particularly symbolic role in Scottish history. The sound of pipes was supposed to awaken clan pride, strength, and endurance of soul in Highland fighters, which made them feel invincible on the battlefield; the manner in which bagpipes were later used to rally troops in the Scottish regiments of the British Army reflects a continuity with this clan tradition. Other centuries-old pibrochs, such as MacCrimmon’s Lament, illustrate the use of pipes to mourn the fallen, serving as a precursor to the modern-day presence of solo pipers or pipe bands at service funerals.

By the time of the Second Jacobite Rising in 1745, the bagpipes’ symbolic association had become evident beyond the Highlands. As evidenced by archival papers and letters, period newspaper articles, and extant instruments, some of the Highland clan leaders who supported Charles Edward Stewart brought along their bagpipers to play in the Jacobite army, where the pipes, along with elements of Highland dress, were adopted by the Jacobite army as emblems of their cause. Following the Risings, when the British government tried to suppress remnants of Jacobite activity by forbidding Highlanders to
wear tartan and speak Gaelic, and prosecuting bagpipers such as James Reid, both
Highlanders and Lowlanders deliberately embraced the arts and material culture of the
Highlands as national symbols of Scottish identity.

During the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, increasingly exoticized
portrayals of the Highlands and the Highlanders were depicted in period British literature
and poetry, including the writings of Sir Walter Scott, James Macpherson, and Robert
Burns. Through historicized representations of kilted bagpipers and rugged clan fighters,
quaint descriptions of Scottish customs, and the romantic imagery of the Highlands, these
authors managed to create a fanciful Scotland that appealed to the British public and
morphed the once-feared Highlander into a “noble savage” that was devoid of all threat.
This nostalgic perception of Scottishness, known as Highlandism, became wildly popular
in the nineteenth century. Some scholars, such as Murray Pittock, connect Highlandism
with the imperial subtext of the Primitivist movement: the Highlander was tamed by the
British government in order to take advantage of his “primitive ferocity” and fashion him
into a “formidable fighting machine” used to expand the British Empire.510

During the Crimean War, the Second Boer War, and World Wars I and II, the pipes
and drums of the British Army pipe bands had great effects on the morale of the troops in
Scottish regiments. This fact is evidenced by the quotations of George Ives (the 111-year-
old last surviving veteran of the Second Boer War in the 1990s) and Harry Lunan (the
piper who continued to play, despite heavy enemy fire, during World War II’s Battle of
the Somme), who noted that the sound of the pipers giving the troops courage during
fighting. Bagpipers also played during funerals, continuing the enduring association of
the use of the pipes to lament fallen comrades. Over time, as Grant Lawrence Kerr states, “pipe bands became a summarizing symbol for all that is Scottish. Part and parcel of British imperialism, pipe bands were transmitted to all parts of the former British empire.”

7.3 Production and Consumption of Identity in Contemporary Civilian Pipe Bands

In the late nineteenth century, pipe bands transitioned to become largely civilian entities, but during my research, I was surprised how many elements in contemporary civilian bands are still tied to the traditional structure and function of the bands to the British Army. These include the internal structure and leadership of the bands (pipe major, drum sergeant, quartermaster, and so forth), standard tempos and repertoire (drill pace for the British Army influenced musical tempos, works like “Flowers of the Forest” came to popularity through their use in the British Army, and marches are the most popular genre of pieces played by civilian pipe bands), the performance occasions (pipe bands often march in rank and file for parades, and small groups of pipers and drummers perform at service funerals), and the set manner in which each pipe band performs (to start a piece, all pipe majors give a staccato, in-time command: “Band, to the ready… quick, march,” which is then followed by a roll-off). Perhaps most importantly, the “pride in ancestry and strength of spirit” mentioned so commonly in quotations from soldiers in the British Army’s Highland regiments have also been retained in the largely civilian ensemble.

Other elements in the modern civilian pipe band show a great shift in meaning from the ensemble’s military and clan past, including the facts that women now play and
hold leadership positions in the groups today, and wear uniforms that were once specifically designed to be only for men. These practices illustrate that the representative male dominance of the tradition, although still in place symbolically, has been modified by the participation of women. The emphasis on competition in bands of today is also a significant change from the past: many performers, as I discovered in my interviews, specifically tie elements of their identity as pipers and drummers to their participation in the competition circuit.

I postulated that the imaginative cultural narratives in twenty-first-century pipe bands are Scottish-themed; I hypothesized that patterns of tradition and identity creation would be evident in standard instrumentation, dress, performance occasions, repertoire, and even the set manner in which each group performs. I found these connections to be exemplified in my case studies of the Kentucky United Pipes and Drums and the Knoxville Pipes and Drums, and my ethnography of the Scotland County Highland Games. Moreover, as a member of these bands, and a researcher of their practices, I became aware of the special contributions that the music of the pipe band made in continuing Scottish traditions and forging new Scottish-inspired identities. As Simon Frith states in *Performing Rites*: “Music constructs our sense of identity through the experiences it offers of the body, time and sociability, experiences which enable us to place ourselves in imaginative cultural narratives.” As in past centuries, the musicians involved in piping and drumming have an important status as bearers and interpreters of Scottish cultural identity, as purveyors of “ethnic markers,” or, in other words, the accrued symbolism of pipe band music and practices.
Tartan patterns, kilts, Glengarry hats, sporran pouches, ghillie brogue shoes, and sgian dubh daggers are common elements of Highland folk costume, and in my research, it was clear that these articles act as identity emblems for different pipe bands. In most circumstances today, pipe bands choose their accessories to match their kilts, which in turn are selected based on the patronage of a specific clan society, on the certified tartan of a state or province (as with Kentucky United), or, on economic concerns (such as when Knoxville Pipes and Drums bought used kilts because of their discounted price). These practices represent a marked shift from the original association of tartan identity with geographic location, and even from the later alignment of tartans with clans and septs.

Through rehearsals and performances with KUPD and KPD, and by researching sheet music and method books, I affirmed that the pipe band’s repertoire is also emblematic of Scottishness. The unique lilt to the music, the bagpipe gracings and embellishments, the rhythmic intricacies of the drum passages, and the Scottish snap found so commonly in strathspeys all evoke a sense of identity. Likewise, the types of pieces played by each band (marches, reels, and strathspeys, for example) have been performed by pipe bands for many years, and are played in standard fashions with 16- or 32-bar AABB structure, and, because of their short length, often in sets of three pieces. The methods of learning the music, however, are different today: oral traditions such as cantairreachd have largely been replaced by sheet music. Through the practice of offering free lessons, though, pipe bands like KUPD and KPD still foster palpable connections between instructors and students, similar to the strength with which clan pipers passed traditions on to their apprentices.
The manipulation and renegotiation of tradition became evident in my examination of some of the most popular tunes in the pipe band repertoire. In particular, “Amazing Grace” was included on the set list of every single band I investigated, and was cited by many people I spoke with, including Barbara Willard and Douglas Johnson, as being an especially significant and meaningful piece. As seen with “Amazing Grace,” it is possible for a pipe band to appropriate a composition that was important in the American context but not originally associated with Scottish music, and shift it to a quintessential role in the social process of performance at Highland games and funerals. A similar renegotiation of tradition and identity occurs when a Scottish pipe band like KUPD plays its “Irish sets” during parades or holiday performances; in this scenario, the traditionally Scottish piping and drumming ensemble expands a great deal to accommodate a larger “pan Celtic” identity.

In many ways, the conclusion that playing in a pipe band established a feeling of Scottish identity was indeed borne out in my research. A large percentage of the members of KUPD and KPD do have Scottish heritage (70-80%), and, as expected, for many, pipe band participation does serve to honor their ancestry. For pipers such as Kay Irwin and Reed Bagley, playing in the pipe band helps them search for their roots; it represents a tradition, or an ethnic identity that brings them closer to their familial homeland. In this way, playing pipes is a way to live their heritage, and celebrating their heritage is one way of understanding their own identity. As such, the ritual massed band performances and pipe band competitions at Highland games, as well as heritage celebrations like the Kirking of the Tartan, serve to unite members in an enactment of Scottishness. These
intense rituals are occasions when cultural and national identity can be created, maintained, and feelings of self-awareness and participation in common experiences reaffirmed. In particular, competing at Highland games festivals allows many pipe band members to feel part of something much larger than themselves, as Keith Goins described. The clan and heritage organizations, the Scottish dancers and athletes, and the unison performances of traditional songs such as “Highland Laddie” allow participants to show what it means to them to be of Scottish ancestry.

As stated above, I did anticipate that my dissertation would prove that participation in a pipe band fosters a sense of Scottish identity. I did not expect, though, that this sense of Scottishness would also be mixed with other types of identity. It was difficult reconciling how group identity, family identity, and individual identity could coexist with cultural identity.

First, it became clear in my interviews that, besides Scottish identity, participation in a pipe band created a sense of community and collective identity in the performers. According to William Bloom, “A shared group identification can be triggered only by meaningful and real experience.” This statement speaks to the integrative function of pipe bands: pipers and drummers spend a large amount of time in each other’s company. The year-round schedule for rehearsals, concerts, and parades strengthens ties between the pipers and drummers, and, in a sense, regularly brings them together as a group apart. In a larger sense, this *communitas* may be reflective of the fact that as a part of their cultural heritage, certain segments of American society position themselves outside the cultural “norm,” longing for the distinction that comes from functioning as a subculture.
Perhaps this desire for communal activities in pipe band participants can be interpreted as a reaction to economic, political, and cultural globalization and mainstreaming, as they search for a “meaningful community” in their shared affinity for cultural activities and musical participation; as such, this same desire might be reflected in other cultural groups in society. In any case, socialization, for many pipers and drummers, is the important part of rehearsals and performances (and for some members, it may be their only hobby and repeated social interaction). Indeed, an appreciation for the sense of community created through making music together came up frequently in my discussions with the members of KUPD and KPD. KUPD bass drummer Lance Dahl stated that his favorite part of the band was the friendships he made with the other musicians. KPD members Beth Morgan and Chris Riedl both said they valued above all the camaraderie and friendship of the other band members.

The pull of family connections was also powerful to the people that I interviewed. Attending rehearsals and performances for KUPD and KPD gives spouses such as Angela and Tracy Wilson, parents and children like Warren and Haley Mays, and siblings, including Raegan and Renae Dishman, a chance to spend time together. By playing in the same pipe band, they create a shared sense of identity through a common activity in addition to their family bond. This desire to play in the pipe band because of family connections echoes the patrilineal tradition of clan bagpiping, though today, of course, this tradition is not just patrilineal.

While speaking with some of the pipers and drummers in KUPD and KPD, I was initially surprised that the reason for some performers’ participation seemed not to be
from group or cultural interest, but from the desire for personal fulfillment. This was
exemplified by those informants who mentioned that competition and challenge was
paramount to their involvement in the band. Accumulating knowledge of different pipe
band tunes, embellishments, rhythmic combinations, performers, and ensembles, as well
as improving musical skills, is a powerful motivator to these people, and is the primary
focus of their activity during practice and performance. For them, learning to master
something that few people know how to do gives them confidence and identity. In this
way, their individual concepts of Scottishness or its associated cultural values, are either
secondary or, perhaps, nonexistent.

Connecting the different senses of Scottish, group, family, and individual identity
was a struggle for me at first, but then I realized that these types of identity do not have to
be mutually exclusive. As Estelle Jorgensen reminds us, “The notion of ‘identity’ is itself
an imaginary construction, an ambiguous, fuzzy and complex notion that is subjective
and objective, individual and collective, normative and descriptive, malleable and
committed, dynamic and static.” In my interpretation, this idea led me to the
understanding that the reasons people play in pipe bands could be interconnected; the
work of Victor Turner, Mats Hermansson, and Mark Slobin was also instrumental in my
arrival at this conclusion. Essentially, the multiple themes that surface from the case
studies indicate that no simple answer can be offered to explain the nature of people’s
participation in a pipe band. Simultaneously, the ensemble serves as a symbol of ethnic
identity in many ways and for many people, but also as a cherished form of musical
expression that is aesthetically pleasing and emotionally satisfying in its own right.

213
Though I believe that KUPD and KPD can be taken as representative bands from North America, it is likely that researching different ensembles would probably highlight different aspects of the subculture, and even suggest alternative interpretations of it. There are perhaps as many personal perspectives on the pipe band scene as there are people involved in it. Certainly many other people could have made interesting contributions, and even the individuals consulted will may change their opinions with the passage of time. Like the constant renegotiation of tradition, individual perceptions and understandings of one’s relationship with the pipe band subculture are constantly being debated, changed, and redefined.

7.4 Larger Connections; Avenues for Future Research

Understanding the role played by Highlandism, as well as authentic and invented traditions, was essential in my analysis. As highlighted by scholars such as Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger, the Highlandist movement was founded partially on “invented” traditions. James Macpherson falsely claimed to have translated the work of Ossian. Sir Walter Scott embellished historic storylines and clan customs. The “Sobieski Stuarts” posed as descendants of the royal Stuart line and unscrupulously marketed their Vestiarium Scoticum as a reproduction of an ancient manuscript. Textile mills produced large bolts of “ancient” hunting and dress sets of the clan-specific tartans derived from the patterns and colors displayed in this manual with very little evidence of historical accuracy.

Reconciling Highlandism’s romantic portrayal of Scotland was important to my study, particularly in my ethnography of the Scotland County Highland Games, in which
I needed to draw connections between authentic traditions and the imagined cultural narratives staged at the Games. I was forced to consider the question: how does one evaluate authenticity as a means of preserving a tradition? Is it even possible, when traditions change over time, and when the lines between authentic and inauthentic can be blurry? Do the Scotland County Games participants and visitors really connect with Scottish music, food, people, and scenery, or do they identity with their own constructed images of them?

At the Games, shared perceptions of past and present are utilized to create a comfortable social space and support a particular set of cultural values. Because there are not “live” Highland clan cultures in existence, this type of event is as close as people can get to firsthand experience of them. Yes, these images are often based on stereotypes, but there are real elements woven into the “inventions.” As discussed in Chapter Two, there are aspects of what Hobsbawm and Ranger, as well as Hugh Trevor-Roper, would call “invented” traditions that—though they may have shifted meaning over time—are certainly based on reality. Trevor-Roper claims that the kilt was an imagined national dress conjured up by Thomas Rawlinson in the mid-eighteenth century, but tartan and plaid have been in regular use since at least the early seventeenth century (and continental images and accounts of tartan worn by Scots date back thousands of years). Hugh Cheape asserts that the modern three-drone Great Highland bagpipes were essentially invented by two pipe makers in Edinburgh in the nineteenth century, yet a three-drone model of the Great Highland Bagpipe, as being played by a piper wearing a pleated, knee-length garment that looks exactly like a kilt, is clearly shown in the 1714 painting *Piper to the*
Therefore we should not consider even the “imagined Scotland” portrayed in Laurinburg simply as a product of idealization and mythologization. Tradition, after all, is a dynamic concept, rather than a fixed one. Perhaps, then, the most important thing is that across the world today, Scots and non-Scots alike are able to use this imagery and material culture, promoted by the bagpipes and the pipe band, to celebrate Scottish identity.

Besides the pipe band, there are many other musical subcultures that foster feelings of cultural identity in their participants. What I have discovered about the pipe band and diasporic Scottishness in the United States could also be true of other music and dance traditions associated with a history of societal outmigration, such as Balkan brass bands, Irish step dance, Trinidadian tassa drumming, Nuyorican salsa, and so on. Certainly drawing connections between the pipe band and these various affinity groups and the subcultures in which they exist would be an interesting avenue for future study, and would further explore the relationship between diasporic populations, music, and cultural identity. Another avenue for future research could center on how pipe band membership will respond to the decrease in respondents claiming Scottish heritage in the past two United States censuses; still another could explore the study of “whiteness” in relation to Scottishness and the pipe band subculture. Other studies could expand on the pipe band’s relationship to heritage tourism in different regions of North America. Finally, it would be very interesting to confront additional questions of gender and race, both historical and contemporary, in the piping and drumming subculture.
7.5 Epilogue

The ideas, concepts, and values attached to the pipe band subculture today are a means of connecting pipers and drummers with multiple overlapping forms of identity, both in the present and in the past, and without the combination of the wide historical angle and the ethnographic studies used in this research, the impact of the bagpipes and the pipe band on identity would not have been as easily understood. On the micro level, this research has illustrated how participants in the pipe band channel group cultural expression. In a larger sense, it shows how pervasive the concept of ancestral heritage is in selected subcultures of American society, and how music acts as a medium for transmitting cultural identity therein.
The term “bagpipes” will be used in this plural form throughout this dissertation. Though the singular “bagpipe” is equally correct, it is much more common to hear bagpipers (whether they are from Scotland, the United States, Canada, or other diasporic lands) speak of playing “the pipes” or a “set of pipes.”

Pipe band snare drums are also commonly referred to as “side drums.”

“Kiltophiles” were Scots who, after the post-Jacobite outlawing of the Gaelic language, the clan tartans, and the bagpipes as emblems of war in 1745, deliberately began to embrace them as national symbols of Scottish independence. This practice is often referred to as “tartanization.”

A diaspora refers to the dispersion of a population group from their original homeland.

This affinity developed primarily during the reigns of the latter four British monarchs from the House of Hanover: George III (r. 1760-1820), George IV (r. 1820-1830), William IV (r. 1830-1837), and Victoria (r. 1837-1901).


The appropriation of Scottish soldiers and pipers into the British Army, and the complexity of an underlying Scottish identity therein, will be discussed in Chapter Three.


Though the pipe band is a Scottish, not Irish, ensemble, its instruments and repertoire are sometimes used to symbolize a pan-Celtic identity. This will be discussed further in this chapter in the “Limitations” section.

Cannon, Highland Bagpipe, 153.


From the 1980s until 2013, there was also a Southern United States Pipe Band Association, which included 17 groups; those bands have since been absorbed by the Eastern United States Pipe Band Association.


This study does not include all possible ideas of “Scottishness,” which almost certainly varied among groups of settlers of Scottish origin, including the Scots-Irish, in North America; I will address these limitations in section 1.2.
The Highland Clearances occurred between the late-eighteenth and mid-nineteenth centuries when Highland landlords forcibly expelled thousands of poor residents with the desire to clear larger plots of land for more profitable agricultural endeavors such as sheep farming.


A *ceilidh* (pronounced “kay-lee”) is a traditional Gaelic social gathering that often includes music and dance.

Beginning in the 1820s, these festivals included Scottish athletic events, dancing, and musical performances by pipe bands. Modern Scottish festivals—particularly Highland games—also include “kilt rock” groups and traditional Scottish folk ensembles.


The term “Celtic” refers to the descendants of the Celtic tribes that populated areas of Europe (specifically the British Isles) beginning in the Iron Age, and today the term is used to signify anything linked to the modern or ancient cultures (religions, music, manuscripts, and artifacts) of historically-Celtic areas.


*Seisiuns* or “sessions” are scheduled musical gatherings where people sit in and jam to traditional tunes.


There are a number of dissertations on the bagpipes, but to my knowledge, there are only a few that address the pipe band as a whole in any great detail.

The adjective “post-diasporic” is typically used in reference to the time period that occurs a generation or more after the diaspora.


Historically, “Scotch-Irish” was more common than “Scots-Irish,” since people from Scotland were referred to as “Scotchmen”; but the modern term for a man from Scotland is a “Scotsman,” so correspondingly, the term has shifted from “Scotch-Irish” to “Scots-Irish” in more recent years.


Ibid.


Ibid.

Ray, Highland Heritage, 47.


Ibid.


Pittock, Scottish Nationality, 21.

Andrew Milner and Jeff Browitt, Contemporary Cultural Theory, 139.


Hobsbawm and Ranger, eds., *The Invention of Tradition*, 1.

Ibid.


Ray, *Highland Heritage*.

Ray, Highland Heritage, xi.


Paul F. Moulton, “Imagining Scotland in Music: Place, Audience, and Attraction” (Ph.D. Diss, Florida State University, 2008). Moulton’s research investigates the origins of Scottish identity, but his musical focus is on songbooks, opera, and the concert hall and not at all on bagpipes or the pipe band.


Erin Columbus Doyle, “The Community is the Culture: Festivity, Community Identity and Ethnicity at the Antigonish Highland Games” (MA Thesis, Memorial University, 2005).


Piobaireachd (pronounced “pea-bruck”), also known as Ceol Mor, is the formally structured solo music of the Highland bagpipes.

Ceol beag (pronounced “kyol beg”) means “light music;” this repertoire includes marches and dances such as reels and strathspeys.


Mats D. Hermansson, “From Icon to Identity: Scottish Piping and Drumming in Scandinavia” (Ph.D. Diss., Göteborg University, 2003).

Francis M. Collinson, Bagpipe, Fiddle, and Harp (Newtongrange, Scotland: Lang Syne, 1983).


Cannon, Highland Bagpipe.


Cheape, *Bagpipes*.


Septs are branches of clans.


Ibid., 187.

Prior to this point, Scotland and England had been ruled by the same monarch, but they were separate states with separate legislatures.


Known as the Black Watch because of the members’ tartan, this police force was eventually established as the first Highland regiment.

The number shown after the title of each act is its chapter number. This signifies the year of the reign in which the parliamentary session was held and the sequential number of the act of all the acts passed in that session.

Another anti-Jacobite act came before this period, the 1715 Highland Services Act c. 54 20 Geo. 2 (commonly called the Clan Act).

*Chronological Table and Index of the Statutes* (London: Her Majesty’s Stationery Office by Eyre and Spottiswoode, 11th edition, 1890).


The term “heavy athletics” collectively refers to traditional Highland sporting events such as the caber toss, the hammer throw, the stone throw, and the sheaf toss.

Technically the word “clan” has also been used for centuries to refer to family groups in the Lowlands as well, though this is not as common a reference.


Martin Martin, *A Description of the Western Islands of Scotland: Containing a Full Account of Their Situation, Extent, Soils, Products, Harbours, Bays, ... With a New Map of the Whole, ... To which is Added a Brief Description of the Isles of Orkney, and Schetland* (London, England: Andrew Bell, 1716). Digitized by the National Library of Scotland and accessed October 4, 2014, at https://archive.org/stream/descriptionofwes00mart#page/n3/mode/2up.

There are numerous tartan designers and warehouses in Scotland that manufacture tartans. It is even possible for individuals or organizations to design their own tartans online with the help of websites such as Scots Web, which has a special “tartan designer” application page.


GD71/23, Title bond by Andrew Munro, December 14, 1615, National Archives of Scotland, Edinburgh.

GD1/504/44, Account of legal expenses and for tartan, etc. 2 sheets, Documents relating to the family of Menzies of Weem, 1622, National Archives of Scotland, Edinburgh.

Katherine Grant to Lilias Murray, Papers of the Ogilvy family, Earls of Seafield (Seafield Papers) n.d. but sometime between 1640 and 1649, National Archives of Scotland, Edinburgh.

Papers of the Campbell Family, Earls of Breadalbane (Breadalbane Muniments), July 15, 1675, National Archives of Scotland, Edinburgh.


Ibid., 22.

I viewed this painting in the National Gallery of Scotland in Edinburgh, but the painting can also be viewed online at: http://www.nationalgalleries.org/collection/artists-a-z/w/artist/john-michael-wright/object/lord-mungo-murray-am-morair-mungo-moireach-1668-1700-son-of-1st-marquess-of-atholl-pg-997.


Interestingly, the pipes are resting on his right shoulder, not the left, as is more common nowadays.

RH19/36. Envelope bears printed label 726. Rectangular piece of tartan, with triangular corner portion missing, 14 x 10 cms. See file A/1240, 1745, National Archives of Scotland, Edinburgh.

Visitors to the Archives are only allowed to request a photograph of the tartan (which I did), not to view the fabric itself. This restriction seems to emphasize how important tartan has become to the idea of Scottish nationalism.


“The Contents of the Sea-Chest on board the Pretender’s Ship, bound for Scotland,” accessed in the seventeenth and eighteenth Century Burney Collection Newspapers, *London Post*, 1745. Another type of bagpipes popular during this time was the French musette, which had conventional drones replaced by a cylinder or “shuttle” which contain four or six drones. According to the National Piping Centre Museum in Glasgow, Charles Edward Stuart, aka Bonnie Prince Charlie, owned and possibly played a set of these chamber pipes.

GD248/48/3, Grant correspondence, Jan-Feb 1746, Letter 9. Governor George Grant, Fort George, to Ludovick Grant, Scottish National Archives, Edinburgh.


“Neil MacLean,” Bute Collection from the National Museums of Scotland, National Piping Centre Museum, Glasgow.

*Pibroch*, pronounced “pee-bruckh,” is also spelled *piobaireachd*. It is the “Great Music” of the Highland pipes, a repertory of extended and complex tunes, dating mainly to the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, that commemorate clan gatherings and battles, salute clan chieftains, and lament the death of leading men. It is typically performed in theme and variations form.

GB248/27/2, Papers selected for, and partly noted in, “The Chiefs of Grant,” by William Fraser, LLD, “Circumstantial account of the exhibition on the great Highland pipes in Dunn's Assembly Rooms,” October 22, 1783, Scottish National Archives, Edinburgh.

Both St. Fillans and Braemar host large, well-attended Highland games festivals every year.


James Macpherson, *The Poems of Ossian, the Son of Fingal, Translated by James Macpherson, Esq.* (Galsgow, Scotland: Cameron and Murdoch, 1797); digitized by the National Library of Scotland, https://archive.org/details/poemsofossianson07macp. The National Library includes the following description with the digitization: “In fact written largely by James Macpherson.”

(And, as an aside, these Sir Walter Scott works later inspired Hector Berlioz’s *Rob Roy* and *Waverley* overtures.)


Scott first visited the borders of the Highlands as a boy. While studying at Edinburgh University during the early 1790s, he began traveling to the Highlands more extensively.


GD157/2548, August 17, 1822, “Levee is well over,” letter from Harriet Scott to Anne Scott, Scottish National Archives.

“The Queen’s Visit to Scotland” from *The Belfast News-Letter*, Tuesday, September 13, 1842.

Tacksmen were tenants who held leases, or tacks, of land from estates. Many sublet them to farmers.


Campey, *Unstoppable Force*, 255.

Ibid., 32.

Ibid., 35.


Ibid., xix.

Ibid., 6.


Ibid., 96.


My own Scottish ancestors were all present in the States by this point; the last of them, my great-great-grandfather, John Crooks, came to New York from Glasgow on the Anchoria on August 23, 1882, at the age of 26.


McCarthy, A Global Clan, 13.

Campey, Unstoppable Force, 214.


Campey, Unstoppable Force, 219.


Emily Donaldson, Scottish Highland Games, 25.

Ibid., 25.


McCarthy, A Global Clan, 89.

“Highland Games at St. Fillans,” National Piping Centre Museum plaque, Glasgow, Scotland.

John Eddowes Bowman, The Highlands and Islands: a Nineteenth Century Tour. (Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan, 1986), 67. Diary entries from the trip date to 1825; diary was not published until 1986.

Emily Donaldson, Scottish Highland Games, 26.
Ibid., 28.

Ibid., 28.

Ibid., 32.


Ibid., 199.


Technical Committee of the Scottish Official Highland Dancing Association, *The A.B.C. of Highland Dancing & Games Directory* (Midlothian, Scotland: Kinmor Music, 1994), 61-84. (This publication is twenty years old, and is no longer being updated, but I did not locate a central website that lists all of the Highland games throughout the world today.)

Ibid., 87-111.

Ibid., 61-84.

Ibid., 87-111.


Or imaginary remembrance, since many of the participants have never been to Scotland and are not first-generation immigrants.


Pittock, *Scottish Nationality*, 3.

Ibid.


Paul Basu, *Highland Homecomings*, 68.


Ibid., 23.

Photo by author.


The Eistedfodd is a Welsh cultural festival somewhat similar to a Scottish Highland games.


Vincenzo Galilei, *Dialogo Della Musica Antica Et Della Moderna of Vincenzo Galilei*, and Robert Henry Herman, translation and commentary (Denton, TX: North Texas State University, 1973), 247.


Photo by author.

Cheape is the former head of the Scottish Material Culture Research Centre at the National Museums of Scotland in Edinburgh.


Non-lexical vocables are syllables not connected with words. In canntairreachd, they do have specific musical meanings, though; they are associated with particular musical sounds, as well as the hand movements required to produce them on the pipes.

Canntaireachd is pronounced “can-truckh,” with a guttural “-ch” sound.


According to the documentary Great Highland Pipe, Instrument of War, Part 3: When the Pipers Play, during this period, the Isle of Skye alone supplied the British Army with more than 10,000 soldiers.

The term “line regiments” is used to refer to non-specializing regiments in an army. “Fencible” regiments were army regiments raised in Britain and the colonies for defense against the threat of invasion during the late eighteenth century.


Ibid.

Ibid.

GD427/303, Military correspondence to George Gillanders, Brahan Castle and Stornoway, February 1778, Scottish National Archives, Edinburgh.


John G. Gibson, *Traditional Gaelic Bagpiping*, 111.


Ibid., 4.


MacDonald’s claims about the bagpipes being unique to Scotland are exaggerated, as evidenced by the instrument’s history that is detailed earlier in this chapter.

Donald MacDonald, *A Collection of Highland Vocal Airs* (Kilmore, Scotland: Donald MacDonald, 1784), 12.

“Angus Mackay,” Museum Plaque, National Piping Centre, Glasgow.

This Mackay collection includes arrangements with piano accompaniment, possibly designed to make it appealing to performers of other instruments in salon-style settings.


Ibid.


Tenor and bass drums were added to civilian bands during the late nineteenth century.


Ibid., 3.

Ibid., 26.

A fife is a small, thin transverse flute that is similar to a piccolo.
The tattoo was the signal for the men to secure their posts and prepare for bedtime.


When the Pipers Play.

Liner notes to The Last Piper, a tribute CD to Harry Lunan by Stuart Shedden, Roddy McLeod, Gordon Walker, and Angus McColl (Highland Classics, 2008).

IWM (Q71103) Royal Archives, Windsor Collection. Portrait of Pipe Major John Macdonald, 72nd Highlanders, with bagpipes, photo taken by Joseph Cundall and Robert Howlett between 1854 and 1856.


Pipers in the Trenches, BBC Scotland documentary, accessed October 16, 2015, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=4oXiAu3P0LM.

Ibid.


Pipers in the Trenches, BBC Scotland documentary, accessed October 16, 2015, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=4oXiAu3P0LM.

Ibid.

This is a possible allusion to the “Dance of Death” trope of other skeletal musicians (xylophonists, hurdy gurdy players, etc.) found in European manuscripts and artwork, such as that of Hans Holbein the Younger, starting in the fifteenth century.


IWM Q2120, Imperial War Museum photo, Lt. Ernest Brooks, photographer, British Army, fifteenth Division, Liencourt, Pas-de-Calais, France.

This use of the word “tattoo” here refers to a mass ensemble formation, not to the signal played at bedtime.


Ibid., 307.


Ibid.

Ibid.

Ibid.

Hermansson, “From Icon to Identity,” 43.


Ibid.


“Ibid. ”


Ibid.


Ibid., 96.


Girls are two fast taps on a low G, doublings are two grace notes preceding a melody note, and shakes, throws and grips are embellishments that consist of prescribed movements between notes.


Photo by author.


Rick Clayburn, lead tip of KUPD, interview by author, April 8, 2008.

Pipe bands are ranked in five grades: one through five, with one being the highest.

The bands Foote has played with include the 78th Frasers, Toronto Metro Police Pipe Band, and Peel Regional Police Pipe Band.

Tom Foote, telephone interview by author, February 24, 2008.


The dead stick drag is a grace-note rudiment unique to Scottish drumming. Instead of playing the drag as a double bounce grace note leading into the principal note, Scottish drummers play it as a dead stroke by not buzzing the stick on the head or rebounding it but by leaving it on the drumhead once it has struck.

Tom Foote, telephone interview by author, February 24, 2008.


Campbell, “Pipe Band Competitions,” 32.


Photo by author.

Tom Foote, telephone interview by author, February 24, 2008.
368 Ibid.


372 Emmerson, Rantin’ Pipe and Tremblin’ String, 6.


375 Emmerson, Rantin’ Pipe and Tremblin’ String, 6.

376 Ross DeAeth, e-mail interview with author, April 8, 2008.

377 Mats D. Hermansson, “From Icon to Identity,” 39.

378 Mats D. Hermansson, “From Icon to Identity,” 55.


383 Emmerson, Rantin’ Pipe and Tremblin’ String, 115.

384 Ibid., 19.

385 Slobin, Subcultural Sounds, viii.

386 David Murray, Music of the Scottish Regiments: Cogadh no Sith = War or Peace (Edinburgh, Scotland: Mercat Press, 2001), 54.

387 Emmerson, Rantin’ Pipe and Tremblin’ String, 122

388 Ibid., 144.


391 Ibid.

Ibid.


Ibid., 93.


Gene Smarte, e-mail interview, May 2, 2008.


Ibid.

This solo-group-group-solo arrangement of “Amazing Grace” has become standard today: it is almost always performed in this fashion at Highland games. The Knoxville Pipes and Drums performed this piece with the Irish traditional group Gaelic Storm on January 30, 2015, and this is the manner in which the tune was played during that concert as well.


“‘Amazing Grace’ - Royal Scots Dragoon Guards (with bagpipes) - 45 RPM RCA Record,” YouTube video, 3:55, posted by “ThisGuyFrritz,” accessed January 4, 2015, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Zg1QMQKuDaE.

Barb Willard, e-mail interview, April 6, 2008.


E-mail interview with Keith Goins of Kentucky United Pipes and Drums, May 2, 2008.


Barbara Willard, e-mail interview, April 2, 2008.


Interestingly, these numbers are greatly reduced from the 1990 Census: in that year, 5.4 million people claimed Scottish ancestry, at 2.2% of the total population of 248,709,873, and 5.6 million people, or 2.3 percent of the American populace, claimed Scots-Irish heritage. By the 2000 census, these figures had dropped by 9.3% and 23% respectively.

Admittedly, first and last names do not always signal heritage: some names could be married names; not all those named “Erin” necessarily have Scottish heritage, and so forth.


Jeanie Hilten, e-mail interview, March 9, 2015.

Gene Smarte, e-mail interview, May 2, 2008.

Keith Goins, e-mail interview, May 2, 2008.

Slobin, *Subcultural Sounds*, 35.

Ibid.

Tom Hall, e-mail interview, April 7, 2008.

Slobin, *Subcultural Sounds*, 56.

Hermansson, “From Icon to Identity,” 330.
459 Ibid.

460 Douglas Johnson, e-mail interview, April 7, 2008.

461 Tom Foote, phone interview, February 24, 2008.

462 Douglas Johnson, e-mail interview, April 7, 2008.

463 Keith Goins, e-mail interview, May 2, 2008.

464 Gene Smarte, e-mail interview, May 2, 2008.

465 Barbara Willard, e-mail interview, April 2, 2008.

466 Chris Riedl, e-mail interview, March 8, 2015.


470 Ibid.

471 Ibid.


473 Chris Riedl, e-mail interview, March 8, 2015.


475 Douglas Johnson, e-mail interview, April 6, 2008.

476 Barbara Willard, e-mail interview, April 2, 2008.

477 Kevin Hale, e-mail interview, April 13, 2008.

478 Douglas Johnson, e-mail interview, April 7, 2008.


481 Turner, Anthropology of Performance, 80.

482 Turner, Anthropology of Performance, 25.

Gaelic Storm is a band that plays both traditional Irish and Scottish music as well as what is known as “Celtic rock.” They were formed in the 1990s; the group gained international attention performing as the steerage band in Titanic. The ensemble features uilleann pipes, fiddle, guitar, tin whistle, and drum set, among other instruments.

The Chieftains are a traditional Irish band, formed by Paddy Moloney in the early 1960s. The ensemble features uilleann pipes, tin whistle, button accordion, and bodhrán, among other instruments.

Barbara Willard, e-mail interview, April 2, 2008.

Mats Hermansson, “From Icon to Identity,” 87.


Manning, The Celebration of Society, 35.

Turner, Anthropology of Performance, 80.


Hermansson, “From Icon to Identity,” 330.

Turner, Anthropology of Performance, 90.


Manning, The Celebration of Society, 11.

Hermansson, From Icon to Identity, 184.

Photo by author.

Hermansson, “From Icon to Identity,” 79.

The Appendix includes scoresheets received by KUPD in a 2010 competition at the Central Kentucky Highland Games.

The Scotland County piping score sheet for the Knoxville Pipes and Drums’ Grade Five band is included in the Appendix.


511 Grant Lawrence Kerr, *Scottish Pipe Bands in Winnipeg*, 146.


Primary Sources: Oral History Sources

Bagley, Reed. E-mail interview. April 6, 2008.


Dahl, Lance. E-mail interview. April 7, 2008.

DeAeth, Ross. E-mail interview. April 7, 2008.

Dishman, Renae. E-mail interview. March 17, 2015.

Dishman, Raegan. E-mail interview. March 17, 2015.


Goins, Keith. E-mail interview. May 2, 2008.

Hale, Kevin. E-mail interview. April 13, 2008.

Hall, Tom. E-mail interview. April 7, 2008.

Hilten, Jeanie. E-mail interview. March 9, 2015.


Irwin, Kay. E-mail interview. March 8, 2015.

Johnson, Douglas. E-mail interview. April 7, 2008.

Jones, Joe. E-mail interview. May 2, 2008.

Mays, Warren. E-mail interview. March 26, 2015.

Morgan, Beth. E-mail interview. March 8, 2015.

Payzant, Andrew. E-mail interview. April 8, 2015.

Riedl, Chris. E-mail interview. March 8, 2015.

Smarte, Gene. E-mail interview. May 2, 2008.


Willard, Barbara. E-mail interview. April 2, 2008.

Wilson, Angela. E-mail interview. March 8, 2015.

Wilson, Tracy. E-mail interview. March 8, 2015.


**Primary Sources: Manuscripts and Publications**


GD1/504/44. Account of legal expenses and for tartan, etc. 2 sheets. Documents relating to the family of Menzies of Weem, 1622. National Archives of Scotland, Edinburgh.


Katherine Grant to Lilias Murray, Papers of the Ogilvy family, Earls of Seafield (Seafield Papers) N.d. but sometime between 1640 and 1649, National Archives of Scotland, Edinburgh.


RH19/36. Envelope bears printed label 726. Rectangular piece of tartan, with triangular corner portion missing, 14 x 10 cms. Dyes are authentic for the period, see file A/1240, 1745, National Archives of Scotland, Edinburgh.


**Secondary Sources**


*Chronological Table and Index of the Statutes*. London: Her Majesty’s Stationery Office by Eyre and Spottiswoode, 11th edition, 1890.


“Highland Games at St. Fillans.” Plaque, National Piping Centre Museum. Glasgow, Scotland.


The Last Piper, a tribute CD to Harry Lunan by Stuart Shedden, Roddy McLeod, Gordon Walker, and Angus McColl (Highland Classics, 2008).


Mantle, Craig Leslie. “Bagpipe and Limestone: The History of the 253rd Battalion (Queen’s University Highlanders), C.E.F.” M.A. Thesis, Queen’s University, 2002.

“Map of Scotland showing where the playing of the bagpipe flourished in about the year 1700.” Plaque. National Piping Centre Museum, Glasgow.


Moulton, Paul F. “Imagining Scotland in Music: Place, Audience, and Attraction.” Ph.D. Diss, Florida State University, 2008.


261


Sanger, Keith, and Roderick D. Cannon. “A Letter from Donald MacDonald” (Piping Today Volume 46, 2010), 34-6.


VITA

EDUCATION

D.M.A. PERCUSSION PERFORMANCE, UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY LEXINGTON, KY DEC. 2008
M.M PERCUSSION PERFORMANCE, DEPAUL UNIVERSITY CHICAGO, IL JUNE 2004
B.M. PERCUSSION PERFORMANCE, NORTHERN ILLINOIS UNIVERSITY DEKALB, IL MAY 2002

PROFESSIONAL TEACHING EXPERIENCE

LECTURER, UNIV. OF KENTUCKY LEXINGTON, KY FALL 2011-PRESENT
PART-TIME INSTRUCTOR, UNIV. OF KENTUCKY LEXINGTON, KY FALL 2009-SPRING 2011
MUSICOCOLOGY TEACHING ASSISTANT, UNIV. OF KENTUCKY LEXINGTON, KY 2006-2009
TEMPORARY FACULTY, NORTHERN ILLINOIS UNIVERSITY DEKALB, IL SUMMER 2007
INTERIM DIRECTOR OF PERCUSSION, UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY LEXINGTON, KY SPRING 2006
PERCUSSION TEACHING ASSISTANT, UNIV. OF KENTUCKY LEXINGTON, KY FALL 2004-SPRING 06
PERCUSSION TEACHING ASSISTANT, DEPAUL UNIVERSITY CHICAGO, IL 2002-04

AWARDS

FRIENDS OF MUSIC AWARD, UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY NOVEMBER 2012
FRIENDS OF MUSIC AWARD, UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY FEBRUARY 2012
FRIENDS OF MUSIC AWARD, UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY AUGUST 2011
ASSOCIATION OF EMERITI FACULTY AWARD, UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY JAN. 2010
GRADUATE TEACHING ASSISTANTSHIP, UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY FALL 2004-SPRING 2009
FRIENDS OF MUSIC AWARD, UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY APR. 2009
GRADUATE STUDENT INCENTIVE AWARD, UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY FEB. 2009
GRADUATE STUDENT SUPPORT AWARD, UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY MAR. 2005
UNIVERSITY SCHOLAR AWARD, NORTHERN ILLINOIS UNIVERSITY 1998-2002

PROFESSIONAL ADMINISTRATIVE EXPERIENCE

DIRECTOR, CENTRAL MUSIC ACADEMY (CMA) LEXINGTON, KY 2005-PRESENT
CREATIVE & PERFORMING ACTIVITIES / INTERNATIONAL ACTIVITIES

PRESENTER, JOINT SEM/AMS/SMT CONFERENCE NEW ORLEANS, LA NOVEMBER 2012

PRESENTER, MUSICA SCOTICA CONFERENCE GLASGOW, UK APRIL 2012

PRESENTER, CONFERENCE ON MUSIC IN NINETEENTH-CENTURY BRITAIN BELFAST, UK JULY 2011

PRESENTER, CMS NATIONAL CONFERENCE PORTLAND, OR OCTOBER 2009

PRESENTER, CMS INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ZAGREB, CROATIA JULY 2009

PRESENTER, IASPM CANADIAN CONFERENCE HALIFAX, NOVA SCOTIA, CANADA JUNE 2009

PERFORMER, SEOUL DRUM FESTIVAL SEOUL, KOREA 2002

PERFORMER, WORLD STEELBAND FESTIVAL PORT OF SPAIN, TRINIDAD 2000

FEATURED PERFORMER, IL. BRASS BAND’S UNITED KINGDOM TOUR UNITED KINGDOM 2000

CREATIVE & PERFORMING ACTIVITIES / NATIONAL ACTIVITIES

PERFORMING MEMBER, NIEF-NORF PROJECT 2006 - PRESENT

CONFERENCE CO-CHAIR, NIEF-NORF RESEARCH SUMMIT GREENVILLE, SC MAY 2012

PRESENTER, COLLEGE MUSIC SOCIETY NATIONAL CONFERENCE PORTLAND, OREGON OCT. 2009

PRESENTER, IASPM NATIONAL CONFERENCE SAN DIEGO, CA MAY 2009

ARTIST, PERCUSSIVE ARTS SOCIETY INTERNATIONAL CONVENTION COLUMBUS, OH NOV. 2007

ARTIST, PERCUSSIVE ARTS SOCIETY KENTUCKY DAY OF PERCUSSION LEXINGTON, KY FEB. 2007

MASTERCLASS, UNIVERSITY OF TENNESSEE @ MARTIN MARTIN, TN OCT. 2006

FACULTY, BANDS OF AMERICA WORLD PERCUSSION SYMPOSIUM NORMAL, IL 2005-06

ARTIST, PERCUSSIVE ARTS SOCIETY INTERNATIONAL CONVENTION NASHVILLE, TN NOV. 2004

CREATIVE & PERFORMING ACTIVITIES / REGIONAL ACTIVITIES

STEEL PAN PERFORMER AND INSTRUCTOR 1998-PRESENT

SNARE DRUMMER, KNOXVILLE PIPES & DRUMS (KPD) KNOXVILLE, TN 2014-PRESENT

SNARE DRUMMER, KENTUCKY UNITED PIPES & DRUMS (KUPD) LEXINGTON, KY 2006-2012

PERFORMER, UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY GAMELAN ENSEMBLES LEXINGTON, KY 2005-FALL 2012
PERFORMER, UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY THAI ENSEMBLE LEXINGTON, KY FALL 2009-FALL 2012

FACULTY, MONTREAT WORSHIP AND MUSIC CONFERENCE BLACK MOUNTAIN, NC SUMMER 2011

PERFORMER, UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY CHINESE ENSEMBLE LEXINGTON, KY 2005-2011

PERFORMER, LEXINGTON TAIKO GROUP LEXINGTON, KY FALL 2010-SPRING 2011

ORCHESTRAL PERCUSSIONIST 2000-PRESENT

DMA LECTURE RECITAL, UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY LEXINGTON, KY APR. 2008

DMA SOLO RECITAL, UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY LEXINGTON, KY APR. 2008

MASTERCLASS, LAFAYETTE HIGH SCHOOL LEXINGTON, KY FEB. 2007

PRESENTER, UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY MUSICOLOGY COLLOQUIUM LEXINGTON, KY NOV. 2006

FACULTY, YAMAHA SOUNDS OF SUMMER CAMP LEXINGTON, KY 2005-06

DMA CONCERTO RECITAL, UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY LEXINGTON, KY APR. 2006

DMA CHAMBER RECITAL, UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY LEXINGTON, KY APR. 2006

SOLOIST, UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY WIND ENSEMBLE LEXINGTON, KY 2005

SOLOIST, DEPAUL UNIVERSITY PERCUSSION ENSEMBLE CHICAGO, IL 2003-04

TEACHING ASSISTANT, BIRCH CREEK MUSIC FESTIVAL BIRCH CREEK, WI 2003-04

AUDIO RECORDINGS

LIVE FROM LEXINGTON, UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY PERCUSSION ENSEMBLE OCT. 2007

TYMPANUM UBİQUITAŞ, HONEYROCK PERCUSSION PUBLISHING OCT. 2007
  • [Everett, PA]: Disc Makers, [2007]. Compact disc.

WIND BAND SAMPLER, ALFRED MUSIC PUBLISHING COMPANY 1999-2002
  • Wind Band Promotion Recording (Section Percussion). Compact disc.

LANGUAGE STUDY

FRENCH

GERMAN (READING)

SPANISH (READING)

MEMBERSHIPS

SOCIETY FOR ETHNOMUSICOLOGY

AMERICAN MUSICOLOGICAL SOCIETY
PERCUSSIVE ARTS SOCIETY
INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATION FOR THE STUDY OF POPULAR MUSIC

PERFORMANCE STUDY

- **Dr. Kuo Huang Han** (Gamelan, Chinese and Thai Ensembles), University of Kentucky; 2004-2012
- **Amit Pandya** (Tabla), Lexington, KY; 2006-2007
- **Liam Teague** (Steelpan), Northern Illinois University; 1998-2002
- **Orlando Cotto** (Afro-Cuban), Northern Illinois University; 2002
- **Rick Clayburn** (Scottish Drumming), Lexington, KY; 2006-2012
- **Susann Barrett** (Taiko), Lexington, KY; 2010-2011
- **Yaya Diallo** (West African Drumming), Louisville, KY; 2011
- **James Campbell** (Percussion), University of Kentucky; 2004-2008
- **Robert Chappell** (Percussion), Northern Illinois University; 1998-2002
- **Rich Holly** (Percussion), Northern Illinois University; 1998-2002
- **Jeff Stitely** (Drumset), Northern Illinois University; 1999
- **Bob Becker** (Ragtime Xylophone), Nexus Percussion Ensemble; 2003-2005
- **Ted Atkatz** (Orchestral Percussion), Chicago Symphony Orchestra; 2002-2004
- **Michael Green** (Orchestral Percussion), Chicago Lyric Opera; 2002-2004
- **Eric Millstein** (Orchestral Percussion), Chicago Lyric Opera; 2002-2004
- **James Ross** (Orchestral Percussion), Chicago Symphony Orchestra; 1999-2002