

University of Kentucky

UKnowledge

---

Theses and Dissertations--Anthropology

Anthropology

---


2021

## WHO'S DOING THE DISHES?: REPRODUCTIVE LABOR, GENDER, AND MIDDLE-CLASS SUBJECTIVITIES IN RABAT, MOROCCO

Miriam Ruth Dike

*University of Kentucky*, [mruthdike@gmail.com](mailto:mruthdike@gmail.com)

Author ORCID Identifier:

 <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6900-9543>

Digital Object Identifier: <https://doi.org/10.13023/etd.2021.306>

[Right click to open a feedback form in a new tab to let us know how this document benefits you.](#)

### Recommended Citation

Dike, Miriam Ruth, "WHO'S DOING THE DISHES?: REPRODUCTIVE LABOR, GENDER, AND MIDDLE-CLASS SUBJECTIVITIES IN RABAT, MOROCCO" (2021). *Theses and Dissertations--Anthropology*. 58.

[https://uknowledge.uky.edu/anthro\\_etds/58](https://uknowledge.uky.edu/anthro_etds/58)

This Doctoral Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Anthropology at UKnowledge. It has been accepted for inclusion in Theses and Dissertations--Anthropology by an authorized administrator of UKnowledge. For more information, please contact [UKnowledge@lsv.uky.edu](mailto:UKnowledge@lsv.uky.edu).

## **STUDENT AGREEMENT:**

I represent that my thesis or dissertation and abstract are my original work. Proper attribution has been given to all outside sources. I understand that I am solely responsible for obtaining any needed copyright permissions. I have obtained needed written permission statement(s) from the owner(s) of each third-party copyrighted matter to be included in my work, allowing electronic distribution (if such use is not permitted by the fair use doctrine) which will be submitted to UKnowledge as Additional File.

I hereby grant to The University of Kentucky and its agents the irrevocable, non-exclusive, and royalty-free license to archive and make accessible my work in whole or in part in all forms of media, now or hereafter known. I agree that the document mentioned above may be made available immediately for worldwide access unless an embargo applies.

I retain all other ownership rights to the copyright of my work. I also retain the right to use in future works (such as articles or books) all or part of my work. I understand that I am free to register the copyright to my work.

## **REVIEW, APPROVAL AND ACCEPTANCE**

The document mentioned above has been reviewed and accepted by the student's advisor, on behalf of the advisory committee, and by the Director of Graduate Studies (DGS), on behalf of the program; we verify that this is the final, approved version of the student's thesis including all changes required by the advisory committee. The undersigned agree to abide by the statements above.

Miriam Ruth Dike, Student

Dr. Sarah Lyon, Major Professor

Dr. Kristin Monroe, Director of Graduate Studies

WHO'S DOING THE DISHES?: REPRODUCTIVE LABOR, GENDER, AND  
MIDDLE-CLASS SUBJECTIVITIES IN RABAT, MOROCCO

---

DISSERTATION

---

A dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the  
requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the  
College of Arts & Sciences  
at the University of Kentucky

By  
Miriam Ruth Dike  
Lexington, Kentucky  
Director: Dr. Sarah Lyon, Professor of Anthropology  
Lexington, Kentucky  
2021

Copyright © Miriam Ruth Dike 2021  
<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6900-9543>

## ABSTRACT OF DISSERTATION

### WHO'S DOING THE DISHES?: REPRODUCTIVE LABOR, GENDER, AND MIDDLE-CLASS SUBJECTIVITIES IN RABAT, MOROCCO

The dissertation uses reproductive labor as a lens to examine how gendered and classed subjectivities are continuously created, performed, and subtly transformed within and outside of urban middle-class Moroccan households. Reproductive labor is broadly defined as unpaid and paid labor associated with caregiving and domestic roles including but not limited to cleaning, cooking, and child care. Subjectivities are the perspectives, feelings, beliefs, and desires of subjects within uneven relations of power. This research is based on seventeen months of ethnographic fieldwork in Rabat-Sale, Morocco including fifty-seven semi-structured interviews with married working- and middle-class Moroccans, as well as extensive participant observation in various parts of the family lives of Moroccan couples. This research deepens our understanding of how and why households create more equitable distributions of reproductive labor, a persistent form of feminized labor that underpins the reproduction of society and capitalism. The second chapter exposes the interconnected nature of paid and unpaid labor, examining how religion, family structure, economics, children, geography, education, and class influence household decision-making. The third chapter analyzes how urban middle-class men “do domesticity” and the small, slow changes shaping Moroccan middle-class masculinities for younger generations. Though extensive literature exists on Moroccan women in the public sphere (Cairolì 2011), less research explores the ways in which Moroccan men “do domesticity” and interact within the private spheres of life. The fourth chapter analyzes Moroccan middle-class subjectivities by examining their intersecting forms of capital; their effect on the market economy; and finally, the sociocultural, religious, and affective dimensions of obtaining markers of middle-classness through bank loans. This chapter combines a Marxist-inspired material approach and Bourdieu-inspired symbolic approach to examine the material, affective, and symbolic dimensions of class. The fifth chapter examines how Moroccan middle-class marital relations are changing in relation to companionate marriage and criticisms of the new middle-class marital relations. The sixth chapter examines how convenience technologies and foods challenge and reinforce gendered and classed subjectivities among urban middle-class Moroccans. Besides expressing class, convenience technologies can contribute to a restructuring of women’s positions within the household. The final chapter reviews the main findings and identifies unanswered questions in need of further research.

KEYWORDS: Reproductive Labor, Households, Foodways, Gender Roles, Middle-Class Identities, Morocco

Miriam Ruth Dike

---

*(Name of Student)*

7/26/2021

---

Date

WHO'S DOING THE DISHES?: REPRODUCTIVE LABOR, GENDER, AND  
MIDDLE-CLASS SUBJECTIVITIES IN RABAT, MOROCCO

By  
Miriam Ruth Dike

Sarah Lyon

---

Director of Dissertation

Kristin Monroe

---

Director of Graduate Studies

7/26/21

---

Date

## DEDICATION

To the warm and inviting Moroccans who shared their lives with me.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The following dissertation benefited immensely from the insights and direction of several people. First, I would like to thank the participants and friends that shared their lives with me in Rabat, Morocco. There are no words to adequately thank you for inviting me to countless dinner, lunches and family events and patiently attempting to understand my countless questions and broken darija. I thank you for your lively conversation, honesty, openness, and delicious meals and snacks. This dissertation would be nothing without your insights. Unfortunately, in order to protect their privacy, I am unable to name everyone individually.

Second, my Dissertation Chair, Dr. Sarah Lyon, improved both the clarity of ideas and scholarship of this dissertation. Thank you for always providing timely feedback and making me a better writer. I would also like to thank my Dissertation Committee respectively: Dr. Kristin Monroe, Dr. Karen Rignall, and Dr. Monica Udvardy, who all imparted invaluable intellectual support through the entire PhD and dissertation process. Each individual provided insights that guided and challenged my thinking, substantially improving the finished product. I would also like to thank Dr. Hsain Ilahiane for providing early support in the PhD process and helpful contacts during fieldwork. Thank you to Dr. Fadma Aït Mouse, who provided invaluable support during fieldwork. Thank you to the outside reader, Dr. Tony Love, for their beneficial contributions.

This dissertation was improved by the American Institute for Maghreb Studies (AIMS) Dissertation Workshop. This research was possible through generous funding from the U.S. Department of Education, Lambda Alpha, and the University of



Kentucky's Food Connection and Department of Anthropology. An earlier version of Chapter 6 appeared in 2021 in *Economic Anthropology*. Many thanks are due Dr. Brandon Lundy and the anonymous reviewers who greatly improved this publication. I am furthermore grateful to the American Anthropological Association for providing me permission to use this copyrighted material.

In addition to the instrumental theoretical and technical assistance above, I received equally important assistance from family and friends. Thank you so much to my husband, Mario Saucedo, for providing on-going emotional support throughout the entire process. Thank you to my parents for their ongoing emotional support, financial assistance, and all-important encouragement. My writing group, Anahid Matossian and Stacie Hatfield were also crucially helpful in keeping me on track and progressing towards my degree. I would not have finished the PhD program or this dissertation without the support of the UK Counseling Center, and especially Dr. Amanda Bloom and Dr. Jamie Hopkins. I would also like to thank countless friends who encouraged me throughout the process to continue to live a full life and to keep working hard. All of this support and encouragement I received was crucial to my ability to finish.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS .....	iii
LIST OF TABLES .....	ix
LIST OF FIGURES .....	x
CHAPTER 1. Introduction.....	1
1.1 <i>Introduction</i> .....	1
1.2 <i>Contributions to Literatures</i> .....	5
1.2.1    Reproductive Labor .....	5
1.2.2    Households.....	9
1.2.3    Gendered Subjectivities .....	11
1.2.4    Classed Subjectivities .....	15
1.3 <i>Research Context</i> .....	18
1.3.1    Middle East & North Africa .....	18
1.3.2    Morocco .....	21
1.3.3    Urban Morocco .....	24
1.4 <i>Methodology</i> .....	27
1.4.1    Semi-Structured Interviews .....	35
1.4.2    Participant Observation.....	36
1.4.3    Data Analysis .....	37
1.4.4    Limitations of Study .....	38
1.4.5    Positionality .....	40
1.5 <i>Why does this matter?</i> .....	41
1.5.1    Why does this matter to me?.....	41
1.5.2    Why is this important to society? What’s at stake here? .....	43
1.5.3    Why does it matter to research participants? .....	44
1.5.4    Why does it matter to other scholars in the region?.....	45
1.5.5    Why does this matter to other scholars not in the region?.....	46
1.6 <i>Overview of Chapters</i> .....	47
CHAPTER 2. Who’s Doing the Dishes? Gendered Subjectivities and Reproductive Labor	50
2.1 <i>Introduction</i> .....	50
2.2 <i>Reproductive Labor Literature</i> .....	53
2.3 <i>Economics and Labor</i> .....	54

2.4	<i>Religion</i> .....	63
2.5	<i>Family Structure</i> .....	70
2.6	<i>Children &amp; Childcare</i> .....	78
2.7	<i>Education and Class</i> .....	90
2.8	<i>Conclusion</i> .....	100
CHAPTER 3. Men “Doing Domesticity” Throughout The Life Course: Gendered and Classed Subjectivities In Urban Morocco.....		
3.1	<i>Introduction</i> .....	102
3.2	<i>MENA Masculinities Literature</i> .....	109
3.3	<i>Early Marriage</i> .....	110
3.4	<i>Mid-Marriage</i> .....	113
3.4.1	Being a Good Father .....	114
3.4.2	Cooking.....	121
3.5	<i>Retirement</i> .....	126
3.6	<i>Conclusion</i> .....	131
CHAPTER 4. Moroccan Middle-Class Aspirations, Capital, Anxieties, and Credit.....		
4.1	<i>Introduction</i> .....	133
4.2	<i>Anthropology of the Global Middle Classes</i> .....	136
4.3	<i>Middle Class Aspirations</i> .....	140
4.3.1	“I don’t want to deprive my kids”.....	144
4.3.2	Relative Definitions: “Having the Necessities” .....	145
4.3.3	Education and Capital .....	148
4.3.4	Housing, Food, and Capital .....	154
4.3.5	Healthcare and Capital .....	157
4.3.6	Transportation, Mobility, and Capital.....	159
4.4	<i>Middle Class Anxieties</i> .....	161
4.4.1	Less Formal Forms of Credit .....	162
4.4.2	Bank Credit .....	163
4.4.3	Eid Sheep .....	170
4.5	<i>Conclusion</i> .....	176
CHAPTER 5. Middle-Class Companionate Marriages and household Relations .....		
5.1	<i>Introduction</i> .....	177
5.2	<i>Companionate Marriage</i> .....	180

5.3	<i>Choice of Spouse</i> .....	181
5.4	<i>Neolocal Nuclear Family Household</i> .....	188
5.5	<i>Open-mindedness</i> .....	191
5.6	<i>Sharing Responsibility</i> .....	193
5.7	<i>Communication</i> .....	196
5.8	<i>Critiquing the New Generation</i> .....	199
5.9	<i>Conclusion</i> .....	203
CHAPTER 6. “The Machine Does It!”: Using Convenience Technologies and Foods to Analyze Care, Reproductive Labor, Gender, and Class in Urban Morocco.....		
6.1	<i>Introduction</i> .....	204
6.2	<i>Convenience Technologies</i> .....	206
6.3	<i>Convenience Foods and Convenience as Care</i> .....	208
6.4	<i>Convenience as Care and Care Work</i> .....	209
6.5	<i>Do convenience technologies save time and labor?</i> .....	210
6.5.1	Yes – Washing Machines.....	210
6.5.2	No - Mixers.....	212
6.6	<i>How do convenience technologies hurt and help women?</i> .....	214
6.6.1	An “Easy” Task.....	214
6.6.2	Men Doing Laundry.....	215
6.6.3	Tajine versus the Pressure Cooker?.....	220
6.7	<i>How do convenience technologies reinforce classed subjectivities?</i> .....	223
6.7.1	Class, Capital, and Reputation.....	224
6.7.2	Using Your Hands.....	226
6.7.3	Living in a Developed Morocco.....	227
6.8	<i>How do convenience foods challenge and reinforce gendered and classed subjectivities?</i> .....	230
6.8.1	Whole Foods to Processed Foods.....	231
6.8.2	One vs. Two-income Households.....	234
6.8.2.1	Bread.....	234
6.8.2.2	Pastries.....	237
6.9	<i>Conclusion</i> .....	240
CHAPTER 7. Conclusions.....		
7.1	<i>Introduction</i> .....	243
7.2	<i>Main Findings</i> .....	244

7.3	<i>Need for Further Research</i> .....	246
7.4	<i>Policy Recommendations</i> .....	247
7.5	<i>What can be learned from this dissertation?</i> .....	250
APPENDICES .....		253
<i>APPENDIX A. VERSION 1 INTERVIEW QUESTIONS</i> .....		254
<i>APPENDIX B. VERSION 2 INTERVIEW QUESTIONS</i> .....		259
<i>APPENDIX C. VERSION 3 INTERVIEW QUESTIONS</i> .....		263
References Cited .....		267
VITA.....		285

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Moroccan Economy Over Time .....	25
Table 2: Participant Socioeconomic Class Information.....	30
Table 3: Occupations by Class.....	34
Table 4: Distribution of Reproductive Labor & Class.....	94

## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Roasted chicken.....	3
Figure 2: Sfa.....	3
Figure 3: Tajine.....	220
Figure 4: Moroccan pastries.....	237

## CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION

### 1.1 Introduction

*I stayed with Abdelhafid<sup>1</sup>, his wife Iman, and their three children for a week during mid-July 2019. On the first day, Abdelhafid picked me up from the local grand taxi station in Yacoub Mansour. Then, we left for a Sadaqa Party at Abdelhafid's parent's house at 10:19 pm. A Sadaqa (ṣaḍaqa<sup>2</sup>) or Charity party is a party that a family hosts to celebrate something good happening in their lives, like buying a new house or celebrating good health. Abdelhafid's mother, Safiya decided to host the party for her family, friends, and neighbors to honor her husband's good health after recovering from illness earlier in the year. While Abdelhafid and Iman (42) are renting a large apartment in Yacoub Mansour, a middle-class neighborhood in the suburbs of Rabat, Abdelhafid's parents Safiya (57) and Arabi (60) live in a working-class neighborhood that is about 15 minutes away from Abdelhafid and Iman's apartment. Safiya and Arabi live on the second floor of the building and one of their daughters and her family live on the two floors above them.*

*The ṣaḍaqa party was held in the living room (salon) upstairs on the roof. I walked up the three flights of stairs and then said hello to Abdelhafid's mother and sister who were both stirring big pots of food over a gas tank (bota) on the roof. Then I sat in the living room (salon) with Iman and the other women that were at the party. This included one of Abdelhafid's other married sisters who had come up from the southern city of Agadir with her two daughters who were at university for engineering and*

---

<sup>1</sup> The names used for all particular individuals in this dissertation are pseudonyms. Biographical details have been slightly altered to protect anonymity.

<sup>2</sup> All transliterations from Arabic use the system adopted by the *International Journal of Middle East Studies*. French words in Moroccan Arabic are kept in French.



nursing. Iman introduced me to the women in the living room and I briefly explained my research in Morocco, asking who does housework in the home and how is this changing among different generations. Abdelhafid's sister from Agadir (about 40 years old) said that, "The younger generation of men help in the beginning of marriage, but not after a few years." Another woman who was about the age of Iman, in her 40's, chimed in that "My generation of men don't want to set a precedent of helping at all with housework or childcare, so they don't do anything." I said, "oooo, is that so?" and another woman agreed and said that, "Men from the younger generation will help when it is just them in the house but not around family because they don't want to appear like the wife governs (kthkm) the man." I said "That is very interesting!" and then the conversation drifted to other topics. Later in the night, Abdelhafid's niece from Agadir who is studying engineering brought out water and then later tea and cookies around midnight. At 12:45 am, Safiya asked what time it was and exclaimed "oh wiliwiliwili" presumably because it was so late. At Abdelhafid's house we usually ate dinner around 10 or 11 pm and for events with more elaborate menus, dinner is often later. After the niece took away the tea tray and wiped the two large tables down from cookie crumbs, she returned to sit down and talk some more. At 1:23 am, Abdelhafid's sister went around with a large tea pot of water, basin, and towel for guests to wash their hands before dinner. Then bread was brought out along with large dishes with roasted chicken (Figure 1- djāj lhamra) with green olives and sautéed onions. This was served with three different types of soda.



Figure 1: Roasted chicken

*After that had been eaten a second large dish of sweet small vermicelli noodles (Figure 2- sfa) with cinnamon, powdered sugar, some raisins and crushed peanuts on top surrounded by chicken bones left over from the chicken course.*



Figure 2: Sfa

*To finish the elaborate meal, big plates of cut up watermelon were brought out. Then around 2:15 am, we said goodbye and left the party.*

The female members of Abdelhafid's family were almost constantly doing reproductive labor (cooking food, laying out food, clearing food) during the ṣadaqa party.

**Reproductive labor** is broadly defined as unpaid and paid labor associated with caregiving and domestic roles, including but not limited to cleaning, cooking, and child care (Smith 2013). Reproductive labor is important because it enables capitalism to continue running with a supply of workers (Chibnik 2011), but also because it upholds social relations among family and friends. Safiya's Sadaqa party maintained and strengthened the bonds between family (especially family living out of town but also in the same city) and neighbors by providing a space for commensality. The opinions of the women present echo an important finding within the data I collected, namely that the younger generation is more willing to do reproductive labor than their parent's generation but that this varies depending on the context and can fluctuate over time. This dissertation examines the generational changes that the women at the party discussed regarding reproductive labor. Specifically, the dissertation uses reproductive labor as a lens to examine how gendered and classed subjectivities are continuously created, performed, and subtly transformed within and outside of urban middle-class Moroccan families' households. **Subjectivities** are the perspectives, feelings, beliefs, and desires of subjects within uneven relations of power (Solomon 2005). This dissertation analyzes reproductive labor to illuminate the ways that urban middle-class Moroccan society is subtly changing through everyday practices. I use the term subjectivities because I am examining the ways in which urban middle-class Moroccans view, embody, perform,

enact, and inhabit their sense of self and place in the world in relation to others and along uneven power relations (Garcia et al. 2021:191; Staunæs 2003; Cahill 2007). Participants who identified as men and women viewed themselves, and their own perspectives, feelings, and desires as dissimilar to those of a different gender and class. For this reason, it is important to examine “intersecting subjectivities,” or how subject-making processes occur across different intersecting aspects of inequality (Crenshaw 1989; Gonda 2017).

## 1.2 Contributions to Literatures

### 1.2.1 Reproductive Labor

Although reproductive labor by definition is associated with caregiving and domestic roles often connected to the household (Smith 2013), I argue that reproductive labor can happen both within and outside of a household and be paid and unpaid. For example, a fast food worker making a French taco for a middle-class teenager is making food that reproduces society and is reproductive labor, despite being paid to do so and making this food outside of the household. There is also a large amount of childcare activities that happens outside of a family’s household, particularly in public or in extended family and friend’s households. I mainly studied unpaid reproductive labor happening within distinct households due to time and methodological constraints but have included some examples of paid reproductive labor and reproductive labor outside of the household (see Chapter 6 section on convenience foods).

Even as more women around the world enter the paid labor force full-time, men do not do the same amount of reproductive labor as women (Hollows 2003:230; Swenson 2009:47; Kan et al. 2011; Gutmann 1999:167; Fuwa 2004). Additionally, this persistent

form of feminized labor (including care and emotional labor) is usually not included in national economic statistics, despite reproductive labor's fundamental role in the reproduction of society and capitalism (Chibnik 2011). Furthermore, reproductive labor often constitutes diverse economies in an informal exchange of food, labor, and childcare between family and neighbors (Gibson-Graham 1996). One of Safiya's female neighbors helped with the Sadaqa Party, presumably in return for help that Safiya provided in the past or might provide in the future. While much of the existing social science literature focuses on formal waged labor, my dissertation highlights the ways that informal labor arrangements shape gendered and classed subjectivities, formal labor, and everyday practices (Chibnik 2011).

Post-Marxist feminists argue that because of unpaid reproductive labor, the reproduction of society and capitalism, are possible (Rubin 1975). On the other hand, informal and unpaid diverse economies associated with reproductive labor can be seen as a way to reject or fight against capitalism. In the Moroccan context, both arguments are true in different ways: women and some younger urban middle-class men care for children who reproduce society and fuel increased levels of consumption. At the same time, doing more reproductive labor at home (like making your own bread, lunch, and tea time snacks) could reduce the amount of money spent on consumer foods, especially in a one-income family (where the breadwinner is usually male). In the urban Moroccan middle-class context, I found that two-income households tend to consume more than one-income households, which often buy less expensive unprocessed goods to make bread, pastries, and home-cooked meals at home due to economic necessity. As my

findings demonstrate, reproductive labor is experienced vastly differently depending on gender, class, status, race, ability, etc. (Glenn 1992).

This project conceptualizes reproductive labor practices through a phenomenological interpretation of practice theory (de Certeau 1984; Merleau-Ponty 1962; Jackson 1996). This is the idea that our perceptions and understandings of the world actively influence the way we create and transform the world in which we live, recognizing the dialectic between social structure and human agency (O'Dougherty 2002). For example, AbdulWahed (31), who is married to Catherine (24), an American, feels that it is his responsibility to do reproductive labor, just as much as his wife (whether or not she is Moroccan or American). When I asked AbdulWahed (31) if he thinks that he is unique in Moroccan society to have these thoughts on housework, he said "No I don't think I am unique, I think this is what we should all be doing. And before I got married I would tell friends and family and coworkers that a man needs to help his wife, sister, daughter in the home." In this way, AbdulWahed is actively transforming his own actions in his household with his wife Catherine, but he also told his friends and family and coworkers about this, subtly, slowly transforming gendered subjectivities. Social scientists created different theories to explain the difference between men and women doing reproductive labor, including time availability or role-strain (Becker 1991)<sup>3</sup>, resource allocation (Kunovich & Kunovich 2008; Baxter & Kane

---

<sup>3</sup> The time availability or role strain approach posits that if someone works outside the home less often and has more flexible hours, they will be more likely to contribute more to the household labor than someone who works more often outside the home and has less flexible working hours. Additionally, if someone has a management position in the paid labor force where they are expected to put professional demands over family needs, they will have less time for housework than someone not in a management position (Goñi-Legaz et al 2010). Role strain theory has been confirmed by studies to some extent, in that women with a

1995)<sup>4</sup>, and theories of gender ideology and division (Pittman & Blanchard 1996; Presser 1994)<sup>5</sup>. Rather than using theoretical models of reproductive labor distribution, this dissertation understands practices, practical knowledge, and bodily movements as the fundamental unit of social existence (Giddens 1984; Reckwitz 2002:259) and individuality (Schatzki 1996). My approach to reproductive labor differs from the largely quantitative sociological approaches (Greenstein 2009; Bianchi et al. 2000) by foregrounding the voices, opinions, and everyday lives of participants (Higgins 2015; Fetterman 2010; Pink 2009). Much of the existing literature on reproductive labor ignores the impact of life stage on reproductive labor, while my research is particularly aware of differences among children, youth, adults, and retirees. Any change in society begins with a change in practice at the level of everyday life (Shove et al. 2012). My dissertation demonstrates how small everyday changes in practices at the household level signify subtle changes in gendered subjectivities for urban middle-class Moroccan men and women and a change in society.

---

continuous work-day schedule participate in more housework than women with split-shifts but this pattern did not hold for men (Goñi-Legaz et al 2010).

<sup>4</sup> The resource allocation approach emphasizes the resources (earnings, education) each member of the relationship brings to the household, such that someone who earns more money for the family would do less household labor and someone who earns less money for the family would do more housework (Shelton & John 1996). Generally, this theory has been supported in the literature (Kunovich and Kunovich 2008, Baxter and Kane 1995) but if a woman is the main breadwinner for a family, her husband usually does not do the majority of the housework and not to the extent that women do when the husband makes more money.

<sup>5</sup> The gender division theory suggests that in general an older and less educated population will be more likely to follow “traditional” gender roles compared to a younger and more educated population due to the importance of gender norms and traditions. Traditional gender roles are characterized by the male being the main breadwinner and the female doing the majority of the household labor while egalitarian gender roles contrast in that men and women often work outside the home and share the household labor more equally. Moreover, the more educated and younger population will be more likely to adopt egalitarian gender roles. In general, this theory has been confirmed in the literature (Goñi-Legaz et al 2010).

My research is guided by Marxist feminist theory (Barrett 1997: 127) that argues for an equal distribution of reproductive labor among men and women, that the assumed or actual dependence of women upon men economically be abolished, and that the ideology of gender be transformed. Although some feminist Marxists characterize housework as drudgery (Federici & Vishmidt 2013; Whitney 2017), people's experiences and relationships to reproductive labor are extremely diverse and can be a source of power in the household (Counihan 2009). Therefore, instead of asserting an equal distribution of reproductive labor as the ideal for everyone in the world, this research centers the knowledge, desires, and beliefs of participants. For example, rather than only looking for ways the Moroccan women resist patriarchy by pushing their husbands to do reproductive labor as scholars with narrow views of agency and feminism might (Mahmood 2005), I center participants diverse subjectivities while analyzing gender, class and power. This is an ethnography of conversation with participants and their own theories, rather than an ethnography of mastery (Mahmood 2005). I center the words of participants and their analysis, rather than attempting to forcefully impose outside theories exclusively.

### 1.2.2 Households

In this dissertation, I define **households** as individuals living together and pooling their collective resources as one unit (Chibnik 2011). Households could be comprised of members of the same family or not, but all of the married Moroccan individuals with whom I spoke lived only with family members (usually only nuclear family, sometimes extended family as well). By using the term households instead of families, I emphasize the nuclearization and urbanization of Moroccan society as a whole as education



improves, changing expectations for Moroccan middle-classes by themselves, and increased standards of living (Abdelmajid & Benohoud 2010:9; Alpert 2007). Although the majority of participants lived in nuclear family households with only immediate family (i.e. father, mother, children), the importance of larger extended kin networks (especially parents, siblings, in-laws, aunts and uncles) is demonstrated throughout. Additionally, the members of the household remained relatively stable over time, with some additions and subtractions (e.g. Rkia's sister coming to stay with her for several months after the birth of Rkia's third child).

Instead of using quantitative methods, as most existing household labor research does (with few exceptions, e.g. Berridge & Romich 2011), my research employs practice theory and in-depth qualitative methods. Although quantitative methods provide a wide sample to produce statistically significant results, they do not illuminate the multifaceted phenomena of social reality, nor do they account for the complexities and variation of everyday life (Glaser & Strauss 1967; Higgins 2015; Fetterman 2010; Pink 2009; Gobo 2008; Cerwonka & Malkki 2007). Relying on pre-formulated questions and answers to choose from, a quantitative approach would not adequately capture the nuance of the realities and challenges facing urban Moroccans (Higgins 2015; Fetterman 2010; Pink 2009). Instead, I use ethnographic methods that allowed participants to explain in their own words why they distribute reproductive labor in a particular way. Following Murcott's (2000) critique of research based on self-reported household practices, the project also examines actual household practices through extensive participant observation.

As more Moroccan women participate in the paid labor force (Alpert 2007), the rights and responsibilities historically associated with Moroccan husbands and wives are evolving. Due to this, the household emerges as a key location where gendered and classed subjectivities are actively negotiated and shift slightly (Chant 2002). While there are several noteworthy examples of anthropological literature examining households in the MENA (Middle East & North Africa) region (e.g. Hoodfar 1997, Singerman 1995, Mernissi 1994, Mundy 1995), households as a unit have been less studied in Morocco. This is despite the fact that households are “all-important” (Crawford 2008:149) in Morocco, meaning that households are the fundamental social unit from which an understanding of larger social processes must start. Few studies have examined changes within the household structure and practices within Morocco, with some exceptions (i.e., Crawford 2008). For example, some studies have examined the impact of male out-migration on women left behind and their household units (Ennaji & Sadiqi 2008), but very few of these examine the distribution of reproductive labor (with some exceptions, e.g., Bouasria 2013). By analyzing the way that gendered and classed subjectivities are continuously created, performed, and subtly transformed within and outside of the household, I highlight both diverse gendered and classed subjectivities as well as the individual perspectives (from within and outside the household) that collectively influence and contribute to households.

### 1.2.3 Gendered Subjectivities

**Gendered subjectivities** are the gendered perspectives, feelings, beliefs, and desires of subjects within uneven relations of power (Solomon 2005). Subjectivities are continuously created through an iterative process by which people are “subjected” to

institutions of power or authority (Foucault 1980) and then convey, perform, and reproduce that power in relation to one another (Nightingale 2013; Garcia et al. 2021). Within processes of subjugation, humans actively assert their will through agency. However, humans experience subjectivities differently and have unequal access to different forms of agency, based on their positionality and place within society (Crenshaw 1989). In short, the term “intersectional subjectivities” encompasses how the process of subject-making is experienced differently along intersecting lines of power and inequality (Crenshaw 1989; Gonda 2017). Everyone has different gendered subjectivities due to their own unique position in the world and in relation to institutions of authority and one another. However, for the purpose of this analysis, I am making conclusions about how broadly gendered subjectivities are continuously created, performed, and subtly transformed within and outside of the households of the Moroccans with whom I spoke.

Mahmood (2005) argues that many Western feminists tend to only search for agency in Muslim and Middle Eastern contexts with an extremely narrowly defined definition of “agency.” Specifically, Mahmood (2005) critiques Western feminists for often viewing Islam as enforcing patriarchal values and actions in opposition to an “appropriate” version of agency or “freedom” that Western feminists deem valuable. Instead, Mahmood (2005) argues that the pious Muslim women that she spoke to in Cairo *are* asserting their agency by submitting to God in various ways that are deemed appropriate according to a variety of religious discursive texts and scholars. Mahmood (2005) expands the definition of agency to include self-cultivation within power structures instead of only fighting for individual freedom against power structures. In this

way, Mahmood (2005) urges scholars to expand the boundaries of how and when they identify women asserting agency beyond the unnecessarily constricting confines of Western feminism.

This is an extremely important critique that I have incorporated into my dissertation. Specifically, Western post-Marxist feminists might assume that the only ‘appropriate’ way to assert agency and resist the patriarchy would be to demand husbands do more reproductive labor in the household and/or manipulate them into doing more reproductive labor. A number of female and male participants with whom I spoke asserted that Muslim men have a responsibility to do at least some reproductive labor inside of the household, in the same way that the Prophet Mohammad did. At the same time, I show how another way that Moroccan women assert their agency and power within Moroccan society is by drawing on classical Islamic interpretations of the Qur’an in order to say that the husband holds full financial responsibility for all household expenses and in return the wife takes care of the children and household.

Although this argument relegates women’s most important role to caretaker, it could be what the wife wants most and/or finds most fulfilling. Women can often find and assert power within their role as caretaker inside of the kitchen and household (Counihan 2009). For those living in poverty, the degree to which wages bestow personal benefits, let alone economic independence, is uncertain (McClenaghan 1997:29). For these reasons, it might be better for some woman to be financially dependent on a man in order to shield themselves from the structural violence (not emancipatory freedom) that working-class women, especially, may experience by participating in the paid labor force in urban Morocco. As feminism is a “movement to end sexism, sexist exploitation and

oppression” (hooks 2000:viii), this can be viewed as a feminist act. Agency and feminism are not solely rooted in resisting patriarchal structures and I take the desires, words, and actions of the people who shared their lives with me seriously. Because of this, I tried to enter fieldwork without a prescription for an “ideal” distribution of labor or preconceived notion of resistance against patriarchy. Instead, I sought to understand how people negotiate reproductive labor and what factors influence these constant decisions (see Chapter 2). As Ghannam (2013) notes, unlike the pious women that Mahmood spoke to (2005), religion is an important force influencing people’s lives, but it is not the only force doing so. Additionally, not all Muslims actually want to be Good Muslims (Schielke 2015). In addition to realizing that resisting patriarchy is not the only way to assert agency, I also recognize that Islam, while extremely important, is not the only structure dictating the range of possible actions within the lives of the people with whom I spoke (Ghannam 2013).

Participants gave a variety of reasons for wanting to participate in the paid labor force and not wanting to participate in the paid labor force. I use the longer phrase “participating in the paid labor force” in this dissertation to denote anyone working for money, instead of the phrase “working outside” (*khadam ‘la barā*), that most participants used. This is because using the term “working outside” to signify only those working for money outside of the house is exclusionary of women working inside the house for money (such as by weaving rugs) and those working outside of the household (often in agriculture), but not for a direct salary. Many rural Moroccan women regularly work within and outside of the home, but do not receive a salary for doing so (Crawford 2008).

Studying gendered subjectivities does not only mean studying women. Much of the social science research on households was historically conducted by women, about and for women, producing men as a static, stereotypical, and under-problematized construct (Kunovich & Kunovich 2008; Baxter & Kane 1995; Bianchi et al. 2000; Ishii-Kuntz & Coltrane 1992). Social science research on masculinity is strongly informed by Connell's (1995) hegemonic masculinities framework. Scholars critique hegemonic masculinity for reifying a dualism that fails to account for nuance (Demetriou 2001) and change over time (Inhorn & Wentzell 2011), for being theoretically over-determined (Donaldson 1993), and for being difficult to apply to diverse populations (Inhorn 2012). In contrast, my research builds on more recent scholarship that presents more dynamic and thorough pictures of masculinity (Klasson & Ulver 2015; Gorman-Murray 2013; Scott 1994:6), while highlighting the diversity of the male experience (Gutmann 1996; Pineda 2000). Specifically, my dissertation analyzes the ways masculinity and femininity are co-constructed and negotiated in relation to each other through economic and household practices (Connell & Messerschmidt 2005:848).

#### 1.2.4 Classed Subjectivities

In addition to gendered subjectivities, this dissertation also examines how classed subjectivities are continuously created, performed, and subtly transformed within and outside urban middle-class Moroccan households. **Classed subjectivities** are the classed perspectives, feelings, beliefs, and desires of subjects within uneven relations of power (Solomon 2005). This dissertation focuses on gendered and class subjectivities throughout, while recognizing that other aspects of intersectional subjectivities can influence the way that someone is subjected by institutions of authority (Foucault 1980)

and also by examining intersecting axes of identity (such as age, geography, education, family, reputation, etc.). Rather than viewing class as a static “structuring” force in which people stay in a particular class bracket statically throughout their lives, I understand class as a process that is continually happening and evolving throughout someone’s lifetime and throughout various situations (Thompson 1978:147). Despite class being an active process that can change over time, for the purpose of this dissertation, I placed participants in specific socioeconomic class categories based on participants’ education, economic resources, consumption, and job placement, in conjunction with their own self-identification (Boufous & Khariss 2015; Cohen 2000; Goldstein 2012; Armbrust 2003; Davis 2004; de Koning 2009; Dickey 2000). Specifically, I categorized participants into upper class, upper-middle class, middle class, lower-middle class, and working class. I divided the middle class into three sections due to the diversity of participants saying that they were middle class, and because there was significantly fewer upper-class and working-class participants and less diversity within those categories.

It is difficult to define “middle class” because it has been expressed in so many different ways and can be made up of so many diverse types of people (O’Dougherty 2002; Jaffrelot & Veer 2008). How do Moroccans define being “middle class”? Boufous and Khariss (2015) argue that the middle class emerged in post-independence Morocco from the bourgeoisie and working classes, including various government civil servants, merchants, technicians, teachers, and some skilled laborers who spoke Arabic and French. Participants used the direct translation middle-class (*ṭabaqa mutawassṭa*) and associated being middle-class with being an “employee” (*mūzaḥ*) of the Moroccan government with benefits and a pension, and in contrast to working-class or popular

(*sh'bi*) people. When asked to define what makes a Moroccan “middle class,” participants mentioned the importance of “having the necessities.” Participants defined these middle-class necessities as private education, neolocal housing, food, money for private health care, and mobility (having a car and/or taking vacations inside of Morocco).<sup>6</sup>

Because Moroccan urban middle-classes have both greater access to strategies to mitigate tensions and need two spouses to participate in the paid workforce, the middle classes are uniquely situated for research on reproductive labor in Morocco. Unlike working-class Moroccans who have less disposable income, middle-class Moroccans have greater access to a larger variety of ways to mitigate tensions arising from reproductive labor, like the ability to hire a domestic worker, buy household appliances, and/or change food habits. Additionally, middle-class Moroccans likely have more access to higher levels of education, which encourages male and female workforce participation (Alpert 2007). Unlike the upper-class Moroccans who can often live well on one income, both middle-class spouses are likely to work outside the home due to economic necessity (Gray & Finley-Hervey 2005). This dissertation explores both the experiences of those struggling to maintain their class and those firmly entrenched, providing information about a broad cross-section of Moroccan society.

---

<sup>6</sup> For more on Moroccan urban middle-class aspirations and anxieties, see Chapter 4.



### 1.3 Research Context

#### 1.3.1 Middle East & North Africa

Morocco is the Western-most state within the MENA region of the world and has a rich anthropological literature illuminating the ways that Morocco is similar to and different than other nations in the region. The term “Middle East” has been criticized for being Eurocentric, focusing on Europe as the West and everything else as East (i.e. Near East, Far East, Middle East). Instead, some have suggested the use of the term South West Asia and North Africa (SWANA). I recognize the colonial and racist history of the term Middle East but continue to use it because it is the most widely used term for this region in anthropology, social sciences, and area studies.

As Abu-Lughod (1989) and Deeb & Winegar (2012) note, there is a dearth of anthropological research in the MENA region that uses economic anthropology as a lens of analysis or studies finance and labor, a gap that this dissertation helps to fill. Furthermore, while some MENA scholars focus on how youth conceptualize their place in society, few examine what happens when the “generation in waiting” (Dhillon & Yousef 2009) transitions to adulthood by marrying and establishing households. My research explores this, with a specific focus on how these broader socioeconomic and demographic trends shape gendered and classed subjectivities within and outside of the household. Additionally, few studies examine how Arab families have changed over time (Joseph 2018:483) but this study demonstrates how specific Arab-Amazigh Moroccan families, gender relations, and patriarchy have changed over time. Less studies on middle-classness in the MENA region have focused on the intersectional aspect of

classed subjectivities, specifically examining the ways in which gender, household relations, geography, education, and class intersect.

Much research analyzing gender in the MENA region focuses solely on women (Inhorn 2014), with a few exceptions examining masculinity (Ghannam 2013; Ouzgane 2006; Naguib 2015). Studies on gender in the MENA region have made important contributions to anthropological literature, dispelling the false binaries of public and private spheres to show that men and women are active participants in and influence both public and private spheres (Meneley 1996). However, only a handful of researchers explore how MENA men in private spaces “do” domesticity. Although a number of studies exist examining masculinities at home in the Global North (e.g., Meah & Jackson 2013; Swenson 2009), relatively few studies have examined masculinity in the MENA region compared to the rest of the world (Inhorn 2014). My research contributes to the anthropology of masculinities in the MENA region by further examining men’s role in the household and how what it means to be a good father and husband is subtly changing in urban Morocco among the middle-class participants with whom I spoke. This research builds on hegemonic masculinities (Connell & Messerschmidt 2005) to examine multiple masculinities (Sobal 2005) shaped by particular social and historical contexts (Ouzgane 2006), the positionality, and subjectivities of individuals.

Inhorn (2012:71) argues that while historically MENA anthropologists have viewed Middle Eastern men as a “masculine black box,” or as all-powerful patriarchs who do little to actually care for children in the family or foster love, in fact, couples often work together equally to have children and that wives feel supported by their husbands, rather than ignored or antagonized by them. In this way, Inhorn (2012:17)

seeks to analyze embodied subjectivities for Arab men, looking for new ways to engage in the particularities of life, affect, action, cognition, and moral responsibility. My dissertation builds on Inhorn's (2012) work by examining the ways in which Moroccan Muslim men define and actively construct ways of being a good father and husband. Rather than simply supporting a wife's quest to get pregnant, the participants with whom I spoke embodied their gendered subjectivities by purchasing groceries, disciplining their children, and by doing "easy" chores like laundry. In this way, urban middle-class Moroccans' ideas about appropriate gendered subjectivities are changing how urban middle-class Moroccan men and women perform and practice their gender roles.

Adely (2016) also examines new forms of masculinity and femininity in relation to love and marriage by analyzing discourses about marriage among young Jordanian middle-class participants. More university-educated working young men and women in Jordan have the opportunity to court and meet a potential spouse at work, in cafes (also see Deeb & Harb 2013), and at university (instead of family-organized gatherings). More education and career opportunities have also increased the average age of marriage and time for courtship in Jordan (Adely 2016). Rather than emphasizing "hub" or romantic love, Adely's participants discuss "insijam" or compatibility as the basis for marriage: on a cultural, classed, and personal level. While all rejected the notion of traditional marriage (*zawaj taqlidi*), the extent to which partners might know each other before marriage varied. Additionally, some participants emphasized needing to love one another before marriage and others emphasized love growing during marriage (Adely 2016). Adely (2016) argues that most MENA anthropological research represents two types of marriages: arranged marriages inside the family (consanguineous) as traditional

marriages and love marriages as agentive and progressive (Ahearn 2004), but that there is a need for more research into how these types of marriages intersect and play out during marriage. My dissertation demonstrates how “traditional” and “love” marriages are often a false binary. Specifically, I find that love and agency can exist within more “traditional” relationships and that “love” does not always last within “love” marriages. The urban middle-class Moroccan couples with whom I spoke are inching towards companionate marriages and many value both romantic love (*hub*) and compatibility (*insijam*).

### 1.3.2 Morocco

Morocco is an ideal site for exploring changing reproductive labor practices and gendered and classed subjectivities at the household level. In the MENA region, Morocco is one of the only countries to recently change its family status code law (or *mudawana*), which is based on Shari’a law, to be more equitable between the sexes in terms of marriage, divorce, and inheritance (Sadiqi 2008). Consequently, Morocco is a site where men and women are actively renegotiating their places in the family, household, and society (Conway-Long 2006; Newcomb 2009). However, not all Moroccans experience the *mudawana* reform in the same way. Zvan-Elliott (2015) finds that the *mudawana* reform does provide some additional protections for women in the context of marriage but largely leaves divorced, unmarried, or widowed women vulnerable. Additionally, Zvan-Elliott (2015) argues that the reforms disproportionately favor urban middle-class Moroccan women who know about the reform, can read the new law, and can assert their rights in court. In contrast, rural women often do not know the full implications of the law and cannot assert their rights in court (Zvan-Elliott 2015). Similarly, I found that

class, gender, age, geography, etc. all influence the way that gendered and classed subjectivities are practiced and interpreted (Crenshaw 1989; Gonda 2017).

Moroccan women increasingly participate in the paid labor market, delaying marriage and having fewer children (Ayad & Roudi 2006; Assad & Zouari 2003). Women's paid employment in Morocco is particularly complicated because male Moroccans sometimes blame female labor force participation for male unemployment (Conway-Long 2006). In addition to this, the way Moroccan men and women construct their gender, especially in relation to food practices, is changing in urban Morocco (Ennaji 2016; Salime 2012; Dike 2012; Newcomb 2013; Ennaji & Sadiqi 2008; Sadiqi & Ennaji 2006).

In Morocco, ideologies of separate public/private spheres are still present but more women are working outside the home in the paid workforce and asking for help with reproductive labor. Because of this, there are vague borders between men and women's obligations in- and outside the home. Though anthropological literature examines Moroccan women in the public sphere (Ennaji 2016; Cairoli 2011; Newcomb 2009; Ennaji & Sadiqi 2008; Gray 2001; Kapchan 1996; Mernissi 1975), the dearth of research examining men "doing domesticity" is conspicuous. Less research exists exploring how men interact within the private spheres of life, why they do so, and what this means for gendered subjectivities in Morocco. This dissertation works to actively dispel false binaries of public/private, male/female, tradition/modernity, and feminism/Islam.

Rather than focusing on men as reasonable, logical, and acting in public, Ghannam (2013) examines the embodied nature of masculinity for Egyptian men, emphasizing their feelings, emotions, and bodies. Ghannam (2013) finds that masculinity

is dynamic and fluid, changing depending on the context, defined through failures and success, and socially produced as much by women as by men. While Ghannam (2013:84) focuses on how the “eyes, ears and tongues of others” create ideals about and reputations of masculinity, the data I collected shows how urban middle-class younger Moroccan masculinities are changing within households. Similar to the female workers with whom Bouasria (2013) spoke, some participants said that maintaining their husband’s reputation and appearing to “be a man” when neighbors, parents and extended family were present, was important. Despite the importance of appearing to be masculine in front of parents, neighbors, and extended family, many middle-class urban Moroccan men with whom I spoke believed that doing reproductive labor was essential to their role as husband and father in the household [unlike Ghannam (2013)’s and Naguib (2018)’s participants in working-class Cairo]. The participants with whom I spoke often did reproductive labor when extended family members were not present or actively disagreed with their friends or family who commented on their actions. For some participants, masculinity was performed and practiced differently depending on the audience: whether that be for the spouse, parents, extended family, or neighbors. In exploring these processes, this dissertation contributes to literature on dynamic masculinities and the complicated relationship between public and private lives and reputations.

Newcomb (2017) also seeks to explain the myriad of ways in which globalization influences gender, kinship, marriage, reproduction, labor, diet, and housing for middle-class Moroccan Fassi families. Newcomb (2017:23) argues that the experiences of men are often ignored in studies of gender inequality in society and marriage, but that their experiences of marriage and masculinity are important. My dissertation research fills that

gap by analyzing men and women's experiences of marriage, reproductive labor, and gendered and classed subjectivities. In response to infertility, only the wealthiest members of Moroccan society can afford expensive assisted reproductive technologies, which often exist alongside local traditional practices (Newcomb 2017). Despite family members pressuring husbands to either divorce or marry a second wife when a couple faces fertility issues, Moroccan couples, urged by doctors, often decide to stay together regardless of infertility (Newcomb 2017). This shows how the authority of the extended family has declined. My dissertation also shows the growing power of the couple, especially with neolocal residence, even as extended family and kin relations remain important.

### 1.3.3 Urban Morocco

This research took place between April 11, 2018 and September 15, 2019 (about 17 months) in Rabat, the capital of Morocco, and Salé, Rabat's less expensive sister city. Approximately 90% of industry in the country is located between Rabat and Casablanca, and rural Moroccans are often drawn to Rabat in search of employment (Batnitzky 2008). Because Moroccans from the entire country come to Rabat in search of employment, the city is ethnically and linguistically diverse (Abu-Lughod 1980) but the level of female paid formal employment is higher compared to the rest of the country and the data I collected is not representative of Morocco as a whole. Furthermore, a sizable middle-class population lives in Rabat, which often does not exist in other major Moroccan cities, due to the fact that a large portion of the population works for the government (Batnitzky 2008). Unlike many Moroccans in rural regions who live with extended

family in large households, in urban areas more Moroccans are living with nuclear families, often in apartments (Alpert 2007).

It is important to note that the Moroccan political and economic situation during my fieldwork directly impacted the classed subjectivities of the participants with whom I spoke. Despite the potentially destabilizing effects of liberalizing the Moroccan Dirham in 2018, the Moroccan economy remained relatively stable and strong. The Moroccan GDP has grown relatively consistently since 1970 from \$4 billion in 1970 to \$113 billion in 2020. See Table 1 below for an overview of the Moroccan economy over time.

Table 1: Moroccan Economy Over Time

	1970	1980	1990	2000	2010	2020
GDP	\$4 Billion	\$22 Billion	\$30 Billion	\$39 Billion	\$93 Billion	\$113 Billion
Main Industries as % of GDP	--	Services (51%), Industry (31%), Agriculture (18%)	Services (53%), Industry (29%), Agriculture (18%)	Services (58%), Industry (31%), Agriculture (11%)	Services (57%), Industry (31%), Agriculture (12%)	Services (56%), Industry (29%), Agriculture (14%)
Labor Force Participation Rates, total (% of total population age 15-64)	--	--	70%	69.5%	67%	66.5%



Table 1 (continued)

Female Labor Force Participation Rate (% of female population ages 15+)	13%	17%	25%	29%	26%	24%
Male Labor Force Participation Rate (% of male population ages 15+)	--	--	78%	77%	76%	70%
Population	16 Million	20 Million	25 Million	29 Million	32 Million	37 Million

Table 1: This table was created by the author using data from the World Bank. “—” means that data was not available for that time period.

Regardless of the growing economy, most participants said that the cost of living, especially for daily expenses in a big city like Rabat or Sale, is very expensive, particularly compared to 20 years ago. Due to elected Prime Minister Benkirane being unable to create a coalition government for five months at the beginning of his second term in late 2016, King Mohammad VI appointed Saad-Eddine El Othmani to be Prime Minister in March 2017. Othmani remains Morocco’s Prime Minister. The King-appointed Prime Minister contributed to a feeling among those with whom I spoke of disinterest in politics and a feeling that the government would not actually help the Moroccan people. In this climate in 2018 and 2019, a variety of protests did emerge around the sentencing of leaders of the Hirak social movement in the North/Rif region of Morocco in April 2018, against companies spending money on a large annual concert

Mawazine<sup>7</sup> in May 2018, and contract government teachers demanding guaranteed work and retirement benefits March-April 2019. To my knowledge, no participants that with whom I spoke participated in these protests. During Summer 2018, a significant number of Moroccans, including several of those with whom I spoke, boycotted Sidi Ali water and products, Afrikiya gasoline, and Centrale/Danon dairy products due to high costs for the Moroccan consumer. The boycott demonstrates how frustrated many Moroccans felt during my fieldwork about large Moroccan and foreign companies controlling the prices of everyday goods with little competition and often at high prices for consumers. This economic and political snapshot shows that even though participants focused most on living their lives and taking care of their families, they were also aware of what was happening around them politically in and outside of Morocco.

#### 1.4 Methodology

During seventeen months of fieldwork living in Rabat, Morocco, I explored how women entering the paid work force influences the distribution of reproductive labor among middle-class Moroccans in Rabat and Salé. My research is grounded in practice theory, noting that our understandings of the world actively influence the way that we produce and change the world we live in, highlighting the dialectical relationship between agency and structure (O'Dougherty 2002). Research included interviewing fifty-three married, adult Moroccan men and women and four adult American men and women who were married to Moroccans. In addition to this, participant observation consisted of

---

<sup>7</sup> Mawazine is a large annual concert organized by the Moroccan government and multiple large Moroccan companies that brings in various well-known international and Moroccan artists to perform in Rabat right after students are done with their high school exams (Baccalauréat).

deep hanging out (Geertz 1998) with participants in their places of work, at homes, and during weddings, Ramadan, holidays, and other special occasions. Of 57 interviews, 48 were conducted in Moroccan Arabic (*dārija*) (84%), with the exception of nine participants who said they preferred English (16%). The interviews in English were conducted with the four Moroccan-American couples who preferred English for better communication with their American spouse, in addition to two participants who wanted to practice their English. Participation was limited to households where the husband works outside the home, although not necessarily as the main breadwinner. The dissertation research includes households with and without children. The project excludes those households maintained through a women's income alone because I am specifically exploring the distribution of reproductive labor within households where both spouses are engaged in waged labor. Households, centered around a married couple, served as the main unit of analysis for my study. However, I also analyzed parent/child relationships, relationships with in-laws, sibling relationships, and larger extended family relationships. Using a purposive sampling strategy, I recruited participants through contacts established during preliminary research, volunteering teaching English, and the chain-referral method (Gobo 2008). I pursued a representative overall sample, specifically searching for diversity within confounding variables: age, participants' length of marriage, education levels, existence/number of children, and household structure (multi-generational or nuclear). However, the sample was skewed based on the willingness and availability of participants.

The majority of participants were between the ages of 24-48 (74%), with about 26% being 50-70 years old. Being a female researcher, Moroccan women were more

willing to speak with me compared to Moroccan men, but 42% of participants are male (24) and 58% are female (33). Of 34 households, 24 had the wife participating in the paid labor force full time (71%). The households are slightly skewed towards being married over 7 years, with 44% of households being “newly” married for under 7 years (15 households).<sup>8</sup> Participants’ classes ranged from lower class to upper class, but most were middle and upper-middle class. I evaluated socioeconomic class membership through participants’ assessments of their class in addition to their education, economic resources, consumption, and job placement (Armbrust 2003; Cohen 2000; de Koning 2009). In the table below, I use “lower class” because this was the terminology in Moroccan Arabic that participants used to describe their social class, in addition to me verifying this through the means mentioned above. I also use the term “working-class” throughout the dissertation to denote participants and things that were identified as “popular” or sh‘bī. Specifically, 15% of households were lower class (5 households/34), 12% lower middle class (4), 41% middle class (14), 26% upper middle class (9), and 6% upper class (2). Owning a home, automatic washing machine, car, and employing a household employee often were all associated with being middle or upper class in Moroccan society. These factors are included in the tables below (Table 2 and 3) to give the reader a better sense of the participants’ socioeconomic class and their social standing in Moroccan society.

---

<sup>8</sup> “Newly-married” is defined by being married within the past seven years (Ranade 2011; Holmberg et al 2004; Chang & Chan 2007).

Table 2: Participant Socioeconomic Class Information

<b>Number</b>	<b># of inhabitants living in household currently</b>	<b>Ages (wife, husband, children, other family)</b>	<b>Socioeconomic Class</b>	<b>Rent or Own</b>	<b>Washing Machine</b>	<b>Car</b>	<b>Household Employee</b>	<b>Education Level</b>
1. Wife, Husband, Children	5	29, 38, 8, 4, 1	Lower Class	Own (his parent's house)	Yes (semi-automatic)	Yes; motorcycle	No	Middle School; Elementary School
2. Wife (W), Husband, Children	5	39, 60, 19, 18, 11	Lower Class	Own (his parent's house)	Yes (automatic)	No	No	Middle School; Some High School
3. Wife, Husband, Husband's Mother	3	29, (?), (?)	Lower Class	Own (his mother's house)	Yes (mother-in-law's semi-automatic)	Yes; motorcycle	No	Some High School; ?
4. Wife, Husband, Children	7	53, 65, 33, 27, 27, 22, 20	Lower Class	Rent	No (broken)	No	No	None
5. Wife (W), Husband	2	50, 50	Working Class	Rent	Yes	No	No	Some High School; Elementary School

Table 2 (continued)

6. Wife (W), Husband, Daughters	4	61, 70, 28, 25	Lower Middle Class	Own (her parent's house)	Yes (automatic)	Yes	No	None; High School
7. Wife (W), Husband	2	30, (?)	Lower Middle Class	Rent	Yes (automatic)	No	No	Bachelor's
8. Wife, Husband	2	64, 69	Lower Middle Class	Own	Yes	No	Yes (1x/year)	None; Elementary School
9. Wife (W), Husband, Children	4	43, ?, 6, 2	Lower Middle Class	Own (credit)	Yes	Yes	Yes (2x/month)	Some High School
10. Wife (W), Husband, Children	5	51, ?, ?, ?	Middle Class	Rent	Yes	Yes	No	Elementary School and Stylist Degree; ?
11. Wife (W), Husband	2	40, 42	Middle Class	Own (his parent's house)	Yes	No	No	Some University; Masters
12. Wife (W), Husband, Sons	5	42, 48, 10, 8, 3	Middle Class	Rent	Yes (automatic)	Yes	Yes (4x/week)	Bachelor's; Associate's
13. Wife (W), Husband	2	36, 30	Middle Class	Rent	No	No	No	Some Bachelor's; High School

Table 2 (continued)

14. Wife (W), Husband, Daughter, Husband's Mother	4	30, 39, 2, ?	Middle Class	Own (his mother's house)	Yes	Yes	No	?, Some University
15. Wife (W), Husband	2	27, 27	Middle Class	Rent	Yes	Yes	No	Master's; Bachelor's
16. Wife (W), Husband, Children	5	44, 47, 23, 14, 4	Middle Class	Rent	Yes	Yes	Yes (1x/2 months)	Some High School; Some High School
17. Wife, Husband, Son	3	64, 70, 29	Middle Class	Own	Yes (semi-automatic)	No	Yes (2x/month)	Literacy Classes; Middle School
18. Wife (W), Husband, Sons	4	34, 36, 4, 1	Middle Class	Own (credit)	Yes	Yes	Yes (2x/month)	Master's Degree; Some PhD
19. Wife, Husband, Daughter	3	42, 47, 5	Middle Class	Own (his parent's house)	Yes	Yes	Yes (1x/3 months)	High School; Bachelor's
20. Wife (W), Husband	2	31, 40	Middle Class	Rent	Yes	Yes	No	Bachelor's; Some High School

Table 2 (continued)

21. Wife (W), Husband, Children	5	36, 43, 13, 9, 4	Middle Class	Own (credit)	Yes (automatic)	Yes	Yes (4x/year)	Some University; Associates'
22. Wife, Husband, Twin girls	4	38, 35, 4, 4	Middle Class	Own (credit)	Yes	Yes	Yes (2x/year)	Bachelor's Bachelor's
23. Wife (W), Husband	2	31, 33	Middle Class	Rent	Yes (semi-automatic)	No	No	Some PhD; Some PhD
24. Wife, Husband, Children	6	43, ?, 21, 17, 16, 7	Upper Middle Class	Own	Yes	Yes	Yes (1x/month)	Some University
25. Wife, Son, Husband's Mother, Brother, Sister and Nephew	5	32, 1, ?, ?, ?, ?	Upper Middle Class	Rent	Yes (automatic)	Yes	No	Bachelor's
26. Wife (W), Husband, Children	5	42, 41, 12, 9, 6	Upper Middle Class	Rent	Yes (automatic)	Yes (2)	Yes (daily)	Master's; PhD
27. Wife (W), Husband	2	24, 31	Upper Middle Class	Rent	Yes (semi-automatic)	Yes	Yes (1x/month)	Bachelor's; PhD
28. Wife (W), Husband, Daughter	3	43, 43, 1	Upper Middle Class	Own (his parent's house)	Yes	Yes	No (occasionally)	Bachelor's; PhD
29. Wife (W), Husband, Children	5	44, (?), 15, 13, 9	Upper Middle Class	Own (built it)	Yes (automatic)	Yes	Yes (4x/month)	Associate's



Table 2 (continued)

30. Wife (W), Husband, Daughter	3	58, 62, 17	Upper Middle Class	Own	Yes (automatic; semi-automatic)	Yes	No	Bachelor's; PhD
31. Wife, Husband, Adult Daughter	3	63, 68, 40	Upper Middle Class	Own	Yes	Yes	Yes (2x/month)	Some Middle School; Middle School
32. Wife (W), Husband, Children	5	43, (?), 14, 13, 10	Upper Middle Class	Own	Yes (automatic)	Yes	No	Some PhD
33. Wife (W), Husband	2	43, ?	Upper Class	Rent	Yes	Yes (2)	Yes (daily)	Master's
34. Wife (W), Husband, Children	3	34, 36, 2	Upper Class	Rent	Yes	Yes	Yes (daily)	Bachelor's; Master's

Table 2: List of participants included in the study and corresponding information. A (W) means that the wife is participating in the paid labor force. A (?) means that I did not ask the age of the spouse or household member of the participant that I interviewed.

Table 3: Occupations by Class

	Typical Occupations of Participants:
Lower Class	Homemaker; Chauffeur; Preschool Teacher; Household Employee; Wedding Attendant; Small Business Owner; Nanny; Construction Worker
Lower Middle Class	Household Employee; Nanny, Private Elementary School Teacher (English); Retired Embassy Guard; Homemaker; Taxi Driver; Pharmacy Assistant

Table 3 (continued)

Middle Class	Small Business Owner; Banker; Café Manager; Private High School Teacher (English); Study Abroad Coordinator; Online Tourism Management; Blogger/Free-Lance Writer; Secretary; Security Guard; Homemaker; Retired Military; Public High School Teacher (Geography/History; French); Computer Engineer; Café Owner; Call Center Manager; Language Tutor; Call Center Worker; Company Driver; English Language Center Teacher; English Language Center Manager
Upper Middle Class	Computer Engineer; Public High School Teacher (Islamic Studies); Government Civil Servant; Public High School Teacher (Physics; Math); Private High School Teacher (Math); Professor (Physics); Homemaker; Retired Military
Upper Class	NGO Evaluations Manager; Computer Engineer; Business Owner

Table 3: List of participants' occupations divided by socioeconomic class. <sup>9</sup>

#### 1.4.1 Semi-Structured Interviews

Semi-structured interviews let me ask questions to begin the interview or spur it during gaps, but also allowed the participant to lead the interview, reducing bias from myself (Weller 2014). The interviews were conducted with male and female spouses separately when possible in order to compare their perceptions and avoid a stronger personality dominating the voice of their spouse. However, some couples were interviewed together, especially if it was more convenient for participants. Interviews provided data about the following topics: labor outside the home, reproductive labor in the present and reproductive labor during childhood, gender roles, and middle-class identities. I asked participants about the nature of their labor outside the home, and if applicable, analyzed its effects on reproductive labor. I asked participants to free list

---

<sup>9</sup> I put participants' occupations in a separate table (Table 3), divided by class, in order to protect participants' anonymity and give the reader a sense of different professions and overlap between socioeconomic class classifications.

domestic tasks involving but not limited to cleaning, cooking, and childcare, and asked specific questions about how this labor is distributed, how it compares to their childhood households, and how and why it fluctuates. I changed the interview questions twice. The first time was to streamline the questions from 53 questions to 41 questions and the second time was to ask more appropriately-worded questions. For a full list of interview questions in English and Moroccan Arabic, see the appendices. My full name is Miriam Ruth Dike but I have gone by Ruth most of my life. However, because Miriam is a very common name in Morocco, I chose to go by Miriam while in Morocco. In transcripts from data, I use “Ruth” to demarcate myself because most reading this dissertation know me by Ruth.

#### 1.4.2 Participant Observation

I conducted participant observation from April 2018 to September 2019 within and outside of homes where the participants live and work, focusing on gender roles and reproductive labor. While conducting participant observation in participants’ homes, I also conducted opportunistic informal interviews with family members who live with the middle-class families and/or while household employees were working. I used structured participant observation (Glazier & Powell 1992) to ensure households were observed at a variety of different times in order to take note of cooking, cleaning, and childcare across different times of the day, week, month, and seasons. The field notes simultaneously constitute data and analysis of that data (DeWalt & DeWalt 2011), which I later typed and coded for further analysis.

Additionally, towards the end of my fieldwork I lived with four different families for a week each to gain more fine-grained data on exactly who did which kinds of

reproductive labor. The families were selected to include two families with the wife participating in the paid labor force and two not, in addition to two families with upper-middle class backgrounds and two working-class families. I asked each family to treat me as a family member, rather than as a guest, and reinforced this by helping with childcare, cooking, clearing tables, and some cleaning. I also bought groceries or meals for the families as a small thank you and to partially counteract the financial strain of having an extra person to feed for a week. I chose to spend a week with each family because I wanted to see how the distribution of reproductive labor changed throughout the week from workdays to the weekend. Overall, the participant observation data describing who did which types of reproductive labor supports the answers that participants gave in interviews.

#### 1.4.3 Data Analysis

Using a grounded theory approach, all interviews and participant observation data were analyzed through an iterative, cyclical process including data collection, data inspection, and theoretical reasoning resulting in open coding (Emerson et al. 1995; Charmaz 2014; Hames & Paolisso 2014; Glaser & Strauss 1967). I identified rich ethnographic areas for further selective coding (Emerson et al. 1995:179-185). I then cross indexed the data between interviews and participant observation to note similarities, differences, and omissions or silences (Hames & Paolisso 2014). Qualitative methods more adequately capture the multifaceted phenomena and complexities of everyday life (Glaser & Strauss 1967; Higgins 2015; Fetterman 2009; Pink 2009; Gobo 2008; Cerwonka & Malkki 2007). Interviews allowed participants to explain in their own words how and why they distribute reproductive labor in a particular way. I used participant

observation data to study and compare the distribution of reproductive labor among households and to analyze the ways in which families mitigate tensions that may arise from reproductive labor.

Interview responses and participant observation data from households with women and men working outside the home was systematically compared to data from households with only men working outside the home. Although the research is not able to generate statistically relevant data, the data presents meaningful identifiable differences between the two groups. The dissertation research also compares participants' length of marriage, education level, number of children, and household structure (multigenerational or nuclear) to the distribution of reproductive labor, determining how these factors influence a more or less equitable division of reproductive labor (see chapter 2). The analyses included are based on common themes that arose from the data. I chose not to use the phrase "my participants" in order to dispel any notion of my ownership of the words that participants and friends shared with me. I have edited direct quotes slightly for clarity, maintaining the original intention of participants' words. While I have pulled a snapshot of quotes from interviews and informal interactions, the selected quotes are representative of my other findings. This dissertation includes only a fraction of the data I collected, but highlights the strongest arguments with representative samples of data.

#### 1.4.4 Limitations of Study

The main limitation of this study is the small sample size (57 participants) and lack of diversity among participants, who were mainly from the urban area of Rabat-Salé. The sample is non-random and non-representative of the larger population of Morocco. The participants tend to be more middle and middle-upper class compared to the majority

of Moroccans. Additionally, I only interviewed and spent time with participants living in mainly one large urban area, which is different from other urban and from rural areas in Morocco. Rabat has a larger professional middle-class population because it is the capital city of the country and the second largest city in Morocco. The research was mainly conducted within different neighborhoods of Rabat-Salé, specifically the neighborhoods of Bāb l ḥād (where I lived), L'Ocean, Yacoub Mansour, Takkadoum, and Harhoura in Rabat and the Qariya, Hay Salam, Sidi Moussa, Tabriquet, Sla Jadida, and Doha neighborhoods in Salé. Due to living in urban areas, participants could only speak to their experiences of living in urban areas at the time of the interview and in some cases remembering what it was like to grow up in rural places before moving to Rabat for work or marriage. This study is also not representative of the larger North Africa or Middle East regions. In sum, the data I collected is not representative of all inhabitants of Rabat, Morocco; the broader MENA region; or of Muslim, married, or middle-class populations.

I interviewed members of 34 households, but not both the husband and the wife for every household, due to availability of the spouse. Of the 34 households, I interviewed both husband and wife for 23 households (68%) but only one spouse for 11 households (32%), hence the difference in 34 households, but only 57 participants. I focused on interviewing as many married Moroccans that were willing to speak with me and spending as much time as possible in people's homes gathering participant observation data. Although I was able to gather multi-generational data by interviewing a married couple and their parents within two families, most of the data I collected is a snapshot of urban middle-class Moroccans aged 24-48. The dataset could have been strengthened by including more data from multi-generational families, in addition to a

more diverse population and/or focusing more on inter-familial relations. I did hear a number of complaints from Moroccan wives with whom I spoke about their husbands not doing reproductive labor, probably due to my positionality as a wife. However, I did not hear many complaints from Moroccan husbands with whom I spoke complaining about the way their wives do reproductive labor. This is a limitation of my study.

#### 1.4.5 Positionality

As a white, young, married American woman, it is important to think about my positionality in relation to what participants say, do, and choose to omit from interviews and informal conversations. Americans, especially white Americans, are privileged in Morocco. Due to my position as a married woman, it was easier to gain access to married women, who constitute the majority of participants. Most Moroccans with whom I spoke have an idea about “Western” feminism, especially middle and upper-middle class Moroccans. Some probably feel that I valued flexible gender roles and household divisions of labor in which men perform some of the reproductive labor, in contrast to those where women are responsible for most or all of reproductive labor. Due to this, participants may have over-estimated or emphasized Moroccan men doing reproductive labor in order to appear more “progressive.”

Some participants also assumed that the division of labor was equal between men and women in the U.S. When, during an interview, 31-year-old AbdulWahed said, “In America maybe people actually split the work 50/50,” I immediately said, “That’s not true.” AbdulWahed went on to say, “So, in Morocco I can feel it changing, changing a little bit by bit.” I then tried to dispel the myth of gender equity in the U.S. by saying that American women still do more than American men on average and mentioned personal

examples from my own family and life (i.e., “My dad knows how to cook 2 things: omelets and salmon croquettes”). During another interview, 38-year-old Samira said, “Only some men help and even if they do, they just do little things like taking care of the children while the woman is doing everything.” I added that, “Even in America, it’s hard to find households who do housework equally” and Samira agreed, “Yes, that’s why women feel so much pressure that they decide to quit their jobs and stay at home.” By providing an example from my own country, Samira might have felt more comfortable sharing her opinions and experiences. However, by saying “even in America,” I was implying that while people might think that in the U.S. the distribution of reproductive labor between women and men is equal, it is surprisingly unequal. Unfortunately, this comment perpetuated a problematic imaginary of a global hierarchy in which the U.S. is presumably higher-ranked than Morocco based on Western feminist ideas about gender equality. In contrast, I actually argue that Americans should learn from Moroccans more about how and why younger urban middle-class Moroccan men are doing more reproductive labor than their father’s generation. This is important because it denotes a significant change within one generation.

## 1.5 Why does this matter?

### 1.5.1 Why does this matter to me?

My grandmother, mother, and myself all worked outside the house full-time and were married, but had very different experiences and expectations regarding our husbands’ contributions to reproductive labor within and outside of the household. My grandmother on my mom’s side, Sally, did all of the reproductive labor around the house



while my grandfather, Papa, did not cook, clean, or take care of the children (that I know of). Sally also worked full-time as a middle-school math teacher, taking off a few years when my mother and uncle were young children. Papa became blind when my mother and uncle were 16 and 14 years old and Sally took care of Papa from then on. However, from talking with my mom, it is my understanding that even before Papa was blind, Sally would still do all of the reproductive labor in the house and participated in the paid labor force full-time while Papa only participated in the paid labor force full-time. I would estimate that Papa did no reproductive labor and Sally did 100% (maybe with the exception of helping with the children occasionally).

My mother stipulated in her marriage contract that she would never have to turn on the dishwashing machine. When my sisters and I were growing up, my mother frequently joked that she had children so that they would do the dishes or clean the house for her. Like Sally, my mother worked full-time as a special education teacher and my dad is a software engineer. When growing up, I remember that my mom would always organize dinner either by cooking it or making sure that everyone ate. My mother also cleaned the house regularly and organized the duties of her three daughters in helping clean the house. My mother raised us and my father was the reinforcement disciplinarian when needed. My oldest sister Sara was also expected to take care of her younger sisters because she was five years older than my middle sister Katharine and seven years older than myself. Mom did expect Dad (or one of her three daughters) to do the dishes and he occasionally cooked salmon croquets, omelets, tuna fish, or grilled (the extent of his culinary repertoire). I would estimate that my father did about 20% of the reproductive labor and my mother 80%.

Within my own marriage, my husband and I share responsibilities of cleaning the house and cooking. While I routinely straighten the house, Mario actually vacuums and cleans the bathroom. We both cook at different times for different occasions and both do the dishes and laundry together regularly. We do not have children to care for. I would estimate that Mario does 40% of the reproductive labor and I do 60%. Reproductive labor has been important in our lives because it takes up so much time and is somewhat connected to our role as women and wives. I feel like my grandmother, my mother, and myself all view our houses and households as an extension of our identity as women, something that also came up with the Moroccan women with whom I spoke. My own family history shows how gendered subjectivities regarding who should do reproductive labor can change slowly over three generations. The data with younger urban middle-class Moroccans shows that reproductive labor can change more quickly within one generation.

Although these examples show men doing more reproductive labor progressively from the 1960's to the present in the US, I categorically reject the teleological notion that society is consistently marching towards gender equality. Rather, history shows that at times things have gotten better and at times worse for different people but that there is no consistent progressive movement towards gender equality that all people in the world have experienced.

#### 1.5.2 Why is this important to society? What's at stake here?

Reproductive labor is important to study because women do disproportionately more reproductive labor than men throughout the world, even as more women enter the paid workforce (Hollows 2003:230; Swenson 2009:47; Kan et al. 2011; Gutmann

1999:167; Fuwa 2004). By feeding, clothing, and cleaning up after members of a household, reproductive labor enables the reproduction of the household, society, capitalism (Chibnik 2011), and social relations. If (mainly) women did not ensure the procurement of food, clothes, childcare, and clean the house, the household and society would not be able to reproduce itself. Additionally, women who perform reproductive labor (either through paid or unpaid paths) allow especially male, but also female workers, in a capitalist society to work longer hours. Reproductive labor, and especially hosting family and friends informally at home and at parties, also ensures the reproduction of social relations. Childrearing, another crucial component of reproductive labor, is also equally important for the reproduction of social relations. As the COVID-19 pandemic has demonstrated, it is possible to maintain social relations without face to face interactions within someone's home, but hosting friends and family in the home is important in many societies, especially Moroccan society (Newcomb 2013). The importance of reproductive labor has only become more apparent during the COVID-19 pandemic starting in 2020. As many workers were forced to stay home due to the pandemic, childcare, cleaning, and other domestic responsibilities were disproportionately borne by women, even if both spouses participated in the paid labor force full-time.

### 1.5.3 Why does it matter to research participants?

While in Morocco, I noticed that Moroccan women, especially those who worked outside the house, and especially those who had small children under the age of five years old, were extremely tired. I attributed this to the “second shift” (Hochschild 1989),

working outside the home for paid labor in addition to working inside the home as unpaid labor. While talking with Amal (42 years old), she said:

*Amal: Before having a housekeeper, I was about to lose my mind, I had to do everything inside and outside. I also had to correct exams at home and this made me mad at my kids, my husband and myself. Luckily my husband understands my case otherwise we would've been divorced now; he knows how to calm me down. Sometimes I become aggressive with my children.*

*Ruth: It's tough.*

Amal explains how hard it was for her to work full time as an English teacher at a private high school in addition to taking care of her children, husband, herself, and the house without additional help. This was before Amal and Yahia (48 years old) could afford a household employee at the beginning of their careers as teachers, but also when their three boys were quite young and needed more attention. This is important to the research participants with whom I spoke because completing reproductive labor added stress to their lives, for both men and women, but especially for women.

#### 1.5.4 Why does it matter to other scholars in the region?

Although my dissertation builds on Western Feminist scholarship, my analysis is driven by the grounded theory of participants' experiences (Charmaz 2014) and their own words and actions. In this way, I engage with Western theories but I do not privilege them over the theories of the participants with whom I spoke. This ethnography is important to scholars in the MENA region because it does not exoticize the MENA region or its people by focusing on women's oppression (without discussing their

agency), religion as an all-encompassing or all-explanatory force within society, or political instability. Such exoticized accounts of the MENA region can reify a problematic orientalist image asserting that the East is everything (violent, Muslim, backwards) that the West is not (peaceful, Christian, progressive) (Said 1979). Instead, this dissertation provides an everyday account of how people live their lives and decide who is going to do the dishes after dinner, providing a solid ethnographic account of household affairs.

#### 1.5.5 Why does this matter to other scholars not in the region?

This research deepens our understanding of how and why households create more equitable distributions of reproductive labor, a persistent form of feminized labor that underpins the reproduction of society and capitalism. While a number of studies have focused on the quantitative aspects of reproductive labor (e.g. Kan et al. 2011; Gutmann 1999:167; Fuwa 2004; Geist 2005; Yodanis 2005; Hook 2004; Davis and Greenstein 2004), my research uses a qualitative approach to analyze how gendered and classed subjectivities are continuously created, performed, and subtly transformed within and outside of the household. Although the majority of my research is focused on intersections between married Moroccan husbands and wives, I also captured and highlighted the role of siblings, children, parents, in-laws, and extended family members in influencing gendered and classed subjectivities. Further, rather than focusing on how globalization influences households (Donner 2008, Jaffrelot & Veer 2008, Mcewan et al 2015, O'Dougherty 2002, Aaftaab 2013), the dissertation project places the household at the epicenter of change, examining how change emanates locally. Finally, instead of trying to explain what Moroccans need to learn from Western feminists or Americans, I

assert that Americans and Western scholars need to learn from Moroccans about how and why their distributions of reproductive labor are changing relatively quickly for urban middle-class Moroccans. In this way, I attempt to reverse persistent (neo)colonial power dynamics.

## 1.6 Overview of Chapters

The second chapter demonstrates how gendered subjectivities and reproductive labor co-constitute one another by analyzing the structures that influence household decision-making processes with particular attention to power. Specifically, this chapter analyzes how economics and labor, religion, family structure, children and childcare, education, and class influence how labor is distributed within and outside of the household. This chapter demonstrates how the household is a central location where gender roles are negotiated and reproduced. In analyzing the way that gendered subjectivities and reproductive labor co-constitute one another across various household units, I highlight the variety of gendered subjectivities and practices across households and the individual perspectives that collectively influence household reproductive labor negotiations.

The third chapter analyzes how urban middle-class men “do domesticity” throughout the life course and the small, slow changes in Moroccan middle-class masculinities among younger generations. Though extensive literature exists on Moroccan women in the public sphere (Cairolì 2011), simultaneously less research explores the ways in which Moroccan men “do domesticity” and interact within the private spheres of life. Women still do the majority of reproductive labor in every family

with whom I spoke but men are helping in significant ways, especially for middle-upper class families younger than 50 years old.

The fourth chapter analyzes Moroccan middle-class subjectivities by examining their intersecting forms of capital, their effect on the market economy and finally the sociocultural, religious, and affective dimensions of obtaining markers of middle-classness through bank loans. This chapter combines a Marxist-inspired material approach and Bourdieu-inspired symbolic approach to examine the material, affective, and symbolic dimensions of class. The existing research on middle classes often examines the influence of globalization and economic reform on household consumption patterns (Donner 2008; Jaffrelot & Veer 2008; Mcewan et al 2015; O'Dougherty 2002; Aaftaab 2013). In contrast, my research builds on Freeman (2000) to show how local phenomena influence the global market economy.

The fifth chapter examines how Moroccan middle-class marital relations are changing in relation to companionate marriage and criticisms of the new middle-class marital relations. Companionate marriages are generally defined by neolocal nuclear family, individual choice of spouse, an emphasis on emotional connection and gratification, fidelity, monogamy, an emphasis on verbal expressions of love rather than actions, and a preference for the company of one's spouse to familial or same-sex sociality (Hirsch & Wardlow 2006; Kipnis 2005). I discuss the ways in which urban middle-class marriages align and diverge from companionate marriages. This chapter examines how urban Moroccan middle-class subjectivities and companionate marriage relations (Hirsch & Wardlow 2006) co-constitute one another. Specifically, I found that urban middle-class Moroccan marriages are characterized by their individual choice of

spouse, neolocal nuclear family household, being open to the world and consumption (which participants name “open-mindedness”), sharing responsibilities, and communication. I also analyze the working-class critique of urban middle-class marriages for being more like a company than a marriage.

Convenience technologies have the ability to change the way people do reproductive labor, or labor associated with caregiving and domestic roles, in their households. The sixth chapter examines how convenience technology challenges and reinforces gendered and classed subjectivities for urban middle-class Moroccans. Although experiences of “convenience” are highly variable, gender and socioeconomic class influence experiences of convenience technologies. Convenience technologies help urban Moroccan women by opening up reproductive labor to men and children but, simultaneously, hurt urban Moroccan women by devaluing their reproductive labor in relation to men’s labor. Convenience technologies reinforce classed subjectivities by supporting a household’s reputation and validating urban Moroccans’ perceptions of themselves as citizens of a developed nation-state. Besides expressing class, convenience technologies can contribute to a restructuring of women’s position within the household. The final chapter reviews the main findings and questions in need of further research.



## CHAPTER 2. WHO'S DOING THE DISHES? GENDERED SUBJECTIVITIES AND REPRODUCTIVE LABOR

### 2.1 Introduction

In an interview, in his home in Rabat, the 43-year-old Physics professor Saad explains how he does not have any specific domestic tasks or a role in the house: “*My responsibility now is mainly [my 1-year-old daughter] Alae. I help sometimes by putting the dishes in the machine. I don't have specific responsibilities that I do every day... I don't have a specific role in the house.*” Despite also participating in the paid work force full time, Saad's wife Ilham is responsible for keeping the house clean, cooking, and taking care of Alae most of the time. In another interview with 43-year-old Malika, she explains her family's responsibilities in the house, “*When I'm home, I clean and cook with the help of my kids, they exchange roles between them. But when I'm not home my husband cleans and cooks and does the dishes. He does this almost every day. He helps a lot with housework.*” While Malika has more regular work hours as an Islamic Studies teacher at a high school in Salé and a doctoral candidate in Islamic Studies, her husband owns his own business and is frequently home more often than Malika. In contrast to Malika's husband doing reproductive labor in the house when his wife is not home, Saad does not feel he has defined household responsibilities. Although Saad and Malika are both middle-class urban Moroccans of the same age with spouses that work outside the home, these two examples show the diversity of daily practices regarding reproductive labor in urban Moroccan families.

This chapter demonstrates how gendered subjectivities and reproductive labor co-constitute one another by analyzing the structures that influence household decision-

making processes, with particular attention to power. Specifically, this chapter analyzes how economics and labor, religion, family structure, children and childcare, education, and class influence how labor is distributed within and outside of the household. It explores who does reproductive and paid labor, the types of labor different household members do, how much reproductive labor they do, and how regularly they do this labor. Gendered subjectivities are the perspectives, feelings, beliefs, and desires of diverse gendered subjects (Solomon 2005). Reproductive labor is broadly defined as unpaid and paid labor associated with care giving and domestic roles including but not limited to cleaning, cooking, and childcare (Smith 2013). Various factors influence household labor negotiations and practices, including who participates in the paid labor force, how participants interpret Islamic teachings in their daily lives, and whether a nuclear family lives with extended family. Additionally, the presence or absence of children and the number of children has a significant impact, as do education and social class. Moroccan men are generally more associated with public spaces and activities (open-air markets, cafés, taking out the trash, etc.), while women are more associated with private spaces and activities in the home, like cooking, cleaning, and childcare (Kapchan 1996). Because of this, reproductive labor is generally gendered as female in Moroccan society.

For the majority of this chapter, I use the household as the basic unit of analysis, rather than the individual. I do so because it enables me to illustrate how household labor practices emerge from decisions negotiated among household members rather than unilateral decisions made by individuals. Although I use households as the basic unit of analysis in this chapter, I do not assume that every household member has the same goals, opinions, or practices within a household (Chibnik 2011:170). Additionally, I

explicitly seek to uncover power dynamics within the household, especially regarding gender, class, and age.

Within this chapter, I define households as individuals living together and pooling their collective resources as one unit (Chibnik 2011). This definition does not explicitly mention families, but all the households that I discuss in this dissertation happen to be a part of various family units. The constitution of a household, who is residing within and participating in it, can often change based on a variety of variables. Most of the households with whom I spoke remained relatively stable in their make-up throughout the 17 months of fieldwork. Methodologically, this approach influenced how I analyzed the data that I collected. Instead of analyzing individual interview transcripts in isolation, I situated them within their household context. The household is an especially appropriate unit of analysis for analyzing reproductive labor because reproductive labor (cooking, cleaning, childcare, etc.) most often happens within a household and helps reproduce the household as a unit. By feeding, clothing, and cleaning up after members of a households, reproductive labor enables the reproduction of household members and society at large. The household is also a key location where gender roles are negotiated amidst more women going to work (Chant 2002). By analyzing the way that gendered subjectivities and reproductive labor co-constitute one another across various household units, I highlight the variety of gendered subjectivities and practices across households and the individual perspectives that collectively influence and contribute to households.

## 2.2 Reproductive Labor Literature

Men do not perform reproductive labor at an equivalent rate to women, even as more women around the world enter the paid labor force (Meah & Jackson 2013; Hollows 2003:230; Swenson 2009:47; Kan et al. 2011; Gutmann 1999:167; Fuwa 2004; Geist 2005; Yodanis 2005; Hook 2004; Davis and Greenstein 2004; Batalova & Cohen 2002). While women around the world spend an average of three to six hours on unpaid care activities every day, men only spend between half an hour and two hours (Ferrant, Pesando & Nowacka 2014). In Morocco in 2011, women over the age of 15 spent about five hours a day on unpaid reproductive labor and Moroccan men over the age of 15 spent less than one hour a day on unpaid reproductive labor (Musawah 2018). This enduring form of feminized labor is often unaccounted for in national economic statistics despite its crucial role in the reproduction of society and capitalism (Chibnik 2011; Rubin 1975).

Some participants use the term “traditional” to describe gender roles associated with men participating in the paid labor force full time outside of the home and women being responsible for all reproductive labor inside of the home, without participating in the paid labor force. However, this “traditional ideal” never existed, in practice, for *all* of Moroccan society. Additionally, such notions of men occupying public space and women occupying private space perpetuate problematic oriental tropes, are unrepresentative of reality, and deny the existence of working-class, unmarried, and rural Moroccan women who often do work outside the home, for an income or not (Kapchan 1996; Cairoli 2011; Crawford 2008). Talking about rural households as “traditional” in contrast to more “modern” urban households falsely implies that rurality is forever stuck in a “traditional”

past while the urban world is dynamic and changing (Crawford 2008:1).<sup>10</sup> Although this chapter employs “traditional gender roles” as an ideological term used by participants, it’s important to stress that the concept is not reflected in broader Moroccan social structures.

### 2.3 Economics and Labor

In discussing the various factors influencing reproductive labor, including economics and labor, I highlight the ways that reproductive labor and gendered subjectivities co-constitute one another. Household economics, or how much money a household has to spend, what they spend it on, and the source of the income, shapes reproductive labor negotiations. When I asked why more Moroccan men are willing to do reproductive labor today compared to their father’s generation, most participants cited economics: specifically, more Moroccan women participating in the paid labor force full-time than their mother’s generation. During an interview with 44-year-old middle-upper class schoolteacher Hanane at Amal’s house, Hanane explains why Moroccan men have changed and Amal chimes in:

*Hanane: Now the Moroccan man’s mind has changed, it’s not the same as before.*

*Ruth: Why did it change?*

*Hanane: Because women don’t stay at home anymore. In the old days, women used to work inside the house and men outside, so it didn’t make sense for men to*

---

<sup>10</sup> These prejudices extend to scholarly work, as some Moroccan researchers also problematically mischaracterize rural Morocco as “stagnant,” patriarchal, rural, and traditional (Lagnaoui 1999).

*help with housework. Now they both leave the house together and come back together, so who will make food for the kids?*

*Amal: Poor Samir... (Hanane's husband) (Laughing)*

*Hanane: We both make it and after we eat, he goes to finish his work and I make dinner and organize things. In the weekend, I stay at home to clean the house with the maid, and he goes out to shop for food. So, we always share the work.*

Hanane emphasizes that she shared reproductive labor, both within and outside of the house, with her husband Samir because they “both leave the house together and come back together, so who will make food for the kids?” Hanane describes how an evolving distribution of reproductive labor creates new gendered subjectivities for herself and her husband who both labor as providers *and* caretakers. Hanane’s sentiment that Moroccan women working outside the home changed the nature of work inside the home was echoed across multiple interviews.

Of the 57 participants, more Moroccan women participated in the paid labor force compared to their mothers. Of 34 households with whom I spoke, 24 (71%) had the wife participating in the paid labor force full time and 10 households did not have the wife participating in the paid labor force full time (29%). This includes 4 households of Moroccans who married Americans (3 Moroccan men married 3 American women and 1 Moroccan woman married 1 American man). Of 29 Moroccan female participants interviewed, 19 of them participate in the paid workforce full time (65.5%), which is significantly above the Moroccan national average of 24% in 2019 (World Bank 2021). This difference is likely due to my data’s sample bias, which includes a larger portion of

middle-class upper-middle class women than the national average. Some participants noted their mother participated in the paid labor force (out of 53 Moroccan participants, 16 have mothers who participated in the paid labor force, about 30%).

This marked increase from 30% to 65.5% is particularly notable because the Moroccan female labor force participation rose relatively steadily since the 1970 and 1980's until 2005 when it began to decline slightly from 26.97% in 2005 to 24.28% in 2019 (Alpert 2007). Therefore, it is important to explore why this group of women are participating in the paid labor force. Working outside the home is often structured by class differences, both in the type of jobs accessible to different populations and the jobs' impact on workers (Gray & Finley-Hervey 2005; Cerrutti 2000; Willis 2000; Safa 1995:58; McClenaghan 1997:29). Specifically, social class and educational attainment are strong indicators of female labor force participation because middle-class urban Moroccan women have both the cultural capital (i.e., advanced education, knowledge of French) and social capital (i.e., networks) to secure well-paying jobs. As I will discuss further in Chapter 4, a number of participants noted that they are of a higher social class (middle class) compared to their parents (working class) due to educational attainment and the jobs that they were able to secure.

In another interview excerpt, 39-year-old middle-class tourism manager Zakaria identifies working conditions for women, rather than just women working outside the home, as a driver of change. Zakaria explains that while some women from his mother's generation participated in the paid labor force, there is a difference in the way his wife and his mother work. Zakaria has been married for three years, has one daughter and his wife is pregnant with their second child.

*Ruth: When you were with your parents, who did the housework most of the time?*

*Zakaria: In the old days, it was women's job to do housework.*

*Ruth: Did you have a household employee?*

*Zakaria: Sometimes, but our house used to be full of women, so men have never helped. Now things have changed, now everyone helps.*

*Ruth: Why?*

*Zakaria: Because now everyone is working. Before we used to think that even the woman who works outside had enough time. Now it's different. Women work now... more than before. My mother, for example, used to work until 5 pm, but my wife comes sometimes back at 8 pm. Most of the time I babysit the girl [his daughter] and do the dishes when she sleeps. It's not a problem for me. That's the difference, in the old days, women had time to work, take care of the kids and do housework. But now they can't because of the work conditions.*

Zakaria works from home by managing the logistics of tourism experiences and is able to babysit their daughter and do the dishes while his wife is sleeping or working outside the home. His wife works in a store and must work long hours to provide for the family, unlike his mother. This is an important point because some older women complain that they worked in and outside of the household when they were young, but now young women are lazy and do not know how to work properly in and outside of the house. Contrary to this perspective, Zakaria argues that young Moroccan women today are actually working longer hours than his mother's generation. The younger urban middle-class Moroccan women today have different gendered work expectations than their



mother's generation, which leads to a new distribution of reproductive labor (i.e., the husband doing reproductive labor).

In addition to participating in the paid labor force outside of the home, women are also contributing fiscally to household economics. Some scholars argue that women are persistently only associated with motherhood and domesticity, despite the potentially transformative effect of women's employment (Tiano 2001:202; Wangui 2014). Rather than viewing their labor as contributing significantly and sometimes solely to the welfare of their family, women often view their labor as simply fulfilling their role as good wife and mother and only as supplemental even if they are the sole earner (Chant 2002). Whereas participants under 40 years old talked of their mother's incomes "helping" the family, most female participants discussed their own contribution to household economics differently. Of the participating households in my research, most women reported that they share financial decision-making authority with their partners. I asked the question "who pays for household expenses?" (shkūn kayṣarf 'lā dār?) of research participants. Of the participating households in my research, the vast majority of women reported that they and their husband both pay for household expenses and share the financial decision-making authority with their partners.<sup>11</sup>

---

<sup>11</sup> I interviewed 57 participants who were a part of 34 households in total. For this section on "Economics," I omitted six of 34 of these households from the following percentages presented. Specifically, I omitted four households with an American spouse, one household with the husband living abroad, and one household that did not answer the question "who pays for household expenses?". Of the 28 households analyzed in this section, 19 had spouses who both participated in the paid labor force and nine households only had one spouse participating in the paid labor force. Out of 19 Moroccan households with both spouses participating in the paid labor force full-time, 16 households (84%) report that they are both responsible for money in the household and both make decisions about money.

Of the three households that reported not sharing expenses, two households reported that the husband supports the house financially and one household gave contradictory answers. Within this middle-class household, 47-year-old Tareq and 44-year-old Fatima Zahra give conflicting answers that emphasize different aspects of Moroccan gender roles. Tareq emphasizes equality:

*Ruth: Who pays for household expenses?*

*Tareq: Both, my wife and I.*

*Ruth: Is there anything specific you or she pays for?*

*Tareq: No, there is no difference.*

While Tareq emphasizes “no difference” between himself and his wife, Fatima Zahra emphasizes more specific gendered responsibilities.

*Ruth: Who pays for household expenses?*

*Fatima Zahra: My husband.*

*Ruth: Is he in charge of everything?*

*Fatima Zahra: No, of course we help each other.*

*Ruth: Is there anything specific you or he pays for?*

*Fatima Zahra: He's in charge of rent, the school, bills and I'm in charge of what women know best: the household needs.*

*Ruth: Do you have someone who helps you in the house?*

*Fatima Zahra: No.*

*Ruth: You buy everything for the house?*

*Fatima Zahra: I buy things I like for the house.*

In this exchange Fatima Zahra reports that her husband pays for household expenses, but that they still help each other. Specifically, he is in charge of “rent, schools, bills” and she is in charge of “what women know best: the house needs.” Although Fatima Zahra participates in the paid labor force, she is still emphasizing her husband’s responsibility to pay for most bills and her power and authority over “household needs.” Fatima Zahra does the shopping, cleaning, cooking, and caring for the children the majority of the time. Tareq makes food for himself and the family when Fatima Zahra is at work and he is at home. When Tareq has the night shift and is at home during the day, he will help with dishes, laundry, and childcare. Based on Fatima Zahra’s response “I buy things I like for the house,” she is asserting that she buys extra non-essential household items (e.g., new upholstery for salon furniture) while her husband fulfills his responsibility to pay for necessities like rent, school, and bills (see the next section on religion for more information about a husband’s responsibility to pay for household expenses). Fatima Zahra is upholding the patriarchal bargain (Kandiyoti 1988) by conforming to more rigid gender roles, despite participating in the paid labor force and her ability to buy “things I like for the house.” Tareq, in contrast, emphasizes more equitable and flexible gender roles by saying that they “both” hold the money in the household and there is “no difference” between who pays for what.

Tareq notes that Fatima Zahra is “working now so she can help me” but that “if my salary was enough, I would want my wife to stay at home and not work.” By saying that Fatima Zahra is “working *now*,” Tareq is implying that Fatima Zahra’s participation

in the paid labor force is only temporary and will change in the future. For Tareq, an ideal middle-class lifestyle would mean that he would have enough money to support his wife and their children without needing her to participate in the paid workforce. Fatima Zahra is actually claiming this ideal to me by saying that her husband pays for necessities like “rent, school, and bills” while she is able to “buy things she likes for the house.” I suspect that Tareq and Fatima Zahra both help pay for household necessities (although Tareq likely contributes more) but that Fatima Zahra wanted it to appear in front of a stranger that Tareq pays for all household necessities. Although Tareq and Fatima Zahra will likely continue to need two incomes to support their three children, Tareq and Fatima Zahra want to assert an ideal of the sole male breadwinner. Additionally, Tareq and Fatima Zahra subtly uphold the patriarchal bargain (Kandiyoti 1988) by implying that the current situation is temporary and that Fatima Zahra should have responsibility over the household. Tareq claims responsibility for the family financially, with Fatima Zahra currently “helping” him and Fatima Zahra claims responsibility for the household with Tareq sometimes helping her. By saying that Tareq pays for household expenses, Fatima Zahra reproduces certain gendered subjectivities, namely that her husband is responsible for the family financially and she is responsible for reproductive labor and “what women know best.”

Moroccan households in which both partners participate in the paid labor force are also more likely to share reproductive labor more equitably between the spouses. This shows how different gendered subjectivities (women feeling the need or desire to participate in the paid labor force or not) shape the distribution of reproductive labor. Of nine households with only the husband participating in the paid labor force, seven (78%)

reported that the wife does the vast majority, if not all, reproductive labor at all times. Two out of nine households report that while the husband sometimes helps, the wife still does the majority of reproductive labor. For these households, because the wives do not participate in the paid labor force (a particular gendered subjectivity), they are expected to do most of the reproductive labor. Additionally, because the husband participates in the paid labor force fulfilling his role as sole breadwinner, most participants said that he only has the responsibility to do reproductive labor if his wife is sick or travelling. In a conversation with 29-year-old working-class Nadia and her sister-in-law 29-year-old Rkia, I asked:

*Ruth: Did your dad do housework sometimes?*

*Nadia: I don't remember, but I don't think so, men don't do housework in our family.*

*Ruth: Why?*

*Rkia: They say that it's women's work.*

*Nadia: They only do it if the woman is sick or traveling.*

*Rkia: They say that they work outside so we should work inside.*

In another interview, Yousra, who is an upper-class 42-year-old woman working for a non-governmental organization (NGO) said that, “if he (her husband) was paying for everything, I would happily take care of everything and do housework.” This shows how specific gendered subjectivities (i.e. participating in the paid labor force or not) affect different distributions of reproductive labor.

Of the 19 households with both partners participating in the paid labor force, seven (37%) report that the wife does most, if not all reproductive labor, at all times. The majority (63%) of dual-income households report both partners doing significant portions of reproductive labor, but the wife still does more reproductive labor than the husband for every household interviewed. The economics of a household, who is participating in the paid labor force and paying for household expenses, clearly influence patterns of household negotiations over reproductive labor. In the next section, I dive deeper into the religious aspects of gendered and financial household responsibilities for Moroccans.

## 2.4 Religion

Multiple participants with whom I spoke used Islamic jurisprudence or legal theory (*fiqh*) to argue that specific distributions of reproductive labor are better or more appropriate, thereby privileging certain types of gendered subjectivities. When explaining men and women's rights and responsibilities within marriage, participants would sometimes cite the beginning of *Sura An-Nisa* (The Women's Chapter) Aya 34 which roughly begins with "Men are the *qawwamun* (protectors/maintainers) of women." Based on classical interpretations of Qur'anic verses 4:34, 2:228, and selected *hadith* (actions and saying of the Prophet Mohammad), Muslim husbands are responsible for the wife's maintenance and protection and have the sole right to marital resources, his wife's autonomy and body, and the right to polygamy (with certain limitations) and divorce (Musawah 2018). In the same classical interpretation, Muslim wives are responsible for obeying and being sexually available to her husband and have the right to *nafaqah* (shelter, food and clothing provided by the husband), *mahr* (dower paid by the husband), her own wealth and limited access to divorce (Musawah 2018).

Most participants with whom I spoke felt that married men have a religious duty to provide financially for their households (usually their wife and children). Malika is a 43-year-old Islamic Education public high school teacher, mother of three children, and almost done with her PhD in Comparative Religion. Malika explains:

*In [Islamic] religion, working women are not supposed to spend the money they make, because it is the man's responsibility to pay for everything. Her income is considered as charity. Women are not supposed to pay for the expenses, except if they want to.*

Malika explains that men are responsible for taking care of household finances and any money that a woman makes is strictly hers to spend as she wishes. This was a point brought up multiple times in interviews: that women use the money they earn to help with household expenses but that ultimately the women themselves have the decision-making power over their own income, according to classical interpretations of Islamic teachings. Hanane, a 44-year-old schoolteacher, explains who makes decisions about her money:

*Ruth: Who pays for household expenses?*

*Hanane: My husband, of course.*

*Ruth: Do you help him?*

*Hanane: Of course, but that's because I want to, he doesn't impose it on me. But of course, since I'm working, I have to help.*

*Ruth: Does he pay for the kids' school, and did he pay for the house?*

*Hanane: He pays for the kids' school, but I helped him when we built the house because it was a lot of expenses.*

*Ruth: Yes, it's very expensive.*

*Hanane: Yes, we both used bank credit, but he paid most of the expenses because his salary is better than mine.*

*Ruth: He pays more of the house and everything?*

*Hanane: Exactly.*

Similar to Fatima Zahra from the Economics section above, Hanane first says that her husband pays for household expenses. Upon further questioning, Hanane admits that she helps with household expenses “because I want to.” In the next breath, she admits that because she is participating in the paid labor force full-time, “I *have* [my emphasis] to help.” Hanane’s words explain the conundrum facing Moroccan women participating in the paid labor force: according to classical interpretations of Muslim legal (*fiqh*) texts, Muslim women can do whatever they wish with their earnings and have no financial responsibility to the household. Additionally, their husband cannot put demands upon his wife’s salary. However, in reality, many Muslim Moroccan women feel that they must help the family survive financially to provide a better life for their children, husband, and themselves. Using their earnings to support the house financially can sometimes affect the distribution of reproductive labor, but it also affects gendered subjectivities and is affected by gendered subjectivities. Specifically, how a woman views her role in the household can expand to include contributing to the household economy as equal partners with her husband.



On the flip side, the distribution of reproductive labor may reinforce a specific gendered subjectivity for urban middle-class women where participating in the paid labor force “helps” the family but her identity is mainly tied to care for the family and household (Chant 2002). Although Chant (2002) is arguing that it would be better for working Latin American women to view their salaries as contributing significantly to household expenses rather than only “helping,” by asserting that Moroccan Muslim men have responsibility over household expenses, urban Moroccan women may be attempting to put boundaries on for what their salary can and should be used. However, as I pointed out above, the reality of women using their own salaries for something other than household expenses to benefit children, husband, and themselves (especially if they see a need) is complicated.

Women are commonly expected to take care of their children, often in addition to cooking, cleaning, and potentially working outside the home. Malika, explains how in the early days of Islam (7<sup>th</sup> century CE), women were required only to take care of the children, but society added the responsibilities of cleaning and cooking:

*At the beginning of Islam, one of the marriage conditions was for the man to hire a maid who will help his wife in the housework. Wives weren't supposed to cook, clean, and do everything, because that's not the purpose of the marriage. In Islam, women's responsibility was to raise the kids and it's considered as a big responsibility, bigger than cleaning and cooking, Unfortunately, after the fall of Al-Andalus, women had to work outside to help their husbands, so religion has nothing to do with our reality now.*

Malika explains that in an ideal Muslim family, the wife would only be responsible for taking care of the children, but not cooking and cleaning the house. As an Islamic religious scholar, Malika asserts that “religion has nothing to do with our reality now,” because Muslims today do not live strictly by the *hadith*, or sayings and actions of the Prophet Mohammad. The dissonance between Islamic ideals regarding the distribution of reproductive labor and reality was an ongoing theme in my conversations with research participants.

In an informal conversation, Kareem, a 40-year-old male divorced plastic surgeon living in Casablanca, stated “*In our religion, it is the women’s responsibility to take care of the house and the man’s [responsibility] to provide money for the house- this is true in all Arab countries. This is from religion.*” In Kareem’s opinion, women have the responsibility to take care of the house and perform all reproductive labor and men have the responsibility to provide financially for their families. While Malika states that women are only responsible for child rearing, Kareem believes that women are responsible for all activities associated with taking care of the house. These examples show how gender roles and religious interpretations are not monolithic and unchanging, but rather continuously evolve and vary significantly within Moroccan society. This is partly because Moroccans are exposed to a variety of different opinions about how to be good Muslims. These sources of religious knowledge include local and international radio and television shows; the mosque and the weekly Friday sermons (*khutab*); Islamic Education courses in primary, secondary and postsecondary schools; and conversations with family, friends, neighbors, teachers, and acquaintances, among other sources. Additionally, Islamic jurisprudence (*fiqh*) supports specific types of distributions of

reproductive labor (either Muslim wives caring for children only or also the household) which reproduces specific types of gendered subjectivities (based in childrearing solely or also domesticity).

In contrast to classical interpretations of *fiqh* (Islamic jurisprudence), some Islamic scholars argue that the Muslim family should be based on *sakinah* (serenity), *qist* (fairness), and *tashawur wa taradi* (consultation and mutual consent). Musawah (which literally means “equality” in Arabic) is a global movement for equality and justice in the Muslim family, which was launched in February 2009 at a Global Meeting in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia with scholars, activists, and policy makers, including women and men from 47 countries. Instead of following classical interpretations of Muslim husbands and wives’ differing rights and responsibilities, Musawah argues that both the husband and wife should be responsible for the shared maintenance of the household and have a joint responsibility to care for and protect each other and their family members with equally shared decision-making power (Musawah 2018:13). Specifically, Musawah argues that a world in which a husband can solely take care of his family financially is no longer possible in the changing global economy. Muslim married couples must both contribute financially to the household, share reproductive labor equally, and make decisions together. Most Moroccans with whom I spoke are not aware of this specific *fiqh* (legal jurisprudence) basis for the shared responsibility arguments. However, some households do have a sense of shared financial responsibility and share household decision-making power and reproductive labor.

Instead of arguing that the Muslim family should be based in serenity, fairness, consultation, and mutual consent, multiple Moroccan women with whom I spoke did

mention that the Prophet Mohammad would mend his own clothes. Recently married, Nadia (29 years old), who lives in a popular (sh‘bī) working-class neighborhood in Casablanca and was pregnant with her first child during the interview, said:

*The Prophet Mohammed, peace be upon him, used to help his wife, sew his clothes and wash them, so why can't a normal man do it? When you tell them that, they say that Mohammed was a prophet, so he was perfect. Which is why they should do like him and consider him as an idol. You can't just do like him in prayers and not be like him, because religion is a lifestyle.*

Nadia argues that even though the Prophet Mohammed was perfect, every Muslim man should strive to be like the Prophet Mohammad and should help his wife with household duties. By mentioning this, Nadia and other women who brought this up argued that Moroccan men have a responsibility to do reproductive labor as the Prophet Mohammad did, but that in reality this does not always happen. Within Nadia's own young marriage, she does not participate in the paid labor force but her husband does. Regarding reproductive labor, her husband shops for the food from the market for his wife and mother who lives with them, aligning with a specific gendered subjectivity associating masculinity with public spaces, while his wife Nadia cooks and cleans in the house. The accounts of the life and sayings of the Prophet Mohammad (*hadith*) reinforce a specific distribution of reproductive labor (where Muslim husbands and wives do reproductive labor) that is not reflected in the reality of living in Moroccan society in the late 2010s. Instead, a gendered subjectivity where women do reproductive labor and men do not is reinforced by the perspectives of most men and some women in society, which reinforces an unequal distribution of reproductive labor.

Boujmaa, a 68-year-old upper-middle class man who retired from the military, said “...equality is a part of our religion, the Prophet Mohammed, peace be upon him, used to help his wives, but people forget this (Rachidia, his wife, nods in agreement). We have equality in our religion but no one believes in it, they still treat women badly in the street and harass them.” Although for Boujmaa and his wife Rachidia Islam promotes a specific gendered subjectivity (equality between men and women), this is not reflected in the reality of gendered subjectivities in which men and women are not treated equally in Moroccan society. In this way, Malika, Nadia, and Boujmaa all argue that there is a religious ideal (i.e., women only being responsible for children; men doing housework; equality between men and women) but that in reality, everyday practices in Morocco do not live up to these religious ideals. Examining the ways that religion structures household decision making processes reveals the dialectical relationship between reproductive labor and gendered subjectivities.

## 2.5 Family Structure

In addition to economics and religion influencing household decision-making, family structure also influences reproductive labor negotiations and practices. By examining family structure, I illuminate the ways in which the distribution of reproductive labor and gendered subjectivities co-constitute one another. By family structure, I am referring to whether or not a family lives as a nuclear family in a single-family dwelling or with members of extended family. Participants mentioned that 20 years ago, it was more common for newlywed couples to live with the husband’s family for a time (or potentially forever) until they were able to save enough money to buy or build their own house. As more and more households live on their own as a nuclear

family, away from their parents and siblings, especially in urban spaces, households negotiate reproductive labor within their marriage and nuclear families, outside of the influence of in-laws and extended family. My analysis here focuses on how family structure influences the distribution of reproductive labor, focusing mainly on nuclear family households.

Of the 34 households that I interviewed, 71% live by themselves as a nuclear family comprised of a mother, father, and their unmarried children in a completely separate physical residence from extended family. The 29% of households (ten total) that lived with extended family can be categorized according to their levels of integration with extended family members, ranging from minimal to extensive. Four households completely integrate with extended family and live in the same space. Four households live with extended family, but in a separate apartment upstairs in the same building and have some medium interactions with them daily. Two households live in the same building with extended family but only have minimal interactions, usually weekly.

These examples show the diversity of living arrangements in urban Morocco, but also the prevalence of living with nuclear family as opposed to extended family. This shift toward nuclearization has occurred in the last 40 years in urban and rural spaces as education improves, standard of living increases, and expectations for the Moroccan middle-class change (Abdelmajid & Benohoud 2010:9; Alpert 2007). Explaining this shift, 42-year-old Fatima says that, “Nowadays, most couples like to live alone, they like the freedom of living alone and to make sure there are no problems like this with the mother-in-law.” Other female participants also expressed a desire to avoid the potential problems and complications of living with their husbands’ families and, in particular,

their mother-in-law. Most urban middle-class Moroccan mothers-in-law tend to reinforce gendered subjectivities that expect their daughter-in-law to do all reproductive labor for their son, regardless of her work status. In other words, they attempt to enforce a specific distribution of reproductive labor. I will discuss specific issues regarding reproductive labor and mothers-in-law as well as possible motivations below.

Specifically, when a Moroccan urban household lives separately as a nuclear family, they tend to have a more equal distribution of labor compared to those households living in some capacity with their extended family, based on my research data. However, correlation is not the same as causation. Six of the ten households (60%) whose husbands only participate in the paid labor force full-time live with extended family in some capacity. In contrast, only four out of the 24 households (17%) who both participate full-time in the paid labor force live with extended family in some capacity. I argue that living in a one- or two-income household more directly influences negotiations over distribution of reproductive labor than household structure, but that household structure is an interrelated issue. Households living as a separate nuclear family may require more financial resources to secure housing and childcare (and therefore be in more need of a second income), compared to households living with extended family.

Here, 30-year-old kindergarten English teacher, Fatiha, explains that often in Moroccan culture, the presence of the husband's mother can influence the distribution of reproductive labor:

*Ruth: What if they live with the husband's parents, do you think the husband will help in the kitchen?*

*Fatiha: Do you mean my friend's husband or mine?*

*Ruth: In Moroccan culture in general...*

*Fatiha: No, they don't.*

*Ruth: Why is it a problem?*

*Fatiha: The mother doesn't like to see her son working in the house, she tells her daughter-in-law that she should take care of him and make him comfortable. Most of the men don't do housework in the presence of their mothers, even if they usually do it when she's not there...*

Fatiha explains that in Moroccan culture in general, Moroccan mothers do not like to see their son doing reproductive labor and therefore make sure that their daughter-in-law understands that reproductive labor is the wife's responsibility. As a member of an older generation with sometimes different perspectives, beliefs, and desires about reproductive labor, mothers-in-law tend to force a stricter division of labor on younger couples (i.e. only women doing reproductive labor). In another example, Fatima (42), explains:

*A mother may ask her married son, "how can you help now with this woman when you didn't help me when you were young? This is ridiculous!" They may say this and may be jealous of her son helping his new wife in their life when he didn't help her when he was young.*

Moroccan mothers may get jealous of how their son is treating his new wife compared to how he treated his own mother. Moroccan mothers will sometimes uphold the structures of the patriarchy in this way to ensure that their son is properly cared for and that her



daughter-in-law is working as much as she worked. As the majority of the households with whom I spoke lived in neolocal nuclear households, I did not personally observe a mother-in-law policing her daughter-in-law in such a way. However, female participants routinely mentioned potential problems with mothers-in-law. For example, Naima (43) said, “I will tell you a story. One time, my mother-in-law and his sisters were over at the house and they didn’t want him to serve tea to the table- they said that this is shameful (hashuma). But it is not shameful (hashuma) for him to serve them.”

Naima and her in-law’s had different gendered expectations for Naima’s husband about what was appropriate or shameful. Fatima (42) said that, “*It is ok for Omar [her husband] to clear the table when his mother is here- that is fine and just to take stuff in and out of the kitchen...but if his mother is here, I do not let him do the dishes.*” Public schoolteacher Malika (43 years old, also highlighted in the Religion section above), explains how her mother-in-law treated her son and daughter-in-law doing reproductive labor differently:

*Malika: Another thing that happened and that hurt me is when I gave birth to my daughter Lina and left the hospital on the same morning my husband was washing dishes, and when his mother saw him doing that, she wanted to do it instead of him, but when I was cleaning them, she didn’t try to stop me. They have this bad culture in their region where they just count on their women to do everything. Their women work inside and outside.*

*Ruth: Your husband’s family?*

*Malika: Yes, they have very bad habits. My husband and I work outside so why not work inside together!?*

Malika's mother-in-law lives in the countryside and maintains a stricter adherence to gendered divisions of labor, where women "work inside and outside." Malika exclaims that her husband's family has "very bad habits," moralizing their gendered division of labor negatively. In this way, certain Moroccan mothers maintain the very patriarchal structures that oppress them (Kandiyoti 1988). Why do mothers do this? Fatima, a *dārija* (Moroccan Arabic) teacher and 42-year-old Moroccan middle-class woman, explained that:

*Most Moroccan women don't have a good relationship with their mothers-in-law because there is a competition between the son's mother and wife-if someone puts their mother over their wife, their wife might get mad and vice versa.*

Fatima's explanation resonates with Kandiyoti's (1988) argument that often in classic patriarchal societies, mothers guard and maintain their special relationship with their son, especially their eldest son, who will often be expected to take care of his mother in her old age or if his father dies. Sometimes, Moroccan mothers will view a daughter-in-law as competition for resources from her son. Several Moroccans with whom I spoke mentioned that it is common to give small or larger amounts of money to their parents as a way of thanking their parents for taking care of them when they were young. However, this can create problems with mothers-in-law. Fatima explains:

*“Money is also a problem- why do you give your parents money? They can use credit from a bank- you have kids of your own why do you give them money? Both the wife and the husband might have the same questions.*

Because of the potential for problems with mothers-in-law, the desire for freedom, and the ability to afford a single nuclear-family home, many urban Moroccans chose to live with only their nuclear family, rather than extended family.

Based on my data, it appears that men are less willing to do reproductive labor when they live with their extended family, especially in front of their mothers. The 42-year-old *dārija* (Moroccan Arabic) teacher, Fatima, lives in the same building as her husband’s family but only sees them about once a week (minimal interaction). Fatima explains why she does not let her husband do the dishes in front of his mother:<sup>12</sup>

*Omar helps out in the kitchen and in general in the house when no one else is here, but if his mother is here, I do not let him do the dishes because I do not like him to [do dishes] in front of his mother. What if she says something back when she goes upstairs- even if she only saw her son doing the dishes once- she might ask, “What is Fatima doing? Why is she letting him do that?” It is ok for Omar to clear the table when his mother is here- that is fine and just to take stuff in and out of the kitchen...Help in the house should stay a private issue- you shouldn’t tell people that you help each other in the house like this or let other people know about your problems. It is important for these things to stay private. Problems stay in the house, this is very important.*

---

<sup>12</sup> This is an extended quote from above.

In this way, Fatima maintains her own reputation and the reputation of her marriage, by not allowing her husband to do housework in front of his mother and by not discussing private issues. The presence or absence of a mother-in-law in the same physical household influences the distribution of reproductive labor and expected gendered subjectivities. Some households that include extended family do share reproductive labor between female members of extended family, but this often means that husbands are even less inclined to help with reproductive labor. Because the men of the house see multiple women doing reproductive labor, they do not feel a need for themselves to do reproductive labor. Despite helping some, female members of extended family did not do a significant amount of reproductive labor in the households with whom I spoke and observed.

Of ten households living with extended family, nine husbands (90%) do very little reproductive labor (ranging from 0-20% of the reproductive labor), and only one household (10%) has the husband doing a significant amount of reproductive labor (about 40%). Compared to the 24 nuclear households, 18 husbands (75%) do very little reproductive labor (ranging from 0-20% of the reproductive labor), and six (25%) do a significant amount of reproductive labor (ranging from 30-50%). This data shows that nuclear households are more likely to have a more equitable distribution of reproductive labor than extended family households. As explained earlier, this is likely because it is often inappropriate for Moroccan men to do reproductive labor in front of their mothers, who might live with them, and in an extended family, husbands might feel less responsibility to help because their mother or sisters can help their wife with reproductive labor, rather than themselves. By analyzing the influence of family structure and

particularly mothers-in-law on household decision making processes, it is clear that the distribution of reproductive labor and gendered subjectivities are intimately linked and actually co-constitute one another.

## 2.6 Children & Childcare

One of the most significant influences on household decision-making processes is the birth of a new baby who requires constant feeding, watching, changing diapers, bathing, burping, and soothing to sleep. As children get older, they can require less labor and potentially even do some reproductive labor, but the first 5 years of a child's life is particularly laborious. Iman (42), who is married to Abdelhafid, explains what it was like when their children were younger:

*When you have small kids, it is a TON of work. When they grow up a little, it is better because they can do things for themselves and help out around the house some but when they are young it is like you have to do EVERYTHING- clean them, bath them, clothe them, feed them all the time and it's always the mom doing all these things, it's almost never the dad changing the diaper or feeding his kids.*

Iman explains that there is a lot of work involved in raising a young child and that generally the mother does most of the childcare for young children, a division of labor that reproduces an unequal distribution of reproductive labor. This is changing to some extent within younger households: men care for their young children sometimes (see Chapter 3), but women still do the vast majority of childcare in many families. Because most women are able to breastfeed, this also sets a precedent in who is feeding the infant

that can often continue throughout most of the child's life. Whereas I observed ~24 hours of reproductive labor in Aziza and Hassan's house with three children aged 19, 18 and 11, I observed almost three times that amount, ~67 hours of reproductive labor in Rkia and Nouredine's house with three young children aged 8, 4 and 1 years old. Although both households have three children, the amount of time they spend taking care of those children is vastly different because younger children require more time, care, and attention. Although this is only one specific comparison between two families, participant observation and interviews also overwhelmingly supported the idea that young children require lots of work. Most quantitative literature on reproductive labor does not discuss the ebbs and flows of reproductive labor throughout the life course of a family or even throughout the year (Kan et al. 2011; Fuwa 2004; Geist 2005; Hook 2004; Davis and Greenstein 2004; Batalova & Cohen 2002). The qualitative data that I collected suggests that households with children under the age of five have significantly higher levels of reproductive labor. Children with significant mental or physical ailments might also require extra care throughout their lifetime. In addition to changes throughout the life course of a family, it is also important to note how the amount of reproductive labor changes throughout the course of the year. For example, Fatima (42) said that:

*Housework increases three times for Moroccan women during Ramadan (the Islamic holy month of fasting). This is not in cleaning the house as much but mostly in the kitchen... Men can't be in the kitchen during Ramadan because they are sleeping. It is like a man's battery goes out during Ramadan- he doesn't have any energy to do anything.... If there are kids, women can't sleep but he can sleep because it is a man, he is tired, he did tarawih (an extra non-obligatory but*

encouraged Ramadan prayer) *and is tired. Women take kids to school during Ramadan- usually during the school year there are a few dads who take their kids to school but during Ramadan there are no dad's at Fjr (Fatima's 5-year-old daughter)'s preschool. This is because they (the dads) would have to wake up early in order to get their child to school on time so instead they sleep in and go to work late and the mother has to take the kid to school, even if on a normal day he takes the kid to school.*

Fatima observes that reproductive labor increases threefold for Moroccan women during the holy month of Ramadan because she is usually expected to prepare an elaborate *Iftar* (breaking the fast meal) daily for the family, in addition to snacks and *Sahūr* (small meal right before sunrise) and feed and care for children during Ramadan<sup>13</sup>. In addition to Ramadan and Eid al Ftr (‘īd al-fiṭr or ‘īd al-ṣaghīr), the holiday celebrating the end of the holy month of Ramadan, Eid al Adha (‘īd al-āḍḥā or ‘īd al-kbīr), the holiday celebrating Ibrahim’s sacrifice to God, is also a time of increased reproductive labor (see Chapter 4 for more discussion of Eid al Adha).

If both parents are participating in the paid labor force, the household must also negotiate who will take care of the child during working hours. Fatima (42), a middle-class Moroccan Arabic teacher, explains the childcare situation in Morocco based on her experiences:

---

<sup>13</sup> While adults are expected to fast from sunrise to sunset during Ramadan, children are not. Children still expect food during the daytime, despite fasting adults. Most Moroccans with whom I spoke mentioned beginning fasting for the full month of Ramadan during their teenage years.

*Because you only get three months paid maternity leave from the government and I think two months from private companies so it's not very long and you still need to take care of the baby. You could take up to a year off work to take care of the baby, but you won't get paid during that year. You also get one hour during the day for breastfeeding during the first year or the baby's life, but this is just taken up in taxis driving home to breastfeed the baby. And nurseries are very expensive- they are about 1000 dirhams (~\$100) a month just to have your baby in the nursery so if you take that from your salary plus transportation, it is like your salary is cut in half, just for you not to see your baby. So, some women will say, 'hey sister come and take care of my baby and I'll give you the money that I would have given to a nursery (1000 dirhams/month),' because a lot of people don't trust nurseries. You don't know who is working for them very well and you don't know what they do with your baby when you're not there. But if it is a family member, you can trust them.*

Fatima explains the problems mothers who participate in the paid labor force face: short maternity leave (for those lucky enough to have formal full-time employment that offers maternity leave), little time for breastfeeding, and expensive, sometimes untrustworthy nurseries. For these reasons, women working outside the home will sometimes ask a family member like a sister, sister-in-law, mother, mother-in-law, or aunt to look after the child while they are young. Because women working outside the home only usually ask for help from *female* extended family members, they effectively reproduce the gendered division of reproductive labor. Again, specific gendered subjectivities (the expectation that a *female* family member is better suited to look after a young child than a male



family member) reinforce a specific gendered division of reproductive labor. This specific gendered division of reproductive labor also reinforces the gendered subjectivity that women have more experience with and knowledge of children, compared to men.

Souhaila (28), who lives and works in Morocco and France, married Badr who lives and works in the US. When discussing childcare, Souhaila (28), a computer engineer, noted “*I don’t want to put Heron [her newborn son] in a crèche or a preschool, I don’t trust the people here. I trust my family, but not strangers.*” Souhaila went on to discuss asking her husband’s sister who has two children of her own and/or her younger sister who lives in Casablanca and is looking for work to look after her newborn son. Trust is an important repeated theme in relation to finding adequate childcare. In the end, Souhaila lived with her husband’s family (mother, brother, sister, and her children) in Meknes until moving to the U.S. to be with her husband. If grandparents do not live far away and there are no other relatives to fill the role, parents will sometimes ask the child’s grandparents to look after the baby or take in the baby while the parents work. However, then the parents only see the child on the weekend until they are older. While upper-class families can simply pay a live-in nanny to look after the child, this expense is out of reach for most Moroccan middle-class families. Fatima went on to explain how childcare activities have changed over the years:

*It used to be that there was an unspoken rule that if you had your baby your mother would come and stay with you for the first six to seven months of the child’s life. Or you could go and live with your in-laws. Mostly for the first-born child because everything is new, and you don’t know how to do anything and have lots of questions. But this can cause issues with the couple if one wants to live*

*with one set of parents and another their own parents, they will ask why your mother and not my mother or vice versa. So, if the woman works, this is the source of a lot of problems.*

Fatima expands upon the sensitive family politics of who should come to stay with the family during the first months of the newborn's life. Because Fatima ends with "if the woman works...", it seems that she is implying that this "unspoken rule" for a mother to come stay with the first newborn is only for women who participate in the paid labor force. This may also be true for mothers who do not participate in the paid labor force. Although Rkia (28) does not participate in the paid labor force, her younger sister came from the countryside to help with Rkia's third child for first six months of his life. Souhaila (29), decided to move in with her husband's family when she was pregnant and about to have her first child during maternity leave. In Fatima's opinion, one childcare solution would be to put more nurseries inside of workplaces so that mothers would have a safe, inexpensive, and close place to put their child while they work. Currently, very few employers provide nurseries inside of the workplace.

Besides paying for a nursery and asking a family member to come take care of the child, families also have the option of hiring a household employee or nanny to do some of the reproductive labor. Malika (43), an Islamic Studies high school teacher, explains that she used to have a household employee while living in a smaller city, Sidi Bennour, when her children were small, but once moving to Rabat, she was unable to find a household employee. Malika explains:

*Malika: I used to have a maid when I was working in Al-Jadida (a region South of Rabat and Casablanca) who helped me a lot when my kids were little: Omar was*

*two, Lina was one and Shoaib was born later. But after moving to Rabat, I found difficulties in finding one, so my husband and I shared the chores and now that the kids are growing, they help me a lot with housework so I don't have that big responsibility anymore.*

*Ruth: For how long did you have a maid in the house?*

*Malika: The last time I had a maid was nine years ago, I fear them because they may treat the kids badly. Also working in education doesn't require a lot of time, so I didn't have a reason to hire a maid.*

*Ruth: You had a maid when the kids were little...*

*Malika: Yes, it was hard to take care of them alone.*

*Ruth: In Rabat?*

*Malika: No, in Sidi Bennour, near Al-Jadida. It was a small city, and the living cost was cheap, we were able to save even though we were renting a house and paying a maid, but once we moved to Rabat it was difficult to find a maid.*

Malika discusses the multiple factors one should consider when hiring a household employee: Can I afford someone? How will they treat my children? Do I need to hire someone? Malika mentions that “I didn't have a reason to hire a maid” because “education doesn't require a lot of time.” As a Moroccan public-school teacher, Malika usually teaches for 21 hours a week in the classroom and then grades and prepares lesson plans the rest of the week. Malika reasons that because her work does not require a lot of time, she does not need to hire a household employee, implying that she has enough time

to complete the reproductive labor herself. Because almost all household employees are female, the ability to hire a household employee also reinforces specific gendered subjectivities that promote the idea that women are more suited and better at taking care of children and household tasks.

When the children get a bit older, they are able to take care of themselves more and require less constant attention. Fatima (42) reasons that, *“if a kid is six years or older, the mom may leave breakfast for them to eat alone or they may drop them off at the grandparents’ house to spend time with grandparents. If younger than six years old, they can’t be alone by themselves.”* In addition to the cost and availability of childcare, the age of the child influences the intensity of the care needed. After a child is in preschool (~three years old), private schools offer afterschool daycare often called “La Guard” that can look after the child after school ends until parents are done with work (~3:45-5:30 pm). In comparing afterschool daycare and hiring a nanny, Fatima (42) concludes that, *“In Morocco, it is better to find a woman to look after kids at this time because it is less expensive than paying for an afterschool program.”* Again, cost is an important factor to consider: in many middle-class households, both parents must work in order to afford a nanny or afterschool program. One participant, Nadia (29) used to work in a pre-school before getting married. Although I did not confirm this, I suspect that most teachers at preschool and afterschool programs for young children are female due to gendered subjectivities that further reinforce the association of women with childcare.

Children can also help with reproductive labor. Age and gender both play a role in children helping with reproductive labor: generally, if a child is older than their siblings and/or female, they are more likely that they will be expected to help with reproductive

labor around the house. Unlike the working-class working women in Casablanca that Bouasria (2013) spoke with, several participants with whom I spoke emphasized the importance of “equality,” especially between siblings. Although participants did not specifically identify themselves as aligning with “feminism” or being “feminist,” they did discuss the importance of treating their current or future boys and girls “equally,” often in contrast to their own upbringing. This desire demonstrates that participants recognize that men and women are treated differently in Moroccan society, and that the Moroccans with whom I spoke see themselves in the world as gendered beings. Fatiha, a childless 30-year-old lower-middle class elementary English teacher, emphasizes equality in raising her future children:

*Ruth: Do you think girls should learn more about housework and do more?*

*Fatiha: I think it's the same for girls and boys they both have to learn to be organized, I can't ask the girl to clean and tell the boy that he can sit and relax, they will be equal.*

*Ruth: Not like your parents.*

*Fatiha: No, I have a different idea, my mother used to ask us to serve our brother, bring him water or make him tea, so he got used to it that he doesn't even organize his bed. For me, a girl is like a boy, I will never ask my daughter to serve her brother, if he wants to eat he should make his own food.*

*Ruth: Why are your idea different from your parents?*

*Fatiha: Because before they used to give the man a big value, but now there is equality and we became able to understand our religion more, our religion says that both women and men should work and men should help their wives.*

In this excerpt, Fatiha emphasizes that equality between raising boys and girls is extremely important in the way that she will raise her future children. Several participants noted a difference in how they were raised and how they are raising or intend to raise their children.

In an interview, Meryiem (34), a middle-class History and Geography high school teacher, noted that “my brothers and I were the youngest, so we used to just play or go to the store.” Meryiem notes that because her brothers were younger than her, they would simply play and did not have the responsibility that her older sisters had to do housework and cook. By expecting female children to do reproductive labor but not male children, families reinforce and reproduce gendered subjectivities. Some parents with whom I spoke asserted that they would expect the same of male and female children regarding household chores, but I was unable to confirm these assertions with extended participant observation in those households.

When I asked Samira (38), who currently does not participate in the paid labor force but who used to work at a research center and a call center, why Moroccan men are willing to do reproductive labor now, she replied:

*Samira: Because people before were less educated than now and the society has changed a lot, people are more open-minded and it's not shameful anymore for a man to do housework or for a woman to work outside.*

*Ruth: ...Do you think most of your friends get help from their husbands in housework?*

*Samira: No, only a few of them help I think.*

*Ruth: Why?*

*Samira: It's a matter of education, as I told you before. In my family, we all did housework, boys and girls. My friends always complain about their husbands not helping them in housework.*

Samira says twice that education has changed Moroccan society in that it is no longer shameful (*hashūma*) for a Moroccan man to do reproductive labor or for a woman to participate in the paid labor force (see Education & Class section below). Samira's words imply that she, her husband, and her family are more educated than her friends because her husband and father do housework. However, it is not clear if this is true. Earlier in the interview, Samira explained that when she was growing up her father did housework sometimes but that "*my mother did all of the work, all the pressure was on my mother because she didn't have girls, she had only me and two sons.*" Samira and her two brothers did housework growing up "*when we were alone at home*" because both of her parents were working but they needed to have lunch in the middle of the day at home because they went to a public school. Even while demarcating her family as different because "*we all did housework, boys and girls,*" Samira highlights her mother's responsibility to do "all of the work" and the necessity for her and her brothers to do housework sometimes. Samira's example shows both the importance of education but also that if there are few older daughters available, older sons will have to help with

reproductive labor. This example also highlights how specific gendered subjectivities (feeling responsible for “all of the work”) contribute to a specific distribution of reproductive labor (Samira’s mother doing most of the housework, with some help from her male and female children).

Within another household that is working-class, Hassan (60) and Fatiha (49)’s youngest daughter Wiam is, at 11 years old, expected to help more with reproductive labor than her older brothers (age 18 and 19). In another interview I asked Hanane (44) if she would teach her daughter to cook, and she said that “the girl must learn, not now though because she’s only nine years old, but once she gets to a certain age, she will have to learn.” These gendered patterns are not universal, however. For example, lower-class Rkia (29) routinely expects her nine-year-old son Saad to take care of his two younger siblings, his sister Romesa (4) and brother Zayed (1). When Rkia asked Saad to finish cleaning up the carpet in the salon when I was staying at the house for a week Saad said:

*Saad: Am I a boy or a girl? You are treating me like a girl and Romesa doesn’t do anything!*

*Rkia: You’re older than your sister right now and so you do the work now, and because you all are both young, you are the same. When you get older, there will be a difference, but right now you are the same.’ Rkia then told Romesa in a sweet, soothing voice: ‘I’ll teach you how to make couscous and tajine and later on you can make lunch while I clean the house and then we can rest together during the day!’*



Because Romesa and Zayed are still quite young, Rkia expects her oldest child Saad to help with the immense amounts of reproductive labor that need to be completed around the house, including looking after a 1-year-old baby constantly. Rkia justifies this because “you’re older than your sister right now” and “when you get older, there will be a difference.” This implies that it is generally ok for young boys to do reproductive labor, especially when they are older than their siblings, but that when they get older the appropriate gendered subjectivities will change. Rkia also paints a beautiful picture of teaching her 4-year-old daughter Romesa how to cook and then getting rest together after being done with work. During the week that I stayed with Rkia, Nouredine, and their three children, I never saw Rkia rest. Instead, I personally witnessed about 67 hours of reproductive labor (58 of which was done by Rkia; four by Nouredine, two by Saad, almost two hours by other female family members and less than an hour by Romesa). This distribution illustrates the high reproductive labor demands within households with young children and the extent to which this reproductive labor is performed by women. Saad’s comments (You are treating me like a girl!) also illustrate the ways that reproductive labor co-constitutes specific gendered subjectivities: who is “supposed” to do reproductive labor and when.

## 2.7 Education and Class

Education and social class also shape household negotiations over the distribution of reproductive labor and, in turn, shape gendered subjectivities. In general, having two incomes secures middle- and upper-class status among the Moroccan households with whom I spoke. In contrast, households with only one income, were more likely to identify as working class. There are exceptions to this trend (my research included three

upper middle-class households with only one income), but it holds true generally. In broad terms, Moroccan men and women with a higher level of educational attainment and higher socioeconomic class tend to live in households with more flexible distributions of reproductive labor in comparison to those with lower levels of education and lower socioeconomic status.

Although the Moroccan education system has changed over time, the current system heavily reinforces class distinctions (Boutieri 2016). The Moroccan government in the 1960s introduced a policy of Arabization, replacing French in public schools with Modern Standard Arabic (MSA) in order to create a homogeneous and united society literate in MSA (Ennaji 2005). However, the current public MSA-focused education does not prepare Moroccan graduates for a globalized and neoliberal<sup>14</sup> job market, which favors French and English (Boutieri 2016). Private schools and additional extracurricular activities provide French and/or English-focused education, better preparing students for the job market. However, lower-class Moroccans cannot afford private education. In this way, only upper- and upper-middle class Moroccans with access to expensive high-quality private education are fluent enough in French or to be competitive on the neoliberal job market, to get a well-paying professional job, and maintain their class status (discussed further in Chapter 4). Because education reinforces class distinctions

---

<sup>14</sup> By globalized and neoliberal job market, I am referring to Morocco's move from a large bureaucratic government (mostly left in place by the French through colonization) in the 1950's-1970's to structural adjustment and market liberalization programs adopted in the early 1980's spurred by the World Bank and International Monetary Fund (Cohen 2000). This structural adjustment program shrunk centralized government spending, attempting to enlarge private markets, and took away a number of welfare programs benefitting Moroccan citizens (Cohen 2000). In a globalized and neoliberal job market in 2018, foreign companies in Morocco aim to employ skilled workers fluent in French and/or English, which are both more common in most global economic markets than Arabic.

(Boutieri 2016), I combined the education and class sections influencing household decision making processes.

Several participants mentioned that as Moroccan society is becoming more educated, men are becoming more willing to do more reproductive labor. For this reason, I examined the influence of educational attainment on the distribution of reproductive labor. Overall, my research shows that the higher the education status of the household (husband and wife), the more likely the husband is to do reproductive labor. A significant portion of reproductive labor is defined as doing 30-50% of the total reproductive labor in the household. Specifically, while only 14% of urban Moroccan households with no schooling to middle school have men doing a significant portion of reproductive labor, 17% of households with at least some high school education had men doing a significant portion of reproductive labor. For households with the highest level of educational achievement, some post-secondary education (often a BA, MA or even a PhD), 29% have men doing a significant portion of reproductive labor. The rate of households with men doing a significant portion of reproductive labor almost doubles when the household has some postsecondary education.

It is also significant that older adults (older than 50) likely have less education attainment than younger adults (younger than 50) due to many participants' families moving from working-class to middle-class over the course of their lifetimes. Additionally, the current curriculum that younger participants had is not the same as past curriculums that older participants had (Boutieri 2016). For example, Arabi (60), said that he finished elementary school but that an elementary school diploma "was like getting a Bacc back then." A "Bacc" is short for "baccalauréat," which is the exam that Moroccan

students must pass in order to complete any postsecondary education, similar to a high school diploma. In general, older, less-educated participants had women doing more reproductive labor compared to younger, more-educated participants. Due to the interconnected nature of my data, differences in the division of labor must be explained by educational, generational, and class differences in conjunction with one another rather than as individual characteristics. For this reason, intersectional subjectivities (Crenshaw 1989; Gonda 2017) are important.

Rather than treating class as a solely socioeconomic category, I use a non-essentialist feminist Marxist framework to argue that class is a process that can be created in multiple spaces and ways over time, rather than a static thing that someone has throughout their life (Resnick & Wolff 1987; Boufous & Khariss 2015; Goldstein 2012). In this way, class identities are constantly being formed, contested, and changed through various class processes and no one static and uniform “middle class” or “working class” exists. Although class changes over time and space, I used the factors of participants’ education, economic resources, consumption, and job placement, in conjunction with self-identification, in order to categorize households according to class status for the purpose of analysis (Cohen 2000; Goldstein 2012; Armbrust 2003; Davis 2004; de Koning 2009).<sup>15</sup> Specifically, I found that 27% of middle and upper-class men do a significant portion of reproductive labor, compared to only 12.5% of lower-middle and lower-class men doing a significant portion of reproductive labor (highlighted in Table 4 below). When isolating one-income households, there is a contrast between 0% of lower and lower-middle class households and 17% of middle, upper-middle and upper-class

---

<sup>15</sup> In this section, I use the terms class, social class, and socioeconomic class interchangeably.

households who have a husband who did a significant portion of reproductive labor. This difference almost disappears when comparing two-income households who are lower and lower-middle class households (25%) to two-income middle, upper-middle and upper-class households (30%). These findings indicate socioeconomic class and economics (whether or not a Moroccan woman participates in the paid labor force full-time) are correlated with men's rates of reproductive labor.

Table 4: Distribution of Reproductive Labor & Class

	Everyone	2-Income Households	1-Income Households
Lower and lower middle-class households, husband doing a significant portion of reproductive labor (30-50%)	13% (1 out of 8)	25% (1 out of 4)	0% (0 out of 4)
Lower and lower middle-class households, husband doing an insignificant portion of reproductive labor (0-20%)	87% (7 out of 8)	75% (3 out of 4)	100% (4 out of 4)
Middle, upper-middle and upper-class households, husband doing a significant portion of reproductive labor (30-50%)	27% (7 out of 26)	30% (6 out of 20)	17% (1 out of 6)

Table 4 (continued)

Middle, upper-middle, and upper-class households, husband doing insignificant portion of reproductive labor (0-20%)	73% (19 out of 26)	70% (14 out of 20)	83% (5 out of 6)
---	--------------------	--------------------	------------------

Table 4: This table shows the percentages of households with men doing a significant portion of reproductive labor (30-50%) and insignificant portion (0-20%), divided by class standings and 1-income vs. 2-income households. The table shows percentages within each class grouping and has the specific number of participants beside in parenthesis.

These trends relating to household decision making processes also appeared in the way urban Moroccans spoke about men doing reproductive labor. When I asked why some Moroccan men were willing to do reproductive labor while others were not, many participants explained that more educated Moroccan men were more willing to do reproductive labor compared to less educated Moroccan men. Education is also important for Moroccan women in order to have more employment opportunities. In the following excerpt, 43-year old Islamic Studies teacher Malika explains her sister-in-law's situation:

*Malika: My sister-in-law has one girl and nine boys, she lost one so she has eight now, she also lives with her husbands' parents.*

*Ruth: wow nine kids!*

*Malika: ...which makes them 13 people in the house. She wakes up and makes eight large pieces of bread just for the morning and she doesn't cook on gas.*

*Ruth: They don't have gas?*

*Malika: No, they cook with firewood, she's the one who brings it from the forest and then she does laundry with her hands and then she cooks for all of them. And the rest are always tired and sick.*

*Ruth: Her husband doesn't help her?*

*Malika: No, he doesn't help at all but some of her kids started to help lately. She doesn't dare to ask her husband for help.*

*Ruth: Her husband is a government worker?*

*Malika: Yes.*

*Ruth: and she works at home?*

*Malika: Yes, she didn't go to school, she's just working at home.*

*Ruth: That's hard*

*Malika: Yes, it's hard.*

Malika's sister-in-law, who lives in the countryside, highlights how social class and educational opportunities can shape employment opportunities available to Moroccan women. This example also highlights how gender and age influence whether and when a child may help with reproductive labor (see above Childcare section).

In addition to education, men's engagement in reproductive labor is also shaped by class expectations. Many Moroccans expect upper-middle class urban Moroccan men to be more willing to do reproductive labor than lower-middle-class or working-class urban Moroccan men. In this way, the distribution of reproductive labor is classed, in addition to being gendered. During an interview with upper-middle class Rachidia (63)

and Boujmaa (68), Rachidia said “The employees work inside and outside but the housewives work inside and their husband outside.” In this way, Rachidia is contrasting middle-class Moroccans where both husband and wife work for the government as employees (*mūzaf*) and a couple with the husband participating in the paid labor force (working outside) and the wife not (working inside). In Moroccan Arabic, employee (*mūzaf*) implies that someone has a stable job with benefits, often working for the government and often defined as upper-middle or middle class. In another example, Hassan (60), who owns a struggling upholstery business in a popular (sh‘bī) neighborhood, said the following during our interview:

*Ruth: Do you do housework when your parents are at your house?*

*Hassan: No, I can't.*

*Ruth: It's a problem (laughing)*

*Hassan: They will laugh at me.*

*Ruth: What would happen if you do housework?*

*Hassan: Nothing would happen, but they won't let me, if my sister visits me and I'm doing housework she will ask me to sit and she will do it instead, it's a little...*

*Ruth: Shameful.*

*Hassan: Yes.*

*Ruth: Is it still considered as a shameful thing to do especially if family is over?*

*Hassan: No, some people think it's normal to help their wives in the kitchen, it's normal for employees to help each other, but for us it's not.*



*Ruth: Why is it normal for employees?*

*Hassan: Because they both work outside and they both should make food so fast or they won't eat. But for men who work outside and their wives are at home they must come and find the food ready.*

Hassan explains that his family would laugh at him if he did housework, and his sister would not let this happen. During Hassan's interview, I said "is it *still* considered shameful..." implying that men not doing housework is somehow part of past, surprising actions that are *still* happening. Although other participants expressed this same sentiment, Hassan did not, and I was asserting an unnecessary teleological hierarchy on distributions of reproductive labor. In response, Hassan pointed out that "some people think it's normal to help their wives in the kitchen, it's normal for employees to help each other, but for us it's not," saying that Hassan and his wife are not employees. Hassan has three children and a wife who works as a household employee cleaning other houses and wedding attendant. Earlier in the interview, Hassan classified his social class as "between middle class and the poor" in Moroccan society. Hassan reasons that employees live in households with a more flexible division of reproductive labor because both husband and wife work outside the home.

I argue that it is not only working outside the house (economics) that denotes living in a household with a more flexible division of labor but also a household's religious beliefs, family structure, children and childcare, education, and social class in conjunction with one another that influence household decision-making processes. Specifically, because Hassan is lower-middle class, he is less willing to do reproductive labor, despite the fact that his wife participates in the paid labor force almost full time

(about 30 hours a week, variable). During the interview, Hassan emphasized that “the neighbors will talk and won’t respect him” if a man does housework. Similar to the working-class Egyptian men that Ghannam (2013) spoke to, Hassan is worried about maintaining his reputation as a man who is to be respected and who should not do reproductive labor. Hassan is an example of the diverse forms of masculinity that are present in urban Moroccan society. In general, as a household’s educational attainment and class increase, gendered subjectivities change and the amount of reproductive labor that a husband does also increases. In this way, the variances of gendered and classed subjectivities are intimately linked to the distribution of reproductive labor.

When I asked upper-middle class Boujmaa (68) and Rachidia (63) why things have changed so that men are more willing to do reproductive labor, Rachidia said, “People are more educated, and life has changed.” And Boujmaa added that, “now they see how European people live.” Boujmaa’s statement supports the notion that middle-class men are more willing to help with some reproductive labor tasks compared to lower-middle and lower-class men, because the middle-class has more exposure to, and potentially more closely identifies with, “how European people live.” Boujmaa and Rachidia’s son lives in Germany and married a German woman (he is now divorced), so Boujmaa might have heard first-hand accounts of “how European people live.” However, such a narrative of “progressive” values of equality in the Global North can reify Orientalist tropes (Said 1979). Specific types of gendered subjectivities (i.e. when men feel a responsibility to do some reproductive labor) and distributions of reproductive labor are associated with education, modernity, and Europe.

## 2.8 Conclusion

Economics, religion, family structure, children and childcare, education, and class intersect to shape the co-constitution of gendered subjectivities and reproductive labor practices within households. For example, how women discussed the income they earned through paid labor, and the contributions they make to the household economy, reflects distinct gendered subjectivities and influences the distribution of reproductive labor within the household. Paid labor supports unpaid labor, either by a husband's salary supporting his wife and child(ren) or potentially a wife's salary supporting female family members caring for her children, which reinforces specific gendered subjectivities. If an urban middle-class Moroccan woman participates in the paid labor force full-time, her husband is more likely to do some reproductive labor. Different interpretations of the Maliki school of Sunni Islam religion affect the way people define appropriate rights and responsibilities of the Muslim husband and wife. While most Moroccans with whom I spoke take a classical approach to interpreting the Qur'an and therefore feel that it is the husband's sole responsibility to care for his family financially, some felt that Muslim husbands and wives should both support the family financially and through reproductive labor. While certain hadith's (accounts of the Prophet Mohammad's life) support a more equal distribution of reproductive labor, most of Moroccan society follows specific gendered subjectivities that support an unequal distribution of reproductive labor. Generally, in households that included extended family, men were less likely to do reproductive labor, in comparison to nuclear households. This is, in part, due to their mothers' efforts to reinforce more traditional gendered subjectivities in which the younger wife is responsible for all reproductive labor. Additionally, the presence of children, especially at a young age, increases childcare needs exponentially, meaning that

two-income households must find childcare through grandmothers, other family members like sisters or sisters-in-law, private nurseries, or paid household employees. By displacing reproductive labor from the wife to a female family member or child, the household maintains a gendered division of reproductive labor in which females disproportionately do reproductive labor. Different distributions of reproductive labor are also associated with specific classed and gendered subjectivities. Generally, as education and class increase, urban Moroccan men are more willing to do reproductive labor.

This chapter demonstrates how the household is a central location where gender roles are negotiated and reproduced. In analyzing the way that gendered subjectivities and reproductive labor co-constitute one another across various household units, I highlight the variety of gendered subjectivities and practices across households and the individual perspectives that collectively influence household reproductive labor negotiations. In the next chapter, I explore the ways that Moroccan men “do” domesticity throughout the life course.

## CHAPTER 3. MEN “DOING DOMESTICITY” THROUGHOUT THE LIFE COURSE: GENDERED AND CLASSED SUBJECTIVITIES IN URBAN MOROCCO

### 3.1 Introduction

*While staying with Abdelhafid and Iman for the week in mid-July, I woke up the sound of Abdelhafid taking his son 12-year-old Youssef to the American Language Center for summer English lessons around 9:20 am in the morning. After dropping Youssef off, Abdelhafid went to shop for food for the family. Iman made breakfast for herself and their two younger children, Mohammad Reda (9 years old) and Amira (6 years old). At 10:35 Abdelhafid called Iman to ask what she would like for dinner, again at 10:38 asking about what is in the fridge and then at 10:49 am to ask what he should get at the open-air market. Iman told Abdelhafid to get carrots, onions, green beans, and green zucchini. At 12:08 Abdelhafid comes home from shopping. He has a number of re-usable and some plastic bags and is out of breath from walking up the four flights of stairs to get to their apartment and is saying that he bought fish to cook for lunch. At 12:15 pm Abdelhafid is eating his breakfast and we talk while he is eating.*

*Abdelhafid: I didn't get a chance to eat breakfast earlier--I just had a glass of milk and took Youssef to the center and then went to shop.*

*Ruth: What does Youssef eat for breakfast?*

*Abdelhafid: He eats harsha [semolina pastry] and a cup of tea from the maḥlaba [dairy shop] downstairs, or milawi [flour pastry] with chocolate or something like that--it is like three to five dh (~\$0.30-0.50) for that and his cup of tea. I eat breakfast when I get back home from taking him to the center and often shopping as well.*

*Ruth: It was great talking to your parents- there's a difference between you.*

*Abdelhafid: Yes, there's a huge difference between us! We are not the same.*

*Ruth: I feel like they feel like a woman should be at home and a man should be working outside and that's the best way of life and they like having roles where women stay at home and men work outside.*

*Abdelhafid: Yes, for sure. There is also a difference in the type of work that my dad did. My dad worked in a factory all day long so he was really tired when he came home and really couldn't do housework when he came home. It's not like a job in an office or something like that.*

*Ruth: But your mom worked outside the home some right? In a hammam?*

*Abdelhafid: Yes, but not that often and not every day. So, she would work if there was an event or something like that, but not every day- she would cover for a woman working in the hammam if the woman was sick or traveling or something. She would help work for the military cafeteria if they had a big event where the king was coming for 15 days or something like that. So, she would work a bit and then go back home, but she never had a stable job where she was working everyday outside the house.*

*Ruth: I also get the feeling that even though they say it's ok for a man to do housework if both are working outside the home, they don't feel like that really.*

*Abdelhafid: Yeah, they don't really like a man doing housework.*

*Ruth: Both your mom and your dad!*

*Abdelhafid: Yeah, both of them. Even when I was little, my dad would do housework sometimes but I think he still felt that it was strange [ghrīb], shameful [ḥashūma], bad*

*[khāyeb] to do. He [my father] didn't feel like it was normal or like something that he would be doing a lot.*

*Ruth: When did your dad do housework when you were little?*

*Abdelhafid: Just like when my mom was sick or if someone from the family came who was sick and they went to the local doctor or hospital together and so he was without her in the house and so he would take care of the house some.*

*Ruth: Why don't you have a problem with doing housework?*

*Abdelhafid: Well, it's normal. And in this time period, it is necessary to help each other with everything.*

*Ruth: Everything is mixed together.*

*Abdelhafid: Yes.*

*Ruth: Both of you [Abdelhafid & Iman] are working outside so both of you must do more things inside.*

*Abdelhafid: Yes, we must help each other with everything. And in relation to religion, there is no problem.*

*Ruth: No problem, the opposite, it is better to do housework and help his wife like the Prophet Mohammad did.*

*Abdelhafid: Yes, exactly, it is better to do these things.*

*Ruth: Some people say that there is a problem that the Prophet did these things because he wanted to do these things, of his own volition but it's a problem if his wife asks him to do these things.*

*Abdelhafid: I think that the important thing is the action- that he did these things. Not whether or not he did them with or without his wives asking for help.*

*Ruth: Right- action is more important than words.*

*Abdelhafid: I also think it's important that couples don't count up actions and things- do you understand me?*

*Ruth: Yes, like saying I did this, you must do that.*

*Abdelhafid: Yes, exactly. It is better just to do it all together. And the same for money- it shouldn't be this is my money or this is your money- this is our money all together, not yours or mine but ours.*

I begin this chapter with the above vignette from the morning after I interviewed Abdelhafid's parents, Safiya (64) and Arabi (69). Abdelhafid does a significant portion of reproductive labor (shopping for food and transporting his children to various activities) while his father Arabi did not and continues to do very little reproductive labor. As we discussed, both of Abdelhafid's parents agree that it is better for the wife to care for the house and children while the husband makes money. This chapter examines the way that Moroccan men "do domesticity" and how this is evolving in contemporary Morocco. Though extensive literature exists on Moroccan women in the public sphere (Cairolì 2011; Newcomb 2009; Kapchan 1996), less research explores the ways in which men "do domesticity" and interact within the private spheres of life, why they do so, and what this



means for gendered subjectivities in Morocco. For some urban middle-class Moroccan men, being a good father means taking an active role in their children's lives and taking care of them with the help of their wives. This is not true for all urban younger middle-class men, but most said that they were more willing to help with cooking, cleaning, and childcare than their father had been, showing a generational shift. When I asked participants if men doing housework means that a man is perceived to be less masculine, most participants, both men and women, said that doing housework does not lower the level of a man's masculinity. Despite this, every Moroccan woman that I talked to does the vast majority of reproductive labor around the house. This chapter explores the dynamic nature of Moroccan masculinity during marriage. Specifically, this chapter examines how urban middle-class Moroccan men often end up doing "easy" chores, how they conceptualize being a "good father," how they cook, and the classed dimensions of Moroccan men doing reproductive labor. I place urban Moroccan middle-class masculinities in context with Moroccan femininities and highlight both male and female voices.

While examining the structures that influence household decision-making processes (see Chapter 2), I noticed that younger participants (under 50) have different ideas about appropriate actions for urban middle-class Moroccan men compared to their father's generation (over 50). Specifically, younger middle-class Moroccan males tended to have broader, more active definition for what it means to be a "good husband" and "good father," whereas older men would often solely base this role on providing financially for their family. Older urban middle-class Moroccan men often define their masculinity based primarily on their role as breadwinner, which is upheld in the public

and private sphere (like the participants that Ghannam [2018, 2013] and Naguib [2015] spoke with). Unlike in Cairo, and among older urban middle-class Moroccan men, younger urban middle-class Moroccan men root their masculine identities in their roles as active, participatory fathers and breadwinners.

In this chapter, I discuss how urban middle-class Moroccan men practice, perform, and “do” domesticity throughout their marriage: during the early marriage and newlywed period (under seven years), during the mid-marriage period often after a couple has children, and finally when the husband retires or is no longer able to do his job. My research builds on Butler’s (1990) concept of gender performativity to analyze how urban middle-class men perform masculinity while doing reproductive labor. Additionally, participants actively enact their specific gendered subjectivities through a bundle of practices associated with their masculine identities. Most urban middle-class Moroccan men with whom I spoke did less reproductive labor when they were newlyweds and without children. When they became fathers, they were more willing to do reproductive labor. To understand Moroccan masculinities, I examine how Moroccan women envision their role within the household in relation to their family and how they envision a husband’s role in the household. This chapter is structured into three main sections: early marriage, middle marriage and retirement and draws on data from 34 households.

In this chapter, I distinguish between older (over 50 years old) and younger urban middle-class Moroccan men (under 50 years old). This age range appeared organically in the dataset as a method for demarcating generational differences. I realize that generational differences develop gradually, and people do not change their attitudes about

being a participatory father overnight when reaching a certain age. However, this classification is a simple way to categorize differences that emerged from the data. Due to my sample of urban Moroccans being skewed more towards middle, upper-middle, and upper-class urban Moroccans under the age of 50 years old, most of the data presented below represents this subset of the population. Due to this, my data is more representative of what younger middle-class urban Moroccans said about themselves and their father's generation, rather than the actual household practices in the nine older households that I interviewed. It is also important to note that while my analysis focuses on differences in two age groups (over or under 50 years old), most of it is more representative of middle, upper-middle and upper-class households but not lower-middle and lower-class households.

Throughout the early, middle, and late portions of marriage, urban middle-class Moroccan men are most willing to shop for food for the household. During semi-structured interviews, I asked every participant who shops for cook, who cooks in the house, who does the cleaning, and who takes care of the children (if applicable), most of the time. Of the 34 households interviewed, 25 (74%) men shopped for food sometimes, with their wives, and/or exclusively. Shopping for food is by far the task that men are most comfortable doing (out of shopping, cooking, or taking care of children). This is likely because shopping happens outside of the home in public spaces, which are often gendered "male" in Moroccan society (Kapchan 1996). This finding aligns with Egyptian men also often shopping for their families (Naguib 2015; Ghannam 2013). Participants also mentioned that one or the other spouse was better at shopping (finding the best produce, getting the best price at the open-air market/sūq) and therefore did most of the

shopping for the family. There was no clear gender division on who was better at shopping, but it is seemingly more often based on experience and knowledge.

### 3.2 MENA Masculinities Literature

As explained in Chapter 1, much research on gender in the MENA region uses “gender” as code for “women” (Inhorn 2014), with some recent exceptions examining the construction of masculinity (Inhorn & Naguib 2018; Ghannam 2013; Ouzgane 2006). While these studies show how men and women are active participants in and influence both public and private spheres (Meneley 1996), only a handful of existing studies explore MENA men in private spaces “doing” domesticity. Research exists examining masculinities at home elsewhere (Meah & Jackson 2013; Swenson 2009), but MENA masculinity studies is limited in comparison to masculinity studies worldwide (Inhorn 2014). Even within research conducted in Morocco, a number of studies examine Moroccan women in the public sphere (Ennaji 2016; Cairoli 2011; Newcomb 2009; Ennaji & Sadiqi 2008; Gray 2006 & 2001; Kapchan 1996; Mernissi 1975), but the dearth of research examining Moroccan men “doing domesticity” is conspicuous. Less research exists exploring how men interact with private spheres of life, why they do so, and what this means for gendered subjectivities in Morocco. My research dispels common Western discourses about Muslim men as “dangerous Others who perpetrate war, brutality, and radicalization as well as the oppressive subjugation of women and religious minorities” (Inhorn & Naguib 2018:1).

Social scientists studying the MENA region are concerned about unemployed young adults aged 15 to 29, termed the “generation in waiting,” whose economic

opportunities are constrained by the lengthy economic slowdown and public-sector structural adjustment programs that began in the early 1980s (Cohen 2000; Dhillon & Yousef 2009). Barbosa (2018) discusses how Muslim men are creating new ways of being men when they are unable to participate in the labor market or marry, but few ethnographies exist on how being part of the “generation in waiting” (Dhillon & Yousef 2009) affects men’s marriage and family relations. My research examines how gendered and classed subjectivities are continuously performed and subtly changing over time due to urban Moroccan middle-classes’ previous experiences as the “generation in waiting.”

In Morocco, ideologies of separate public/private spheres are present, but more women are participating in the paid labor force outside of the home (Alpert 2007) and asking for help with reproductive labor from their male spouses. Because of this, the boundaries between men and women’s responsibilities within and outside the home are increasingly blurred. My research works to actively break down false binaries that associate everything public with masculinity and everything private with femininity.

### 3.3 Early Marriage

In the beginning of marriage, most participants stressed that there was not very much reproductive labor to do and that they did not negotiate between each other who would do what. Generally, the urban middle-class Moroccan wife felt that it was her responsibility to take care of the house and cook for the new household. Sometimes the wife does ask for help and/or sometimes the husband will offer to help. I spoke with Jamila (31) and Jalal (40), who married 4 months before the interview, in their home about their household responsibilities:

*Ruth: Tell me about your responsibilities in the house.*

*Jamila: Like any other woman, the kitchen and the house.*

*Ruth: What are your responsibilities in the house? [to Jalal]*

*Jalal: I help my wife in the kitchen sometimes if she's sick even though she doesn't let me. But I always insist on helping her sometimes.*

*Ruth: She doesn't want you to help her in the house?*

*Jamila: There is not much to do.*

*Ruth: How did you both decide who would do what in the house?*

*Jamila: It's automatic and it doesn't need to be thought of.*

During the interview, it was clear that Jalal wanted to help Jamila sometimes with some small household tasks like cooking and small chores around the house but in general she wanted to do them herself. Jalal insists that he helps “in the kitchen sometimes if she’s sick, even though she doesn’t let me.” Jalal’s words, “I *always* insist on helping her *sometimes*,” (I added emphasis) capture the tension and ambiguity of Jalal wanting to help sometimes, but still wanting to respect his wife’s wishes. This interaction could have been additionally complicated by my presence as a white American woman because Jalal might have assumed that I would like to hear about him doing reproductive labor.

Jamila repeatedly said that she doesn’t want help because “there is not much to do” around the house. They live in a relatively small apartment with only the kitchen, living room, bedroom, and bathroom to clean. Jamila also mentioned that the division of reproductive labor is “automatic and doesn’t need to be thought of,” suggesting that there

is a widely understood division of household labor within Morocco (i.e. that the wife is responsible for taking care of cooking, cleaning, and childcare). In contrast to Jamila's assertions, many urban middle-class Moroccan men with whom I spoke felt that it was their responsibility to actively take care of their children. However, Jalal and Jamila have only just gotten married and do not have children. Jamila later says, "I have a Moroccan mentality, I don't want to be sitting while my husband is doing the housework, except if I'm sick." Jamila defines a "Moroccan mentality" as it only being appropriate for a married Moroccan man to do housework if his wife is sick. The image of a man cleaning while his wife rests appeared in informal conversations and Moroccan sitcoms and was used as a way to justify Moroccan men not doing reproductive labor.

Often, urban Moroccan middle-class men agree to do simple or "easy" chores around the household (I discuss the intersection of "easy" chores with technology in Chapter 6). When I asked Fatiha (30), an English teacher for kindergarten children in a private school who married two months before the interview, who does the laundry, she said that "He [her husband] does, because it's easy." Fatiha explained that her husband willingly took up laundry in the household because it is an "easy" chore, without being prompted to do so. Yousra (43), an NGO worker without children, says that her husband "only cooks, he does nothing else." In this way, Moroccan men often do some reproductive labor, but do not take on a significant portion of it. During the early stages of marriage, there is little reproductive labor and most urban middle-class Moroccan women feel responsible for cooking, cleaning, and childcare, which some assistance from husbands doing small chores around the house. In this way, most urban middle-class younger Moroccan men with whom I spoke "do" or practice domesticity by only

occasionally doing small chores around the house during the early stages of marriage. In general, I noted that newlywed couples do not actively negotiate who should do what but simply do what they feel a responsibility to do and/or feel willing to do. I did not specifically ask older couples married for more than seven years how their distribution of reproductive labor had changed during the course of their marriage. However, several participants mentioned organically that reproductive labor increased significantly after having children, which often spurred urban younger middle-class men into doing more reproductive labor.

### 3.4 Mid-Marriage

The younger middle-class urban Moroccan men under 50 years old with whom I spoke were more willing to do reproductive labor compared to their father's generation (over 50 years), especially in relation to caring for their child or children and sometimes in cooking. This section examines the ways that Moroccan men perform "domesticity" during the middle years of a marriage. After a couple has one or multiple children, the amount of reproductive labor needed to sustain and reproduce the household dramatically increases. Because of the increased need for reproductive labor and the lack of availability of help from extended family (due to living in a neolocal residence), urban middle-class Moroccan men often take an active role in their child or children's lives, actively caring for and raising them. Even prior to the birth of a baby, Moroccan women are also sometimes unable to do every chore that they would be able to do prior to the birth of a child. Amal (42), an English teacher at a private high school, noted that, "He [her husband] started cleaning the floor when I was pregnant with Salman." Nadia (29), a newlywed and newly pregnant wife, said, "my husband goes shopping I just tell him what



I need, especially now after I got pregnant.” In this way, the increased need for reproductive labor starts even before a baby is born.

### 3.4.1 Being a Good Father

Participants noted that they have a responsibility to be an active caretaker in their child or children’s lives and most young middle-class Moroccan men are becoming more willing to do some reproductive labor activities in general, and childcare specifically, compared to their father’s generation, showing a small but significant generational shift. Of the 34 couples I interviewed, 23 have children. Of the 23 couples with children, 14 (60.9%) have a father actively taking care of the child or children in ways beyond monetary support. This classification is based on the question “who takes care of the children most of the time?” Of 7 couples 50 years or older, only 1 father (14% of the older couples) was mentioned when answering the question who takes care (or took care) of the children. Of the 16 couples under 50 years old, 13 (81% of the younger couples) have a father who actively takes care of the child or children. In the below example, middle-class Youssef (36) explains why he chooses to go shopping and take care of his kids, while his father did not do these things. Youssef’s wife Meryiem (34) also discusses her father’s parenting style. Youssef and Meryiem are both Geography and History teachers at a local public high school.

*Youssef: I have some responsibilities in the house that my father didn’t have like shopping or taking care of the kids.*

*Ruth: Why are you different than him?*

*Youssef: Because these are the responsibilities of both, the man and the woman. The kids were made by both of them (laughing), and they want to see both of their parents around them, not just their mother. I grew up far from my father and closer to my mother.*

*Meryiem: My father was very close to us, maybe because he worked with Europeans. We could tell that he was very different from other men.*

Unlike his own father, Youssef feels a responsibility to shop for the household and to actively take care of the kids “because these are the responsibilities of both, the man and the woman.” Youssef goes on to note that children want to see both of their parents, not just their mother, implying that it is better for the children to be actively raised by both parents. Youssef’s desire to be an active father may also be related to his own father’s absence.

Throughout the interview at Youssef and Meryiem’s home, both Youssef and Meryiem got up multiple times (about equal amounts) to check in on and look after their four-year old and one-year old sons in the other room. Youssef took his sons to the other room to watch television during the interview, he later gave their four-year-old son a piece of paper and crayons to color at the same table, and reprimanded his son slightly when he drew on my sheet of paper with interview questions on it. I was also surprised to learn that Youssef actually changed his four-year-old son’s diapers when he was younger. For Youssef, these actions are an expression of his love for his children. Among the households with whom I spoke, Youssef takes one of the most active approaches to being a father, but almost every younger, middle-class male participant noted that they do more

reproductive labor today (during my fieldwork 2018-2019) compared to what their father did growing up.

Meryiem, whose father worked as the Chief of Service at a hotel in Rabat before she was born, mentions that “my father was very close to us.” Meryiem suggests that her father was different from most Moroccan urban fathers at the time by saying that “we could tell that he was very different from other men.” Specifically, Meryiem’s father occasionally cooked for the family and was quite close to his children, being an active father. Meryiem explained that this might be because “he worked with Europeans,” associating being an active, participatory father with Europeans and potentially some form of “modernity.” Youssef’s father occasionally cooked a very simple eggs and tomatoes dish but only when he felt like it and he was not close to his children. In contrast to his father, Youssef regularly shops for the household groceries and goods, actively takes care of the two young children, and regularly fixes things around the house. Meryiem enjoys cooking and so she cooks most of the time, does the housework, and also shares the responsibility of taking care of their two children with Youssef.

Although Youssef may be a bit of an exception in taking a particularly active role in parenting, another participant with whom I spoke, Yahia, is typical of most younger middle-class urban men I interviewed. While I was interviewing Hanane (44) at Amal and Yahia’s house, Amal (42) and her husband Yahia (48) chimed in during the interview process about when and why Moroccan husbands become obligated to do housework and take care of children:

*Ruth: Does he (your husband) help you with cleaning?*

*Hanane: No! (laughing) No, no (everyone is laughing)*

*Amal: Ask Yahia.*

*(Hanane asks Amal's husband Yahia who's also in the room): Do you help with cleaning?*

*Youssef: Yes, I help sometimes.*

*Hanane: My husband never cleans the floor; I think because he has a fat belly that prevents him from bending (laughs).*

*Yahia: I don't know how to do it, but I do.*

*Amal: He started cleaning the floor when I was pregnant with Salman.*

*Hanane: That's why.*

*Amal: Sometimes men are obliged to clean because they have no choice.*

*Ruth: With taking care of the children?*

*Amal: Of course.*

*Ruth: How so?*

*Amal: Help them with the homework, take them out to the forest or go for walks. Especially with the boys, they are always together. They go out to play soccer or watch a game.*

*Hanane: While my girl spends most of her time with me.*

*Amal: Does she always stay with you?*

*Hanane: No, she goes out with them too sometimes. I can leave them with him and travel with no problem too.*

There are several themes covered in this excerpt that showed up across interviews. Yahia admits that he does not really know how to clean the floor properly, but he does it anyways sometimes. This echoes the finding of other researches who find a common perception that men often do not know how to clean or cook well (Meah & Jackson 2013). In Yahia's interview he said that he cleans the floor when his wife Amal is sick. Following Jamila's definition of the "Moroccan mentality," men doing reproductive labor when their wife is sick was a common theme that appeared in several interviews. Amal also asserts that men are sometimes "obliged to clean because they have no choice," like when Yahia cleans the floor because Amal is sick. Pushing further, Amal implies that men have a responsibility to take care of their children by helping them with homework and taking them for walks, especially boys.

There is a sense in the interviews and participant observation that it is more appropriate for a father to teach a boy to be a man and a mother to teach a girl to be a woman. However, in reality, both parents teach their children gender roles through active parenting, gendered expectations of boys and girls (see Chapter 2's portion of Childcare), and through the children mirroring their parents. Hanane mentions that most of her 9-year-old daughter's time is spent with Hanane, rather than her husband. However, Hanane also notes that "she goes out with them [her husband and two teenage sons] too," adding that "I can leave them with him and travel with no problem." Hanane seemed to be bragging a bit at this point in the conversation that her husband, unlike some Moroccan husbands, can be left alone to successfully take care of his three children aged

15, 13 and 9, even with his wife travelling. Hanane praises her husband's ability to care for their three children alone, associating proper Moroccan masculinity with being an active participatory father who does not need constant female supervision. Additionally, by being able to care for the children, Hanane can travel without her husband and children. I did not ask where she travels to, but having the freedom to travel without her family is beneficial. In 2011, there was an entire comical Moroccan reality show called "Traveling Mother" (madame msafra) where inept husbands were left to take care of the house and kids while mothers are away on a retreat with hilarious and sometimes sad results<sup>16</sup>. Although this show came out seven years before I began the research for this dissertation, the presence of this television series shows that my findings only represent a small change in societal gender roles and are limited only to the urban younger middle-class Moroccan households with whom I spoke.

When I was interviewing Yahia in his house on the same day that I interviewed Hanane, he described his responsibilities in the house: "My responsibility is the kids, sometimes I help with housework, my main responsibility is to educate the kids and make them respect the rules/limits (laughs) They only study when I'm here and they don't listen a lot to their mother."

Although perhaps not as active of a father as Youssef, Yahia still feels that his main responsibility within the household is to "educate the kids and make them respect the rules/limits." Specifically, Yahia feels that it is necessary to be the disciplinarian in the household in order for their children to study. When Amal, I, and Hanane returned home

---

<sup>16</sup> I was told that the show was originally based on a British reality show but that the Moroccan version was canceled after one or two seasons because it resulted in the divorce of one of the couples featured on the show. Similar themes are present in American popular culture.

a little late after Amal and Hanane worked all day, there was tea, bread, jam, and butter set out, either by Yahia or their eldest son, who is ten years old. I put the fancy Moroccan cookies that I brought on a plate and brought them out and a little later Amal brought out warm Moroccan crepes (msemin) which were delicious. Yahia or their ten-year-old son felt comfortable making tea and putting together the daily tray of tea time accompaniments. Although their actions were supplemented by Amal warming up msemin and me bringing in extra cookies, their original initial actions show their active and important role in the household.

In addition to age, class and occupation influence gendered subjectivities significantly. Working-class men might not have the time or energy to care for their children in a more active way or to do housework after a long day's work of manual labor. In the ethnographic vignette at the beginning of this chapter, Abdelhafid said that "there is also a difference in the type of work that my dad did. My dad worked in a factory all day long so he was really tired when he came home and really couldn't do housework when he came home. It's not like a job in an office or something like that." In this way, Abdelhafid is suggesting that in addition to being part of a different generation and socioeconomic class that influences gendered subjectivities, his father's occupation limited his ability to do reproductive labor when he came home.

Like Ghannam (2013)'s and Naguib (2015)'s findings in Cairo regarding men providing for the family, I found that urban middle-class Moroccan men can reinforce the status-quo version of masculinity by being a disciplinarian and/or providing food and shelter for their family. In contrast, Youssef physically changing his son's diapers clashes with hegemonic versions of masculinity in Morocco because he is providing physical

care that some would consider demeaning. Overall, most urban middle-class participants under 50 were closer to Yahia than Youssef, but both show a small generational shift in gendered subjectivities: the way urban middle-class Moroccan men view their responsibility as a father. Specifically, an older generation (over 50) of urban middle-class Moroccan men viewed their primary responsibility as taking care of their families financially by providing the material resources for food, clothing, and shelter. In contrast, my data shows that a slightly younger generation (under 50) of urban middle-class Moroccan men view their responsibility more broadly as taking care of the family financially and actively caring for their children (i.e., by changing the diaper, being a disciplinarian or looking after the children while the wife is away).

### 3.4.2 Cooking

In addition to taking a more active role as a father, some urban middle-class Moroccan men also do reproductive labor in the household either by cooking lavish ceremonial meals that garner much praise or by occasionally preparing or cooking simple dishes out of necessity (i.e., tea, eggs with tomatoes). Although I have placed this section in the middle of marriage, Moroccan men sometimes cook in all stages of marriage and life. I include examples from throughout the life course in this section on cooking. I base this section on a very broad definition of cooking which includes preparing, processing, and cooking food and drinks. When I asked the question “who cooks in the house most of the time?” all 34 couples answered that the wife (or housekeeper) cooks most of the time. Twelve out of 34 couples or 35% also mentioned men cooking on a semi-regular basis. These answers were then double-checked through analysis of responses to the question “tell me about a normal day for you,” in which I noted any time a man prepares or cooks



food and participant observation. When I interviewed Hassan (60) in his home during Ramadan, he revealed that he sometimes cooks “simple” meals for the children when his wife is working as a household employee or as a wedding attendant.

*Ruth: Do you help with housework?*

*Hassan: Sometimes, yes.*

*Ruth: What do you do?*

*Hassan: Make lunch for the kids, peel off vegetables, make juice. But I don't enter the kitchen when she's in it.*

*Ruth: What do you cook for the kids?*

*Hassan: Potatoes Tagine or pasta... Something simple.*

In this excerpt, Hassan stresses that he cooks something simple like potato tajine, juice, or pasta for his three children (aged 19, 18 and 11). Hassan also says that he “doesn’t enter the kitchen when she’s [his wife] in it.” Recall that in Moroccan society, many argue that the home, and especially the kitchen, is coded as “female space” while outside the home is coded as “male” space, implying that women belong in the kitchen and men belong in public spaces (Kapchan 1996).<sup>17</sup> Although men and women routinely enter both spaces, Hassan feels especially that the kitchen of the house is his wife’s domain when she is inside of it. However, when she is at work cleaning other people’s houses or preparing wives for their wedding, Hassan must enter the kitchen to prepare food for his children. Because the children are older, sometimes they also prepare breakfast or a

---

<sup>17</sup> This theme is also raised in Chapter 6 on convenience technology in the “Men Doing Laundry” section.

teatime meal for themselves while their parents are working. Hassan, who owns his own upholstery shop, and his wife Aziza (39), who works as a household employee and wedding attendant, are a working-class family. As noted in Chapter 2's section on "Class & Education," being of a slightly lower social class, Hassan might have been more hesitant to do reproductive labor compared to his middle-class counterparts. Although Hassan is not middle-class, he provides an excellent example of an urban Moroccan man occasionally cooking simple meals for his family out of necessity.

While I was staying with Hassan and his family for a week during intensive participant observation, Hassan would put on water to boil in the morning around 7 am every day to make himself strong black instant coffee in the morning before going to work at his upholstery business. On a Saturday in June 2019, Aziza (39) was at work as a wedding attendant and Hassan cooked dinner for the family from 11 to 11:45 pm. He peeled and cut up peaches and blended them in the blender with a little bit of help from his 11-year-old daughter and 18-year-old son. I smelled something burning and assumed that the motor on the blender might be working hard but did not say anything. The burning smell was later confirmed to be the blender that had gotten too hot from being used for an extended period, blending peaches and mangoes for juice. Because of the blender issues, we ate the peach and mango mixture out of small cups with spoons instead of as a juice. The 11-year-old daughter, Wiam, went down the street to buy spicy olives to go with dinner, which took about five minutes. Hassan took about 45 minutes to make dinner, which was white beans in a red sauce, bread, spicy olives, and pureed peach and mango for dessert. Hassan asked Wiam to get the cold jug of water from the refrigerator, but she didn't want to, so I went and got the water. It was just me, Wiam,

and Hassan eating dinner because the oldest son, Achraf, was sleeping due to the medicine that he was taking and the 18-year-old son, Souhail, had eaten a fried potato croquette sandwich (m'qūda) from the street that are usually five dh (about \$0.50). This dinner was the only instance during the seven days I lived with the family when Hassan did a sustained amount of reproductive labor.

During the week Hassan did 1.1 hours of housework (mostly cooking dinner on Saturday) and worked 51 hours outside of the house. In contrast, his wife Aziza did about 17 hours of reproductive labor for the family and worked 29.5 hours outside of the house in paid labor. Additionally, the 11-year-old Wiam did about five hours of reproductive labor, the 18-year son did about half an hour of reproductive labor, and the oldest 19-year-old son did a little over half an hour of reproductive labor during seven days. I was not always in the home, but this data gives a rough estimate of reproductive labor needed to care for a family of five with older children (~24 hours within a week). Despite being the youngest sibling, Wiam was expected to do more reproductive labor because she is a girl compared to her older brothers. One brother was studying for the final high school exam, the Baccalaureate, and the other taking college courses but, based on my observations, both had ample time to do more reproductive labor around the house. Similar to Cairo's working-class context (Ghannam 2013; Naguib 2018), Hassan taught his children that the proper role for a woman or girl is helping to make lunch or doing laundry while the most proper role for a man or boy is to study in order to make money for the family, coding the breadwinner role as masculine.

In contrast to urban middle-class Moroccan men occasionally cooking simple meals out of necessity, some men also cook special dishes when they want to, gaining

praise and prestige from the family. Food scholars have noted that while women are expected to cook daily and receive little commendation, when a man cooks anything, it is usually celebrated and praised (Meah & Johnson 2013). The following excerpt is from the interview with Youssef (36) and Meryiem (34) from earlier in the “Being a Good Father” section, with Meryiem explaining that her father occasionally cooked special meals for the family that he learned from working at a European hotel in Rabat.

*Ruth: When you were with your parents, who did the housework most of the time?*

*Meryiem: My mother and my old sisters. My father was old when I was born because I'm the youngest one, but my sisters told me that he used to cook sometimes and serve them special dishes in the same way they used to do it in the hotel.*

*Youssef: But not all the time.*

*Meryiem: No, he cooked but occasionally, but usually my mother and my sisters were the ones who cooked.*

Meryiem’s father provides a good example of an urban middle-class man occasionally cooking for his family special meals that he learned at work. Because Meryiem’s father’s meals were “special dishes” made “in the same way they used to do it in the hotel,” they were highly valued and occasional, in contrast to Meryiem’s mother’s and sisters’ daily cooking for the family. This trend is also confirmed in scholarly literature on food (Meah & Jackson 2013). Hassan’s only cooking very simple meals out of necessity and Meryiem’s father occasionally cooking elaborate and grandiose meals for his family

when he wanted to, both exemplify how most urban middle-class Moroccan men approach cooking.

In addition to being active fathers and cooking sometimes, 11 out of 34 households mentioned men cleaning the house at least some of the time (although never exclusively). Two out of nine older households included husbands who cleaned some of the time (22%) and nine out of 25 younger households included husbands who cleaned some of the time (36%). Although this data is present because I asked the question “who cleans the house most of the time?” not many participants spoke extensively about sweeping, mopping, straightening, and cleaning the bathrooms of their houses. Additionally, I did not often actually see men cleaning the house during participant observation. Due to lack of data, I did not include a section on men cleaning.

During the middle of marriage after a couple has children, urban middle-class Moroccan men under 50 years old are more likely than those over 50 years old to actively participate in “domesticity” by doing some reproductive labor regularly. This mainly manifests in two main ways: through childcare and cooking. Specifically, younger middle-class urban Moroccan men are more willing to have an active role in parenting their children today compared to their father’s generation. In addition, men are also sometimes willing to cook for the family either simple dishes only by necessity because their wife is unable to or special elaborate occasional meals that garner much praise.

### 3.5 Retirement

Multiple research participants noted that retirement is a great thing for a Moroccan woman, because they can go back home, but for a Moroccan man, it is strange

and unfulfilling. Rachidia (63) said that “they [Moroccan men] don’t have anything to do and just sit in the house all day and this is bad.” This ideology perpetuates a gendered public/private binary and the belief that Moroccan women, in general, belong inside the house and that Moroccan men belong outside of the house (Kapchan 1996). In interviews, there is a sense that the retired man has lost his purpose in life because he is no longer working, and he has nothing to do in the house. Furthermore, men are bringing in less income when they retire and so they are not able to contribute to the household budget (the responsibility of a man in a classical interpretation of the Qur’an) in the same way as when they were working full time. It is important to note that almost every man currently retired in Moroccan society is older than 50 years old and considered to be part of an older generation that is often less willing to do reproductive labor. In general, most male urban middle-class older retired participants felt less comfortable in the household and were less willing to do reproductive labor than their younger counterparts. Below is a longer quote explaining this further. The quote is from a conversation with Iman (42), who works in the government health insurance office, about how men feel about retirement.

*Retirement is hard for men- it is much more suited to women because they have always done housework and so they have no problem with it. But when men retire, they have ALL DAY at home or maybe half the day at a café and half the day at home, so they’re bored and they may criticize their wife’s food or her actions because they don’t have anything else to do. When a man has worked all day, he is happy just to have food- he’s not worried about how his wife cooked it.*

*Because the man is now retired his wife may also ask him to help out around the house because he has time- in the beginning he may say – sure I can help out and for a year or two he'll help out but after a bit he won't want to anymore. **He feels that doing housework is beneath him and it makes him less of a man to do housework because this is a woman's job, this is his wife's job** [my emphasis]. They have also constantly de-valued housework all of their lives, so they don't think it is very important.*

*I'll tell you a story- I have a friend who I work with, her husband just took retirement about a year ago and it's tough for them because he is at home all day and she is still working but he doesn't want to help with housework. He feels that it's not much work and it is beneath him. That doing housework will reduce or take away his masculinity. So, they have this problem, and it is very hard on my friend.*

Iman argues that retirement is hard for men because they are not used to staying at home all day and they may become extra critical of their wife's cooking or cleaning habits because they have nothing else to do and may feel the need to reassert their dominance over the house. Housework is also a tough issue for older, retired men because they have not done housework all their lives and have continually devalued it, saying that it is simple, and it is women's work. However, because they have more time when they are retired, their wife may ask them to help with the housework.

Iman's coworker and friend still participated in the paid labor force full time while her husband, who is retired, still expects her to continue doing all of the cooking and cleaning, like she has always done. For him, doing the housework is something that

can be done easily, so his wife should not ask him to do it. She wants help with housework because her husband is now retired and has time while she is still participating in the paid labor force, but he refuses. Iman's friend and her retired husband have differing views on what a retired urban middle-class Moroccan man *should* be responsible for: what his role should be in the house. While Iman's friend finds it reasonable for him to help with housework, he does not feel that it is necessary or appropriate for him to do housework because it will "reduce or take away his masculinity." Iman's friend has a different perspective on appropriate gendered subjectivities compared to her husband.

Despite the fact that most older urban middle-class men with whom I spoke did not feel comfortable or compelled to do reproductive labor, two older households (out of 9) have husbands who regularly do reproductive labor. In one upper-middle class family, Boujmaa (68) is retired from military service and lives with his homemaker wife Rachidia (63) and their eldest daughter Halima (40). Below is the interview excerpt:

*Ruth: Tell me about your responsibilities in the house.*

*Rachidia: He fixes things if they stop working.*

*Boujmaa: I just finished painting the garage's door. Did you see me doing it?!*

*(Everybody is laughing)*

*Ruth: Yes, I did.*

*Halima: He likes handiwork.*

*Rachidia: Yes, that's right.*



*Boujmaa: I fix things, and organize, I sweep the floor and do laundry. I can do everything.*

*Ruth: How did you both decide who would do what in the house?*

*Rachidia: You mean who decides?*

*Ruth: Yes.*

*Rachidia: We both do, sometimes I decide by myself to do some things.*

*Ruth: When he first retired, did you ask him to help you or he started helping you without you asking?*

*Boujmaa: It happened willingly, nobody told me.*

*Halima: You didn't decide who's going to do what?*

*Rachidia: No, each one does what he can do and want. We help each other.*

Later in the interview, I find out that Rachidia raised their children when they were younger and Boujmaa was travelling for work. Today, Rachidia does almost all the cooking and Boujmaa and Rachidia both do housework. Specifically, Boujmaa does almost all the dishes and laundry for himself and his wife. Boujmaa does the laundry because as Rachidia says, "I can't go upstairs, I have knee problems." I found it interesting that when asked about his "responsibilities in the house," Boujmaa responded that he painted the garage door, fixes things, organizes, sweeps the floor, and does laundry. Although Boujmaa states that "he can do everything," he does not mention doing the dishes on a daily basis. While staying with the family for a week, I noticed that Boujmaa does the dishes almost daily and always makes Moroccan mint tea for himself

for breakfast and teatime (Rachidia puts together breakfast and makes coffee). Instead of actively negotiating who would do what types of reproductive labor after Boujmaa became retired, Boujmaa willingly decided to do the dishes, laundry, and floor sweeping occasionally. Boujmaa and Rachidia both “do what they can do, want to do” and “help each other.” The tendency to “help each other” is present in the households with the least conflict around reproductive labor (which I will discuss further in Chapter 5). Boujmaa is likely different from most other retired middle-class Moroccan men with whom I spoke because of his personality and his socioeconomic class standing and familiarity with marriage in Europe because he has a son who married a German woman. In contrast, most retired Moroccan urban middle-class men tend to “do domesticity” by expressing discomfort with household chores and claim that they are not their responsibility or are only occasionally willingly doing reproductive labor.

### 3.6 Conclusion

In this chapter, I have examined the ways in which urban middle-class Moroccan men “do” domesticity during marriage. In the early years of a marriage, urban middle-class men under 50 years old usually volunteer to do “easy” chores like the laundry while their wives usually do all of the other cooking and cleaning. During the middle of a marriage, usually after a couple has had one or multiple children, urban Moroccan middle-class younger (under 50 years old) men tend to take a more active role as fathers than their fathers did. Urban Moroccan middle-class younger men will also sometimes do some cooking, usually either quite simple meals or elaborate special meals that are more highly valued. After retirement, most urban middle-class Moroccan men with whom I spoke spent more time at home but did not necessarily do more cooking, cleaning, or

childcare because it clashes with their notions of appropriate gendered subjectivities. In the future, this may change as the younger urban middle-class generation ages. These are a few ways in which urban middle-class Moroccan men interact with the domestic sphere on a daily basis and throughout their life course. This change in gendered subjectivities is crucial because it means that urban middle-class Moroccan men are doing more reproductive labor than their father's generation, potentially providing some relief for urban middle-class Moroccan women, who are often unfairly burdened with the "second shift" (Hochschild 1989). By doing more reproductive labor than their father's generation, young urban middle-class Moroccans are mitigating tensions that arise regarding reproductive labor.

CHAPTER 4. MOROCCAN MIDDLE-CLASS ASPIRATIONS, CAPITAL, ANXIETIES,  
AND CREDIT

4.1 Introduction

In the stylish 7ème art café in downtown Rabat, I interviewed Malika about her experiences of work, reproductive labor, and gender roles. I had a latte and Malika had fresh-squeezed orange juice in the relatively hot, late June weather. I first met Malika as one of the Islamic Studies public high school teachers facilitating an English-language learning program for high school students for which I volunteered, about a year before our interview. Having known each other for a year facilitated an open and in-depth interview. In this part of the interview, we were discussing the high cost of living and Moroccan women entering the paid workforce.

*Malika: Women are forced to work now due to the high living costs. I make good money and I spend it every month on the house's credit and the kids' schools. It's hard for a man to do this alone and I don't think he can afford it...*

*Ruth: Does the man asks the woman to work or is it her choice?*

*Malika: Men always look for a working woman to marry, they don't marry women who are not working. I was an exception because I was studying, but my husband knew from the beginning that I was going to work...*

*Ruth: Most of Moroccan men want to marry working women?*

*Malika: Yes, because life is expensive and the income is way less than the expenses so it's hard for the man to take all of the responsibility of the expenses- that's why he is forced to let his wife work.*

*Ruth: Because expenses are high.*

*Malika: Yes, and the income isn't enough even though they work together they can't cover the essential expenses, and that's not even including things like travel.*

*Ruth: It's hard.*

*Malika: Yes, it's hard. Either they work together or they give up something like sending the kids to private schools instead of public schools.*

I chose this excerpt because it is largely indicative of what most participants said and felt: that the cost of living in Morocco, and in Rabat-Salé specifically, has increased significantly during their lifetimes while wages have remained relatively stable. In order to make up for this discrepancy while still providing a good quality of life for their family, many couples both enter the paid workforce. Male and female labor force participation in Morocco has declined from 2011 to 2019, down by 5% for men and 4% for women (World Bank 2019). However, the number of employed women in urban areas increased by 32% from 2001 to 2018 (Lopez-Acevedo et al. 2021).

The process of women entering the workforce is often difficult, both for women finding employment but also for households to adjust (Murray 2015; Blumen 2002; Slaughter 2015). In the past scholars hypothesized that economic necessity is largely the most significant factor driving women into the paid workforce (Cerrutti 2000:889; Chant 1996; Geldstein 1994:55; Gonzalez de la Rocha 1988, 2000; Moser 1989, 1997; Nash 1995:155), but now a more nuanced understanding has emerged, showing that women are influenced by kin relations, economic necessity, religion, cultural and expert discourses, and other influences (Murray 2015; Slaughter 2015; Blumen 2002). Sometimes the

decision to work can only be made with spousal approval (Townsend et al 1999:38), which may only be granted with the assurance that childcare and domestic labor will continue to be performed as before (Bee & Vogel 1997:93). In the above excerpt, Malika switches from emphasizing Moroccan men choosing a wife who is or will be participating in the paid workforce to him “being forced to let his wife work” due to economic necessity. When considering marriage, most participants knew whether or not a potential spouse participated in the paid workforce and did not ask him or her to change their employment status. However, Nadia (29 years old) was told by her husband that she would not be able to participate in the paid workforce if she married him and she decided to choose marriage instead of employment.

The chapter examines whether there is more gender equity in relationships when both husband and wife participate in the paid labor force full time. Moroccan urban middle-class marriage is increasingly marked by shared financial responsibility, as Malika noted, in addition to other characteristics that will be discussed in Chapter 5. This change in the composition of middle-class subjectivities in turn influences the economic market for education, consumption, and health in Morocco. These middle-class subjectivities are embedded in marriage and family practices. This chapter explores the lived experiences of this socioeconomic transition. Specifically, the chapter examines Moroccan middle-class subjectivities and their influence on Moroccan economic markets, as well as affective anxieties associated with middle-class subjectivities.

The first section of this chapter examines the meanings associated with urban Moroccan middle-class subjectivities, their aspirations, the movement of different types of capital (Bourdieu 1984), and their effect on the local market economy. The second

section examines who gets to be a part of the middle-classes, anxieties, and the ways that Moroccans maintain membership in the middle-classes, specifically by taking (or not taking) out bank loans. Instead of only focusing on globalization's effect on household consumption patterns as much literature does (Jaffrelot & Veer 2008; Mcewan et al 2015; O'Dougherty 2002; Aaftaab 2013; Donner 2008), this chapter builds on Freeman (2000) to examine how local phenomena influence local market economies. It is important to study middle-class identities, aspirations, subjectivities, and anxieties in order to more fully understand the classed dimensions of reproductive labor in the urban Moroccan context.

#### 4.2 Anthropology of the Global Middle Classes

The body of anthropological scholarship investigating middle-class identities has increased recently, in large part due to the unique economic and political moment that includes escalating economic uncertainty and change, neoliberal restructuring, and extensive global media that promote middle class aspirations (Heiman, Leichty, & Freeman 2012). Class is not a "model" or an organizing "structure," but rather a lived experience- a "social process [that continues] over time" (Thompson 1978:147).

Although middle classes were fashioned during capitalism's formation, this research avoids imposing a teleological pattern of history of class spreading from early modern Europe out by "modernizing" societies (Heiman, Leichty, & Freeman 2012). Rather, I argue that classes form only in relation to other classes and due to the widespread process of capitalist economic logics covering the globe (Heiman, Leichty, & Freeman 2012:13). While much research on middle classes worldwide focuses solely on consumption (Donner 2008; Jaffrelot & Veer 2008; Mcewan et al. 2015; O'Dougherty 2002; Aaftaab

2013), my research places the household at the epicenter of class processes, showing how change originates from everyday household practices.

The everyday lives of middle-class families received little attention in anthropology historically (Donner 2008) and much of the existing research only explores changes in family composition in the Global North, largely ignoring the rest of the world (O'Dougherty 2002). The research that does exist exploring middle classes in the Global South mostly focuses on growing middle classes in China and India, shrinking middle classes in Latin America, and fragile Western European and US middle classes (Aaftaab 2013; Davis 2004; Fernandes 2006; Goldstein 2012; Shakow 2014). Research in China, Hungary, and Egypt demonstrates how members of the aspiring middle classes long for middle-class spaces, lifestyles, and modes of consumption with critical local differences due to differing colonial histories and political-economic transformations (Heiman, Leichty, & Freeman 2012; Peterson 2011). Most research on middle-classes throughout the world, but particularly in China, India and South Korea, finds that middle-class families tend to move from larger multi-generational families, marrying young and having multiple children, to an increasingly nuclear family, marrying at an older age and having fewer children (Chao 2013; Donner 2008; Kim 1992). However, existing research does not adequately explore the dialectical relationship between middle-class subjectivities and the market economy.

The concept “middle class” is ill-defined because it has been expressed in so many different ways and can be made up of so many diverse types of people (O'Dougherty 2002; Jaffrelot & Veer 2008). For this reason, some researchers use “middle classes” to denote said pluralism. However, others argue that changing



consumption patterns are bringing the middle classes back together as a homogenous group with similar consumption patterns (Jaffrelot & Veer 2008; Sheth 2009), often labeled as the “new middle class” (Sheth 2009; Fernandes 2006; Shakow 2014). While Marx only considered how people produce physical things, he left out an analysis of immaterial and affective labor (Hardt and Negri 2000, 2004; Hochschild 1983; Lazzarato 1996; Mills 1951). While the middle-classes used to be defined by not handling physical objects, people across socioeconomic classes do not produce physical things (Heiman, Freeman & Liechty 2012). Additionally, the working classes are increasingly becoming the caring class (Schweid 2021). In late capitalism, the service economy actually represents a significant portion of the world’s working classes.

Globalization also affects the world’s middle-classes and what it means to be part of middle classes is co-constituted by what it means to be a modern global citizen (Peterson 2011). The existing research often examines the influence of globalization and economic reform on household consumption patterns (Donner 2008; Jaffrelot & Veer 2008; Mcewan et al 2015; O’Dougherty 2002; Aaftaab 2013). For example, Peterson (2011) uses Eriksen’s (1996:245) term “multiple traditions” to describe elite middle-class youth living in Cairo as cosmopolitans who consume global products while simultaneously managing “multiple traditions” within their local spheres. It is also important to point out that the process of globalization is neither new nor only from Western or outside forces spreading across an “untouched” pristine culture. Newcomb (2017) illustrates these points by pointing out power relations that have continued from premodern, colonial nationalist, and neoliberal structures. Rather than portraying globalization as inevitable and wholly determining, I build on Crawford (2008) and

Newcomb (2017), showing globalization as something that people react to with multiple purposes and also bend, mold, and shape to suit their own interests.

Due to the considerable diversity of individuals within any one Moroccan “middle class,” I conceptualize middle-class Moroccans as part of diverse “middle classes.” Rather than defining the Moroccan middle classes based solely on their consumption patterns (Jaffrelot & Veer 2008; Sheth 2009), I assess class subjectivities through participants’ education, economic resources, consumption, and job placement, in conjunction with self-identification (Cohen 2000; Goldstein 2012; Armbrust 2003; Davis 2004; de Koning 2009; Dickey 2000). Heiman, Leichty, and Freeman (2012) argue that the material, affective, and symbolic dimensions of middle-classness are dialectically intertwined in the formation of class subjectivities and interactions. For this reason, this chapter examines not only material class processes but combines Marxist, materially-focused analyses with Bourdieu-inspired analyses of symbolic status and habitus to explore the material, affective and symbolic dimensions of class that make and re-make middle-class subjectivities. I explore the affective dimensions of class by examining urban Moroccan middle-class aspirations and anxieties associated with their social class subjectivity and maintenance. I also examine the symbolic dimensions of middle-class identities, which include upholding a middle-class reputation. Because middle classness can only be formed in relation to other classes (Heiman, Leichty, & Freeman 2012), I also analyze Moroccan urban middle-classness in relation to those classes above and below the middle classes.

### 4.3 Middle Class Aspirations

Definitions of Moroccan middle-classes are contested and variable (Boufous & Khariss 2015; Cohen 2000). Heiman, Leichty, and Freeman (2012) argue that often political states want to deny that different classes, and therefore class struggles, exist, by painting their entire country as “middle class.” Post-socialist states like Hungary (Febervary 2012) and China (Zhang 2012) attempt to classify all or the majority of their citizens as “middle-class” in order to dispel tensions between capitalist and working classes (Heiman, Leichty, and Freeman 2012). It appears that the Moroccan government is doing something similar by claiming in official statistics that 58.7% of the population is “middle class” (Haut-Commissariat au Plan et la Banque Mondiale 2017). By claiming that the majority of the population is middle class and that everyone else could become middle class, the Moroccan government may be seeking to quell criticism of Moroccan elites<sup>18</sup> who largely control the Moroccan government and economy (Hammoudi 1997). The Moroccan government defines the middle class as anyone within 75% to 275% of the median quality of life (Haut-Commissariat au Plan et la Banque Mondiale 2017). In 2007, Morocco’s central statistics agency, the Haut-Commissariat au Plan (HCP), defined low, intermediate, and high middle classes as households earning an income between 2,800 dh to 6,763 dh (about \$280 to \$676) monthly, representing 53% of the Moroccan population (Haut-Commissariat au Plan et la Banque Mondiale 2017). Seven years later in 2014, the percentage of the middle class increased to 58.7% of the population, of which 62.9% were in urban areas, according to the Moroccan government and World

---

<sup>18</sup> Such as the boycott of Sidi Ali, Afrika and Danon products in 2018 due to the high price of everyday items and perceived unfair profit of the Moroccan (and foreign) elite off the backs of working-class and middle-class Moroccans.

Bank (Haut-Commissariat au Plan et la Banque Mondiale 2017). However, Moroccan economist Youssef Saadani argues that the Moroccan government is falsely inflating the Moroccan middle classes numbers (Loudni 2014). In his opinion, a Moroccan middle-class income would vary from at least 10,000 dh/month<sup>19</sup> up to 40,000 dh per household (about \$1,000 to \$4,000), which would include only about 10% of the Moroccan population (Loudni 2014). The cost of living also varies considerably from rural to urban spaces, so this might account for the lower “middle-class” income according to the HCP. The urban population accounted for 62.45% of the total population in 2018 (Haut-Commissariat au Plan 2019a). Although the Moroccan middle classes have grown over the last 30 years, my research demonstrates that middle-class households in Rabat are financially stressed by the rising cost of living and stagnant incomes.

Although the Moroccan middle classes officially increased from 53% of the population to 58.7% between 2007 to 2014 (Haut-Commissariat au Plan et la Banque Mondiale 2017), significant economic constraints pressure the middle classes. The cost of living in urban Morocco has increased significantly since 2010 (Haut-Commissariat Au Plan 2019b), while salaries have remained relatively stable. Almost all of my participants said that their salary was enough to cover basic living costs, but many also stressed that life today in Morocco, especially compared to 20 years ago when they were growing up, is expensive, particularly in a city like Rabat. Moroccan families must pay for housing, electricity, water, internet, phone bills, healthcare, food, transportation, as well as costs associated with child raising like private schooling, clothes, toys, and books (in addition

---

<sup>19</sup> Saadani based the minimum 10,000 dh/month on the following budget: housing (3,000 dh), car (2,000 dh), school fees (2,000 dh) and other charges (3,000 dh).

to extras such as savings, ‘luxury’ consumer goods, and travel). Because the Moroccan state does not provide adequate public education that would prepare students for the workforce (Boutieri 2016), most parents with whom I spoke decided to pay for private schooling for their children, if they could afford it. Additionally, a failing public health system encourages most who can afford it to turn to private clinics for any health care needs, an additional cost. Many of the research participants with whom I spoke are stressed to make ends meet.

Simultaneously, less stable employment is available. Stable employment with retirement and health insurance, in the global neoliberal economy, is becoming harder and harder to find throughout the world and in Morocco (Cohen 2000). Despite government jobs being the epitome of stable employment in most Moroccan minds, even the government now employs certain teachers by contract without benefits in addition to privatizing a number of previously “public” services, often due to World Bank and IMF stipulations (Newcomb 2017). As a result, the Moroccan government is shrinking its large French-inspired bureaucracy and providing poorer-quality public services like education and health care. If a Moroccan woman is a stable government worker, there is more pressure to keep her job, despite having kids, in order to qualify for a substantial government retirement pension. Like the Indian government creating “consumer citizens” (Srivastava 2012), the Moroccan government promotes an entrepreneurial “self-made” middle class through programs like L’Agence Nationale de Promotion de L’Emploi et des Compétences (ANAPEC). ANAPEC connects employees and job seekers but also trains citizens to open their own businesses. However, I heard no mention of ANAPEC helping someone create or find a job that would adequately cover all living expenses.

Simultaneously, women of a lower socioeconomic status have also worked outside the home due to economic necessity, often in lower-paid, informal temporary work like being a housekeeper, wedding attendant, or childcare provider. The high cost of living and lack of formal jobs creates a situation where urban middle-class Moroccans with whom I spoke feel that they are doing better today than when they were growing up, but simultaneously know that there is not enough money to attain all appropriate markers of middle-class identity. Aspiring to live a better life by attaining more and better markers of middle-class identity might be a characteristic of middle-class subjectivities across time and space.

The rise of two-income, middle-class families and interrelated changes in the middle-class marital relations have also had a significant impact on the urban Moroccan market economy. Building on Freeman (2000), this section demonstrates how globalization does not only change local realities but also how local phenomena influence the global market economy. In the following examples, the changes to Moroccan urban middle-class marital relations, the growth in the Moroccan middle-class, and state policies have all had a significant impact on Moroccan markets for education, food, and healthcare. Although proponents of neoliberal market ideology often pretend that the market does not need the state, in reality, state actions enable private projects to happen through tax benefits for foreign investors, deregulation, and banking reform (Heiman, Leichty, & Freeman 2012). Specifically, the growing but squeezed middle-classes have affected the Moroccan market economy in terms of education, foodways, and health care.

#### 4.3.1 “I don’t want to deprive my kids”

Many participants grew up in the countryside and/or with a lower standard of living than they currently enjoy. Their parents could not afford to buy a car or send them to private schools. So, they feel added pressure to provide everything to their own children that their parents could not provide them. This is an important aspect of newer members of the middle classes in Morocco who want to provide an adequate middle-class lifestyle for their children while they are growing up and a foundation for their children’s future. In an informal interview with my 42-year-old year Moroccan Arabic (*dārija*) tutor, Fatima, she said:

*Moroccans have a very strong sense of wanting to provide for their kids and the next generation. Moroccans don’t want to deprive their kids. So, if the parents didn’t get everything they wanted when they were young, now they’re determined to give everything their kids want now, when their kids are growing up. They think of money as their responsibility to the kids and don’t really think of the future (saving for the future/etc.) and they want to live well now, not 20 years from now.*

In this example, Fatima explains how Moroccan parents feel intense pressure to provide for their children and value living well in the present, rather than saving to live well in the distant future. In other conversations, parents expressed the need to provide well for their children, especially through private schooling, but I did not discuss future financial planning with participants. Although Fatima does not expressly mention middle-class Moroccans because all Moroccans feel immense pressure to provide for their children, I argue that middle-class urban Moroccans might feel added pressure to maintain their current standard of living for their children because they grew up without that standard of

living. Additionally, because a number of urban middle-class participants were a part of the “generation in waiting” (Dhillon & Youssef 2009) or had friends who were, they place extra value on having a job and being able to attain markers of a middle-class lifestyle.

#### 4.3.2 Relative Definitions: “Having the Necessities”

Economic capital is one of the most important types of capital. Participants often listed what someone in the middle classes should be buying with their economic capital when I asked, “What is the meaning of the middle class?” and “What are the things someone must do to be in the middle class?” Participants had a wide variety of opinions about exactly who constitutes the Moroccan middle classes and what qualifies them for access to it. This is likely because an idea of the “middle class” cannot exist without also an idea about what constitutes upper and lower classes (Heiman, Leichty, & Freeman 2012).

Additionally, participants tended to define characteristics of “middle classness” in relation to their own background, experiences, and lives. For example, while 43-year-old Yousra, who identified herself as somewhere between middle class and rich, said that *“middle class can at least have a small apartment, the man and the wife have one car for each.”* By “have a small apartment” Yousra meant that the family would own an apartment, within a larger building. In contrast, Mohammad and Sanaa (both 50-years-old), who identified as members of the lowest social class, said the meaning of middle class is defined by need:



*Mohammad: It's the class that has everything limited: they can't dress the way they want or go to a cafe, or pay for the gym. That's the life of a middle-class person. Of course, it depends on each person and their choices, but we want a car, a house, nice furniture, and a good life! That's all, we don't ask for more. This is the middle class.*

*Sanaa: Most middle-class people don't own a house.*

Yousra, Mohammad, and Sanaa's answers demonstrate that participants' definitions of middle-classness varied considerably and were also often based on their own background and how they felt that they fit into Moroccan social classes. Although Yousra defined herself as between middle-class and rich, I defined Yousra as upper-class. Her own experiences influence her perceptions of the Moroccan middle-classes. She speculated that in the middle-class, both the husband and wife would have one car each, because that aligned more with her own current situation. Mohammad and Sanaa identified as working class and speculated that middle-class Moroccans want a car, house, nice furniture, and "a good life" but that it is not always possible and that most middle-class people do not own their own home.

Several participants explained how being middle-class is defined by "having necessities" (*nhum darouriat*) but that "extras" were often out of reach. Forty-three-year-old public schoolteacher Malika explains the meaning of middle class: "*Middle class have only the necessities: they work to provide that. They can't travel a lot, even inside of the country. We have what we need but we don't have more to provide a nicer life.*" In Moroccan society, it is important to show that you are grateful for what you have and to make sure that you do not seem ungrateful for what you have. Most Moroccans with

whom I spoke would say “Thanks be to God”<sup>20</sup> for what they have but often simultaneously point out what they do not have i.e., “*we don’t have more to provide a nicer life.*” Participants define middle-class necessities in varying ways but usually included having a place to live, having food to eat, having their children go to school (often private school), and being able to afford healthcare and transportation.

The next sections explore the nuanced aspects of these “necessities” using an analysis of Bourdieu’s cycle of different forms of capital: economic, cultural, social, and symbolic (Bourdieu 1984). Economic, social, cultural, and symbolic capital intersect to shape Moroccan middle classes. Economic capital includes cash economic assets and can be immediately and directly converted into money (Bourdieu 1986). Cultural capital is defined as what you know, tastes, cultural dispositions, and is divided into three different types: embodied, objectified, and institutionalized cultural capital (Bourdieu 1986). Embodied cultural capital is imprinted on the mind and body, like an accent or a way of walking. Objectified cultural capital is in the form of cultural goods or physical objects that are meaningful, like a luxury car (Bourdieu 1986). Institutionalized cultural capital is degree or title that symbolizes cultural competence and authority, often an educational qualification. Social capital is made up of social obligations or connections which can sometimes be converted into economic capital and may be institutionalized (Bourdieu 1986). Having symbolic capital means that someone is recognized for their legitimate competence, authority, prestige, and reputation (Bourdieu 1986). Instead of organizing

---

<sup>20</sup> It is quite common in Moroccan culture to say Al-Humdullah/Al-Humdulilah (Thanks be to God) when someone asks “how is your day?.” Additionally, when anything good happens, people often say “Thanks be to God,” almost as a way to ward off the Evil Eye/jealously of others. Participants both ascribed their social standing and the good things that they had to their hard work, while also thanking God for what they had.

the data by forms of capital, I analyze the ways that different goods and services transform into different forms of capital, sometimes multiple times.

#### 4.3.3 Education and Capital

One important way that middle-class families use economic capital is to send their children to private schools. Why is it necessary to pay for private schools? Parents believe the job market is becoming more competitive and simultaneously that the Moroccan public education system is not preparing students adequately for the current global job market (Boutieri 2016). Due to colonial history and ongoing neocolonial economic and political structures which often favor French over Modern Standard and Moroccan Arabic, having knowledge of the French language, customs, and culture is associated with middle and upper-class subjectivities in Morocco. Even when speaking Moroccan Arabic, the number of French phrases added often denotes class: the more French incorporated into Moroccan Arabic, often the higher the socioeconomic class. Ironically, Moroccan public schools fail to adequately teach French and English well, but simultaneously blame students for not knowing French classics (Boutieri 2016). In addition to French, English language skills are extremely valuable on the job market, but Moroccan public schools only begin to teach English in high school, and in a largely superficial way that focuses solely on grammar and does not promote fluency (Boutieri 2016). In contrast, Moroccan private schools often begin teaching English to students in primary school. In short, knowing how to speak certain languages (like French and English) is a form of embodied cultural capital. For these reasons, private schools are generally seen to be superior to public schools today in Morocco, but usually only middle and upper-class Moroccans can afford the extra cost of private schooling. In a similar

way that going to university, and often going into debt to do so, is a defining characteristic of the American middle classes (Zaloom 2019), paying for private schools (although usually not going into debt to do so) is a defining characteristic of Moroccan middle classes.

In addition, private schools are often more convenient for Moroccan middle-class (working) parents, compared to public schools. Most Moroccans who work outside the home now work from around 8 am to 5 pm without a 2-hour break from 12-2 pm for lunch. Historically, during the 12-2 pm lunch hour children and adult family members were often able to go back home and eat lunch with their family. Although few workers today have a 2-hour lunch break, public schools still maintain a 2-hour lunch break in the middle of the day from 12 to 2 pm when the students are expected to go home and have a family member feed them. Because they are less likely to have a long break in the middle of their workday and because both parents are typically working outside the home and, as nuclear families, cannot rely on extended family members, middle class households feel more pressure to pay for private schooling. Private schools usually care for children from 8:30 am to 4 pm, which generally fits the working parents' schedules better.

Middle-class Moroccans often use their economic capital to pay for private schooling for their children to ensure that their children also gain sufficient and appropriate forms of capital to become middle-class. The economic capital investment in private schooling produces different forms of embodied cultural capital. These include the skills acquired in school, appropriate ways of speaking and being in the world, acceptable accents, and second language acquisition, among others. In addition to this embodied cultural capital, private schooling also provides institutional cultural capital in

the form of a degree and should result in an acceptable score on the end-of-high school test the Baccalaureate exam. The economic capital invested by parents into private schooling also leads to expanded social capital for their children who graduate with stronger and more extensive social networks. Simply attending certain private schools can lead to an increase in symbolic capital or prestige in society. Moroccan parents invest their economic capital in private schooling so that eventually their child can secure the type of job necessary to sustain their middle-class identity. This same job will eventually lead to the accumulation of economic capital which the middle-class children can use to send their own children to private schools, perpetuating the cyclical relationship of capital and class subjectivities.

Knowledge of French and English is not only important to demonstrate social class but can also signal to government actors whose lives matter and whose do not. The following example demonstrates how Moroccan police perceive Moroccan lives in relation to language. I volunteered with an English-language program for Moroccan high-school students called “Companionship through Language and Language through Companionship” (CLLC). The program builds students’ confidence in speaking English by providing opportunities to speak with native speakers, discussing various topics in English and Arabic. I led five different English-language sections on different topics with another American Fulbright volunteer. Ideally, we were supposed to have a Moroccan English-language teacher in the classroom as well but there were not enough Moroccan teachers for all groups. We taught the highest English language level, so students were eloquent and comfortable speaking about abstract concepts. In late April 2019, we were discussing stereotypes, globalization, and power in the English language session. I and

my co-teacher were making the point that different languages and cultures are valued differently due to globalization (i.e. Moroccans watch American movies but Americans do not watch Moroccan movies). One public high school student, Loubaba, shared her story about the English language and power:

*You all know about the many protests happening about school teachers' contracts. Well, near a protest, me and my friend got kind of pushed into the crowd with the teachers protesting. We did not have signs and were not wearing their uniforms and the police were nearby. I told the police that we were not part of their group in dārija (Moroccan Arabic) and they didn't listen to me. Then I started speaking in perfect English and they listened to me. They moved me and my friend away from the teacher protesters.*

Loubaba's story illustrates the value of knowing English in Morocco. When Loubaba spoke in Moroccan Arabic the policemen did not listen to her and did not acknowledge her words: they did not matter, she did not matter. However, when she demonstrated her embodied cultural capital by speaking perfect English, her words (and body) mattered in the eyes of the state. The contract teachers protested the terms of their contract, namely not providing job security or retirement, in the streets during March and April 2019. The teachers' protests also demonstrate a larger trend of the Moroccan government employing fewer people, and often in more unstable positions (like contract work) without benefits. The teachers' protest was a particularly volatile situation for Loubaba and her friend because the Moroccan police do sometimes use force against protesters. Loubaba's parents did not have enough economic capital to be able to send her to private schools but Loubaba herself invested a significant amount of labor and time to learn English by

watching American movies online. In this way, Loubaba's embodied cultural capital and symbolic capital signified a higher socioeconomic class than her parents' economic capital. This example shows that although economic capital is often extremely important in relation to class, one must also examine cultural, social, and symbolic forms of capital that may or may not have been acquired through economic capital. In other words, middle class processes are not solely economic, but also affective and symbolic.

The growing middle-classes coupled with state education policies (Boutieri 2016) have created a significant demand for private education and increased the number of private primary, middle, and secondary private schools in urban Moroccan centers. Most participants stated that middle-class Moroccans should send their children to private, rather than public schools. In addition to a concern about the quality of education, some participants mentioned that public schools might have a "bad influence" on their children. Thirty-six-year-old Youssef, who works as a History and Geography teacher at a public high school explained:

*I want my kids to go to private schools at the beginning of their schooling because I don't want them to mix with kids who can influence them in a bad way. Then, when they turn 12, I want them to be able to understand what's good and what's bad and avoid the bad and learn what is good.*

Based on Youssef's reasoning, public and private schooling is classed in a certain way and also moralized with the implication that good, middle-class children go to private schools and bad, unruly working-class children go to public schools. Most participants did not say that public schools could influence children in a negative way outright, but many argued that the quality of education in private schools is far superior to Moroccan

public schools and would give children a better chance at a better paying job in the future (Boutieri 2016). This discourse reinforces the need for parents to scrape and save to afford to send their children to private schools for their future education and work prospects, but also for their morality. This intense pressure to send children to private schools increases the demand for private schools and because of this, the number of private schools has increased significantly in the past 30 years (Boutieri 2016).

In addition to private schools, middle-class parents will also spend money to send their children to private language centers, if they can afford it. Morocco has always been a country of impressive language skills but the number of private language centers, especially in urban cities, has increased significantly in the past 30 years as the more affluent middle-class has grown. However, only two participants mentioned regularly sending their teenage son to an American English language center, probably due to the associated costs. Besides language centers, extracurricular activities outside of school can be important. Forty-four-year-old private school teacher Hanane explains about the middle class:

*They must have a car, a house, send their kids to nice schools and clubs like swimming club or soccer club and have them learn languages. All of these things are important in [the] middle-class, while people who are in a lower class, their kids go to public schools, they can't travel or buy a car or eat outside.*

Hanane argues that middle-class Moroccans send their kids to swimming club, soccer club and language center. As an important reminder of the heterogeneity and subjective nature of the middle-classes, Hanane described herself as being solidly middle-class but during the interview, my friend Amal, who had organized the interview, stated that



Hanane is probably lower-upper class rather than middle class. Based on Amal's assessment and the interview, I would argue Hanane is upper-middle class and because of this may have an elevated opinion about what defines "middle-class" identities. Most participants preferred to categorize themselves as middle-class, either as a status they aspired to or as a more down-to-earth and humble subjectivity than "upper class." It was extremely difficult to categorize some households as middle-class or upper-middle class because of the latter trend. However, only solidly middle-upper class Moroccans can regularly afford to send their children to private language centers and extracurricular activities in addition to private schooling. With that caveat, I argue that the growing urban Moroccan middle-classes have significantly increased the demand for and supply of private education, in addition to the proliferation of private language centers and other extracurricular activities.

#### 4.3.4 Housing, Food, and Capital

Another symbolic form of capital that many participants mentioned as important for middle-class Moroccans is living in a separate apartment, either in the same building or in a separate building, street, neighborhood, and/or city from their parents. Whereas 30 years ago, an ideal upper-middle class urban Moroccan family might all live in one large communal *riyād*, this is much less common today in urban spaces. A *riyād* is a large house with a (sometimes open-air) courtyard in the middle with rooms and hallways surrounding the courtyard. New wives were usually expected to move into their husbands' families' home: a patrilocal residence pattern. Instead of a living with aunts, uncles, parents, and grandparents, most married middle-class Moroccans with whom I spoke in 2018 and 2019 expressed a desire to live away from their parents, either in a

separate apartment but in the same building or more often in a completely separate building and/or neighborhood. As discussed in Chapter 2, many couples today feel that living with their parents or in-laws can cause unnecessary problems and drama. Additionally, participants said that having one's own home (either renting or buying) is an important indicator of middle-class status. Some participants also have parents who still live in the countryside or in a different city, but the participants moved to Rabat and stayed there, usually for a job.<sup>21</sup>

Living with the husband's family in the beginning of marriage is less common today, but this depends on the socioeconomic capabilities of each newlywed couple. A significant portion (about 44%) of the households with whom I spoke were married within seven years of the initial interview (Ranade 2011; Holmberg et al 2004; Chang & Chan 2007) and are classified as newlywed. Most newlywed couples with whom I spoke (67%) rent apartments separate from either parents' home and live alone in them and I have categorized most of them as middle-class. These newlyweds felt that it was important to live in their own space and renting or buying their own apartment reinforced their middle-class subjectivity. Of those 15 newlywed couples, only five (33%) live with any extended family members in the same apartment or building. Two of those five households identify as lower class and cannot afford their own apartment. The two middle-class couples prefer to live in the same building as extended family or need to take care of their aging mother. The last household is upper-middle class with a husband who was in the US preparing a house for his new bride as she stayed with his family.

---

<sup>21</sup> The importance of independent living among the middle-classes will be discussed further in Chapter 5.

Most households (71%) live as a nuclear family with only husband, wife, and children. In using their economic capital to buy or rent an apartment away from their parents, participants are converting their economic capital into objectified cultural capital. While this increases cultural capital, moving away from parents could also simultaneously decrease social capital by weakening bonds with parents, extended family members, and neighbors. Some participants are nostalgic for a past when you knew all your neighbors and had stronger social bonds with them. Newcomb (2017) also discusses the breakdown of the neighborhood network and most of the Moroccans with whom I spoke suggested that they had stronger ties with neighbors when they were growing up compared to today.

In addition to housing, food is also an important way that middle-class Moroccans use their economic capital. Having meat with lunch is an important indicator of a middle-class lifestyle. Generally, going out to eat at least once a month is favorable, even if it is only for a coffee at a café. Middle-class participants spend their economic capital on foods that can become objectified cultural capital.

Besides an increase in the demand for private education, a change in urban middle-class subjectivities and marital relations has also significantly changed Moroccan foodways. Due to having relatively more economic capital paired with less time to prepare, process, and cook food, more urban middle-class Moroccan families buy ready-made food from outside their home today compared to 20 years ago. Because of this spike in demand, the market has created a seemingly endless supply of Western-style fast casual restaurants. These restaurants serve French-Moroccan-style “tacos,” rotisserie chicken, shawarma, burgers, or fries alongside Moroccan favorites like tajines and

couscous. When describing how couples have changed from his parents' generation to his own, Youssef mentioned "*Now couples can go out and eat outside, which didn't happen before.*" For Youssef and most participants, public consumption of food as a couple is an important hallmark of this new generation of urban middle-class couples. Public consumption of food provides an important way for married couples to strengthen their emotional bond, to save time by effectively outsourcing reproductive labor, and to assert their middle-class identity.<sup>22</sup>

#### 4.3.5 Healthcare and Capital

In addition to education, housing, and food, middle-class Moroccans also expressed that it is important to spend economic capital on health care. The rise of the urban Moroccan middle-class combined with state policies encouraged the increase in private health clinics in urban Morocco during the past 30 years. The Moroccan government does provide inexpensive public healthcare, but patients often must wait many months or sometimes years to receive surgery and/or treatment (Newcomb 2007). For this reason, many middle-class participants pay for private healthcare by going to private health clinics instead of government-run hospitals. In the below excerpt, 48-year-old Yahia, a private high school teacher, explains the importance of private healthcare for middle-class Moroccans.

*Yahia: Middle-class people try to have all of those things.*

*Ruth: Money for medical issues*

---

<sup>22</sup> I discuss changing Moroccan foodways in relation to convenience in Chapter 6.

*Yahia: Yes, they should always save for that.*

*Ruth: Do they go to private or public hospitals?*

*Yahia: It depends, sometimes it's necessary to go to a clinic but sometimes you can just go to a public one, but we usually go to a clinic.*

*Ruth: Even though it's expensive?*

*Yahia: Yes, but we have no choice. Especially when I had surgery, if I went to a public hospital, I would have waited for a year for my turn.*

In this example, Yahia connects saving for medical issues and going to the private clinic to middle-classness. For Yahia, it is necessary to go to the private clinic to not have to wait a year to have surgery. Private healthcare is a booming business in Morocco since during the past 30 years more middle-class Moroccans have had the economic capital to pay for private healthcare and the quality of public healthcare has decreased.

How does the Moroccan middle-classes demand for better healthcare affect the Moroccan market and economy? There has been a proliferation of private health clinics in most Moroccan cities. While I was in the car with my friend Halima, she mentioned that her younger brother Mehdi was born in 1988 in the first private clinic that opened in Kenitra, a small city about an hour away from Rabat. While Kenitra only had one small private clinic in 1988, now it has multiple private clinics. Going to private clinics is a way for middle-class Moroccans to ensure their own health in a timely manner and provides another way to separate themselves from regular, working-class Moroccans.

#### 4.3.6 Transportation, Mobility, and Capital

In addition to using economic capital for education, housing, food, and private healthcare, middle-class Moroccans will often buy a car for the family and travel domestically. Most participants said that it was uncommon to own a car 30 years ago but that it is becoming more common. This is in part because the availability of cars has increased while their prices have simultaneously decreased. Additionally, the public bus system is over-extended and often unreliable, particularly in larger cities like Rabat and Casablanca. The public buses were 4 dh (~\$0.40) per ride for a normal passenger but then increased to 5 dh (~\$0.50) after a new bus company took over in 2019. The Moroccan government built and opened two tramway systems in 2012: one for movement within downtown Rabat and another for movement within downtown Casablanca. Both tramway systems are popular but relatively expensive (7 dh or ~\$0.70 per ride) and somewhat limited geographically in scope across the cities. In addition to public buses or the tram, Moroccans can pay for a small taxi, but they are often prohibitively expensive (13 dh, ~\$1.30 for a 10-minute ride). Big taxis also take Moroccans on a set route from one neighborhood or city to another, but this cost can add up (5 dh or ~\$0.50 per ride to most neighborhoods) and availability is sometimes unreliable. Many upper-middle-class Moroccans turn to buying a car outright or on credit to transport themselves and their family for work and errands, sometimes from far-away suburbs to downtown. This quote, from the interview with 43-year-old public schoolteacher Malika is excerpted from the Necessities section:

*I'm thinking to buy a car now but I'll have to take that out of the budget, because the car is a necessity now. But thank God we're better than other people: we can do some things but we have to give up other things in return.*

For Malika, the car “is a necessity now” for her life. Although her husband has his own car, he uses it for his own work but not for the family as much. Malika also just got her driving license two years ago. As cities expand and the public transit systems do not expand enough to keep up with larger demand, having a car, especially to go from further-away suburbs to a job in another far-away neighborhood, becomes necessary.

Upper-middle-class Moroccans use economic capital to buy a car which turns economic capital into objectified cultural capital. Having this objectified cultural capital in the form of a car can also create and/or strengthen existing social capital by providing transportation to certain family members and friends. In some cases, having specific types of cars can also increase symbolic capital and prestige in certain social networks. However, not all Moroccans value expensive cars as a status symbol and might critique someone for spending so much money on a car.

Besides using their car to drive around the city, some middle-class Moroccans also use their cars to see family in other cities and for vacations around the country. Some within the Moroccan middle classes can afford to travel to other countries, but most middle-class Moroccans take short, domestic vacations. By creating tedious and expensive visa processes for certain individuals from certain countries, states coordinate the politics of class containment by only allowing certain upper-middle class individuals into their country (Sharma and Gupta 2006). Simultaneously, goods and economic capital are allowed to flow freely from country to country, but the movement of people is

regulated, contributing to a new specialization of class (Leichty 2012; Peebles 2011; Rouse 1995). Monroe (2011) in Beirut and Truitt (2008) in Vietnam both discuss the importance of mobility to middle-class identities. Mobility is also a trait of Moroccan middle-classness: in the sense of being able to physically move around a city, within a country, and to other countries but also in the ability to move easily between differing social circles, different languages, and different cultures.

The growth of the Moroccan middle-classes, government policies, and the change in Moroccan middle-class subjectivities, have encouraged the growth of the Moroccan private education, convenience foods, and private healthcare markets. Although the Moroccan middle-class is struggling to pay for private school, regular convenience foods, and private health care, the Moroccan government tends to rely on neoliberal rhetoric blaming the middle-class for not working hard enough to be able to pay for private goods and services, rather than providing better quality public services. While this section discusses the aspirations of the Moroccan middle classes and their effects on local markets, the next section analyzes middle class anxieties associated with middle-class “necessities.”

#### 4.4 Middle Class Anxieties

This section examines who belongs to the Moroccan middle classes and who has access to these different forms of economic, cultural, social and symbolic capital. Specifically, this section examines the affective dimensions of attempting to maintain middle-class status by sometimes accessing bank credit. As discussed above, middle-class Moroccans face an increasing cost of living, stagnant incomes, and a decline in the



number of formal (often government) jobs. In the face of pressures to buy a house, car, and pay for private schooling, the number of Moroccans seeking private loans has more than quintupled since 2001 (Bank Al-Maghrib 2019).<sup>23</sup> This section explains a very brief history of credit in Morocco, discusses how the current state of affairs came into existence, and why credit can be anxiety-inducing. In this section, I define credit as any small or large sum of money that is borrowed from an individual or organization and that is expected to be re-paid. I favor the term “credit” to “loan” because most participants use the French word “*crédit*” when discussing money borrowed, especially from a bank.

#### 4.4.1 Less Formal Forms of Credit

There is a long history of informal credit in Morocco. Small corner convenience stores (called a *hanoot*) will often extend credit to a loyal, trusted customer that the owner has known for many years. In this way the shopkeeper will keep track of all purchases for a month and present a bill, usually to the male head of household, at the end of the month. Repayment timelines and methods vary significantly. Some Moroccans will give the *hanoot* owner a blank check as proof of good faith that they will repay him. Pharmacies will also often accept credit but expect payment at the end of every Gregorian calendar year in December. Additionally, some Moroccans also participate in an exchange (*nooba 'a*), common in many parts of the world, where each member contributes a specific amount of money to a common pot over a specific amount of time. For example, each person in a 10-person group exchange may contribute 100 dh (\$10) each week to the exchange for 10 weeks. One person each week gets 1000 dh (\$100),

---

<sup>23</sup> Unfortunately, I did not ask participants their specific salaries or prices that they pay for rent, cars, or private schooling.

often depending on when they may need it the most. In this informal exchange, friends can exert social pressure to encourage one another to save money for an important upcoming expense.

In addition to credit from the convenience store and exchanges with friends, Moroccans will also sometimes simply borrow money from friends and family members to pay for a large expense, like buying a house. While working-class participants older than 60 years old mentioned that they gathered money from friends and paid them back informally to be able to pay for their house, working- and middle-class participants under 60 years old mostly either rent their homes or buy their homes with credit from a formal, non-Islamic bank. It is important to acknowledge the long history of informal forms of credit that Moroccans often have access to in order to disprove the idea that credit and banks only came to Morocco recently and changed everything. Older, more informal and newer, more formal forms of credit co-exist in Morocco today.

#### 4.4.2 Bank Credit

With open markets, a larger middle-class population, and significantly more private banks today in Morocco than 20 years ago, the availability of and access to bank credit has increased (Bank Al-Maghrib 2019). The overall number of bank credits per month in Morocco increased from around 200,000 in 2002 to 870,000 in 2019, including personal, real-estate, consumer, and equipment loans (Bank Al-Maghrib 2019). Most participants with whom I spoke indicated that bank credit is sometimes needed to buy a house or a car or maybe to pay for a large vacation. Participants bemoaned the pervasiveness of credit being used for things like paying for a vacation in Morocco. However, personal credit cards to pay for food or shopping, that are common in the US,

are virtually unheard of in the Moroccan context due to stricter government regulations on the banking industry. Bank credit is also relatively highly regulated in that only Moroccans with stable employment and a certain income, or access to a family member or friend with a certain income who would co-sign for a loan, are able to qualify for credit. While bank credit is based on the economic capital of the person or people applying for a loan, informal credit is more often based on a combination the social, symbolic, and economic capital of an individual and/or family.

Many Islamic scholars strictly forbid Muslims from either administering or taking out loans with interest because *rība* or usury is condemned in several verses in the Qur'an (Ayub 2007). *Rība* can be roughly translated to usury or unjust, exploitative gains in business and trade made at the expense of another person. Because less formal forms of credit with convenience stores, pharmacies, and exchanges with friends do not charge interest, most Islamic scholars find them to be *halal* or permissible. In the following example, 43-year-old public-school teacher Malika explains when she and her husband decided to get bank credit for a house they bought and the dynamic nature of what it means to be a "good Muslim."

*Ruth: Did you take a bank credit for the house?*

*Malika: Yes.*

*Ruth: Some people say it's forbidden [haram] in Islam to use a bank credit.*

*Malika: Yes, that's a big problem, I pay it now, my husband used to have a small apartment, less than 51 meters [549 sq. ft].*

*Ruth: Where?*

*Malika: In Sale Al-Jadida, that's where we first lived and then he sold it and we bought this apartment that is 116 meters [1249 sq. ft], after a Fatwa of Imam Al-Qaradawi who said that everyone who lives in a country where there are no Islamic banks can buy a house through a regular bank. So, we did that, but it was wrong, even Islamic banks have interests. For instance, if you buy a house for 200 000 dhs (\$20,000) you pay it for 600 000 dhs (\$60,000) so you pay three times the original price [with Islamic banks], while regular banks interests are cheaper.*

*Ruth: So...is it forbidden [haram] or not?*

*Malika: Honestly, it's forbidden. I'm not comfortable because of the bank's interests. Some imams say that a person should rent and save money to buy a house in cash, but it's hard to rent and save at the same time. I'll get some money soon and pay for the house.*

In this excerpt, Malika explains the complicated nature of deciding whether to use bank credit as a Muslim. Islamic banks were first created in the 1950s and 1960s as small experimental local banks based on Islamic principles and Shari'a, or Islamic law. However, Islamic banks only became common in Morocco during the last 10 years. Aaminou and Aboulaich (2017) discuss why Moroccans choose specific financial institutions, but less research exists on the gendered and generational aspects of financialization in the Maghrib region (Deeb & Winegar 2012). Because there were no Islamic banks in Morocco when Malika married her husband in 2004, they decided to get credit with a conventional bank, as was considered permissible by the Fatwa (formal religious ruling) of Iman Al-Qaradawi. Even though Morocco now has Islamic banks, Islamic scholars disagree on whether Islamic banks administering loans today is

considered permissible, or *halal*, for Muslims. Specifically, Islamic banks are for-profit finance companies that adhere to Islamic law or Sharia, which prohibits Muslims from administering or using *rība* (Aaminou & Aboulaich 2017). As Malika states, with Islamic banks, the buyer still pays significantly more than the original price of the house, often paying more for credit with an Islamic bank than with regular or conventional banks. Malika's experiences demonstrate the complex thought process many people engage in when deciding whether or not to take out bank credit and the dynamic nature of what is permissible (*halal*) or forbidden (*haram*).

Most participants agree that taking out bank credit with a conventional bank is *haram* or forbidden, so why do many participants use bank credit? Many participants feel that bank credit is necessary for their lives: to buy a house and pay for a car when they do not have the economic capital to pay for these expenses in cash. For most participants, these middle-class markers of identity are more important, in this instance, than the religious rulings saying that bank credit is forbidden for Muslims. Although bank credit is often an important aspect of urban Moroccan middle-class life, being indebted does not define middle-classness in Morocco like it does in the US (Zaloom 2019) and not all middle-class Moroccans use bank credit. Although living in a single-family home and having your own car is associated with modernity, no participants with whom I spoke explicitly connected the use of bank credit to modernity and bank credit is more closely characterized as a type of "necessary evil," due to being forbidden. In the next excerpt, 48-year-old Yahia explains his family's experiences with using bank credit with interjections from his 42-year-old wife Amal.

*Yahia: But the middle-class lives on credit.*

*Amal: They ask “Uncle Bank.” (referring to conventional bank credit)*

*Yahia: Mr. Mohamed helps too (refers to credit from the hanoot shopkeeper)*

*Ruth: You got credit for the house and the car?*

*Yahia: We got credit for the car but we didn't get one for a house yet, we are currently renting. Bank credit is haram (forbidden for Muslims). But we don't have any other choice, we should take a step for the house.*

*Amal: I believe that it will happen when God allows us to, we tried but not yet.*

*We want to have it with no interest because we don't want war with God. I told you about Imrane's accident when he fell from the second floor, that was a sign from God that bank interests are bad, right?*

*Yahia: Yes. [And] when I got my first bank credit I had a terrible accident,*

*Amal: We had bank credits three times and every time something terrible happened. [Thank God] I'm still alive.*

*Yahia: Last time was so terrible*

*Ruth: A car accident?*

*Yahia: Yes, after the Eid Kbr [Eid Al-Adha/big holiday].*

*Amal: Isn't it a message from God?*

*Ruth [trying to diffuse tension between Amal and Yahia]: I don't know what's in God's head or what he is thinking. (laughing)*

*Yahia (laughing): Exactly*

Amal bought a car with a loan with interest but then her youngest son [Imrane] fell out of a window. Thankfully, the son was not hurt but Amal felt that her son's fall was a sign from God that she should not have bank credit because it is forbidden. Due to this, she

sold her car and now no longer has a car. Her husband, Yahia, also has a car, which is being paid for through bank credit, and he has had three separate car accidents. Amal feels that her husband will keep having car accidents until he pays off or sells his car because he is “*at war with God.*” This example shows the extent to which some Moroccans feel the need for credit *and* the simultaneous heavy guilt of doing something forbidden (*haram*). Amal and Yahia also show the wide variety of opinions about bank credit, even within the same family and household. While Amal is adamantly opposed to using bank credit, Yahia, her husband, feels that it is necessary to use bank credit to keep his car, despite having car accidents. While Amal’s work is quite close to the apartment they are renting and she is able to walk to work every day, Yahia’s work is a 30-minute drive away. If Yahia sold his car to pay off his loan, he would be forced to use grand taxis to get to work every day, significantly increasing his commute. Yahia also said “*we don’t have any other choice, we should take a step for the house,*” suggesting that he thinks that the family needs to get a bank loan to buy a house instead of paying rent every month. Yahia and Amal disagree about the loan and I did not want to put myself in the middle of this disagreement, so I tried to remain neutral by saying that “*I don’t know what is in God’s head.*” Amal chooses not to use bank credit in order to avoid being “*at war with God,*” and bad things happening as a result. At the same time, Yahia is more ambivalent about whether these accidents were signs from God and wants to seek a second bank loan to buy a house. Amal is somewhat unique: no other participant mentioned specific “signs from God” in relation to using bank credit, but this is an important example of religion and economics affectively colliding. Most participants who

do use bank credit share Yahia's feelings: that bank credit is a type of "necessary evil" due to the high cost of living in urban Morocco today.

Although most participants use bank credit, some chose to specifically avoid bank credit because it is forbidden for Muslims. Some participants were able to maintain a middle-class lifestyle without credit and other participants did not have enough economic capital to qualify for conventional loans. Ibrahim (33 years old) and Yasmine (31 years old) were one of the few participants who had access to bank credit but chose not to use it for religious and personal reasons. During our interview, Yasmine and Ibrahim explained that they do not take out bank credit for religious reasons but also because they want to "live in peace and not stress about anything." They have seen their friends worry about the money that they owe to banks and other people and are not envious of this life. In contrast to their friends, Yasmine and Ibrahim choose to save slowly: using taxis, buses, and carpools instead of buying their own car. Likewise, they rent their apartment and do not own their own home. In this excerpt, Yasmine and Ibrahim explain how they feel they are different from their urban middle-class Moroccan married friends:

*Yasmine: I feel like we're different from most of the couples nowadays, most of them want to buy a house on credit and furnish it completely. For me, I don't care about having so many things in the house we have the necessities and we're happy. While our colleagues stress a lot because they want a new car, more furniture, a bigger house...*

*Ibrahim: We're taking life easily.*



For Yasmine, it is a necessity to have an apartment, food, and means of transportation but Yasmine and Ibrahim do not feel it is necessary to buy their own home and car. They contrast their own spiritual and economic tranquility with “*most couples*” who stress over paying for a “*new car, new furniture, a bigger house*” etc. Although Yasmine and Ibrahim felt secure in their decisions to avoid bank credit, most participants embraced credit to obtain markers of middle-class lifestyles but were also simultaneously worried about repaying this bank credit and the forbidden nature of using bank credit in general.

Some urban middle-class Moroccans turn to bank credit to pay for perceived necessities like a house or a car. However, the use of bank interest is forbidden within most interpretations of Islamic texts and therefore taking out a loan can come with moral ambiguity. In the face of pressures to attain middle-class markers of status and to be good Muslims, some middle-class Moroccans choose to reject the need for bank credit and choose to save money slowly instead.

#### 4.4.3 Eid Sheep

Besides providing “the necessities” like housing, transportation, and food, many Moroccans also feel a moral imperative to buy a sheep for their family for *Eid Al-Adha* (Holiday of the Sacrifice). *Eid al-Adha* is also called *Eid Al-Kbr* (The Big Holiday) because it is the most important holiday on the Islamic calendar and in contrast to *Eid Al-Ftr* (Holiday of Breaking the Fast) or *Eid Al-Sgheer* (Small Holiday), which marks the end of the holy month of fasting, Ramadan. *Eid Al-Adha* (Holiday of the Sacrifice) marks remembrance of when Ibrahim was willing to sacrifice his son to God and God intervened and asked him to sacrifice a lamb instead. To celebrate *Eid Al-Adha*, Muslim families sacrifice an animal, often a sheep, keeping one third for the immediate family

and giving a third of the meat to the poor and needy and one third to other family, friends, and neighbors. Most Moroccan families individually procure a sheep from the market (or countryside farm), often keeping it on the roof or terrace for up to a week until the day of *Eid*. Moroccan men kill the sheep ritually and then Moroccan women clean and prepare the meat. Below is an abbreviated excerpt from my fieldnotes for the morning and afternoon of the first day of Eid Al-Adha:

*Badr's brother and 3 of his friends/neighbors went to the roof of the house, helped to kill the sheep, and skin it. This took about an hour. The first thing they did was kill the sheep quickly by slitting its throat and let most of the blood drain and get pushed into the drain on the floor on the roof. I felt like the story from the Bible was coming alive before my eyes. Then they cut off the head and the four feet and put them off to the side. Then they skinned the sheep, placing the sheep on a hook that was conveniently on the roof.*

*Then Badr's mom and sister came to the roof to clean out and deal with the organs and intestines. They cleaned out the big stomach and the little stomach. Cleaning out the intestines took about two hours and this apparently is more so women's work. After the liver and heart had been taken out- they put a cloth over them and put them in the shade. They wanted to make sure the meat didn't get too hot so they brought the sheep down inside the house on the inside of a ladder hanging down with blood dripping a little bit onto the tiled stairs. Later, Souhaila cleaned up the stairs with bleach.*

*The first thing to eat from the sheep is the liver grilled for breakfast. Badr's mom fasted during the morning until she ate the taste of the liver with the fat rolled*

*around it and grilled. I usually hate liver but this way with the fresh liver and fat around it grilled- it was delicious! We also had hot Moroccan mint tea. This day was full of delicious food. For lunch we had the intestines that had been cooked for a while in a very good sauce- it was a little weird eating all of the different textures of the intestines but the flavor was delicious. This was the large lunch with five different kinds of cold salads surrounding the intestines as well as lots of homemade fresh whole wheat bread.*

This excerpt gives a brief description of the traditional *Eid Al-Adha* that most Moroccans experience. Some families chose to slaughter a goat or a cow often due to health reasons, because they have less fat and cholesterol compared to the sheep. My experience with *Eid Al-Adha* shows a clear division of labor between men slaughtering the animal and then women processing and often breaking down the animal. Some families will also pay a butcher to slaughter and break down the animal, but butchers are quite busy on *Eid Al-Adha* and are an additional estimated 50-150 dh (\$5-15) cost.

Working- and middle-class Moroccans feel an intense pressure to buy a sheep for the family to sacrifice on *Eid*. Middle- and working-class Moroccans will sometimes borrow money from family or friends or take out a bank loan to pay for a sheep for the family. It can be quite embarrassing for a family to not have a sheep to kill on *Eid* when all other neighbors have one and some feel that it is shameful. My 42-year-old Moroccan Arabic teacher, Fatima said that “*Eid is a problem for children because they will always ask, ‘when are we buying a sheep like my friends, like the neighbors- where is our sheep?’*” Families without money to buy a sheep feel shame even though Islamic scholars only require families *who can afford* to buy a sheep to do so. If a family cannot

afford to buy a sheep for *Eid*, they can buy a chicken to slaughter, but it pales in comparison. In 2019 during fieldwork, a sheep for *Eid* cost between 2200-5000 dh (\$240-\$546), a significant addition to the monthly budget. In 2018 and 2019, *Eid* fell during the month of August, when private schools bill parents for the coming school year and when all parents must buy their children's books, school supplies, and potentially new clothes for school. In the Moroccan high-pressure environment to buy a sheep, working and middle-class Moroccans will sometimes borrow money to pay for additional costs associated with *Eid* and school. Moroccans negotiate between two contrasting sociocultural religious obligations: to buy a sheep and to not buy anything on credit with interest. Whereas having a sheep to slaughter on the morning of *Eid Al-Adha* is more public, not everyone will necessarily know how the family paid for the sheep. Fatima also said that some poor families who did not have access to bank credit and were unable to borrow money from family or friends, would sell clothes or household items to be able to buy a sheep for *Eid*.

Some households with whom I spoke saved up for *Eid al-Adha* every year (and/or Ramadan, the beginning of the school year, etc.) to have enough money to pay for a sheep for the holiday. However, not every household felt that they were able to take any money away from the monthly budget to set aside to save for an upcoming holiday and therefore would have to borrow money from friends, family, or a bank to meet this sociocultural obligation. Besides forcing oneself to save money from a monthly salary, participants could also decide to participate in an exchange (*nooba'a*), where each member contributes a specific amount of money to a common pot over a specific amount

of time. However, not everyone in the nooba'a would be able to get the money that they need for Eid al-Adha during the same week or month.

It is also common for the oldest Moroccan son to pay for his parents' sheep if they are unable to pay for their own sheep. This can add an additional burden during an already expensive time of the year. During a road trip with friends who are a married couple about a month before *Eid Al-Adha*, they said:

*Badr: Should we buy a sheep this year?*

*Souhaila: I don't see why we would.*

*Badr: Because it is part of our religion, of course.*

Badr and Souhaila had been married for a little over a year when we were having this conversation and they had a newborn boy at the time. Badr lives and works in the US while Souhaila was living in Morocco with Badr's mother and siblings for her pregnancy and the first months of their son's life. Badr was visiting for a few weeks before having to go back to the US for work and would not be in Morocco for *Eid*. Badr's brother already buys a sheep for the family for *Eid* every year, but this would be the first *Eid Al-Adha* that Badr and Souhaila were married. I think that because Badr grew up with the expectation that once he was married, he would buy a sheep for his family and with the added pressure of having his own child, he felt that it was necessary to buy a sheep "*because it is part of our religion.*" Souhaila is more rational and does not see the need to spend so much money on a sheep for only herself and her newborn son: an adult and child would not be able to eat the allotted 1/3 of an entire sheep. Badr and Souhaila did not end up buying their own sheep for one adult and child and instead had one sheep to

kill for Badr's brother, mother, sister, and child as well as his wife and newborn son and myself and my husband. My husband and I visited Badr's family in Meknes for *Eid Al-Adha* a few weeks after the above conversation when Badr was back in the US for work.

In contrast to Badr's family, some upper-class Moroccans are trying to completely avoid buying their own sheep. Some upper-class Moroccans sometimes combine *Eid Al-Adha* and a family vacation by celebrating *Eid* in a hotel with their family during August. Rather than personally killing a sheep and cleaning up the blood, hotel attendants will kill a few sheep for the guests staying at the hotel and then the families just get to enjoy a delicious buffet. Following the European example, August is often the month of vacation for middle and upper-class Moroccans. Because *Eid* also fell during August in 2018 and 2019, some upper-class Moroccan families decided to combine family vacation time with their *Eid* celebrations, saving time from not personally slaughtering, breaking down, processing, and cooking an entire sheep. For these families, having a family vacation was just as important as celebrating *Eid* and so they decided to combine expenses to achieve both in a convenient combined event.

The examples from this section show the importance of slaughtering one sheep per family for most Moroccans, despite significant costs, and how some upper-class Moroccans are combining vacation and *Eid* celebrations. The variety of opinions and experiences regarding *Eid Al-Adha* demonstrates the highly variable nature of religious practices, which sometimes overlap with socioeconomic class. This section analyzed the affective dimensions of making simultaneously symbolic, economic, and religious decisions about the use of credit. Urban middle-class Moroccans experience conflicting affect or emotions over the need to both provide a number of markers of middle-class

identity, but which might require bank credit to do so, which can produce feelings of guilty. Overall, this section examined informal and formal forms of credit available to middle-class Moroccans, how most middle-class Moroccans with whom I spoke felt that bank credit was a “necessary evil” for living life, despite it being forbidden, and complicated religious obligation to buy a sheep for Eid Al-Adha.

#### 4.5 Conclusion

Focusing on the material, affective, and symbolic dimensions of socioeconomic class, this chapter discusses changes in Moroccan urban middle-class aspirations, anxieties, and subjectivities, and exploring how these combine to impact the market economy. The first section discussed the economic, affective, and symbolic dimensions of defining “necessities” in middle-class urban lives: namely private schooling for their children, adequate (often neolocal) housing, food and (usually private) healthcare. Rather than only examining the influence of globalization on local experiences, this research builds on Freeman (2000) to examine the ways that local middle-class subjectivities influence global economic markets. This section also examined the influence of changes in middle-class subjectivities, marital relations and state policies on the Moroccan market economy for education, food, and healthcare, which are connected to and undoubtedly influence larger global markets. The second section focused on the affective dimensions of maintain a middle-class identity, especially in relation to the religious and cultural decision to seek bank credit for a house, car or to buy an Eid sheep.

CHAPTER 5. MIDDLE-CLASS COMPANIONATE MARRIAGES AND HOUSEHOLD RELATIONS

5.1 Introduction

Middle-class Moroccans feel added pressure to provide a “good” middle-class lifestyle for themselves and their children by buying private education, their own home, private healthcare, private transportation, and a sheep for their own family and potentially their parents as well. This chapter examines how these added pressures are impacting Moroccan middle-class subjectivities and marriage relations. For those with whom I spoke, middle-class urban Moroccan marriages are increasingly marked by shared financial responsibility and more flexible gender roles due in part to increased anxiety about maintaining their middle-class status. This chapter examines how urban Moroccan middle-class subjectivities co-constitute companionate marriage relations (Hirsch & Wardlow 2006). The idea of companionate marriages comes from Western Europe and is largely characterized by individual choice of spouse, neolocal nuclear family household, an emphasis on emotional connection and gratification, monogamy, fidelity, preferring the company of one’s spouse to the familial or same-sex sociality, and an emphasis on verbal expression of love rather than actions (Hirsch & Wardlow 2006; Kipnis 2005). Members of the younger generation of urban middle-class Moroccans (under 50 years old) with whom I spoke characterized their marriages as sharing some of these traits, specifically, the individual choice of spouse, neolocal nuclear family household, open-mindedness, shared responsibilities, and communication. However, certain working and middle-class participants critiqued the new generation of urban middle-class Moroccan marriages as being more like a company obsessed with money, than a marriage, suggesting tension. These critiques and my own data signals that these changes to



Moroccan urban middle-class marriages are neither universal or complete, but rather an uneven process.

This gradual shift towards companionate marriage is both a generational and class phenomenon. Generally, urban middle-class couples below the age of 50 have more in common with companionate marriages, compared to urban working-class couples over the age of 50. It is hard to tease out the particularities of both age and social class because several middle-class participants with whom I spoke identified a change in marriage relations between themselves and their parents, suggesting a generational shift based on age, but many of their parents were working-class, suggesting a shift based on socioeconomic class. I argue that based on the couples with whom I spoke, companionate marriages are more characteristic of urban middle-class Moroccan couples under the age of 50 while couples over the age of 50 and working-class couples were less likely to share the characteristics of companionate marriages. Slightly more middle-class couples demonstrated companionate marriage characteristics (56%) compared to those that did not (44%) and more couples younger than 50 demonstrated companionate marriage characteristics (56%) compared to those that did not (44%). More working-class participants did not identify with companionate marriage (80%) than did (20%) and slightly more participants older than 50 did not identify with companionate marriage (67%) than did (33%). Upper-class couples were evenly divided between one with more companionate marriage (50%) and one with less companionate marriage characteristics (50%). I did not specifically ask participants if they identify with companionate marriage, but rather categorized couples based on characteristics of companionate marriage (Hirsch & Wardlow 2006), interview and participant observation data.

Critically, my data is heavily skewed towards middle-class (27 out of 34 couples) and participants younger than 50 years old (28 out of 34 couples). Given this, my data is likely more representative of how younger, urban, middle-class Moroccan couples view themselves in contrast to how they view their older parent's generation and/or working-class counterparts. In other words, my data do not provide a robust overview of the reality of working-class and older marriages. However, by distinguishing themselves from their parents and working-class Moroccans, the urban middle-class younger participants with whom I spoke support and reinforce their own middle-class subjectivities. To examine this critically, I do provide a few contrasting examples of working-class couples and couples older than 50 years old. The alternative to companionate marriage that I observed was generally characterized by more arranged marriages, sometimes living with extended family, stricter gender role divisions, divided responsibilities within and outside of the house, and less communication between husband and wife.

About 25 years ago, Davis and Davis (1995) argued that young Moroccan men were more likely to use a discourse of passionate, romantic love compared to young Moroccan women because women stand to lose more if love turns sour. For example, they (David and Davis 1995) discussed how Amina openly talked to a boy in public and fell in love but shamed her family and ruined her own reputation by doing so, while the boy was able to simply leave her, without major social repercussions. Moroccan women are still more vulnerable in romantic relationships due to harsher consequences for being seen with a man and having more to lose, compared to Moroccan men (Slimani 2017). However, due to the current socioeconomic situation in Morocco, most middle-class men

are unable to provide a middle-class lifestyle for their family on their income alone. In this way, I argue that most middle-class Moroccan men are unable to fully fulfill their cultural and religious obligations to their wife and child. In response to this vulnerability, young men often seek wives who participate in the paid labor force in order to be able to maintain a middle-class lifestyle. By both contributing to the financial security of the family and sometimes both doing some reproductive labor, the clear-cut male and female responsibilities of older generations are blurred. Whereas most middle-class Moroccans who grew up in the 1960's and 1970's were able to live well on the income of one main male breadwinner (Boufous & Khariss 2015), Moroccans who grew up in the 1980's, 1990's and afterwards generally need two incomes to support a household. Although Moroccan patriarchal structures remain intact, most younger Moroccan husbands are dependent on their Moroccan wives working in order to maintain a middle-class lifestyle for their family, which has changed marriage relations.

## 5.2 Companionate Marriage

The idea of “companionate marriage” in which emotional closeness constitutes and reinforces romantic relationships (Simmons 1979; Skolnik 1991), is growing in prominence around the world as one idea about marriage among many that people draw on when “crafting their complicated lives” (Hirsch & Wardlow 2006:6). Skolnik (1991) argues that the companionate ideal became popular in the late 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> century in the U.S. due to declining fertility and infant mortality rates, higher life expectancy, urbanization, wage labor, and increasing female labor force participation rates. These same demographic and economic shifts have been happening in Morocco for the past 50 years (Ayad & Roudi 2006; Assad and Zouari 2003). Based on the responses from older

and younger generations of married Moroccans, I argue that Moroccan urban middle-class marriages match the idea of “companionate marriage” in some ways, but not all, demonstrating that the ideals and some practices of companionate marriage can be pervasive across the globe, but also significantly locally variable (Knauft 2002; Hirsch & Wardlow 2006). Specifically, I argue that urban Moroccan middle-class marriages emphasize individual choice of spouse, neolocal nuclear family household, consumption, shared responsibilities, emotional connection, and communication. These characteristics match companionate marriages, but social and kin relations remain important, and couples do not necessarily value talk of “love” over actions.

### 5.3 Choice of Spouse

Within companionate marriage, individual choice of a spouse is important because two people most often choose one another and build an emotional connection and attachment based on common interests. For companionate marriages, the emotional connection between a couple fuels their marriage, rather than social responsibility to form a family or to uphold kin relations. While many “Western” liberal theories argue that most people are looking for individual autonomy within romantic relationships, Joseph (2005:81) argues that our ideas and perspectives about desire are continuously created within a matrix of relationships throughout our lives. Therefore, our family, friends, and environment teach us what types of “desire” are pleasing and suitable (Joseph 2005). For the middle-class Moroccans with whom I spoke, both an emotional connection between a couple and the importance of creating and maintaining a family and kin relations were important when considering a spouse. In this way, Moroccan middle-class subjectivities are subtly changing to value emotional connection between spouses, but the Moroccan

middle-classes are not seeking to transform the structure of family. Extended kin relations remain important in addition to personal connections between a couple. The current generation of urban Moroccan middle-classes (under 50 years old) usually desire to choose their own spouse and will often choose a working spouse, in order to maintain a middle-class lifestyle, showing a change in Moroccan middle-class subjectivities.

Regarding the individual choice of spouse, 68% of participants (39 out of 57) noted that they met their spouse without the help of family and “chose” their spouse. Most participants met their spouse through school or work, speaking to the importance of both increasing education and work levels for both male and female Moroccans (Alpert 2007). Of 57 participants, 18, or 32%, had their family arrange their marriage. My research data shows an even split between 9 older participants over 50-year-old and 9 younger participants under 50-year-old being in arranged marriages. Looking more closely, 9 out of 15 older participants (age 50-70) have arranged marriages (60%) and 9 out of 42 younger participants (age 24-48) have arranged marriages (21%). Arranged marriages are more significantly common with older generations. However, the fact that 21% of younger participants chose arranged marriage speaks to the adaptability and the enduring value of family and arranged marriages in Morocco. In the following example, 62-year-old Ilyas explains how his father married due to social pressure. During the interview, Ilyas’ wife, 58-year-old Boushra also chimed in:

*Ilyas (speaking about his father): He married because he was supposed to be married, and he had children because he needed them to work on the farm... While I got married because I fell in love and I make decisions because I’m*

*convinced [of those choices] and independent. But my parents lived life [for] others.*

*Ruth: How so?*

*Ilyas: They lived the life that people and neighbors wanted them to live because of traditions.*

*Ruth: They used to care about what the neighbors think...*

*Ilyas: Exactly.*

*Boushra: Some people still live this way: girls who don't go to school get married in a traditional way, and even uneducated men don't get to choose their lives.*

*Ilyas: Yes, they make girls marry older men, the couples don't get to communicate and know each other, and they have nothing in common but they get married because their tribe wanted them to marry each other.*

In this excerpt, Ilyas and Boushra discuss how Ilyas' father's decision to marry was shaped by social and familial pressures, since his parents wanted him to marry and have children to work on the farm. Ilyas contrasts his own marriage with Boushra, whom he met during university in France, to his parents' marriage: older couples do not "get to communicate and know each other, and they have nothing in common, but they get married." Despite Ilyas and Boushra being in the slightly older generation, over 50 years of age, they decided to marry because they "fell in love" through common interests. Earlier in the interview, Ilyas described meeting and deciding together to marry: "When I was studying in Lyon, the Mrs. who is my wife, used to study there too so we met there

and it was a good opportunity, our relationship grew stronger with time, and we decided to get married.” Ilyas and Boushra decided to get married based on common interests and a strong relationship: exemplifying a companionate marriage, in which two people will fall “in love” with a specific individual based on common interests (Hirsch & Wardlow 2006).

There is also an element of classed subjectivities where Boushra looks down on “girls who don’t go to school get married in a traditional way and even uneducated men don’t get to choose their lives.” Boushra’s words illuminate the way that she thinks about “uneducated” girls and men getting married in a traditional way, but they do not represent reality. Getting married in the traditional way does not necessarily mean that one does “not get to choose their lives” or preclude a couple from romantic love. Nadia (29 years old) stopped school after her second year of high school to participate in the paid labor force because her father became sick and unable to work. I became friends with Nadia’s sister-in-law, Rkia (also 29), and interviewed Nadia about a year after she got married. I attended Nadia’s wedding during the previous summer. When I asked Nadia, “How did you meet your spouse?” she replied:

*Nadia: He found me. (laughing) He was looking for me. My husband is my cousin’s friend they used to work together and asked my cousin if he knows a girl with these specifications and my cousin told him about me. That’s it, my cousin called and said that there is a man who wants to see me. He came to our house and had tea with us. He saw me and we liked each other (Nadia, Rkia, and Ruth laughing). After that we signed the marriage document and had the wedding party.*

*Rkia: She came back after signing the marriage documents and we received her with milk and dates and ululations.*

*Nadia: We didn't talk before signing the marriage documents, but after that, we started talking on the phone and that's when he started telling me romantic words.*

Nadia's experience with marriage shows that romance is not solely within the purvey of middle-class subjectivities but can also be experienced within working-class subjectivities. Both Nadia and her husband are devout conservative Muslims and I suspect that by "specifications" Nadia's husband meant that his potential future wife was religious and potentially that she wears the niqab, a religious veil covering all of the face and body, apart from the eyes. Nadia decided to wear the niqab when she turned 16 after studying "up on Islam and the Qur'an" and against her parent's wishes; she "feels like a queen" and like "she is a very special person" when she wears the niqab. After Nadia and her husband had signed the marriage documents, they felt that it was acceptable to talk to each other and Nadia's husband started telling Nadia "romantic words." Although Nadia's parents did not arrange her marriage, Nadia and her new husband had a traditional wedding with separate party times for women and men. Despite her working-class background, Nadia's marriage highlights the ability to choose a spouse and have individual autonomy, even within a traditional marriage. At the same time, not all aspects of Nadia's marriage aligned with urban Moroccan middle-class companionate marriages. Nadia and her husband do not share financial and household responsibilities, did not pay for a neolocal nuclear residence, and do not value freedom of movement or public consumption.



In addition to traditional marriages not being devoid of love, a marriage arranged by parents does not always imply that the couple did not meet and also agree to or “choose” their spouse. Especially for more recent marriages, those in the past 20 years, the explicit consent of both members of the potential couple is important and lawful (Sadiqi & Ennaji 2006). My data also supports scholarly work (De Munck 1998) showing that a neat binary opposition between “love” and “arranged” marriages does not exist in reality. Couples that are “arranged” by parents often grow a strong emotional attachment to each other. For example, they fall “in love” with one another. Likewise, sometimes couples who chose their own spouse for “love” fall out of love with each other. Additionally, every couple who chose their spouse for love with whom I spoke also gained the approval of their parents, an important religious and social practice. Participants mentioned that due to Facebook and the internet in general, most unmarried younger Moroccans are able to find a spouse online, suggesting that arranged marriages would be most common among the older generation.

In order to reveal common interests between a potential couple, romantic courtship is usually defined by consumption. Additionally, “taking a girl out” (i.e. consumption) defines “good treatment” of a woman by her partner (Illouz 1997:11). In urban affluent, middle- and upper-class neighborhoods in Rabat, Morocco, a budding culture of courtship and consumption exists, and gendered subjectivities dictate that the man should almost always pay on a date and often even in non-romantic situations. However, most participants that found and chose their spouses said they met and “got to know” their spouse through school and work, rather than through dating. It is somewhat socially taboo to date before marriage, especially for Moroccan women, so participants

might have omitted details of dating due to its taboo nature (Slimani 2017; Davis & Davis 1995). Aicha, a 51-year-old small business owner, said that she found her husband in “in a box of Molinex” (a laundry detergent brand that used to have small prizes in its packaging), or the cultural equivalent of “in a box of cracker jack caramel popcorn,” in order to evade my question “how did you meet your husband?” The proliferation of messaging and dating applications, like WhatsApp, Facebook, and others, also provide a low-cost and potentially private way to get to know a potential spouse.

These changing subjectivities and individual choice of a spouse are also bound up in socioeconomic class, especially for women. Boushra subtly looks down on “girls who don’t go to school, get married in a traditional way, and even uneducated men don’t get to choose their lives.” As noted in Chapter 2, social class and education are tightly interwoven. Illouz (1997) argues that because more American women were joining the labor force, they sought emotional fulfillment and not solely economic security from marriage. Because Ilyas and Boushra both did postgraduate studies in France and were assured steady jobs when they came home to Morocco in the late 1980’s, they were more likely to choose a mate based on emotional fulfillment, rather than solely economic security. Boushra is making a class comparison between herself and Ilyas as an educated middle-class couple who chose to marry for love, in contrast to uneducated working-class couples who (according to Ilyas and Boushra) often marry for social obligation (and economic security). Unlike Ilyas and Boushra who were able to find steady employment with benefits relatively easily after graduation, younger educated middle-class urban Moroccan couples today do not always have such luck (Boufous & Khariss 2015; Dhillon & Youssef 2009). Due to a lack of stable formal employment combined with “love”

being romanticized in film and TV, younger middle-class Moroccans now seek both economic security and emotional fulfillment. Urban middle-class Moroccan marriages are not purely “companionate marriages” because emotional connection is not the sole thing that initiates and drives marriages: social pressure to form a family and to maintain kin relations also significantly influence couples to initiate and maintain marriage for working and middle-class Moroccans.

#### 5.4 Neolocal Nuclear Family Household

Unlike the aspiring middle-class that Maqsood (2021) spoke to in Pakistan who could generally not afford their own nuclear independent family residence, most middle-class Moroccans with whom I spoke were able to afford to rent or buy their own nuclear independent family residence. Neolocal residence and nuclear family households could both weaken and strengthen kin relations, depending on family relations. As discussed in Chapter 2, family structure (living as a nuclear family or with extended family) can greatly influence the distribution of reproductive labor, which co-constitutes gendered subjectivities. In addition to family structure being important for reproductive labor and gendered subjectivities, classed subjectivities influence family structure. As discussed in Chapter 4’s section on “Middle-Class Aspirations,” it has become increasingly important for newly married middle-class couples to create their own new residence as a nuclear family, away from the parents’ residence, in order to maintain a middle-class lifestyle. In this way, urban Moroccan middle-class subjectivities and companionate marriage co-constitute one another.

A neolocal nuclear family household can be achieved by buying or renting a new house. It is less socially acceptable for middle-class Moroccans to live with the husbands' parents at the beginning of a marriage, than it was 20 years ago. When I asked middle-class Karim (35) and Samira (38) how long they have been married, they explained the need to delay living together:

*Karim: We've been legally married for seven years and started living together five years ago.*

*Ruth: Why didn't you live together after you got married?*

*Karim: We weren't financially ready to have a home.*

*Ruth: Why you didn't live with your parents?*

*Karim: Because my family lives in Meknes and I couldn't live with her family because it's inappropriate in Morocco.*

*Ruth: Did you think about living with her parents?*

*Karim: It's impossible.*

*Ruth: It's a weird thing to do in Morocco?*

*Karim: yes, I think it's weird everywhere.*

*Samira: It's not impossible, some men live with their in-laws*

Karim explains that they were not financially able to buy or rent an apartment when they first got married and were unable to live with his family, so they delayed living together. Living with Samira's parents was not an option because it is "impossible." Karim and

Samira were willing to delay their married life together officially until they were able to afford an apartment of their own.

Although one might view gaining a neolocal nuclear family household as a way to assert individual autonomy and distance a couple from larger kin ties, doing so could strengthen kin relations. When I asked participants about living with in-laws, most explained the desire to live away from the husband's parents because doing so can "create problems" (as discussed in Chapter 2), especially between the new wife and her mother-in-law. Instead of allowing problems spurred from living together to fester and potentially rupture family relations in the future, couples often choose to live alone, ultimately strengthening kin by familial avoiding conflict. When I interviewed 31-year-old Yasmine and her husband, 33-year-old Ibrahim, Yasmine said:

*Yasmine: I see that women I know use all of their energy in housework. I'm not like that, housework is not my priority...The reason why I feel that I'm different is that I don't live with my mother-in-law so there is no pressure on me from her to do daily housework or wake up early, I have the freedom to do what I want.*

*Ruth: Most of Moroccans still live with their in-laws?*

*Yasmine: Yes, there is nothing better than living alone.*

*Ruth: What about your family?*

*Yasmine: I got used to living far from them, we talk on the phone very often and visit them once in a month or two. I believe that couples who live [a] simple life have fewer problems.*

Yasmine and Ibrahim can have “fewer problems” because they live apart from in-laws while still maintaining social relations through phone calls and visits. However, if relations with in-laws are amicable, new couples might weaken kin ties by living away from parents, while also simultaneously strengthening the emotional attachment of the couple.

### 5.5 Open-mindedness

In addition to finding and choosing a spouse, neolocal nuclear family household, participants also stated that this generation is more open-minded compared to their parents’ generation. In this excerpt, 36-year-old History and Geography public school teacher, Youssef, explains the differences between his generation and his parents’ generation:

*Ruth: Is there is a difference in married life between your friends’ marriage and yours?*

*Youssef: I can’t tell you because I don’t know a lot about their lives but the only thing I can say is that they are different than their parents because the mentalities of the people have changed, they are more open-minded than before.*

*Ruth: How so?*

*Youssef: Now couples can go out and eat outside which didn’t happen before, men are more aware of their responsibilities toward their kids, wives and house. Before, men wanted to get to their house and find lunch ready no matter what or how their wife is feeling. After work they go to sleep, and no one should bother*

*them. I want my kids to grow around me and be close to me and everything I do for them I do it because I love them, not just because it's a responsibility.*

For Youssef, being “open-minded,” means freedom of movement for a couple, public consumption, and, particularly more active and loving fathering.<sup>24</sup> Importantly, women participating in the paid labor force facilitates being “open-minded” because economic and reproductive responsibilities are shared more equitably by both husband and wife. Because the wife participates in the paid labor force, she does not have time to have a lunch ready for her husband “no matter what” and the family has more disposable income to “go out and eat outside.” In this way, being “open-minded” is inherently linked to class and consumption: someone’s ability to buy and eat food outside of the house rather than making food at home.<sup>25</sup>

For Youssef, love is an important motivating factor for being close with his children, rather than simply because of responsibilities. Most of the literature on companionate marriages focuses on the relationship between the husband and the wife, and how they treat each other, rather than the nuclear family unit, including kids, as a whole (Hirsch & Wardlow 2006). Within historical literature on love and marriage idealizing companionate marriage, verbal expressions of love (i.e., saying “I love you”) are more important than instrumental expressions of attachment like folding laundry (Hirsch & Wardlow 2006:5). Youssef provides an important example of how the companionate ideals of “love” influence Youssef’s thoughts and actions, but that his

---

<sup>24</sup> Chapter 3 discusses in more detail the changes in urban middle-class Moroccan masculinities and especially what it means to be a “good father.”

<sup>25</sup> I discuss more about changes in Moroccan foodways and social class in Chapter 5 on convenience foods and technologies.

actions do not perfectly align with the ideals of companionate marriage. For Youssef, “love” is important and valuable for him, but he interprets “love” as actions rather than emphasizing the verbal words, unlike companionate marriages (Hirsch & Wardlow 2006). Youssef also does all the shopping for the family rather than asking his wife, 34-year-old Meryiem, who also works as History and Geography public school teacher, to do so. Youssef shows his love for his wife by the repeated action of shopping for the family unit.

## 5.6 Sharing Responsibility

In addition to choosing a spouse, neolocal nuclear family household and being open-minded, participants also declared the importance of shared responsibilities within younger middle-class urban Moroccan couples. I discuss how this change is significant for defining Moroccan masculinity and gendered subjectivities in general in Chapter 3, but this section focuses more on how sharing responsibility impacts marriage relations and aligns with the characteristics of companionate marriage (Hirsch & Wardlow 2006). Bouasria (2013:176) notes that some urban working-class Moroccan who she spoke with mentioned the importance of mutual aid between themselves and their husbands. In the same quote from the open-mindedness section above, Youssef also mentions that “*men are more aware of their responsibilities toward their kids, wives and house.*” For Moroccan men who were and are able to be the sole breadwinner, they often see their sole responsibility as providing financially for the household and that their wife’s responsibility is to take care of any children and the house. However, for Youssef, and his friend’s marriages, he feels that middle-class Moroccan men are becoming more aware of their “*responsibilities toward their kids, wives and house.*” Although Youssef goes on to



say that he takes care of his children because he loves them and not just because it is a responsibility, it is still important to note that he and his friends do see reproductive labor as part of a husband's responsibilities. This marks a dramatic shift in how middle-class urban Moroccan men view their role in marriage and in the family. Rather than viewing responsibilities to the household in a discrete divided way for only wives, urban middle-class younger Moroccan couples now tend to share their economic and household responsibilities.

In addition to Youssef's description of men's responsibility toward their kids, wives, and house, other participants also said that they often "help each other" in referring to their spouse. This exemplifies the change from individual to shared responsibility of both finances and reproductive labor. In the following excerpt, Abdelhafid, a 41-year-old Islamic Studies public high school teacher, explains how he feels about his wife Iman helping him with expenses and him helping his wife with taking care of the children and house:

*Ruth: Does your wife help you in the kitchen?*

*Abdelhafid: Yes! She's the base.*

*Ruth: With taking care of the children?*

*Abdelhafid: Yes.*

*Ruth: And the expenses?*

*Abdelhafid: Yes, we help each other.*

*Ruth: How do you feel about this?*

*Abdelhafid: I feel that we live comfortably.*

*Ruth: And how do you feel when you help her?*

*Abdelhafid: I feel that we help and understand each other. I help her when she's tired, so yes, thanks be to God.*

*Ruth: She helps you and you help her.*

*Abdelhafid: Exactly*

*Ruth: That's the perfect marriage.*

*Abdelhafid: Indeed. We can't continue if there was no help and understanding. And without this, married couples can't enjoy their lives.*

*Ruth: There is a problem if they don't help each other.*

*Abdelhafid: Yes.*

In the interview, Abdelhafid explains that it is important for him and his wife to help each other both financially and in the household. Abdelhafid regularly shops for all food and household items for the family, drives his three children to different extracurricular activities and appointments, and cooks and cleans occasionally. While I was staying with Abdelhafid and Iman for a week in July 2019, I calculated that while Iman did about 17 hours of reproductive labor, Abdelhafid did 20 hours, their household employee Alia did 48 hours, and their two sons did less than one hour each. Abdelhafid was not actively teaching during the summer months, and he had more time to do reproductive labor, compared to Iman who works 35 hours a week for the government. Based on their

interview data, Iman does more reproductive labor than Abdelhafid throughout the year, in addition to significant help from Alia, the household employee.

Abdelhafid goes on to say that without help and understanding between spouses, “*married couples can’t enjoy their lives.*” This signifies the importance for this generation of middle-class Moroccan married couples helping each other with household expenses and also with some reproductive labor like taking care of children, cooking, and/or cleaning. Women still do most of the reproductive labor, but there are significantly more flexible gender roles with shared responsibility for both finances and reproductive labor for the urban middle-class participants with whom I spoke who are under 50 years old compared to those older than 50 years old. Hirsch et al. (2006) argue that in the Mexican migrant community, the new generation bases marriage on intimacy rather than the respect and mutual fulfillment of gendered responsibilities that the older generation valued. In the urban middle-class Moroccan context, participants under 50 did emphasize understanding and emotional connection more than their parents’ generation. However, in contrast to Hirsch’s findings, the “new” Moroccan generation still maintained the importance of fulfilling gendered responsibilities while acknowledging the importance of flexibly sharing those responsibilities.

## 5.7 Communication

In addition to choosing a spouse, being open-minded, and sharing responsibilities, multiple participants noted that communication was also very important for this generation of urban middle-class Moroccans under 50 years old. As middle-class subjects, because the husband and wife are now both sharing the responsibilities of

finances and reproductive labor together, they must communicate with one another to effectively manage the household labor and finances together. Not every urban middle-class Moroccan couple from this new generation openly and cooperatively shares household labor and finances completely but I found that increased and improved communication is required for couples who share even some responsibilities. Sanaa (50-years-old), who works in an upscale preschool but is working-class due to years of husband being unemployed previously, explains:

*Ruth: Do you think that people of the new generation help each other inside [the house] and outside [the house i.e. working]?*

*Sanaa: Yes, they do, because they know how to communicate.*

Sanaa argues that because the new generation knows how to communicate, they help each other inside the house with reproductive labor and outside the house with finances. Although Sanaa and her husband Mohammad are both 50 years old, they still have extensive personal knowledge of the broad trends in marriages in Morocco and can speak of the “new generation” under 50 years old. Additionally, Sanaa’s opinion as a working-class Moroccan woman shows that communication is important for both middle- and working-class Moroccan couples. While Sanaa’s husband was unemployed and Sanaa was the main breadwinner for the family, he helped with reproductive labor more because he was unable to find paid labor. In another example, 31-year-old Yasmine, who works at an Arabic-language center and identifies as middle-class, explains that her parents’ marriage was different from her own due, in part, to her parent’s lack of communication:

*Ruth: Is there a difference between your marriage and your parents’ marriage?*

*Yasmine: Yes, a lot*

*Ruth: How so?*

*Yasmine: My father was a tough man and very traditional. My mother used to fear him, while my husband and I are friends: we communicate and understand each other. My mother still fears my father until now. She doesn't feel free to talk or express herself near him.*

For Yasmine, communication and understanding mark her own marriage, while fear and a lack of communication define her parents' marriage. Yasmine's emphasis on communication and friendship as well as close emotional attachment in her own marriage inches closer to the ideals of companionate marriage compared to her parents' marriage. While Yasmine and Ibrahim decided together to rent an apartment instead of trying to buy one with bank credit, I suspect that in her parents' marriage, such a type of decision would have been made solely by her father. In this way, we can see how gendered and classed subjectivities are formed in conjunction with one another and transform over time. Due to more women participating in the paid labor force, they have more power within marriage relations and do not have to cede sole decision-making authority to their husbands.<sup>26</sup> Because of this change in gendered and classed subjectivities, marriage relations are also fulfilling some of the characteristics of companionate marriages. The new emphasis on individual choice of spouse, open-mindedness, sharing responsibilities,

---

<sup>26</sup> As discussed in Chapter 2, women participating in the paid labor force is not the only thing that creates such a change; religion, family structure, children, education and class also matter.

and communication marks an important shift in Moroccan middle-class subjectivities and the way urban middle-class Moroccans view and practice marriage daily.

### 5.8 Critiquing the New Generation

In response to middle-class Moroccans valuing two incomes, a few self-identified working-class female participants critiqued this type of marriage for being run “like a company” with only concern for money. Nadia (29), who got married about a year ago, explains why women often must work now:

*Nadia: Men of this generation like to marry working women because life is getting expensive. Women before used to accept to live with their in-laws but now they want an independent house and fancy furniture, they like to have a washing machine and have Wi-Fi in the house. Men can't afford all of this alone, that's why women have to work.*

Nadia blames gendered consumption patterns, specifically *women's* desire to have “an independent house and fancy furniture”, for Moroccan men not being able fulfill their sociocultural and religious duty to take care of their families financially. Due to less access to economic, cultural, and symbolic capital, working-class Moroccan women do not have access to the same stable formal employment that middle-class women like Iman can access and therefore are not able to maintain a fully “middle-class” lifestyle. Even if working-class women are married and get a job, they are unlikely to be able to afford markers of a middle-class lifestyle like private school for their children, a private home, regular convenience foods, a car, and travel, even with two incomes. This is because the occupations available to working-class women (e.g., being a household

employee, salesperson, pastry-maker, preschool worker, wedding attendant, etc.) do not pay a substantial salary and are more likely to be informal waged labor that does not include benefits like health care or retirement, as is common for many middle-class occupations. Nadia is unable to access a middle-class lifestyle and feels that it is unnecessary and exorbitant for women to expect markers of a middle-class lifestyle. Nadia feels that it would be better for a couple to live within the means of their husband's salary, rather than being obsessed with money and status.

Sometimes, these critiques are layered onto religious discourse. For example, Nadia also said:

*“If he [her husband] was able to provide me everything, I would rather stay at home than work because women in our religion should be in the house. But many women work outside now because they are forced to help their families. While some other women don't need to work, but they work anyways just to go in and out and be independent, especially in this generation. They like to suffer.”*

Most participants with whom I spoke agreed that it would be better if the wife were able to stay at home, but simultaneously felt that it was necessary to have two incomes in order to maintain a desired standard of life. In the above quote, Nadia questions Moroccan middle-class women's *need* to maintain a middle-class lifestyle. For Nadia, things like an independent house, fancy furniture, a washing machine and Wi-Fi are not necessities: they are just extra things that Moroccan middle-class women demand from their husband. These consumer desires lead women to participate in the paid labor force, thereby violating cultural ideals. Nadia might be valorizing women not participating in the paid labor force because she chose this lifestyle when she married her husband.

Before marrying, Nadia worked in a preschool, but they married on his condition that she would stay at home in order to have a hot meal ready for her husband when he came home from work. Initially it was hard for Nadia to stay at home all day with her mother-in-law, but then her husband let her leave home to go to a Quranic School near their apartment. Living well enough on one income, providing a hot meal for her husband and being able to rest during her pregnancy has convinced Nadia that participating in the paid labor force and the things that middle-class women demand, are unnecessary for her and should not be necessary for other Moroccans.

Other participants, despite being middle-class, also critiqued the new generation for organizing and running their marriages “like a company.” My 42-year-old Moroccan Arabic teacher, Fatima stated, “*some Moroccan couples function more like a company than a romantic relationship or family: they are only concerned with making money in order to buy more things.*” As a way of supporting her argument, she notes that, “*often the first question from a potential male suitor is ‘Does she have a job? Where does she work?’*” Instead of blaming Moroccan women’s desires for “fancy furniture,” Fatima blames both young Moroccan men and women for only wanting to make money to buy more things. Fatima critiques some Moroccan marriages that “run like a company” for not being based in love and a focus on the family. Fatima’s critique of some middle-class Moroccans seeking individual autonomy and consumption over family, romance, and kinship ties resonates with Joseph’s (2005) critique of Western scholarship on love and desire for focusing too much on individual autonomy. Joseph (2005) argues the couple’s ideas about desire are formed and reformed relationally over time through individual agency as well as kin and friend relations defining what desire should look like. While



Nadia and Fatima associate running a marriage like a company as an individual characteristic or personal failing, Joseph (2005)'s insights recognize that people within the social networks of these "company" couples have taught them that a desirable marriage outcome is being able to make more money to buy more things.

Ironically, Fatima uses a discourse of love, romance, and family, things associated with a companionate marriage, to critique some Moroccan middle-class marriages. Fatima herself decided to stop participating in the paid labor force due to health concerns and then went back to work tutoring foreign students from her own house when her daughter was 1.5 years old, where she could still be near and look after her daughter. In her own life, Fatima rejected the possibility of working longer hours outside of her home and having more money in favor of working fewer hours and having less money but being close to her daughter. More broadly, as the Moroccan middle-classes have expanded, some Moroccans critique new generations for only caring about money instead of valuing the institutions of marriage and family. Fatima's characterization of a couple being run like a company does not align with many characteristics of a companionate marriage, such as valuing an emotional connection and intimacy between partners. Not all couples with whom I spoke shared most characteristics of the companionate marriage and some might be run more like a company, as Fatima suggests, than a family. Although I am still arguing that most urban middle-class marriages are inching closer to the archetype of companionate marriage, Fatima's critique and my own data show the diversity of classed and gendered subjectivities within urban middle-class participants.

## 5.9 Conclusion

This chapter examined the ways in which companionate marriage and middle-class subjectivities co-constitute one another. Moroccan urban middle-class marriages align with companionate marriage by emphasizing individual choice of spouse, neolocal nuclear family household, open-mindedness, sharing financial and household responsibilities, and more communication between spouses. I argue that these characteristics constitute middle-class subjectivities because they were not representative of the working-class and upper-class households that I spoke to. However, I had a relatively small data set for lower and working-class (5) and a very small dataset for upper-class households (2). These characteristics are mainly based on how the urban Moroccan middle-class participants with whom I spoke distinguished themselves from working-class and upper-class Moroccans. By describing their own marriages as somehow different from their parents and working-class Moroccans, the urban middle-class Moroccans with whom I spoke strengthen and reinforce their own middle-class subjectivities. Moroccan urban middle-class marriages vary significantly locally (Knauff 2002; Hirsch & Wardlow 2006) because social and kin relations remain important, and couples do not necessarily value talk of “love” over actions. Although the relationship between a husband and wife is becoming more important for urban middle-class Moroccans compared to their parents, family structure and kinship ties remain of paramount importance.

CHAPTER 6. “THE MACHINE DOES IT!”: USING CONVENIENCE TECHNOLOGIES AND FOODS TO ANALYZE CARE, REPRODUCTIVE LABOR, GENDER, AND CLASS IN URBAN MOROCCO

6.1 Introduction

In mid-August 2019, I met with Amine (forty-three years old) and Ameera (36 years old) for an interview in a café in Salé that was convenient for them. A middle-class family, Ameera and Amine are both French teachers in Salé, where Amine also organizes an association where I volunteered. When I asked, “who cleans your clothes most of the time?” Ameera answered “I do.” At the same time, Amine answered “the washing machine.” Then, Ameera added with a chuckle, “Even a washing machine needs someone to make it work.” Language, and the way that Moroccan women highlight their agency through language, is important (Sadiqi 2003, xv). Disagreeing with Amine not recognizing running the washing machine as work, Ameera highlights her crucial role. This demonstrates an interesting tension in who claims the labor of convenience technologies and how urban middle-class Moroccans talk about reproductive labor more broadly.

As described throughout this dissertation, in Rabat, Morocco, an increasing number of Moroccan women are now working outside the home in the paid labor force (Alpert 2007; Bouasria 2013), which means more income and less time for reproductive labor. While younger middle-class Moroccan men sometimes help, women still do most of the reproductive labor within and outside the home in Morocco (Bouasria 2013; Newcomb 2017).

This chapter investigates how convenience technologies and foods challenge and reinforce gendered and classed subjectivities for urban Moroccans. Convenience

technologies are technologies designed to make tasks more convenient, easier, less labor-intensive, and often less time-consuming. Convenience foods are any foods that save time and labor for someone preparing, processing, consuming, or cleaning up after food. The primary focus is washing machines, but I use examples of other convenience technologies to demonstrate that the argument is not limited to one technology. Like other contexts (e.g., Ghannam 2013, 93), washing machines have emerged as an ethnographically significant convenience technology because participants said that washing machines meaningfully impact their daily lives.

The first section discusses contributions to the literatures on convenience technologies, convenience-as-care and care work, and reproductive labor in households before analysis. The data sections answer four main questions: Do convenience technologies save time and labor? How do convenience technologies hurt and help urban Moroccan women? How do convenience technologies reinforce class? And, how do convenience foods challenge and reinforce gendered and classed subjectivities? Experiences of convenience technologies and foods vary from person to person, especially based on gender and socioeconomic class. Convenience technologies help urban Moroccan women by opening up reproductive labor to men and children but simultaneously, hurt urban Moroccan women by devaluing their reproductive labor and women's labor in relation to men's labor in the kitchen. Convenience technology reinforces socioeconomic class through access and by reinforcing a household's reputation. Convenience technologies also support urban Moroccans' perceptions of themselves as citizens of a developed country.

The Moroccan urban middle classes feel pressure to buy convenience technologies to assert class identity, which is fueled by dual incomes that also create the need to save time and labor doing reproductive labor. Urban Morocco is unique because an important convenience technology, the washing machine, became affordable for most urban middle-class Moroccans at the same time that gendered subjectivities are subtly changing (i.e., men doing more reproductive labor than their fathers). In the Moroccan context, convenience technologies contribute to the restructuring of women's and men's position within the household. I am not arguing that if a socioeconomic class is able to afford a new convenience technology, men will suddenly start doing reproductive labor. Rather, I argue that convenience technologies open up reproductive labor to men and children, but concurrently, devalue that reproductive labor in the urban Moroccan context.

## 6.2 Convenience Technologies

Convenience technology's advertisements, starting around the 1920s in the United States (Cowan 1983; Graham 1999; Strasser 1982), promised to free women from excessive amounts of time and labor spent on reproductive labor, potentially creating a more egalitarian society. However, the reality is more nuanced. The actual hours of reproductive labor in the U.S. did not significantly change from 1920 to 1990 because new activities and standards simultaneously increased reproductive labor time (Campanelli 2003, 165).

Although convenience technologies paired with shifting expectations did not dramatically change total hours spent doing reproductive labor in the U.S., convenience

technologies altered the way in which women do reproductive labor. Because more tasks can be done simultaneously with convenience technologies, Campanelli (2003,166) argues that women doing reproductive labor feel more stress than previous generations. Etienne (1980) argues that western technologies like fabric factories were detrimental to the lives of Baule women by making them consumers, rather than producers of cloth, which made them dependent upon their husbands for sustenance and prestige. The presence of convenience technologies can have a physical impact on the body. In Montgomery's 2019 ethnography on domestic workers in Morocco, red and cracked hands are associated with women living in the village without washing machines and other appliances, while soft, white hands are a marker of distinction (Bourdieu 1984), of someone living in the city and of a higher socioeconomic class.

Access to and use of convenience technologies can often have a direct positive correlation to socioeconomic class. Rather than taking a solely subjectivist approach to class, I seek to understand the practices and institutions that produce class (Carrier 2012). I examine local ideas about class and the institutions through which people secure and improve their socioeconomic position. Although the Moroccan middle classes grew from 53% of the population to 58.7% of the population from 2007 to 2014 (Haut-Commissariat au Plan et la Banque Mondiale 2017), the cost of living in urban Morocco has increased significantly since 2010 (Haut-Commissariat Au Plan 2019), while salaries remain relatively stable.

### 6.3 Convenience Foods and Convenience as Care

Because food preparation represents a significant share of reproductive labor in urban Morocco and convenience foods are becoming more popular, this paper focuses on convenience foods in addition to convenience technologies. Convenient and inconvenient foods are not dichotomous but rather on opposite ends of a continuum. Although most literature on convenience foods uses data from the US, the UK and Australia, this paper will analyze data from Rabat, Morocco. While convenience foods symbolized modernity, success and prosperity in the U.S. in the 1950's (Banwell et al. 2012), today, women often receive criticism for relying on convenience foods due to their link to obesity (Ulijaszek 2007).

Besides examining how convenience technologies change the way people do reproductive labor, I also conceive of convenience as a possible way to care for one's family. Public health officials argue convenience foods contribute to obesogenic environments and lifestyle-related illnesses, blaming mothers for not caring for their children properly if they feed them convenience foods (Jackson & Viehoff 2016; Gordon-Larsen 2014; Banwell et al. 2012). In contrast, Meah and Jackson (2017) and Warin et al. (2019) conceptualize convenience as a way to care for oneself, loved ones, distant others, and/or the environment. Convenience as care allows researchers to move beyond binary assertions of convenience being good or bad, to show the complexities of convenience and care within a specific social context (Warde 1999, 519). While Warin et al. (2019) examine life histories and convenience foods, I conceptualize convenience as care to examine the conveniences' multiple layers of meaning that change significantly based on gender and class.

#### 6.4 Convenience as Care and Care Work

Like convenience, care is also an “ambivalent, contextual and relational” practice (Martin, Myers, and Visea 2015) happening across various spaces and at different times (Warin et al. 2019, 286). Rather than solely saving time, Carrington, Szmigin and Leek (2006) argue that convenience technologies, like kitchen appliances, support specific kinds of “gendered caring.” Care work includes any tasks that provide care to someone else (Lane 2017). I use Folbre’s (1995; see also Folbre and Weisskopf 1998) definition of care: to provide services based on personal interaction, motivated at least in part by a concern for the recipient’s welfare. Because care work is associated with feminine qualities, it is often devalued and underpaid (Lane 2017). Arguing against a discourse that paying for care work means the care worker does not care for their recipient enough, social scientists reject the dichotomy between caring for a recipient and receiving compensation for care provided (Lane 2017).

Convenience technologies shape the practice and meaning of care work. I examine which convenience technologies are considered appropriate ways to care for one’s family through reproductive labor. Not all care work is reproductive labor but reproductive labor, in that someone is caring for someone else by providing food, direct childcare, and/or a clean house, can be defined as care work. Viewing reproductive labor through the lens of care work gives meaning to reproductive labor by asking when it constitutes appropriate care and how is it valued within a specific context, which lies at the center of femininity and motherhood (Cowan 1983).



## 6.5 Do convenience technologies save time and labor?

This section analyzes whether or not convenience technologies save time and labor. This is an essential question because advertisements for convenience technologies frequently promise to save time and labor. More importantly, saving women some time and labor that they spend disproportionately doing reproductive labor (Kan et al. 2011) could lead to less inequality between men and women. Specifically, this section finds that while washing machines almost uniformly save urban Moroccan women time and labor, other convenience technologies like mixers could actually increase the amount of time spent doing reproductive labor.

### 6.5.1 Yes – Washing Machines

In the early and mid-2000s, owning a washing machine was economically unfeasible for most urban middle-class Moroccans. A significant drop in the price of washing machines in the last ten years in Morocco, due in part to market liberalization (Newcomb 2017), means that most urban Moroccans now have a semi-automatic or automatic washing machine. Middle-class Karima (61 years old), who is a household employee for an American family, says that she has had her automatic washing machine for “maybe eight years or more” and that “before having the machine, it took me half a day, but now it is quickly done,” stressing time saved.

At Rkia’s (29 years old) house in a working-class neighborhood in Salé, Nadia (29 years old), Rkia, and myself discussed washing clothes in the interview excerpt below. My friend Rkia is Nadia’s sister-in-law because she is married to Nadia’s older brother Noureddine (Table 2). Rkia and Noureddine have three children (ages eight, four, and one) with a fourth on the way. Nadia moved to Casablanca to live with her husband

about a year ago when they got married and lives with her mother-in-law and husband there. Neither Nadia nor Rkia participate in the paid labor force. I asked Nadia if she has a washing machine:

*Nadia: Yes, my mother-in-law has it, everything in the house is hers. (laughing)*

*Ruth: Is it automatic?*

*Nadia: No, it's normal.*

*Ruth: Mine too.*

*Nadia: You don't have an automatic [washing machine]?*

*Ruth: No, because we do not have water inputs in the apartment we rent.*

*Rkia: You should bring someone to install it.*

*Ruth: That's ok, I don't have so much time left in Morocco.*

*Rkia: You're right, you don't have that many clothes either.*

*Ruth: What matters is that I don't wash them with my hands.*

*Rkia: That's true. We used to wash clothes with our hands for a very long time.*

*Have you ever washed them with your hands?*

*Ruth: Yes, I didn't have a washing machine for a few months last year.*

*Rkia: It's so hard especially with kids' clothes, you have to do it one by one.*

*Nadia: Right.*

*Rkia: You have to wash kids' clothes one by one. You can't put them all in at once like with the washing machine.*

*Ruth: That would take a long time!*

*Nadia: Right now, I only do laundry every fifteen days or so, not too much.*

Rkia grew up in the countryside near the mountains with six sisters and one brother. When she was growing up, she did not have a washing machine. Being in the middle of her six sisters, Rkia was old enough to help with chores, like hand-washing her sisters' and brother's clothes. Nadia also has four younger siblings, and she grew up helping hand-wash clothes. Both Nadia and Rkia stress the convenience of having a semi-automatic washing machine that saves time and labor. Nadia seemed surprised that I did not have an automatic washing machine, probably due to my positionality as a white American woman living in Rabat, Morocco. Because of their positionality as women over the age of 20, Karima, Nadia, and Rkia all remember a specific time when they had to wash clothes without the convenience of a washing machine. Because the majority (57%) of the people with whom I spoke identify as women over the age of 20, much of the data stresses the time- and labor-saving properties of washing machines.

#### 6.5.2 No - Mixers

While it is clear that washing machines save time and labor, other convenience technologies led to highly variable results. With stand mixers used for making bread, some participants found them useful while others never used their mixer. While discussing washing dishes, upper-middle class Hanane (44 years old), who works at a private Salé high school, stated, "Yes, I have a mixer that I bought for 1600 dhs (~\$176) and I still don't use it. It's more convenient to just do it with my hands instead of waiting for it to make it." Despite spending a relatively larger amount on this convenience technology, the mixer did not save Hanane time or labor. On the other hand, middle-class

Malika (43 years old) who teaches at a public Salé high school, noted that her mixer saves her both time and money:

*Ruth: Do you make bread at home?*

*Malika: I started making it lately because the bread we buy isn't good enough. I found that we spend 20 dhs (\$2.19) on bread.*

*Ruth: In a week?*

*Malika: No, in a day.*

*Ruth: Five people eat 20 [discs of] bread a day?!*

*Malika: Yes, we consume bread a lot. While I spend 8 dhs (\$0.88) on homemade bread that lasts for three days and it's a lot better than the bread we buy.*

*Ruth: What about time?*

*Malika: I have a mixer, so it doesn't take a lot of time.*

*Ruth: How many times do you make bread in a week?*

*Malika: I make it every three days.*

Despite Hanane and Malika both being urban middle-class women in their 40s, they experience and (dis)use convenience technologies differently. While washing machines save Moroccan women time and labor, mixers do not uniformly save time and labor. These findings indicate that the concept of “convenience” is highly subjective. The uses and experiences of convenience technologies are highly variable and experienced

differently by different people. The following sections examine how convenience technologies are experienced differently based on gender and class.

## 6.6 How do convenience technologies hurt and help women?

This section examines how gender influences the (dis)use of convenience technologies. Convenience technologies promise to liberate women from time- and labor-consuming tasks and Marxist-Feminists argue that a restructuring of labor in the domestic sphere is necessary for gender equality (Maconachie 2009). But what impacts do convenience technologies actually have on gendered subjectivities? This section asks how convenience technologies help and hurt Moroccan women by devaluing reproductive labor, opening up labor to men and children, and facilitating special meals cooked by men.

### 6.6.1 An “Easy” Task

I sometimes interviewed married couples together and sometimes separately based on their availability and preference. I interviewed the upper-middle class couple, Boushra (58 years old) and her husband Ilyas (62 years old), separately. Boushra teaches at a public middle school and Ilyas is a college professor. When I asked Boushra “Who cleans the clothes most of the time?,” she replied, “The washing machine cleans them.” Boushra added, “I help it,” and laughed. I then followed up asking, “Does anyone else use the washing machine?” And Boushra replied, “No, just me. I air dry them and fold them.” Based on her response, we know that she does all of the laundry in the house for herself, her husband, and their teenage daughter. When I interview Boushra’s husband Ilyas about a month later, his answer was more succinct. I asked the same question, “who

cleans the clothes most of the time?” He simply replied, “The washing machine,” without acknowledging his wife’s contribution at all. In this example, Ilyas completely ignored (intentionally or not) his wife’s reproductive labor. Because of washing machines, the labor involved in doing laundry is now viewed as “easy” in urban Morocco. Convenience technologies contribute to the devaluing of reproductive labor, especially in relation to paid labor, which hurts Moroccan women.

### 6.6.2 Men Doing Laundry

At the same time, laundry being “easy” opens this task up to other family members besides mothers: like older children and husbands. At middle-class Amal (42 years old) and Yahia’s (48 years old) house, I interviewed Amal’s coworker Hanane (44 years old), who described herself as “upper-middle class.” The following interview excerpt demonstrates flexibility in who can do reproductive labor:

*Ruth: Who cleans your clothes most of the time?*

*Hanane: The washing machine.*

*Ruth: Who puts the clothes in the machine?*

*Hanane: Me, my husband, or the kids, no problem.*

*Amal chimes in: That’s an easy task!*

*Hanane: Indeed.*

In this example, Hanane and Amal agree that putting the clothes in the machine is an “easy task” that can be completed by anyone in the household, including Hanane’s three children aged 15, 13, and 9 years old. Some urban Moroccan men with whom I spoke are

willing to do the laundry because washing machines have made the chore “easy.” The Moroccan men who do the laundry tend to be younger (under 45 years old) and middle-class rather than older (over 55 years old) and lower-middle or lower class. Convenience technologies are good for urban Moroccan women because they open the door for men and children to do more reproductive labor. However, doing reproductive labor with convenience technologies does not guarantee men will do any other reproductive labor.

Men employ multiple techniques to resist doing more reproductive labor. For example, when I ask middle-class Fatiha (30 years old), “who cleans your clothes most of the time,” she responded:

*Fatiha: He [her husband] does, because it’s easy. (laughing)*

*Ruth: At least he’s doing something.*

*Fatiha: Yes, he does laundry on the weekend.*

*Ruth: Does this change?*

*Fatiha: No, it’s always him.*

*Ruth: Did you both decide to share the chores?*

*Fatiha: No, he decided to do laundry.*

*Ruth: Do you ask him to help you more?*

*Fatiha: Yes, I ask him, but he always says that he’s tired.*

*Ruth: Always tired! (laughing)*

*Fatiha: Always! (laughing) For instance, I ask him to do dishes when I'm cooking but he says that he's tired and he goes to sleep or watch tv and soccer.*

Despite willingly volunteering to do laundry weekly, Fatiha's husband reinforces the idea that reproductive labor is Fatiha's responsibility by refusing to do any other household tasks besides laundry.

My middle-class friend Khadija (25 years old) provided another example. Khadija, her mother Karima (61 years old), and sister Madiha (28 years old) all begged their retired father Rachid (65 years old) for many months to help with housework in some way after he was retired and had more time around the house. After about a year, they finally convinced him to hang the clothes on the roof to dry and take them down every week. Their mother Karima does the laundry in the washing machine downstairs and brings them upstairs for her husband Rachid to put out on the roof every Saturday. This interview took place at Rachid's home while his wife and their two younger daughters laughed and joked:

*Rachid: Laundry, they carry them up to the roof and I hang them.*

*Ruth: How many times do you do laundry in a week?*

*Rachid (jokingly): Four or five times in one week.*

*Ruth: That's a lot, you have so many clothes!*

*Karima: He's lying! You do it every Saturday.*

*Rachid: I'm not going to hang them if you do laundry more than once in a week.*

*Karima: You have many clothes, that's why.*



Rachid jokingly stated that he does laundry four or five times a week when he really only did it once a week. There could have been several reasons for Rachid joking about doing laundry more often than he actually did, but his wife Karima corrected his statement. Rachid asserted that he would not hang the laundry more than once a week, even if Karima did laundry more than once a week. Although Rachid was joking, he was also putting boundaries around the care work that he was currently doing, announcing to everyone that he would not do *more* housework. While Rachid was caring for his family, he simultaneously resisted the idea that he should be the one hanging the clothes to dry by refusing to do any more laundry. Despite only being four years older than his wife, Rachid's (65 years old) ideas about appropriate care for his family clashed with his wife's and children's ideas about who should be doing reproductive labor. Though Rachid is representative of most of the older urban Moroccan men with whom I spoke, it is also important to note that that families vary widely. Younger and older urban Moroccan husbands had no complaints about doing laundry in some families, while in others, it was extremely rare for a husband to do laundry or any reproductive labor.

While older urban Moroccan men push back against doing reproductive labor, Moroccan women sometimes assert that men should be doing reproductive labor. Later in the interview, Rachid's daughter Madiha commented that, "Malak's husband goes into the kitchen. He changes diapers. He helps his wife in everything. This man [her father] is lazy. It is their mindset. The new generation [of men] helps, not like the old one." Madiha contrasted her father's generation's mindset to Malak's presumably younger husband "going into the kitchen." Comparing older (over 55) to younger (under 45) participants' interviews suggests that older participants enact a stricter division of care activities. For

most older participants, husbands should care for their family by paying for household expenses and wives should care for their family by performing reproductive labor. This stricter division of care activities also has a direct gendered impact on domestic spaces inside the home: the kitchen is women's space and men are not welcomed there. After Madiha's comment about generational differences, Rachid said:

*Rachid: Our kitchen fits only one person. She would kick me out of it if I try to help.*

*Ruth: Does she do that? [To Karima] Do you do that?*

*Karima (laughing): Yes!*

*Ruth: Why?!*

*Karima: I don't like being with him in the kitchen. I leave it when he comes in, our kitchen is very little for two people.*

Karima admitted herself that she is not comfortable with her and Rachid being in the kitchen, blaming it on the size of the kitchen. Their kitchen juts out of the main hallway in their apartment and is roughly seven feet (2.1 m) wide and four feet (1.2 m) deep. This is a small kitchen, but I saw Karima in the kitchen with Madiha or Khadija regularly during fieldwork. Being comfortable with her daughters in the kitchen with her, but not her husband, displays a gendered division of domestic spaces. Unlike Madiha's cousin Malak, who is much younger than Karima, Karima is not comfortable with her husband regularly "entering the kitchen." Due to this stricter division of domestic spaces for older participants, Rachid is unlikely to use convenience technologies located in the kitchen (i.e., mixer, pressure cooker, or oven), but has begrudgingly accepted hanging clothes

from the washing machine. Convenience technologies help Moroccan women by opening the “easy” task of laundry to men and children. However, men often reject the notion of doing other care work, reinforcing the idea that reproductive labor is mainly the responsibility of women.

### 6.6.3 Tajine versus the Pressure Cooker?

Urban Moroccan men agree to do laundry with washing machines because it is now an “easy” task. Inside the kitchen, the opposite happens. Urban Moroccan men will sometimes agree to cook more complicated and special meals specifically because they are not “easy.” One such special meal is a tajine, which is very popular and considered by many to be the Moroccan national dish (Dike 2012). A tajine is named after the triangular-shaped earthenware dish in which the ingredients (often some combination of vegetables and meat) are cooked over coals (see figure 3).



Figure 3: Tajine

Both the clay vessel and food dish are called tajine. In the past twenty years, cooking tajines in a clay vessel or in pressure cookers on a gas stove has become more common compared to cooking over a coal fire. Cooking in a pressure cooker can cut the cooking time in half or more. However, some Moroccans express nostalgia for the taste of tajine made over coals that has a smokier flavor (Dike 2012). During my research, I observed nearly all middle-class participants and friends using pressure cookers to cook tajines, most of the time. Cooking over coals is possible on a terrace or rooftop, which most urban Moroccans have access to, but does not happen regularly. Like washing machines, using a convenience technology (the pressure cooker) saves time but hurts women by devaluing their labor for not being the coal-fired, time-consuming tajine. The positive sense of care that frequently accompanies reproductive labor is diminished by using a pressure cooker.

In the following example Iman (49 years old), explains that her husband Abdelhafid occasionally cooks for the family because he has mastered cooking the tajine. He cooks in a clay tajine vessel over the gas stove, roughly once a week on the weekend.

*Ruth: Does your husband help you in the kitchen?*

*Iman: Yes.*

*Ruth: How so?*

*Iman: He cooks. He makes snacks to the kids if I'm not home. He makes the tajine. (laughing) That's it- he makes tea, coffee, tajine.*

*Ruth: When does he cook?*

*Iman: On the weekend, we ask him to make us a tajine because he masters it, or he makes fish sometimes, and I do the rest. I just ask him to make our food when I'm feeling tired.*

This one conversation is indicative of a larger trend in the data, namely that Moroccan women feel the responsibility to care for the family, by doing reproductive labor, most of the time. Iman feels that it is only appropriate to ask her husband Abdelhafid to care for the family by cooking when she is “feeling tired,” but not on a daily basis, and not including “the rest” of the meal.

Because daily cooking is strictly reproductive, it is a woman’s role, while ceremonial meals become a man’s role. Even within domestic spaces, Iman and Abdelhafid’s example shows that men are more likely to cook special, ceremonial meals (like fish or tajine on the weekend), while women cook utilitarian meals daily (Meah and Jackson 2013). This connects to Ortner’s (1997) argument that in many societies, women are associated with reproductive tasks and nature, whereas men are associated with the production of culture. While men are not always associated with ceremonial meals in Morocco (e.g., during Ramadan women cook), it shows the enduring nature of gender roles (Ortner 1997). The Moroccan women with whom I spoke are more likely to embrace effective time-saving convenience technologies to cook daily utilitarian meals than men.

This section analyzed how the addition of convenience technologies tends to devalue reproductive labor as an “easy” task, while simultaneously opening the door for men and children to do more reproductive labor. Some men push back on new expectations to do reproductive labor by putting limitations on what they are willing to

do, while others do not. Inside of the kitchen, when men do cook, it still reinforces their favored status in the household (Meah and Jackson 2013; Ortner 1997). Urban Moroccan women tend to use time-saving practical convenience technologies in the kitchen more often than men. Unlike in the U.S. where convenience technologies increase intensity and therefore stress for mothers (Campanelli 2003), an increase in demand on families' time (more paid labor, more extracurricular children's activities, etc.) more significantly contributed to feelings of stress among participants in Morocco. Ultimately, convenience technologies help urban middle-class Moroccan women some by making it more socially acceptable for men and children to do "easy" household tasks but simultaneously reinforce unequal gendered subjectivities. Similar to Baule women using western technologies in the factories that devalued women's labor (Etienne 1980), using pressure cookers and washing machines often devalues Moroccan women's labor. Convenience technologies hurt urban Moroccan women by contributing to the devaluing of reproductive labor and women's labor in comparison to men's labor.

#### 6.7 How do convenience technologies reinforce classed subjectivities?

This next section examines the ways that convenience technologies reinforce classed subjectivities in urban Morocco. Convenience technologies reinforce socioeconomic class because economic capital determines which classes are able to afford which convenience technologies, which in turn can uphold a household's reputation (Chibnik 2011). Additionally, the (dis)use of convenience technologies can have a physical impact on one's body with the impact on hands negatively correlating to socioeconomic class. Convenience technologies also reinforce urban Moroccan's identity of themselves as citizens of a developed nation in relation to the larger world.

### 6.7.1 Class, Capital, and Reputation

Access to convenience technologies is classed because they cost money and hold symbolic value (Bourdieu 1984). All households, except for two, regardless of class, have a semi-automatic or automatic washing machine because they became more affordable in the last ten years. The few participants (15%) who have a dishwasher are upper-middle and middle class. Even Rkia, who classified herself as “lower class,” has a semi-automatic washing machine. When Rkia and her husband Nouredine moved into an empty three-room apartment in 2015, Nouredine bought a refrigerator, an oven, living room (*salon*) furniture, and a washing machine on credit. Nouredine bought these convenience technologies as necessities for his family, despite not having the economic capital to buy with cash.

When asked to define what makes a Moroccan “middle class,” participants mentioned the importance of “having the necessities.” Across the dataset, participants defined middle-class “necessities” as private education, neolocal housing, food, money for private healthcare, and mobility (having a car and/or taking vacations inside of Morocco).<sup>27</sup> Participants included these main markers of distinction (Bourdieu 1984) but did not mention a household convenience technology like a washing machine. Convenience technologies can serve as an intermediary between the extremes of producing and processing all goods and services by hand (sometimes associated with lower classes) and consuming everything by buying all goods and services (usually associated with higher classes). Convenience technologies can enable the middle-classes

---

<sup>27</sup> As discussed in Chapter 4.

to produce clean clothes and food at home. Washing machines bridge the gap between producing your own clean clothes by hand or consuming this service by hiring someone else to do it.

Convenience technologies can also reinforce class by upholding the reputation of the household, to reproduces itself as an institution (Chibnik 2011). Being hospitable and generous toward guests is very important in Moroccan culture (Elliot 2020). Because it was Ramadan, Aziza (39 years old) and Hassan (60 years old) invited me over for *fṭūr*, or the meal breaking the fast, before the interview in their home. During *fṭūr*, we had mashed potato *brīwāt* (fried snacks), mini vegetable pizzas, *ḥarīra* (soup often served at Ramadan), a white cake with caramel, a chocolate coffee cake, two kinds of *shabākīa* (a fried Moroccan pastry), and three kinds of juice. Aziza used convenience technologies (the blender to make juices and the electric oven to cook cake) to show hospitality and maintain the reputation of her household.

Proudly displaying an expensive convenience technology might also uphold a household's reputation. Participants proudly display or hide convenience technologies for a variety of reasons. Based on my observations, the decision to display or put away small countertop convenience technologies is highly variable, with no clear patterns emerging. Participants could hide a convenience technology due to it being an older model or simply because they have limited counter space. This is a meaningful question because it could show further the symbolic significance of convenience technologies but no patterns about their display emerged in the data. Having convenience technologies and using them to uphold a household's reputation reinforces socioeconomic class in urban Morocco.



### 6.7.2 Using Your Hands

Convenience technologies also reinforce class by physically affecting the body. The amount that someone must use their hands when doing laundry roughly correlates to socioeconomic class in Morocco. The poorest classes cannot afford a washing machine and must hand-wash their own clothes with cold water and potentially the clothes of others as a household employee. The lower and lower-middle classes can afford to buy a “normal” (*‘ādī*) or semi-automatic washing machine that they still must manually add cold or warm water to, but the machine agitates (and sometimes spins) the clothes for them. The upper-middle and wealthiest classes rarely use their hands for manual labor and can afford to buy an automatic washing machine with cold and hot water running directly into the machine and/or pay someone else to do their laundry for them. Montgomery (2019, 160) finds that because the household employees that she spoke to have access to their employer’s convenience technologies, their hands are more “white and beautiful” compared to relatives living in the village.

One advertisement that came out during Ramadan in May 2018 (Mio 2018), stresses the importance of reproductive labor’s impact on hands. Mio is a brand for the Moroccan-based company Ama Detergents that sells washing machine detergents and other household cleaners. The video entitled “Every Hand has a Story,” begins with the proverb written in Moroccan Arabic, “Blessed be the hardworking hand.” In the video, six Moroccan men are asked to look at black and white photos of people’s hands and asked to whom these hands belong. The men speculate that the hands belong to people who work with their hands daily: farmers, household employees, plumbers, etc. (Mio 2018). Then, the men find out that the hands they are seeing belong to a female family

member who cares for them through reproductive labor: their sister, daughter, mother, or wife. After personal reflections, the women come out to show their hands in person to their shocked brother, father, son, or husband. Hamza (22 years old) kisses his sisters' hands and says to her, "I'm very sorry. I didn't know these were your hands. I absolutely must help your hands. It's shameful. These hands [pulling out his hands and shaking them up and down] should also be working hard" (Mio 2018). The advertisement concludes with the written words "One hand is not enough. But hand in hand, everything is easier" before a final picture of the Mio brand and "Let's help each other" in Moroccan Arabic. For the video on YouTube, Mio added French and English subtitles.

Mio has similar advertisements showing men doing housework, but this advertisement stresses the importance of the wives, sisters, daughters, and mothers who do reproductive labor and the impact of that labor on their hands. The Moroccan men in the video associate worn and cracked hands with "someone who works on the land, a plumber, a household employee, someone doing handiwork," distinctly lower-class professions. This advertisement demonstrates a rough correlation between those who work with their hands and being a part of a lower working class. Having a convenience technology like a washing machine can have a direct impact on someone's hands and signify class.

### 6.7.3 Living in a Developed Morocco

Convenience technologies can also reinforce Moroccans' perception of Morocco's "class-standing" in the world order in relation to other countries. Besides making laundry less hands-on, convenience technologies also acquire important symbolic significance in particular social contexts (Miller 2012). For urban Moroccans, the

presence of convenience technologies in the home represents modernity and “development.” In the following example, I asked lower-middle-class Aziza (39 years old) about changing Moroccan foodways and her son Ashraf (19 years old) and husband Hassan (60 years old) chimed in to comment.

*Ruth: How have Moroccan foods changed over time?*

*Aziza: Now it's different. People make cakes and juice. We didn't have juice before, we used to eat the fruit.*

*Ashraf: Didn't you have a blender?*

*Aziza: No, we didn't.*

*Ashraf: Are you talking about the year 1475?! When was there no blender?*

*Aziza: I'm talking about my generation. There wasn't a blender. On the street, you could get juice.*

*Hassan: We used to have juice. (Hassan to Aziza) Which generation are you talking about?*

*Aziza: She asked me to talk about the old generation, not now.*

*Hassan: Ah yes! Morocco has developed in the late years.*

*Aziza: Blenders existed but only a few people had them, only some people.*

*Ruth: Rich people?*

*Aziza, Right, rich people, not everyone. Now, a blender is given to anyone.*

*Anyone has a pressure cooker. Anyone has an oven. Everyone has everything. Not*

*“there is not.” Everything is available now.*

*Ruth: Did you have an oven when you were young?*

*Aziza: I just bought the electric oven a year ago.*

*Ruth: No, I mean at your parents' house.*

*Aziza; Ah! We had a traditional one.*

*Ruth: What about the pressure cooker?*

*Aziza: No, we had a clay pot, and a tajine of course.*

When blenders first appeared on the Moroccan market in the 1970s, not everyone could afford them. As the price went down, these convenience technologies became more affordable and available. Based on Aziza's assessment, convenience technologies like pressure cookers, blenders, and electric ovens used to be status markers for urban upper-class Moroccans (Bourdieu 1984). Today, because “everyone has everything,” owning these convenience technologies does not distinguish oneself from one's neighbors.

Despite not explicitly being markers of an upper- or middle-class lifestyle, these convenience technologies are still associated with “development” or modernity. Hassan symbolically associates more access to blenders with “development,” which is tied to modernity. In this way, wood/coal-burning stoves, clay pots, and tajines are associated with “tradition” and convenience technologies like blenders, pressure cookers, and electric ovens are associated with being part of a “developed” Morocco. Convenience

technologies support urban Moroccans' perceptions of themselves as citizens of a developed nation-state.

This section explored the ways that convenience technologies reinforce socioeconomic class in urban Morocco. Access to convenience technologies is mediated by access to economic capital and the convenience technologies hold symbolic value (Bourdieu 1984) that can maintain a household's reputation (Chibnik 2011). Convenience technologies can also have an embodied effect, which roughly correlate to socioeconomic class (i.e., soft or rough hands). Finally, convenience technologies also support urban Moroccans' perceptions of themselves as citizens of a developed nation-state within the world hierarchy.

#### 6.8 How do convenience foods challenge and reinforce gendered and classed subjectivities?

This section analyzes how convenience foods challenge and reinforce gendered and classed subjectivities, showing how gendered and classed subjectivities, especially in regards to food habits, co-constitute one another. With various free trade agreements since the 1980's, Moroccan foodways changed rapidly over the last thirty years (Newcomb 2013, 2017). Class relations challenge gendered subjectivities about appropriate ways to feed and care for one's husband and family. The decision to make fresh bread and pastries daily, weekly, occasionally, or never can be highly contested, especially intergenerationally.

### 6.8.1 Whole Foods to Processed Foods

Both the food available to Moroccans and what Moroccans consume has changed dramatically in the past thirty years, partly due to opening domestic markets to foreign products and changing sociocultural values (Newcomb 2017). It was more common for families to consume large traditional meals together in the home daily (like a tajine) twenty years ago, whereas, today, each family member often eats something different at different times, alone (Newcomb 2013). Large meals together are more often reserved for weekly couscous on Friday or the weekends due to work schedules and/or ceremonial events and holidays like Ramadan, baptisms, Eid's, and weddings. In addition to changing family meals, processed snack foods like chips and candy bars are widely available at local shops even in remote rural villages across Morocco. Although processed foods are frequently convenience foods, not all convenience foods are also processed (Warin et al. 2019): you can buy traditional pastries that someone else made by hand that conveniently save time and labor.

Inside the home, urban Moroccan women regularly buy bread and ready-made pastries from the street and hire a household employee (if they can afford it) to cook daily meals for the family. While a household employee increases convenience for the upper-middle class Moroccans who can afford to hire one, the working-class Moroccan women working as household employees and in bakeries or on the street making pastries, are inconvenienced by this physical labor, frequently at low wages for long hours. This is another way that the working-class are becoming the caring class (Schweid 2021). Quicker meals inside the home facilitate more time to work for pay, and relatedly, the consumption of products outside the home.

Processed foods are widely consumed in Morocco mainly as snack foods, especially by younger generations, but parents and other authority figures often disapprove of eating so much convenience food daily. While I was staying with Iman and Abdelhafid's family in July 2019, their eldest son, Mohammad (12) had an afternoon snack from the dairy snack shop (*mahlaba*) downstairs three out of five weekdays when his parents were at work. Iman and Abdelhafid employ a household employee, Alia, to come to the house five days a week to cook lunch, clean the house, and look after their three children (12, 9, 6). One day when Iman and Abdelhafid were not at home, Alia cooked a tajine of beef, carrots, and peas as well as a tomato and pepper salad, a beet salad, and watermelon for dessert. Due to it being summertime and having a late breakfast, we had a late lunch around three. During lunch, I noticed that Mohammad was only eating the tomato and pepper salad, but not the tajine or the cold cooked beet salad.

*Ruth: Why aren't you eating the tajine?*

*Mohammad: I don't like vegetables very much- I hate cooked vegetables but I will eat raw vegetables. I eat carrots but only if they aren't cooked.*

*Alia: He is naughty (basal) for not eating vegetables.*

Alia is caring for Iman and Abdelhafid's children by cooking a nutritious meal with vegetables and meat. However, Mohammad is rejecting this care due to his personal dislike for cooked vegetables. Alia is again caring for Mohammad by showing her disapproval of his actions, but ultimately cannot force him to eat the tajine. Later in the day, around 5:45 pm, Mohammad asked Alia to warm up some left-over spaghetti for him because he was hungry. In this case, Mohammad rejected the more nutritious and

Moroccan tajine of meat and vegetables that Alia made in favor of more processed, Western spaghetti with a thin tomato and oil sauce and a little bit of meat. Later in the afternoon, around 6:45 pm, Mohammad ate a packaged sweet yogurt (*riab*) with rose water syrup on top and a vanilla cake pastry layered with cream that he bought from the dairy snack shop downstairs. Alia disapproved of him eating these things and said, “*This is why he won’t eat my tajine, because he eats this junk.*” Alia is both asserting that the yogurt and cake that Mohammad is eating is unhealthy and that her tajine is healthier than what Mohammad chooses to eat. Mohammad is rejecting the care provided by Alia in favor of taking care of himself by buying yogurt and cake.

As the one cooking and cleaning during the day, Alia maintains a pseudo-maternal role in that she is expected to care for the children by feeding them healthy food and cleaning up after them. As a father, most male Moroccans are not expected to care for their children by preparing and feeding them healthy meals daily. In addition to the gendered aspects of this interaction, there is also a class dynamic. Although not directly verbalized, I felt that Alia additionally disapproved of Mohammad’s rejection of her food because she felt that he should just be thankful to have healthy, nutritious food with meat in it at home, instead of going outside to buy convenience foods. Many working-class Moroccans can only afford to consume meat once a week or less often, while Mohammad has access to it daily. Furthermore, when a young man buys or consumes food outside the home, some older generations might assume he does not have a mother or wife to take care of him at home. Younger Moroccans, especially children and younger adults (under 30), are more likely to prefer and consume processed foods within and outside the house compared to their parents and grandparents (Newcomb 2017). In this example, gendered



and classed subjectivities around food clash. Multiple layered gendered, classed, and generational ideas about what types of food (convenience, processed, outside, inside, etc.) constitute care exist simultaneously.

### 6.8.2 One vs. Two-income Households

The extent to which the wife participates in the paid workforce, and a household's classed subjectivity, often determines what gendered subjectivities and what types of convenience foods, are deemed appropriate forms of care in Morocco. Participants expected mothers who are not participating in the paid labor force (sometimes associated with working-class subjectivities and sometimes middle-class subjectivities) to have more time to bake, cook, clean, and take care of their children with no need to hire a household employee and less income to buy convenience foods. Implicitly, participants deemed mothers caring for children with convenience foods more acceptable if the mother participated in the paid workforce. These issues largely centered around family meals and whether or not bread and Moroccan pastries were cooked at home or not. Bread and pastries, in particular, are flashpoints because they are items consumed daily, viewed as a necessity and regularly scrutinized for quality.

#### 6.8.2.1 Bread

As in many Arabic-speaking nations (Naguib 2015), bread (*khubz*) is an important staple in the Moroccan diet. In Morocco, tajines are eaten with bread, a consumable utensil for meat and vegetables and vessel for sauce. In Morocco, bread is usually in disks about six to twelve inches (15-30 cm) wide in a number of varieties including white, wheat, oats, semolina, and nuts. Almost every Moroccan that I know consumes

bread every single day and most meals are incomplete without bread. However, average household consumption varies considerably: While Malika's (43) family of five eat ten to fourteen disks of bread a day, Naima's (43) family of six only consumes one to three disks of bread a day. Although homemade bread is generally considered superior, one can buy good-quality healthy bread from bakeries or women in the streets, but it is two to three times as expensive as the plain white bread (\$0.12) that one participant said tastes "*like plastic.*"

Although every participant has an oven at home in which they can cook bread, most participants buy bread most of the time from the local convenience store, bakery or street vendor. Of 53 Moroccan participants, only six women regularly make their own homemade bread weekly or daily and occasionally buy supplemental bread. The private schoolteacher Yahia (48) explains the situation in his house:

*Yahia: ...The only thing I can't make is the bread.*

*Ruth: It's hard, I'm not good at it either, does she (Amal) make bread?*

*Yahia: Yes.*

*Ruth: You don't buy bread?*

*Yahia: We do sometimes buy whole wheat bread, but homemade bread is so different.*

*Ruth: You buy bread most of the time.*

*Yahia: Yes. It [homemade bread] takes time, so we only have it on the weekend or holidays.*

Both Yahia and his wife Amal work full-time jobs at private high schools in Rabat and Salé, respectively, and they have three boys (10, 8, 3). Despite Yahia loving homemade bread, he is not able to bake, and his wife Amal is not able to bake regularly because she has little time after work. Instead, Yahia and Amal care for their family by buying bread from the convenience store (hanoot) at the basement of their apartment building and occasionally Amal bakes bread. In this way, convenience foods challenge gendered expectations for a wife to bake her husband homemade bread by providing a convenient (although not as tasty) alternative to homemade bread.

In Morocco, baking bread at home is usually unpaid (unlike professional male bakers Meah & Jackson 2013; Swenson 2009) and most often gendered female. When I asked if his father ever helped with housework, Omar (47) laughed, remembering a time when he was growing up: “*My mother was sick and father tried to make bread but he broke the dish (large clay shallow dish that one kneads the bread in).*” This example shows both Omar’s father’s willingness to help but also his lack of knowledge regarding baking. Most female participants remembered being taught how to bake bread and cook by their mothers while almost no male participants were taught how to bake or cook. Of the six women who regularly bake bread for their families, only two currently participate in the paid workforce, showing classed subjectivities. Due to cost, only middle-class participants have the ability to buy higher quality bread on a regular basis and lower-middle class participants either make their own homemade bread, which is less expensive but more time and labor intensive, or buy the least expensive white bread. Convenience foods like high-quality bread made by bakeries and other women reinforce classed subjectivities by ensuring that middle-class participants still had access to high-quality

bread, despite not having the time to prepare it. Inconvenient foods like high-quality bread made at home reinforced gendered subjectivities that the wife and mother (especially if they are not participating in the paid labor force) should be able to provide fresh homemade bread to adequately care for her family.

#### 6.8.2.2 Pastries

In addition to bread consumed with lunch and dinner, Moroccans also often have savory and sweet pastries (like harsha, milawi or ghiaf in Figure 4 below) with breakfast and tea time (kaskrot). Tea time varies significantly between households but usually consists of tea, savory pastries, cake, cookies and/or sweet pastries, cheese, olive oil, and olives with bread, often consumed between about five and eight pm.



Figure 4: Moroccan pastries

Pastries being sold for \$0.25 to \$0.40 in Tangier. Photo by M. Ruth Dike.

Some families combine tea time with dinner, especially if parents have work early in the morning or young children. Both breakfast and tea time often consist of a combination of

homemade or foods bought outside the home. Whereas twenty years ago it was considered strange (*a'eeb*) and even shameful (*hashūma*) for women to buy cookies or Moroccan pastries outside the home, it is now increasingly common and socially acceptable. Several participants also bought *chebakiya*, a sweet Moroccan pastry associated with Ramadan and other savory pastries, during the holy month of Ramadan. Moroccan women do the majority of preparation for Ramadan (Buitelaar 1993:28), often by making soup and pastries ahead of time. The urban middle-class Moroccans with whom I spoke also frequently bought pastries from bakeries and/or women selling them on the streets. In the following example, Iman (42) explains the difference in the availability and acceptability of buying pastries when she was growing up compared to today:

*Ruth: Did your mom make milawi [a Moroccan pastry] when you were young?*

*Iman: Yes, in those times you couldn't find Moroccan pastries (milawi and harsha) and everything on the streets the way you can today. It was very strange and shameful to buy anything from the streets- you would make everything in the house: milawi and harsha and all cakes and sweets. If you didn't make it at home, you didn't eat it.*

*Ruth: Even cookies and sweets for the holiday (Eid)?*

*Iman: Yes, you made everything at home. In the past fifteen to twenty years, you can now buy things from outside and it isn't weird.*

Iman's experiences show how foodways and living arrangements have dramatically changed in Morocco over her lifetime, largely due to more women entering the workforce

(Alpert 2007). While older generations may still find it weird or shameful for a woman to buy Moroccan pastries from another woman on the streets, many participants feel that it is fairly normal to buy pastries from vendors on the street. Often women work in the doorway of snack shops, making fresh pastries in the morning for breakfast and during tea time, which people passing by can buy plain, with honey, cheese, Nutella, etc. and tea on the side. Urban middle-class Moroccan men and women with whom I spoke also often bought several pastries for their family from a woman and brought them home, heated them up, and then ate them as a family at home. According to participants, these women selling pastries on the street were not common 15 to 20 years ago, but they are extremely common today.

Although it is more socially acceptable for women to buy pastries than it was 20 years ago, pastries made by a stranger are not always considered an appropriate form of care for the family. In the next excerpt, working-class Rkia (29), who does not participate in the paid labor force, explains when she first started buying semolina savory cake (*harsha*) and when she feels it is acceptable to buy it:

*Ruth: Do you eat outside sometimes? Or buy some food like harsha or milawi?*

*Rkia: Yes, we buy food, but not always, only when I'm feeling lazy to make snacks I ask him [her husband] to get some harsha.*

*Ruth: When do you buy food?*

*Rkia: I started buying it after I got pregnant, we buy it when I'm feeling sick, but I usually like to make it at home because my husband loves freshly cooked food.*

Rkia's statement implies that based on her gendered subjectivity, she *should* be making fresh *harsha* for her family but, if she is feeling lazy, she asks her husband to buy it. Rkia feels that she has a responsibility to make *harsha* for her husband and family because her husband "loves freshly cooked food." Her husband's preferences are placed above Rkia's or her children's preferences, potentially because he is the breadwinner. Rkia does not currently participate in the paid workforce and probably also feels added pressure to provide "freshly cooked food" for her husband and three children compared to working women. Although *harsha* is not a processed food, there is still some guilt associated with buying convenience foods instead of making *harsha* at home from scratch, especially for a homemaker. Rkia might also feel added guilt because money is already tight for the family, so the added cost of buying *harsha* instead of making it, could negatively affect the family budget. Many participants felt that buying convenience foods like Moroccan pastries from women selling them on the street is a perfectly acceptable way to care for their family, but Rkia's gender and class made it less acceptable for her to ask her husband to buy pastries. These examples show how convenience foods largely reinforce and challenge gendered and class subjectivities.

## 6.9 Conclusion

This chapter analyzes how convenience technology and convenience foods challenges and reinforces gendered and classed subjectivities for urban Moroccans. Viewing reproductive labor through the lens of care work gives meaning to reproductive labor by asking when reproductive labor constitutes care and how is it valued within a specific context. Convenience technologies sometimes save time and labor. However, the experiences of "convenience" are highly subjective and experienced differently by

different people, often due to gender and class. Convenience technologies help urban Moroccan women by enabling men and children to do the “easy” task of laundry. However, convenience technologies also hurt urban Moroccan women by encouraging the persistent devaluing of reproductive labor in the household and women’s labor in relation to men’s labor in the kitchen (Meah and Jackson 2013; Ortner 1997). In this context, reproductive labor is devalued and dismissed because it is engulfed under care work and gender norms. Convenience technologies reinforce socioeconomic class because they require economic capital to purchase and can support the reputation of a household. Convenience technologies symbolically reinforce Moroccans’ perceptions of their standing in the world as citizens of a developed nation-state. Although convenience technologies may be purchased in part to support the reputation of a household, they also have the power to redefine women’s position within the household. In urban Morocco, acquiring cultural capital does not only affect social mobility but can also reshape meanings of care and gender within a household.

The second section of the chapter analyzed the way that gendered and classed subjectivities co-constitute one another especially in regard to convenience foods. Specifically, if a mother participates in the paid workforce full-time, she often has different gendered subjectivities and experiences different gendered expectations of care regarding feeding her family. Urban working-class and middle-class women reinforce these gendered subjectivities by saying that it is only acceptable to buy convenience foods when “I am feeling lazy,” implying that she should normally make everything from scratch. In contrast, I found that urban Moroccan middle-class women who participate full-time in the paid work force experience slightly less shame regarding feeding their



family convenience foods but still feel that in an ideal world, homemade food would be cooked daily by the mother. The examples explained capture the ways in which buying and consuming convenience foods is classed, but also holds significant meaning for gendered subjectivities.

## 7.1 Introduction

More women working outside the home in formal paid labor positions is having a profound impact on Moroccan gender roles and the distribution of reproductive labor in the home. Although women still do the majority of reproductive labor, men are doing a significant portion, especially in middle-class and newlywed families. Many women decide to leave the workforce when they have children in order to take care of their children while their husbands keep working. While retirement is seen as a positive time in life for most Moroccan females that I talked with, retirement is a time when my male participants lost a sense of purpose in their lives. All of the urban middle-class Moroccan participants with whom I spoke felt intense pressure to have their own house, car, and to send their children to private schools in order to provide a better life for their children than when they were growing up. However, to do so many Moroccans use loans which is considered forbidden (haram) by many Islamic scholars and living this new life may result in a new generation out of touch with Moroccan Islamic and family values. It is becoming more socially acceptable, especially among my 30-40-year old middle-class male participants to actively participate in raising their children, as a way of expressing their masculinity, whereas their father's generation would not actively take care of their children. Young Moroccans are unlike their older generation who made bread daily, fed animals on the farm, cooked everything from scratch, cleaned the entire house, raised their children and usually made rugs or did embroidery for extra money for the family. This dissertation uses reproductive labor as a lens to analyze how gendered and classed

subjectivities are continuously created, practiced and subtly transformed within and outside of the household for urban middle-class Moroccan households.

In this chapter, I will conclude how I have used reproductive labor as a lens to examine how gendered and classed subjectivities are continuously created, performed and subtly transformed within and outside of the household for urban middle-class Moroccan households. Specifically, I will examine the main findings of my dissertation and the need for further research. I will then discuss possible policy recommendations for the Moroccan government to implement in order to support urban Moroccan middle classes. Finally, I will discuss why this dissertation matters broadly.

## 7.2 Main Findings

This dissertation has a number of main findings that contribute to anthropological literature and theory. I found that reproductive labor and gendered subjectivities largely co-constitute one another. Within the urban Moroccan context, I found that the structures influencing the distribution of reproductive labor include economics and labor, religion, family structure, children and childcare, and education and class, matching most current literature on reproductive labor. However, no literature on reproductive labor examines the way that religion, specifically differing interpretations of Islam, influence the distribution of reproductive labor.

My research found that urban middle-class Moroccan men are doing slightly more reproductive labor than their father's generation. Urban middle-class Moroccan men actively practice domesticity by shopping for food, being active fathers, cooking and cleaning occasionally, in contrast to Egyptian men (Ghannam 2013; Naguib 2018) who

are generally only breadwinners in relation to the household. This is important because it means that urban middle-class younger Moroccan women are doing slightly less reproductive labor than their mothers. However, the addition of full-time paid work likely means that many urban middle-class Moroccans are doing more paid and unpaid labor than their mothers, especially if their mother did not participate in the paid workforce full-time regularly. Although these findings regarding Moroccan masculinity are slightly optimistic, it is still important to note the uneven distribution of reproductive labor between spouses who both participate in the paid workforce.

While a number of studies examine the influence of globalization on local processes and household consumption patterns (Donner 2008; Jaffrelot & Veer 2008; Mcewan et al 2015; O'Dougherty 2002; Aaftaab 2013, my research examines the influence of local middle-class subjectivities on larger Moroccan and subsequently worldwide economic markets. This shows that globalization does not wholly determine the path of local societies but that local ideas and values also have the power to influence market and globalization processes. I examined the material, affective, and symbolic dimensions of classed subjectivities for the urban middle-class Moroccans with whom I spoke.

Additionally, many of the urban middle-class younger couples with whom I spoke tend to distinguish themselves from their parents and working-classes. They argue that their marriages are different because they chose their spouse, have a neolocal nuclear family household, are open to the world and public consumption, share responsibilities and communicate more often with one another. This aligns well with most characteristics of companionate marriages (Hirsch & Wardlow 2006), but differs in that social and kin

relations remain extremely important and couples do not value talk of “love” over actions. Additionally, working and middle-class participants critiqued some new urban middle-class marriages for caring too much about money and not enough about family and love.

Convenience technologies reinforce classed subjectivities and Moroccan social standings while simultaneously redefine women’s position within the household. Convenience foods also reinforce certain gendered and classed subjectivities by allowing the urban middle-class Moroccan women with whom I spoke to buy ready-made bread and pastries without having to process, bake, and make it themselves. However, even while convenience foods save time, there is a lingering sense that homemade tajines or msemin would be a better way to care for the family. Working-class urban Moroccans with whom I spoke that do not participate in the paid workforce said that convenience foods were only appropriate when they were feeling “lazy.” This illustrates that gendered subjectivities are different based on social class within the same urban context. Throughout the dissertation, my findings show the tensions surrounding what constitutes appropriate forms of marriage, love, middle-classness, masculinity, fatherhood, motherhood, and femininity.

### 7.3 Need for Further Research

In order to more fully understand the ways that gendered and classed subjectivities are created, performed and subtly transformed in Moroccan society, a more representative study of the country would need to be conducted. Specifically, many of my younger urban middle-class participants make conclusions about differences between

themselves and working-class and/or older generations, but I have relatively little data to back up such claims. By conducting extensive ethnographic research with a wider variety of older and working-class Moroccans, the findings could be more fully representative of larger parts of Moroccan society, and not just the mostly younger, urban, middle-class Moroccans with whom I spoke.

Importantly, I also never spoke to Moroccans living in more rural regions of the country. By including further research on the gendered and classed subjectivities of both urban and rural Moroccans across different regions of the country, this research would be strengthened. This is especially intriguing because most rural Moroccan women routinely participate in unsalaried agricultural activities outside of the house, and have done so for a very long time, in addition to reproductive labor (Crawford 2008). A study comparing gendered and classed subjectivities around reproductive labor in urban and rural Morocco would be able to compare the importance of paid labor compared to crucial, but unsalaried agricultural labor.

Additionally, this study could be strengthened by a comparison to other countries within the MENA region, Muslim world, and to other middle-class populations in the Global South. This comparative analysis would be able to expand upon what is unique to Morocco, as a developing Muslim country in North Africa, compared to other countries in the MENA region, Muslim world, or the Global South.

#### 7.4 Policy Recommendations

I will now discuss the ways in which the Moroccan government could better support urban Moroccan middle-classes. The problem that these policy recommendations

would attempt to alleviate is that Moroccan middle-classes feel that they do not have enough money and/or time to always adequately provide a good life for their children. In order to assuage this problem, the Moroccan government should more heavily tax upper-class Moroccans and foreign companies operating within the country in order to better provide social welfare programs for middle- and working-class citizens. Although the idea of taxing Moroccan upper-classes and foreign companies more would likely be extremely unpopular within the centralized Moroccan government (*makhzn*) and is therefore unlikely to happen, I believe that it would be necessary in order for the Moroccan government to better provide for its citizens. Taxing foreign companies also presents a problem with the World Bank and International Monetary Fund (IMF) because most loans to the Moroccan government are contingent upon opening up and liberalizing the Moroccan economy at the expenses of welfare programs and taxing imports and foreign companies. In an ideal world, the World Bank and IMF would not impose such stipulations unevenly on “developing” nations, which tends to reinforce neocolonial power structures. By being able to access loans without imposing structural adjustment programs, the Moroccan government would be able to afford to have a large number of well-paying, secure government jobs with pensions.

With the money raised from taxing the Moroccan upper-classes and foreign companies more, the government could provide better public education for all, better public healthcare and provide incentives for quality home ownership. Within better education, the Moroccan government should provide top-quality government-sponsored nurseries and preschools for all Moroccan children that the public can trust. By providing excellent-quality and free childcare to all Moroccans regardless of class background,

urban middle-class Moroccans participating in the paid workforce do not have to worry about being able to afford a household employee, paid private school or asking a family member to care for their young child or children.

After preschool, providing free, quality primary, secondary and post-secondary schooling is also crucial to the success of Moroccan citizens. Additionally, the government should re-structure public schools to run from 8 am to 3 pm, similar to the private school schedule, instead of including a 2-hour break in the middle for lunch that requires a family member to feed the child at home. By changing the timing of public schools, Moroccan mothers and fathers could choose whether or not they wanted to participate in the paid work force full-time and not have to worry about securing someone to feed their child lunch. In response to the globalized job market, the Moroccan public education system should more adequately prepare Moroccan students by providing better instruction of various subjects in French and English. By overhauling the Moroccan education system, rural, urban, poor and rich Moroccans would all have the ability to choose a preferred profession that would provide for their family. Additionally, if the quality of public nurseries, preschool, primary, secondary and postsecondary education was better, middle-class Moroccans would not feel the need to spend vast amounts of money on private schooling in order to secure a positive future for their children.

In addition to a better public education system, the Moroccan government also desperately needs to invest in the public healthcare system. This begins by training more Moroccans to become quality doctors, paying them adequately, and greatly expanding the number of public hospitals and clinics available. The COVID-19 pandemic has only increased the urgency of creating a better public healthcare system. If the quality of



public healthcare was better and Moroccans were able to access healthcare in a timely manner, they would not need to spend large amounts of money on the private healthcare industry and would therefore be better able to provide a good life for their family.

The Moroccan government should also create programs to make quality home-ownership more attainable and affordable to more Moroccans. By aiding Moroccans with buying a home, the government could decrease the number of Moroccans who need bank credit to be able to afford to build or buy a home. As my research has demonstrated, many urban middle-class Moroccans feel the nuclear neolocal home ownership is important to their identity as middle-class citizens.

#### 7.5 What can be learned from this dissertation?

The biggest take-away from this dissertation is that in an ideal society, men and women would both have the freedom to choose whether or not to participate in the paid work force, without worrying about having enough money to have a good life for themselves and/or their children. However, the reality of the lives of most urban middle-class Moroccans with whom I spoke dictates both husband and wife participate in the paid labor force full-time. Because more urban middle-class women are participating in the paid labor force full-time (Alpert 2007), gendered and classed subjectivities in Morocco are subtly changing.

Specifically, younger urban middle-class husbands are defining masculinity in relation to reproductive labor and especially in being a more participatory father to their children compared to their own experience with their own father. Why is this happening in such a short period of time over one generation? Based on Chapter 2's structures

influencing reproductive labor, I argue that the rise in more Moroccan women participating full-time in the workforce, religious justifications regarding the Prophet Mohammad doing reproductive labor becoming more popular, more neolocal nuclear household residence, increased access to education and a higher socioeconomic class are all associated with a more equitable distribution of reproductive labor. However, correlation does not equal causation. This slight change in younger urban middle-class masculinities, that differs from the Egyptian working-class context (Ghannam 2013; Naguib 2018), is likely due to the conflation of each of these forces working together in addition to individual agency changing everyday practices.

I argue that the intersection of occupation, social class and education are crucial for slightly changing gendered subjectivities because middle-class men with white-collar office jobs actually have the energy to do reproductive labor when they get home after work, instead of being exhausted from manual labor associated with working class occupations. The proliferation of television, radio and internet culture from around the world is also undoubtedly influencing urban middle-class Moroccans in the range of possible masculinities available to them. Because urban younger middle-class Moroccans had the ability and desire to change what it means to be a good husband and father, they have transformed daily practices within Moroccan society in a small subtle way. It is important to not overstate the magnitude of this change, especially given that I only spoke with 34 Moroccan households and that not all of them fully demonstrated this new form of urban middle-class Moroccan masculinity. Some participants, despite being younger than 50 years old, urban and middle-class did not perform their masculinity and “do” domesticity in a way that was significantly different from their father’s generation.

Moroccan women still do the majority of reproductive labor, just as women do disproportionately more reproductive labor compared to men in my own marriage and throughout the world (Hollows 2003:230; Swenson 2009:47; Kan et al. 2011; Gutmann 1999:167; Fuwa 2004). However, the majority of younger middle-class urban Moroccan men did enact being a good husband and a good father in a different way compared to their father's generation.

In addition to new forms of masculinities, urban middle-class Moroccan marriages are more likely to be defined in a way that aligns with many ideals of companionate marriage (Hirsch & Wardlow 2006), but still maintain the importance of kin relations in addition to the couple's marriage. Convenience technologies are reshaping women's role in the home in addition to reinforcing classed subjectivities. Additionally, convenience foods are simultaneously challenging and reinforcing different gendered and classed subjectivities in urban Morocco. The household emerges as a key location where gendered and classed subjectivities are created, performed and negotiated. From this dissertation, scholars can learn that societal change tends to happen in small, subtle ways through everyday practices due to our ideas about the world actively influencing the way we create and transform the world we live in (de Certeau 1984; Merleau-Ponty 1962; Jackson 1996). This recognizes the dialectical relationship between social structures influencing and structuring our relationship to the world and human agency actively changing that world (O'Dougherty 2002). This dissertation uses reproductive labor as a way to examine the ways that gendered and classed subjectivities are continuously created, performed and subtly transformed within and outside of the household for urban middle-class Moroccans.

## APPENDICES

## APPENDIX A. VERSION 1 INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

1. What is your name?
2. What is your age?
3. Where are you from? Where did you grow up? Where were you born? If no Rabat, what brought you to Rabat?
4. When did you end your schooling? How old were you when you stopped your studies?
5. Tell me about your childhood. What did your father and mother do/where did they work?
  - a. Did your mother work outside the house?
  - b. Did your father work for the government or have another job?
6. When you were with your parents, who did the housework most of the time?
  - a. Did your dad help a little? How so? When?
7. When you were young, did you help with housework sometimes? How so? How many times a week?
  - a. What did your parents want you to do in the house? Your sisters/brothers?
  - b. Was there a different because your sisters and brothers?
8. Now, who lives in your house with you? /Who is with you in the house?
9. Where do you work? What is your work?
10. How did you choose this work? Why?
11. How did you find this work? How did you get this job?
12. Tell me about your work. How do you like your job?
13. How long have you worked at this job?
14. How many hours a day do you work? How many days do you work in a week?
15. Is the money you make enough? How do you complete the month?
16. Who pays for household expenses?
17. Are you happy with your work?
18. What do you like about your work?
19. What do you not like about your work? What is missing from your work day to make it better? If you wanted to change something, what might you do?
20. Tell me about your husband/wife please.
21. When did they stop their studies?
22. Where do they work? When did they find this work?
23. Tell me about their work. Is this good work? Important work? Does their work take up a lot of time?
24. Tell me about your responsibilities in the house.
25. Tell me about a normal day for you- what do you do in the morning? In the afternoon? At night?
26. In a typical day, which thing makes you happy/laugh? Which time of the day are you happy? What is a little hard for you during the day?

27. Do this change during the week? During the weekend? During the month? During the year? Is there a different with time when it is Ramadan? Eid Kbr?
28. Tell me about a time last week when it was hard to do everything or when you were happy and did everything.
29. Does your husband/wife help you in the kitchen? With cleaning? With taking care of the children? How do you feel about this?
30. Where do you shop? Who goes shopping most of the time? In a week, how many times do you go? Tell me about shopping, what do you buy?
31. Who cooks at home most of the time? Does this change/Do you do an exchange? When does someone else cook?
32. Who washes the dishes most of the time? Does this change from time to time?
33. Do you eat outside sometimes? How many times in a week and with whom?
34. If you want your house to be clean, what must you do in detail? What is the meaning of a "clean house" in your opinion.
35. Who does the housework most of the time? When does this change?
36. Who cleans your clothes most of the time? Does this person change? Do you have someone to wash your clothes from time to time? When does she clean your clothes?
37. Who takes care of the children most of the time? What do you do with children? When does this change?
38. If you have a girl or a boy, what are the sons responsibilities in the house? The daughters?
39. Have you thought that you need someone to help you in the house with cleaning, cooking and the children before? How did you decide yes or no?  
     Did your parents have a maid when you were small?  
     Do your friends have maids or not?
40. Tell me about your responsibilities in marriage. And the responsibilities of your husband/wife. Do you have a more traditional or modern marriage? Do you live your marriage life more traditionally or modernly?
41. Is there a difference between your marriage and your parents' marriage? How so? Is there is a different in married life between your friends' marriage and yours?
42. Tell me about the responsibilities of a man in Moroccan society and in the house. What is the most important role/~~Is there a different between reality and the thing that you wish?~~
43. Ideally, how do you think the housework should be divided?
44. Is there a problem if the wife makes more than the husband?
45. Do you want your girl to work outside the house (like you/your work)?  
     If yes, Which job do you want her to do in the future?
46. 5 years from now- how do you want your life to be?
47. Which programs/series on tv or radio do you like to watch/listen to?
48. What are the roles for women and men in the house on these shows? Are these good roles or not?
49. Do you have a car? Is there someone you know that has a car you can use?
50. Do you live in a house or an apartment? Renting or owning?
51. Do you have a tv? Fridge? Freezer? Washing machine? Is it automatic? Dryer? Microwave? AC? Dishwasher? Oven? Is it big or small?

52. What is the meaning of middle class? Are you inside it? What are the things someone must do to be in the middle class?  
 53. Is there anything else you would like to add?

- 1 . شنو سميتك؟ اش سماك الله؟
- 2 . شحال فعمرك؟
- 3 . منين انت؟ فين كبرت؟ فين تزايدت؟ شنو جابك للرباط؟
- 4 . فين حبستي لقرابا ديالك؟ شحال فعمرك ملي حبستي لقرابا؟
- 5 . حضري على صغر ديالك \ مرحلة الطفولة . / تكلمي ملي كنت صغيرة (ة) عفاك . شنو الوالدين ديالك كانو كيديروا فين كيخدمو؟
- واش الواليدة ديالك كانت خدامة برا ديال دار؟
- واش الوليد ديالك كان موظف ولا خدام شي حاجة خرا؟
- 6 . ملي كنت مع الوالديك شكون كان كيدير شغل ديال دار لاكتريية د وقت؟
- واش لوليد ديالك كيعاون شيوه؟ كيفاش؟ امنا فوقاش؟
- 7 . ملي كنت صغيرة (ة) واش انت عاونتي فشغل ديال دار مرة مرة؟ كيفاش؟ شحال مرة فسيمانة؟
- شني الوالدين ديالك بغاو انت تديري فدار؟ و خوات اخوت؟
- واش كان فرق بين اخواتك و خوتك؟
- 8 . دابة، شكون سكن ف دار معك؟ \ شكون معاك فدار؟
- 9 . فين كتخدمي؟ \ شنو خدمتك؟
- 1 0 . كيفاش ختاريتي هاد خدمة؟ وعلاش؟
- 1 1 . كيفاش لقيتي هاد خدمة؟ كيفاش حصلتني على هاد الخدمة؟
- 1 2 . تكلمي لي على خدمتك. كيف كاتجيك هاد خدمة؟
- 1 3 . شحال من وقت انت ف هاد الخدمة؟
- 1 4 . شحال من ساعة كتخدمي فنها؟ شحال من نهار كتخدمي ف سمانه؟
- 1 5 . واش فلوس لي كتربحي من هاد خدمة كافيك\كيفدوك\كافين؟
- كيفاق كتكلمي الشهر؟
- 1 6 . شكون كيصرف على دار؟
- 1 7 . واش انت فرحان(ة) بهاد الخدمة؟
- 1 8 . شنو الي كيغيبك فخدمتك؟
- 1 9 . شنو الي ماكيغيبكش فخدمتك؟ شنو الي ناقصك فهاد الخدمة باش تكون اتولي حسن؟ إلا بغيتي تبدلي، شنو يمكن ديري؟
- 2 0 . تكلمي على رجلك\مراتك عفاك.
- 2 1 . فين رجلك\مراتك حبس \ حبسات لقرابا دياله\ها
- 2 2 . فين رجلك\مراتك كيخدم؟ امنا هو لقي \هي لقات هاد خدمة؟
- 2 3 . تهضري على هاد خدمة دياله\ها . واش هاد خدمة مزيانة؟ مهيمه؟ واش كندوز فيها بزف ديال وقت؟
- 2 4 . تكلمي على مسؤولية ديالك ف دار.
- 2 5 . تكلمي على نهار عادي ديالك – شنو كتديري فصبح؟ ف لعيشة؟ ف الليل؟
- 2 6 . شي نهار، اشمن حاجة كنتشطك\كتضحك؟ اشمن وقت فنها انت كتكوني فرحانة؟ و شنو كيكون صعب عليك شوية فنها؟

- 2 7 . واش هاد شي كيتبدل فسيمانة؟ ف لويكند؟ ف شهر؟ ف عام؟ مع لوقت فاش كان رفق ملي كيكون رمضان؟ عيد كبر؟
- 2 8 . ممكن تعطيني مثل من سيمانة لي فاتة كان صعيب عليك تديرني كلشي ولا كنتي فرحان(ة) و انت كتديرني كلشي.
- 2 9 . واش راجلك\مراتك كيعاونك فكوزينة؟ فجفاف؟ تهمل فدراري؟ شنو هو لاحساس ديالك؟
- 3 0 . منين انت كنتدي\كنتقادي؟ شكون كيمشي يتقدي لالكترية د وقت؟ فسيمانة شحال من مرة كتمشي؟  
تكلمي على يهار ديال تقديّة \ ديالك \ لقة
- 3 1 . شكون كيطيب ف دار الاكترية د وقت؟  
واش هاد شي كيتبدل؟ \ واش كتديرو نوبة؟  
فوقاش شي واحد اخر كيطيب؟
- 3 2 . شكون كيغسل لواني الاكترية د وقت؟ واش هاد شي كيتبدل مرة مرة؟
- 3 3 . واش انت كتكولي على برا مرة مرة؟ شحال من مرة فسيمانة و مع من؟
- 3 4 . إلا بغيتي تكون دارك نقيه، شنو خصك تديرني بالضبط؟ شنو معنى ديال "دار نقيه" بنسبة ليك؟
- 3 5 . شكون لي كيدير شغل ديال دار الاكترية دوقت؟ فوقاش هاد شي كيتبدل؟
- 3 6 . شكون كيسين خوايج ديالك الاكترية دوقت؟ واش كان هاد شي واحد تبدل؟ عندك شي واحد كيسين خوايج ديالك مرة مرة؟ فوقاش هي كتسبن خوايج ديالك؟
- 3 7 . شكون كيهتم بدراري الاكترية د وقت؟ شنو كيدير مع دراري؟ فوقاش هاد شي كيتبدل؟
- 3 8 . إلا عندك ولاد ولا بنت.....شنو مسؤولية فدار ديال لولاد؟ ديال لنيات؟
- 3 9 . واش كتظني خصك شي واحد يعاونك فدار مع شغل و طياب و دراري؟ كيفاش كتقرر ويا ولا لا؟  
الوالدين ديالك واش كانت عندهم خدامة ملي كنت صغير(ة)؟  
واش صحابك عندهم خدامة ولا لا؟
- 4 0 . تكلمي على مسؤولية ديالك ف زواج. و مسؤولية ديال راجلك\مراتك ف زواج. واش انت تزوجت لطريقة تقليدي ولا عصري؟ \ واش فحياتك زوجية عايش عيشة تقليدية ولا عصرية؟
- 4 1 . واش كان فرق بين زواج ديالك و ديال والدين؟ كيفاش؟  
واش كان فرق بين حياة زواجك و بين زواج ديال صحابك؟ كيفاش؟
- 4 2 . هضري على دون ديال راجل ي ديال مرا ف مجتمع مغربي و ف دار. شنو دور لمهم\لاساسي ديال راجل و مرا ج دار؟  
واش كان فرق مابين حقيقة\الواقع و د شي لي كتناي؟  
واش كتبغي راجلك\مراتك تعاونك كتر؟
- 4 3 . كيفاش كتظني شغل ديال مرا ف دار كتنتر على حياة المثالية؟  
واش هاد لثالية هي ملي كنقسمو شغل ديال دار مابين مرا و رجل ولا غير مراة؟  
واش ملي كنقسمو شغل ديال دار مابين مرا و رجل واش هادك حياة مثالية؟
- 4 4 . واش كابين مشكيل إلا لمرا كتخلص كتر من راجلها؟
- 4 5 . إلا عندك بنت، واش بغيتيها تخدم على برا (بحال انت \ مراتك)؟  
اشمن خدمة بغيتيها تدير في المستقبل؟
- 4 6 . من هنا خمس سنين – كيفاش بغيتي تكون حياتك؟
- 4 7 . اشمن برنامج ولا مساسل في تلفازة و راديو لي كيعجيك تشوف ولا تسمع؟
- 4 8 . شنو دور ديال رجل و مرا في دار في هاد مساسلات؟ واش هاد دور مزيان ولا لا؟
- 4 9 . واش عندك طوموبيل؟ واش كابين\كتعرف شي واحد عنده طوموبيل يمكن تستعملها؟
- 5 0 . واش كتسكني ف دار ولا شي برطامنت؟ واش شريتي هاد دار ولا كريها؟
- 5 1 . واش عندك تلفازة؟ تلاجة؟ فريزر؟ ماكينة ديال سبن؟ وطوماتيك ولا؟ نشافة؟ ميكروند؟  
كليماتازر؟ ماكينة ديال لواني؟ فران؟ كبر ولا صغير؟
- 5 2 . شنو معنى ديال طبقة متوسطة؟  
واش انت فيها؟



3 5 . واش كاين شي حاجة اللي يمكن تفيديني بها؟  
شنو لخوايج لي كيدير سي واحد ف طبقة متوسطة؟

## APPENDIX B. VERSION 2 INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

1. What is your name?
2. What is your age?
3. Which social class is your family in? In Moroccan society, there are a lot of social classes, and you are in which? Where do you see yourself? What social class would you say you're in now?
4. Where are you from? Where did you grow up? If no Rabat, what brought you to Rabat?
5. When did you end your schooling? How old were you when you stopped your studies?
6. How did you meet your spouse? How did you all meet? How do you know your spouse?
7. How many years have you all been married for? How long has it been that you all have been married?
8. Do you have a car? Is there someone you know that has a car you can borrow? Can you ask him to borrow it without a problem?
9. Do you live in a house or an apartment? Renting or owning?
10. Do you have wifi in the house?
11. Do you have a tv? Fridge? Freezer? Washing machine? Is it automatic? Dryer? Microwave? AC? Dishwasher? Oven? Is it big or small?
12. Tell me about your childhood. What did your father and mother do/where did they work?
13. When you were with your parents, who did the housework most of the time?
  - a. Did your dad help a little? How so? When?
14. When you were young, did you help with housework sometimes? How so? How many times a week?
  - a. Was there a different because your sisters and brothers?
15. Now, who lives in your house with you? /Who is with you in the house?
16. Where do you work? / What is your work?
17. How did you find this job? How do you like your job?
18. Is the money you make enough? How do you complete the month?
19. Who pays for household expenses?
20. Tell me about your husband/wife please.
21. When did they stop their studies?
22. Where do they work? How did they find this work?
23. Tell me about your responsibilities in the house.
24. Tell me about a normal day for you- what do you do in the morning? In the afternoon? At night?
25. Does your husband/wife help you in the kitchen? With cleaning? With taking care of the children? How do you feel about this?

26. Where do you shop? Who goes shopping most of the time? In a week, how many times do you go? Tell me about shopping, what do you buy?
27. Who cooks at home most of the time? Does this change/Do you do an exchange? When does someone else cook?
28. Who washes the dishes most of the time? Does this change from time to time?
29. Do you eat outside sometimes? How many times in a week and with whom?
30. Who does the housework/cleaning most of the time? When does this change?
31. Who cleans your clothes most of the time? When does this change?
32. Who takes care of the children most of the time? What do you do with the children? When does this change?
  
33. If you have a girl or a boy, what are the sons' responsibilities in the house? The daughters?
34. Have you thought that you need someone to help you in the house with cleaning, cooking and the children before? How did you decide yes or no?
  - a. Did your parents have a maid when you were small?
  - b. Do your friends have maids or not?
35. Tell me about your responsibilities in married life. And the responsibilities of your husband/wife.
36. Do you have a more traditional or modern marriage? / Do you live your married life more traditionally or modernly?
37. Is there a difference between your marriage and your parents' marriage? How so? Is there is a difference in married life between your friends' marriage and yours?
  
38. Which programs/series on tv or radio do you like to watch/listen to?
39. What are the roles for women and men in the house on these shows? Are these good roles or not?
  
40. What is the meaning of middle class? Are you inside it? What are the things someone must do to be in the middle class?
  
41. Is there anything else you would like to add? / Is there anything else you think I should know?

1 . شنو سميتك؟ اش سماك الله؟

2 . شحال فعمرك؟

3 . العائلة ديالك لاشمن طبقة كتنتمي؟ \ فالمجتمع المغربي كاين بزاف ديال طبقات و انت فاي طبقة؟ \

فين كتشوف(ي) راسك؟

4 . منين انت؟ فين كبرتي؟ شنو جابك للرباط؟

5 . فين حبستي لقرايا ديالك؟ شحال فعمرك ملي حبستي لقرايا؟

- 6 . كيفاق تلاقيتي بر ارجلك \ مراتك؟ كيفاق تلاقيتو؟ \ كيفاش تعرفتي على راجلك\مراتك؟
- 7 . شحال من عام و نتما مزوجين؟ شحال هادي و نتما مزوجين؟
- 8 . واش عندك طوموبيل؟ واش كتعرف شي واحد عنده طوموبيل يمكن تسلفيها من عنده؟ طليبيها ليه يلا حتاجتها؟
- 9 . واش كنتسكني ف دار ولا شي برطاما؟ واش شريتي هاد دار ولا كريتيها؟
- 1 0 . واش عندك ويفي ف دار؟
- 1 1 . واش عندك تلفازة؟ تلاجة؟ فريگو؟ ماكينة ديال صابون؟ او طوماتيك ولا لا؟ نشافة؟ ميكروند؟ كليماتازر؟ ماكينة ديال لواني؟ فران؟ كبير ولا صغير؟
- 1 2 . 1 . تكلمي على راسك ملي كنت صغير(ة) عفاك . \ حضري علي صغر دياك\ مرحلة ديال الطفولة. شنو كانو كيديرو والدين دياك\ فين كيخدمو؟
- 1 3 . 1 . ملي كنت مع والديك شكون كان كيدير شغل ديال دار لاكتريية د وقت؟ واش لوليد دياك كيعاون شوية؟ كيفاش؟ وامتأ\ فوقاش؟
- 1 4 . 1 . ملي كنت صغير(ة) واش انت عاونت(ي) فشغل ديال دار مرة مرة؟ كيفاش؟ شحال من مرة فسيمانة؟
- واش كان فرق بين اخواتاتك و خوتك؟
- 1 5 . 1 . دابة، شكون سكن ف دار معك؟ \ شكون معاك فدار؟
- 1 6 . 1 . فين كتخدم(ي)؟ \ شنو خدمتك؟
- 1 7 . 1 . كيفاش لقيتي هاد الخدمة؟ كيف كاتجيك هاد خدمة؟
- 1 8 . 1 . واش فلوس لي كتربح(ي) من هاد خدمة كافيينك\كيقدوك\كافين؟ كيفاق كتكلمي الشهر؟
- 1 9 . 1 . شكون كيصرف على دار؟
- 2 0 . 2 . تكلمي على راجلك\مراتك عفاك.
- 2 1 . 2 . فين راجلك حبس \ مراتك حبسات لقرايا ديهالها
- 2 2 . 2 . فين راجلك\مراتك كيخدم؟ كيفاش هو لقي \هي لقات هاد خدمة؟
- 2 3 . 2 . تكلمي على مسؤولية دياك ف دار.
- 2 4 . 2 . تكلمي على نهار عادي دياك - شنو كنتيديري فصباح؟ ف لعيشة؟ ف الليل؟
- 2 5 . 2 . واش راجلك كيعاونك فكوزينة؟ فجفاف؟ فدراري؟ \ واش مراتك كتعاونك على زمان؟ شنو هو لاحساس دياك ملي هو كيعاونك\هي كتعاونك ولا لعكس؟
- 2 6 . 2 . فين كتقداي؟ شكون كيمشي يتقدي لالاكتريية د لوقت؟ فسيمانة شحال من مرة كتمشي؟ تكلمي على نهار ديال تقديية \ دياك\ لقة
- 2 7 . 2 . شكون كيطلب ف دار الاكتريية د لوقت؟ شكون كيبدل لكوزينة لالاكتريية ديال الوقت؟ واش هاد شي كيتبدل؟ \ واش كنتيديرو نوبة؟ فوقاش شي واحد اخر كيطلب؟
- 2 8 . 2 . شكون كيغسل لواني الاكتريية د لوقت؟ واش هاد شي كيتبدل مرة مرة؟
- 2 9 . 2 . واش انت كتكل(ي) على برا مرة مرة؟ شحال من مرة فسيمانة و مع من؟
- 3 0 . 3 . شكون لي كيدير شغل ديال دار الاكتريية دلوقت؟ فوقاش هاد شي كيتبدل؟
- 3 1 . 3 . شكون كيصبن حوايج دياك الاكتريية دلوقت؟ فوقاش هاد شي كيتبدل؟
- 3 2 . 3 . شكون كيهتم بدراري الاكتريية د لوقت؟ شنو كيدير مع دراري؟ فوقاش هاد شي كيتبدل؟
- 3 3 . 3 . إلا عندك ولاد ولا بنت.....شنو مسؤولية فدار ديال لولاد؟ ديال لنيات؟
- 3 4 . 3 . واش كتظني خصك شي واحد يعاونك فدار مع شغل و طياب و دراري؟ وقتاش كتقرر إياه ولا لا؟ والدين دياك واش كانت عندهم خدامة ملي كنت صغير(ة)؟ واش صحابك عندهم خدامة ولا لا؟
- 3 5 . 3 . تكلم(ي) على مسؤولية دياك ف حياة زوجية و مسؤولية ديال راجلك\مراتك.

- 3 6 . واش انت تزوجت بطريقة تقليدية ولا عصرية؟ واش عايش(ة) عيشة عصرية ولا تقليدية ف دارك؟
- 3 7 . واش كان فرق بين زواج ديالك و ديال والدين؟ كيفاش؟  
واش كان فرق مابين حياة زواج ديالك و ديال صحابك؟ كيفاش؟
- 3 8 . اشمن برنامج ولا مساسل في تلفازة ولا راديو لي كييجيك تشوف ولا تسمع؟
- 3 9 . شنو دور ديال رجل و مرا في دار في هاد مساسلات؟ واش هاد دور مزيان ولا لا؟
- 4 0 . شنو معنى ديال طبقة متوسطة؟  
واش انت فيها؟  
شنو لحوايج لي كيدير شي واحد ف طبقة متوسطة؟
- 4 1 . واش كاين شي حاجة اللي يمكن تفيديني بها؟ واش كاين شي حاجة اللي خصني نعرف؟

## APPENDIX C. VERSION 3 INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

(used for majority of interviews, green changes from version 2 highlighted)

1. What is your name?
2. What is your age?
3. Which social class is your family in? In Moroccan society, there are a lot of social classes, and you are in which? Where do you see yourself? What social class would you say you're in now?
4. Where are you from? Where did you grow up? If no Rabat, what brought you to Rabat?
5. When did you end your schooling? How old were you when you stopped your studies?
6. How did you meet your spouse? How did you all meet? How do you know your spouse?
7. How many years have you all been married for? How long has it been that you all have been married?
8. **Do you have children? How many? How old are they?**
9. Do you have a car? Is there someone you know that has a car you can borrow? Can you ask him to borrow it without a problem?
10. Do you live in a house or an apartment? Renting or owning?
11. Do you have wifi in the house? Do you have a tv? Fridge? Freezer? Washing machine? Is it automatic? Dryer? Microwave? AC? Dishwasher? Oven? Is it big or small?
12. Tell me about your childhood. What did your father and mother do/where did they work?
13. When you were with your parents, who did the housework most of the time?
  - a. Did your dad **do housework sometimes**? How so? When?
14. When you were young, did you help with housework sometimes? How so? How many times a week?
  - a. Was there a different because your sisters and brothers?
15. Now, who lives in your house with you? /Who is with you in the house?
16. Where do you work? / What is your work? How do you like your job? / **Do you want to work outside? Have you ever worked outside?**
17. **In the beginning, when did you decide to work and why?**
18. Is the money you make enough? How do you complete the month?
19. Who pays for household expenses?
20. Tell me about your husband/wife please.
21. When did they stop their studies?
22. Where do they work? **When/why did he/she decide to work?**

23. Tell me about your responsibilities in the house. **How did you all decide who would do what in the house?**
24. **How do you think housework should be divided in an ideal life?**
25. Tell me about a normal day for you- what do you do in the morning? In the afternoon? At night?
26. Where do you shop for food? Who goes shopping most of the time? In a week, how many times do you go? Tell me about shopping, what do you buy?
27. Who cooks at home most of the time? Does this change/Do you do an exchange? When does someone else cook?
28. Who washes the dishes most of the time? Does this change from time to time?
29. Do you eat outside sometimes? How many times in a week and with whom? **Why do you eat out sometimes?**
30. Who does the housework/cleaning most of the time? When does this change?
31. Who cleans your clothes most of the time? When does this change?
32. Who takes care of the children most of the time? What do you do with the children? When does this change?
33. If you have a girl or a boy, what are the sons' responsibilities in the house? The daughters?
34. Do you have a woman who helps in the house? How many times a week? Does she stay here? What does she do?
  - a. Did your parents have a maid when you were small?
  - b. Do your friends have maids or not?
35. **Do you do housework when your parents are at your house? Does your husband do housework when his family is at your house?**
36. **When a man does housework, does it lower his level of masculinity?**
37. Is there a difference between your marriage and your parents' marriage? How so? Is there is a difference in married life between your friends' marriage and yours?
38. Which programs/series on tv or radio do you like to watch/listen to?
39. What are the roles for women and men in the house on these shows? Are these good roles or not?
40. What is the meaning of middle class? What are the things someone must do to be in the middle class?
41. Is there anything else you would like to add? / Is there anything else you think I should know?

1 . شنو سمينتك؟ اش سماك الله؟  
2 . شحال فعمرك؟

- 3 . فالمجتمع المغربي كايين بزاف ديال طبقات و انت فاي طبقه؟ \ فين كتشوف(ي) راسك؟ العائلة ديك لاشمن طبقة كنتنتمي؟
- 4 . منين انت؟ فين كبرتي؟ شنو جابك للرباط؟
- 5 . فين حبستي لقرايا ديك؟ شحال فعمرك ملي حبستي لقرايا؟
- 6 . كيفاق تلاقيتي براجلك \ مراتك؟ كيفاق تلاقيتو؟ \ كيفاش تعرفتي على راجلك امراتك؟
- 7 . شحال من عام و ننما مزوجين؟ \ شحال هادي و ننما مزوجين؟
- 8 . واش عندك دراري؟ شحال عندكم؟ شحال فعمركم؟
- 9 . واش عندك طوموبيل؟ واش كتعرف شي واحد عنده طوموبيل يمكن تسلفيها من عنده؟ طليبيها ليه يلا حتاجتها؟
- 1 0 . واش كتسكني ف دار ولا شي برطاما؟ واش شريتي هاد دار ولا كريتيها؟
- 1 1 . واش عندك ويني ف دار؟ واش عندك تلفازة؟ تلاجة؟ فريغو؟ ماكينة ديال صابون؟ اوطوماتيك ولا لا؟ نشافة؟ ميكروند؟ كليماتازر؟ ماكينة ديال لواني؟ فران؟ كبير ولا صغير؟
- 
- 1 2 . تكلمي على راسك ملي كنت صغير(ة) عفاك. شنو كانو كيديرو والدين ديك \ فين كيخدمو؟
- 1 3 . ملي كنت مع والديك شكون كان كيدير شغل ديال دار لاكتريية د وقت؟  
واش لوليد ديك كان يدير شغل فدار مرة مرة؟ كيفاش؟ إمتا \ فوقاش؟
- 1 4 . ملي كنت صغير(ة) واش انت عاونت(ي) فشغل ديال دار مرة مرة؟ كيفاش؟ شحال من مرة فسيمانه؟  
واش كان فرق بين اخواتك و خوتك؟
- 
- 1 5 . دابة، شكون سكن ف دار معك؟ \ شكون معاك فدار؟
- 1 6 . فين كتخدم(ي)؟ \ شنو خدمتك؟ كيف كاتجيك هاد خدمة؟ / عمرك خدمتي و لا لا؟ واش بغيتي يخدم(ي) على برا و لا؟
- 1 7 . فلول، فوقاش قرارتي تخدم(ي) وعلاش؟
- 1 8 . واش فلوس لي كتربح(ي) من هاد خدمة كافيينك \ كيدوك \ كافين؟  
كيفاق كتكلمي الشهر؟
- 1 9 . شكون كيصرف على دار؟
- 
- 2 0 . تكلمي على راجلك امراتك عفاك.
- 2 1 . فين راجلك حبس \ مراتك حبسات لقرايا ديكها
- 2 2 . فين راجلك امراتك كيخدم؟ إمتا هي قرارات تخدم \ هو قرر يخدم؟ علاش؟
- 2 3 . تكلمي على مسؤولية ديك ف دار. كيفاش كتكون تقرارو شكون غادي يدير شنو فدار؟
- 2 4 . كيفاش شغل ف دار خاصو يتقسم فالحياة المثالية؟
- 2 5 . تكلمي على نهار عادي ديك - شنو كتديري فصباح؟ ف لعيشة؟ ف الليل؟
- 
- 2 6 . فين كتقداي؟ شكون كيمشي يتقدي لاكتريية د لوقت؟ فسيمانه شحال من مرة كتمشي؟ تكلمي على نهار ديال تقديية \ ديككم \ لقة
- 2 7 . شكون كيطلب ف دار الاكتريية د لوقت؟ شكون كيدخل لكوزينة لاكتريية ديال الوقت؟  
واش هاد شي كيتبدل؟ \ واش كتديرو نوبة؟  
فوقاش شي واحد اخر كيطلب؟
- 2 8 . شكون كيغسل لواني الاكتريية د لوقت؟ واش هاد شي كيتبدل مرة مرة؟



- 2 9 . واش انت كنتك(ي) على برا مرة مرة؟ شحال من مرة فسيمانة و مع من؟ علاش كليتي على برا مرة مرة؟
- 3 0 . شكون لي كيدير شغل ديال دار الاكترية دلوقت؟ فوقاش هاد شي كيتبدل؟
- 3 1 . شكون كيصبن حوايج ديالك الاكترية دلوقت؟ فوقاش هاد شي كيتبدل؟
- 3 2 . (شكون كيهتم بدراري الاكترية دلوقت؟ شنو كيدير مع دراري؟ فوقاش هاد شي كيتبدل؟)
- 
- 3 3 . إلا عندك ولاد ولا بنت.....شنو مسؤولية فدار ديال لولاد؟ ديال لنيات؟
- 3 4 . واش عندك شي مرا كتجي تيعاونك؟ شحال من مرة فسيمانة؟ واش كتبات؟ شنو كتدير هاد مرا؟  
الوالدين ديالك واش كانت عندهم خدامة ملي كنت صغيرة؟  
واش صحابك عندهم خدامة ولا لا؟
- 3 5 . واش كتدير شغل فدار ملي عائلتك كتكون عندكم فدار؟ \ واش رجلك كيدير شغل فدار ملي عائلتو كتكون عندكم فدار؟
- 3 6 . ملي راجل كيدير شغل فدار، واش كينقص من قمة ديال رجولة؟
- 3 7 . واش كان فرق بين زواج ديالك و ديال والدين؟ كيفاش؟  
واش كان فرق مابين حياة زواج ديالك و ديال صحابك؟ كيفاش؟
- 
- 3 8 . اشمن برنامج ولا مساسل في تلفازة ولا راديو لي كيحببك تشوف ولا تسمع؟
- 3 9 . شنو دور ديال رجل و مرا في دار في هاد مساسلات؟ واش هاد دور مزيان ولا لا؟
- 
- 4 0 . شنو معنى ديال طبقة متوسطة؟ \ شنو لحوايج لي كيدير شي واحد ف طبقة متوسطة؟
- 
- 4 1 . واش كاين شي حاجة اللي يمكن تفيديني بها؟ \ واش كاين شي حاجة اللي خصني نعرف؟

## REFERENCES CITED

- Aaftaab, Naheed. 2013. *Branding a Global Identity: Labor Anxieties, Conspicuous Consumption, and Middle Class Culture in Hyderabad, India*, edited by Naheed Aaftaab. Vol. 73.
- Aaminou, Mohamed Wail and Rajae Aboulaich. 2017. "Modeling Consumers' Behavior in the New Dual Banking Markets: The Case of Morocco." *Review of Pacific Basin Financial markets and Policies*. 20(2): 1750009. DOI: 10.1142/S0219091517500096
- Abu-Lughod, Janet L. 1980. *Rabat: Urban Apartheid in Morocco*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Abdelmajid, Anzoule and Soufiane Benohoud. 2010. "Vers une nucléarisation des ménages marocains: caractéristiques et variations spatiales à travers le RGPH 2004," in *Les Cashiers Du Plan N° 32- Novembre/Decembre 2010*. Haut Commissariat Au Plan. <[https://www.hcp.ma/Les-Cahiers-du-Plan-N-32-Novembre-Decembre-2010\\_a1231.html](https://www.hcp.ma/Les-Cahiers-du-Plan-N-32-Novembre-Decembre-2010_a1231.html)>.
- Abu-Lughod, Lila. 1989. "Zones of Theory in the Anthropology of the Arab World." *Annual Review of Anthropology* 18 (1): 267-306. doi:10.1146/annurev.an.18.100189.001411.
- Adely, Fida. 2016. "A Different Kind of Love: Comptability (Insijam) and Marriage in Jordan." *Arab Studies Journal* 24 (2): 102-127.
- Ahearn, Laura M. 2004. "Literacy, Power, and Agency: Love Letters and Development in Nepal." *Language and Education*. 18(4): 305-16
- Alpert, Rachel. 2007. *Women in Morocco: Participation in the Workforce as an Avenue of Social Mobility*. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press.
- Armbrust, Walter. 2003. "Bourgeois Leisure and Egyptian Media Fantasies." In *New Media in the Muslim World*, edited by Dale Eickelman and Jon Anderson. Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University.
- Assad, Ragui and Sami Zouari. 2003. "Estimating the Impact of Marriage and Fertility on the Female Labor Force Participation when Decisions are Interrelated: Evidence from Urban Morocco." *Topics in Middle Eastern and North African Economies* 5.
- Ayad, Mohamed and Farzaneh Roudi. 2006. "Fertility Decline and Reproductive Health in Morocco: New DHS Figures." *Population Reference Bureau*.
- Ayub, M (2009). *Understanding Islamic Finance*, Vol. 462. Chichester: John Wiley & Sons.

- Bank Al-Maghrib (2019). *Séries Statistiques Monétaires*, Publications, Statistiques et Recherche. <<http://www.bkam.ma/Publications-statistiques-et-recherche/Documents-d-information-et-de-statistiques/Series-statistiques-monetaires>>.
- Barrett, Michele. 1997. "Capitalism and Women's Liberation." In *The Second Wave: A Reader in Feminist Theory*, edited by Linda Nicholson. New York: Routledge.
- Batalova, Jeanne A. and Philip N. Cohen. 2002. "Premarital Cohabitation and Housework: Households in Cross-National Perspective." *Journal of Marriage and Family* 64 (3): 743-755. doi:10.1111/j.1741-3737.2002.00743.x.
- Batnitzky, Adina. 2008. "Obesity and Household Roles: Gender and Social Class in Morocco." *Sociology of Health & Illness* 30 (3): 445-462. doi:10.1111/j.1467-9566.2007.01067.x.
- Baxter, Janeen and Emily W. Kane. 1995. "Dependence and Independence: A Cross-National Analysis of Gender Inequality and Gender Attitudes." *Gender and Society* 9 (2): 193-215. doi:10.1177/089124395009002004.
- Becker, Gary Stanley. 1991. *A Treatise on the Family*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.
- Bee, Anna and Isabel Vogel. 1997. "Temporeras and Household Relations: Seasonal Employment in Chile's Agro-Export Sector." *Bulletin of Latin American Research* 16 (1): 83-95. doi:10.1111/j.1470-9856.1997.tb00161.x.
- Berridge, Clara W. and Jennifer L. Romich. 2011. "'Raising Him . . . to Pull His Own Weight': Boys' Household Work in Single-Mother Households." *Journal of Family Issues* 32 (2): 157-180. doi:10.1177/0192513X10380832.
- Bianchi, Suzanne M., Melissa A. Milkie, Liana C. Sayer, and John P. Robinson. 2000. "Is Anyone Doing the Housework? Trends in the Gender Division of Household Labor." *Social Forces* 79 (1): 191-228. doi:10.1093/sf/79.1.191.
- Blumen, Orna. 2002. "Criss-Crossing Boundaries: Ultraorthodox Jewish Women Go to Work." *Gender, Place and Culture* 9 (2): 133-151. doi:10.1080/09663960220139653.
- Bouasria, Leila. 2013. *Les ouvrières marocaines en mouvement: qui paye? Qui fait le ménage? Et qui décide?.* Paris, France: L'Harmattan.
- Boufous, Sawssan and Mohammed Khariss. 2015. "The Moroccan Middle Class from Yesterday to Today: Definition and Evolving." *Business and Economics Journal* 6 (3): 153.

- Bourdieu, Pierre. 1977. *Outline of a Theory of Practice*. Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. 1984. *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. 1986. The forms of capital. In J. Richardson (Ed.) *Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education*. New York, Greenwood, 241-258.
- Boutieri, Charis. 2016. *Learning in Morocco: Language Politics and the Abandoned Educational Dream*, edited by ProQuest Ebook Central Bloomington, Indiana; Indianapolis, Indiana: Indiana University Press.
- Butler, Judith. 1990. *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Cahill, C., 2007. "The personal is political: Developing new subjectivities through participatory action research." *Gender, Place Culture* 14 (3), 267–292. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09663690701324904>.
- Cairolì, M. L. 2011. *Girls of the Factory: A Year with the Garment Workers of Morocco*. Gainesville, FL: University Press of Florida.
- Campanelli, Giuliana. 2003. "Convenience consumption" and unpaid labor time: Paradoxes or norms.?" In *Unpaid work and the Economy: A gender Analysis of the Standards of Living*, edited by Antonella Picchio, 157-70. London, UK: Routledge.
- Carrier, James G. 2012. "The Trouble with Class." *European Journal of Sociology*. 53(3): 263-84.
- Cerrutti, Marcela. 2000. "Economic Reform, Structural Adjustment and Female Labour Force Participation in Buenos Aires, Argentina." *World Development* 28 (5): 879-891.
- Cerwonka, Allaine and Liisa H. Malkki. 2007. *Improvising Theory: Process and Temporality in Ethnographic Fieldwork*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Chang, Szu-Chia and Chao-Neng Chan. 2007. "Perceptions of Commitment Change during Mate Selection: The Case of Taiwanese Newlyweds." *Journal of Social and Personal Relationships* 24 (1): 55-68. doi:10.1177/0265407507072583.
- Chant, Sylvia. 1996. "Women's Roles in Recession and Economic Restructuring in Mexico and the Philippines." *Geoforum* 27 (3): 297-327. doi:10.1016/S0016-7185(96)00022-X.

- Chant, Silvia. 2002. "Researching Gender, Families and Households in Latin America: From the 20th into the 21st Century." *Bulletin of Latin American Research* 21 (4): 545-575. doi:10.1111/1470-9856.00059.
- Chao, Xia. 2013. "Class Habitus: Middle- Class Chinese Immigrant Parents' Investment in their Newcomer Adolescents' L2 Acquisition and Social Integration." *Anthropology & Education Quarterly* 44 (1): 58-74. doi:10.1111/j.1548-1492.2012.01179.x.
- Charmaz, Kathy. 2014. *Constructing Grounded Theory*. 2nd ed. London: SAGE.
- Chibnik, Michael. 2011. *Anthropology, Economics, and Choice*. Austin, TX: University of Texas Press.
- Cohen, Shana. 2000. *Waiting for a Different Future: Market Reform and the Transformation of the Middle Class in Morocco*, edited by Peter Evans ProQuest Dissertations Publishing.
- Connell, Raewyn. 1995. *Masculinities*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Connell, R. and James Messerschmidt. 2005. "Hegemonic Masculinity: Rethinking the Concept." *Gender & Society* 19 (6): 829-859. doi:10.1177/0891243205278639.
- Conway-Long, Don. 2006. "Gender, Power and Social Change in Morocco." In *Islamic Masculinities*, edited by Lahoucine Ouzgane. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
- Counihan, Carole. 2009. *A Tortilla is Like Life: Food & Culture in the San Luis Valley of Colorado*. Austin, TX: University of Texas Press.
- Cowan, Ruth S. 1983. *More Work for Mother: The ironies of household technology from the open hearth to the microwave*. New York: Basic Books.
- Crawford, David. 2008. *Moroccan Households in the World Economy*. Louisiana State University Press.
- Crenshaw, K., 1989. "Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Antidiscrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory, and Antiracist Politics." *University of Chicago Legal Forum*: 139-167.
- Davis, Diane E. 2004. *Discipline and Development: Middle Classes and Prosperity in East Asia and Latin America*. Cambridge, UK; New York: Cambridge University Press.

- Davis, D. A. and S. S. Davis. 1995. "Possessed by Love: Gender and Romance in Morocco." In *Romantic Passion: A Universal Experience?*, edited by W. Jankowiak, 219-238. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Davis, Shannon N. and Theodore N. Greenstein. 2004. "Cross-National Variations in the Division of Household Labor." *Journal of Marriage and Family* 66 (5): 1260-1271. doi:10.1111/j.0022-2445.2004.00091.x.
- de Certeau, Michel. 1984. *The Practice of Everyday Life*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.
- Deeb, Lara and Mona Harb. 2013. *Leisurely Islam: Negotiating Geography and Morality in Shi'ite South Beirut* New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- Deeb, Lara & Jessica Winegar. 2012. "Anthropologies of Arab-Majority Societies." *Annual Review of Anthropology* 41: 537-58
- de Koning, Anouk. 2009. *Global Dreams: Class, Gender, and Public Space in Cosmopolitan Cairo*. Cairo, Egypt: American University in Cairo Press.
- Demetriou, Demetrakis. 2001. "Connell's Concept of Hegemonic Masculinity: A Critique." *Theory and Society* 30 (3): 337-361. doi:10.1023/A:1017596718715.
- De Munck, Victor. 1998. "Lust, Love and Arranged Marriages in Sri Lanka." In *Romantic Love and Sexual Behavior: Perspectives from the Social Sciences*, ed. V. de Munck, 285-300. Westport, CT: Praeger.
- DeWalt, Kathleen Musante and Billie R. DeWalt. 2011. *Participant Observation: A Guide for Fieldworkers*. 2nd ed. Lanham, Md.: Rowman & Littlefield.
- Dhillon, Navtej and Tarik M. Yousef. 2009. *Generation in Waiting: The Unfulfilled Promise of Young People in the Middle East* Brookings Institution Press.
- Dickey, Sara. 2000. "Permeable Homes: Domestic Service, Household Space, and the Vulnerability of Class Boundaries in Urban India." *American Ethnologist* 27 (2): 462-489. doi:10.1525/ae.2000.27.2.462.
- Dike, M. R. 2012. "Exploring Moroccan Identities: The Tension between Traditional and Modern Cuisine in an Urban Context." Honors Thesis, University of Tennessee Honors Thesis Projects.
- Donaldson, Mike. 1993. "What is Hegemonic Masculinity?" *Theory and Society* 22 (5): 643-657. doi:10.1007/BF00993540.
- Donner, Henrike. 2008. *Domestic Goddesses: Maternity, Globalization and Middle-Class Identity in Contemporary India*. Aldershot, England; Burlington, VT: Ashgate.

- Elliot, Alice. 2020. "Trickster Hospitality: A Moroccan Escalation Act," *History and Anthropology* 31(3): 1-14.
- Emerson, Robert M., Rachel I. Fretz, and Linda L. Shaw. 1995. *Writing Ethnographic Fieldnotes*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Engels, Friedrich. 1884. *The Origin of the Family, Private Property and the State: in the Light of the Researches of Lewis H. Morgan*. New York: International Publishers.
- Ennaji, Moha. 2005. *Multilingualism, Cultural Identity, and Education in Morocco*. New York: Springer.
- Ennaji, Moha. 2016. "Women, Gender, and Politics in Morocco." *Social Sciences* 5 (4): 75. doi:10.3390/socsci5040075.
- Ennaji, Moha and Fatima Sadiqi. 2008. *Migration and Gender in Morocco: The Impact of Migration on the Women Left Behind*. Trenton, NJ: Red Sea Press.
- Eriksen, Thomas Hylland. 1996. *Small Places, Large Issues*. Sterling, VA: Pluto.
- Etienne, Mona. 1980. "Women and Men, Cloth and Colonization: The Transformation of Production-Distribution Relations among the Baule (Ivory Coast)." In *Women and Colonization: Anthropological Perspectives*, edited by Mona Etienne and Elanor Leacock, 214-38. New York: Praeger Publishers.
- Federici, Silvia & Marina Vishmidt. 2013. "Permanent reproductive crisis: an interview with Silvia Federici". *Mute*.  
<<https://www.metamute.org/editorial/articles/permanent-reproductive-crisis-interview-silvia-federici>>.
- Fehervary, Krisztina. 2012. "The Postsocialist Middle Classes and the New "Family House" in Hungary," in *The Global Middle Classes: Theorizing Through Ethnography*, edited by Rachel Heiman, Carla Freeman, Mark Leichty. School for Advanced Research (SAR).
- Fernandes, Leela. 2006. *India's New Middle Class: Democratic Politics in an Era of Economic Reform*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Ferrant, Gaëlle, Luca Maria Pesando and Keiko Nowacka. 2014. "Unpaid Care Work: The missing link in the analysis of gender gaps in labour outcomes." Issues Paper. OECD Development Centre. <[http://www.oecd.org/dev/development-gender/Unpaid\\_care\\_work.pdf](http://www.oecd.org/dev/development-gender/Unpaid_care_work.pdf)>.
- Fetterman, David M. 2010. *Ethnography: Step-by-Step*. Los Angeles: Sage.

- Folbre N. 1995. "‘Holding hands at midnight’: The paradox of caring labor." *Feminist Economics* 1: 73– 92.
- Folbre N., and T. Weisskopf. 1998. "Did father know best? Families, markets and the supply of caring labor." In *Economics, Values and Organization*, edited by A. Ben-Ner and L. Putterman, 171–205. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Foucault. M., 1980. *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings 1972-197*. C. Gordon (ed.). Pantheon Books. New York.
- Freeman, Carla. 2000. *High Tech and High Heels: Women, Work, and Pink-Collar Identities in the Caribbean*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Fuwa, Makiko. 2004. "Macro-Level Gender Inequality and the Division of Household Labor in 22 Countries." *American Sociological Review* 69 (6): 751-767. doi:10.1177/000312240406900601.
- Garcia, Alicea, Petra Tschakert, Nana Afia Karikari, Simon Mariwah, Martin Bosompem. 2021. "Emancipatory spaces: Opportunities for (re)negotiating gendered subjectivities and enhancing adaptive capacities." *Geoforum* 119: 190-205.
- Geertz, Clifford. 1998. "Deep Hanging Out." *The New York Review of Books* 45(16): 69-72.
- Geist, Claudia. 2005. "The Welfare State and the Home: Regime Differences in the Domestic Division of Labour." *European Sociological Review* 21 (1): 23-41. doi:10.1093/esr/jci002.
- Geldstein, Rosa N. 1994. "Working Class Mothers as Economic Providers and Heads of Families in Buenos Aires." *Reproductive Health Matters* 2 (4): 55-64. doi:10.1016/0968-8080(94)90009-4.
- Ghannam, Farha. 2013. *Live and Die Like a Man: Gender Dynamics in Urban Egypt*. Stanford, California: Stanford University Press.
- Ghannam, Farha. 2018. "Teaching Him to Care: Labor and the making of Working-Class Men in Urban Egypt." In *Reconceiving Muslim Men: Love and Marriage, Family and Care in Precarious Times*, edited by Marcia Inhorn and Nafissa Naguib. 129-143. New York, NY: Beghahn Books.
- Gibson-Graham, J. 1996. *The End of Capitalism (as we Knew it): A Feminist Critique of Political Economy*. Cambridge, Mass.: Cambridge, MA: Blackwell Publishers.
- Giddens, Anthony. 1984. *The Constitution of Society: Outline of the Theory of Structuration*. Cambridge Cambridgeshire: Polity Press.



- Glenn, Evelyn Nakano. 1992. "From Servitude to Service Work: Historical Continuities in the Racial Division of Paid Reproductive Labor." *Signs* 18(1): 1–43.
- Glaser, Barney G. and Anselm L. Strauss. 1967. *The Discovery of Grounded Theory; Strategies for Qualitative Research*. Chicago: Aldine Pub. Co.
- Glazier, Jack D. and Ronald R. Powell. 1992. *Qualitative Research in Information Management*. Englewood, Colo.: Libraries Unlimited.
- Gobo, Giampietro. 2008. *Doing Ethnography*. London: Sage.
- Goldstein, Donna M. 2012. "How Corruption Kills: Pharmaceutical Crime, Mediated Representations, and Middle Class Anxiety in Neoliberal Argentina." *City & Society* 24 (2): 218-239. doi:10.1111/j.1548-744X.2012.01076.x.
- Gonda, N. 2017. "Revealing the patriarchal sides of climate change adaptation through intersectionality: A case study from Nicaragua." In Buckingham, S., Masson, V.L. (Eds.), *Understanding Climate Change through Gender Relations*. London: Routledge. 173-189.
- Goñi-Legaz, Salomé, Andrea Ollo-López, and Alberto Bayo-Moriones. 2010. "The Division of Household Labor in Spanish Dual Earner Couples: Testing Three Theories." *Sex Roles; A Journal of Research* 63 (7): 515-529. doi:10.1007/s11199-010-9840-0.
- Gonzalez de la Rocha, Mercedes. 1988. "Economic Crisis, Domestic Reorganisation and Women's Work in Guadalajara, Mexico." *Bulletin of Latin American Research* 7 (2): 207-223. doi:10.2307/3338289.
- . 2000. *Private Adjustments: Household Responses to the Erosion of Work Social Development and Poverty Elimination Division, United Nations Development Programme*.
- Gorman-Murray, Andrew. 2013. "Urban Homebodies: Embodiment, Masculinity, and Domesticity in Inner Sydney." *Geographical Research* 51 (2): 137-144. doi:10.1111/j.1745-5871.2011.00750.x.
- Graham, L. D. 1999. "Domesticating efficiency: Lillian Gilbreth's Scientific Management of Homemakers. 1924-1930." *Signs* 24(3): 633-75.
- Gray, Kenneth. 2001. "Women Entrepreneurs in Morocco: A Preliminary Investigation." *Journal of North African Studies* 6 (4): 64-84.
- Gray, Doris H. 2006. "Educated, Professional Women in Morocco and Women of Moroccan Origin in France: Asserting a New Public and Private Identity." *Journal of*

*Middle East Women's Studies* 2 (3): 48-70. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.2979/MEW.2006.2.3.48>.

Gray, Kenneth and Joycelyn Finley-Hervey. 2005. "Women and Entrepreneurship in Morocco: Debunking Stereotypes and Discerning Strategies." *The International Entrepreneurship and Management Journal* 1 (2): 203-217. doi:10.1007/s11365-005-1129-3.

Greenstein, Theodore N. 2009. "National Context, Family Satisfaction, and Fairness in the Division of Household Labor." *Journal of Marriage and Family* 71 (4): 1039-1051. doi:10.1111/j.1741-3737.2009.00651.x.

Gutmann, Matthew C. 1999. "A Manera De Conclusion: Solteras y Hombres. Cambio e Historia." In *Divergencia s Del Modelo Tradicional: Hogares De Jefatura Femenina En America Latina*, edited by Gonzalez de la Rocha, Mercedes, 163-172. Mexico: Centro de Investigaciones y Estudios Superiores en Antropologia Social.

Hames, Raymond and Michael Paolisso. 2014. "Direct and Indirect Behavior Observations." In *The Handbook of Methods in Cultural Anthropology*, edited by H. Russell Bernard and Clarence Gravlee, 293-313. Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield.

Hammoudi, Abdellah. 1997. *Master and Disciple*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Haut-Commissariat Au Plan 2019a. Taux d'urbanisation (en%) par année: 1960-2050. <[https://www.hcp.ma/Taux-d-urbanisation-en-par-annee-1960-2050\\_a682.html](https://www.hcp.ma/Taux-d-urbanisation-en-par-annee-1960-2050_a682.html)>.

Haut-Commissariat Au Plan 2019b. Indice des prix à la consommation (IPC) par grandes divisions. <[https://www.hcp.ma/Indice-des-prix-a-la-consommation-IPC-par-grandes-divisiones\\_a209.html](https://www.hcp.ma/Indice-des-prix-a-la-consommation-IPC-par-grandes-divisiones_a209.html)>.

Haut-Commissariat au Plan et la Banque mondiale (High Commission for Planning and the World Bank). 2017. *Pauvreté et prospérité partagée au Maroc du troisième millénaire, 2001 – 2014*. <<https://www.hcp.ma/file/195497/>>.

Heiman, Rachel, Carla Freeman, and Mark Leichty. (eds). 2012. *The Global Middle Classes: Theorizing Through Ethnography*. School for Advanced Research (SAR).

Higgins, Rylan. 2015. "Is it My Job to make Him Care? Middle-Class Women and Gender Inequality in Ho Chi Minh City." *Anthropology of Work Review* 36 (2): 74-86. doi:10.1111/awr.12069.

Hirsch, Jennifer et al. 2006. "The Social Consturctions of Sexuality: Companionate Marriage and STD/HIV Risk in a Mexican Migrant Community." In *Modern Loves: The Anthropology of Romantic Courtship & Companionate Marriage*.

Edited by Jennifer S. Hirsch and Holly Wardlow. 95-117. Ann Arbor, MI: The University of Michigan Press.

Hirsch, Jennifer S. and Holly Wardlow (Ed). 2006. *Modern Loves: The Anthropology of Romantic Courtship & Companionate Marriage*. Ann Arbor, MI: The University of Michigan Press.

Hochschild, A. 1989. *The second shift: Working parents and the revolution at home*. New York: Viking.

Hollows, J. 2003. "Oliver's Twist: Leisure, Labour and Domestic Masculinity in the Naked Chef." *International Journal of Cultural Studies* 6: 229-248.

Holmberg, Diane, Terri Orbuch, and Joseph Veroff. 2004. *Thrice-Told Tales: Married Couples Tell their Stories*. Mahwah, N.J.: Lawrence Erlbaum.

Hoodfar, Homa. 1997. *Between Marriage and the Market: Intimate Politics and Survival in Cairo*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Hook, Jennifer L. 2004. "Reconsidering the Division of Household Labor: Incorporating Volunteer Work and Informal Support." *Journal of Marriage and Family* 66 (1): 101-117. doi:10.1111/j.0022-2445.2004.00008.x.

hooks, b. (2000). *Feminism is for everybody: passionate politics*. London: Pluto Press.

Illouz, Eva. 1997. *Consuming the Romantic Utopia: Love and the Cultural Contradictions of Capitalism*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Inhorn, Marcia C. 2012. *The New Arab Man: Emergent Masculinities, Technologies, and Islam in the Middle East*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

———. 2014. "Roads Less Traveled in Middle East Anthropology—And New Paths in Gender Ethnography." *Journal of Middle East Women's Studies* 10 (3): 62-86. doi:10.2979/jmiddeastwomstud.10.3.62.

Inhorn, Marcia and Nefissa Naguib (eds). 2018. *Reconceiving Muslim Men: Love and Marriage, Family and Care in Precarious Times*. New York, NY: Berghahn Books.

Inhorn, Marcia C. and Emily A. Wentzell. 2011. "Embodying Emergent Masculinities: Men Engaging with Reproductive and Sexual Health Technologies in the Middle East and Mexico." *American Ethnologist* 38 (4): 801-815. doi:10.1111/j.1548-1425.2011.01338.x.

- Ishii-Kuntz, Masako and Scott Coltrane. 1992. "Predicting the Sharing of Household Labor: Are Parenting and Housework Distinct?" *Sociological Perspectives* 35 (4): 629-647. doi:10.2307/1389302.
- Jackson, Michael, ed. 1996. *Things as they are: New Directions in Phenomenological Anthropology*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.
- Jackson, Peter, and Valerie Viehoff. 2016. "Reframing Convenience Food." *Appetite* 98: 1–11. doi: 10. 1016/j.appet.2015.11.032.
- Jaffrelot, Christophe and Peter van der Veer. 2008. *Patterns of Middle Class Consumption in India and China*. Los Angeles: SAGE.
- Joseph, Suad (ed). 2018. *Arab Family Studies: Critical Reviews*. Syracuse University Press. Syracuse, New York.
- Joseph, Suad. 2005. "Learning Desire: Relational Pedagogies and the Desiring Female Subject in Lebanon." *Journal of Middle East Women's Studies* 1(1) Winter: 79–109. <https://www.muse.jhu.edu/article/408730>.
- Kan, ManYee, Oriell Sullivan, and Jonathan Gershuny. 2011. *Gender Convergence in Domestic Work: Discerning the Effects of Interactional and Institutional Barriers from Large- Scale Data*. Vol. 45. doi:10.1177/0038038510394014.
- Kandiyoti, Deniz. 1988. "Bargaining with Patriarchy" *Gender & Society* 2(3): 274-290.
- Kapchan, Deborah A. 1996. *Gender on the Market: Moroccan Women and the Re-voicing of Tradition*, edited by Inc Net Library. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Kim, Myung-Hye. 1992. "Late Industrialization and Women's Work in Urban South Korea: An Ethnographic Study of Upper-Middle-Class Families." *City & Society* 6 (2): 156-173.
- Kipnis, Laura. 2005. "Love or Money: The Matrimonial Mystique." *Harper's Magazine* 310 (June): 83-88.
- Klasson, Marcus and Sofia Ulver. 2015. "Masculinising Domesticity: An Investigation of men's Domestic Foodwork." *Journal of Marketing Management* 31 (15-16): 1652-1675. doi:10.1080/0267257X.2015.1078395.
- Knauff, Bruce. 2002. "Critically Modern: An Introduction." In *Critically Modern: Alternatives, Alterities, Anthropologies*, 1-54. Bloomington: University of Indiana Press.

- Kunovich, Robert and Sheri Kunovich. 2008. "Gender Dependence and Attitudes Toward the Distribution of Household Labor: A Comparative and Multilevel Analysis." *International Journal of Comparative Sociology* 49 (6): 395-427. doi:10.1177/0020715208097787.
- Lagnaoui, Ahmed. 1999. *Aux Frontières de la Tradition Marocaine*. Casablanca: Les Editions Toubkal.
- Lane, Carrie M. 2017. "The Work of Care, Caring at Work: An Introduction." *Anthropology of Work Review* 38(1): 3-7.
- Leichty, Mark. 2012. "Middle-Class Déjà Vu: Conditions of Possibility, from Victorian England to Contemporary Kathmandu," in *The Global Middle Classes: Theorizing Through Ethnography*, edited by Rachel Heiman, Carla Freeman, Mark Leichty. School for Advanced Research (SAR).
- Lopez-Acevedo, Gladys, Florencia Devoto, Matías Morales, and Jaime Roche Rodriguez. 2021. "Trends and Determinants of Female Labor Force Participation in Morocco: An Initial Exploratory Analysis." IZA Discussion Paper No. 14218. *IZA Institute of Labor Economics*. <<http://ftp.iza.org/dp14218.pdf>>.
- Loudni, Asmaa. 2014. "La classe moyenne marocaine, des pauvres aux riches..." *La Nouvelle Tribune*. <<https://lnt.ma/classe-moyenne-bourgeoisie-citadine/>>.
- Maconachie, Moira. 2009. "Engels, Sexual Divisions, and the Family," In *Engels Revisited: Feminist Essays*, edited by Janet Sayers, Mary Evans, and Nanneke Redclift, 98-113. New York: Routledge.
- Mahmood, Saba. 2005. *Politics of Piety: The Islamic Revival and the Feminist Subject*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Martin, Aryn, Natasha Myers, and Ana Viseu. 2015. "The Politics of Care in Technoscience." *Social Studies of Science* 45(5): 625–41. doi: 10.1177/0306312715602073.
- Maqsood, Ammara. 2021. "Love as understanding: Marriage, aspiration and the joint family in middle-class Pakistan." *American Ethnologist*. 48(1): 93-104.
- McClenaghan, Sharon. 1997. "Women, Work and Empowerment: Romanticising the Reality." In *Gender Politics in Latin America: Debates in Theory and Practice*, edited by Elizabeth Dore, 19-35. New York: Monthly Review Press.
- Mcewan, Cheryl, Alex Hughes, and David Bek. 2015. "Theorising Middle Class Consumption from the Global South: A Study of Everyday Ethics in South Africa's Western Cape." *Geoforum* 67: 233-243. doi:10.1016/j.geoforum.2015.02.011.

- McMurray, David A. 2001. *In and Out of Morocco: Smuggling and Migration in a Frontier Boomtown*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Meah, Angela and Peter Jackson. 2013. "Crowded Kitchens: The 'democratisation' of Domesticity?" *Gender, Place & Culture* 20 (5): 578-596.  
doi:10.1080/0966369X.2012.701202.
- Meah, Angela, and Peter Jackson. 2017. "Convenience as Care: Culinary Antinomies in Practice." *Environment and Planning A* 49(9): 2065–81.  
doi:10.1177/0308518X17717725.
- Meneley, Anne. 1996. *Tournaments of Value: Sociability and Hierarchy in a Yemeni Town*. Toronto; Buffalo: University of Toronto Press..
- Merleau-Ponty, M. 1962. *Phenomenology of Perception*. Translated by Colin Smith  
Routledge.
- Mernissi, Fatima. 1994. *Dreams of Trespass: Tales of a Harem Girlhood*. Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley.
- Mernissi, Fatima. 1975. *Beyond the Veil: Male-Female Dynamics in a Modern Muslim Society*. Cambridge, Mass.: New York: Schenkman Pub. Co.; distributed solely by Halsted Press.
- Miller, Daniel. 2012. *Capitalism: An Ethnographic Approach*. Oxford: Berg Publishers.
- Mio. 2018. "kul yad 'andhā qsa" (Every Hand has a Story).  
<[https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=03vufKnIujk&feature=emb\\_title&ab\\_channel=MioMaroc](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=03vufKnIujk&feature=emb_title&ab_channel=MioMaroc)>.
- Monroe, Kristin. 2008. "Being Mobile in Beirut." *City & Society* 23(1):94-111.
- Montgomery, Mary. 2019. *Hired Daughters: Domestic Workers among Ordinary Moroccans*. Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University Press.
- Moser, Caroline. 1989. "The Impact of Recession and Structural Adjustment at the Micro-Level: Low-Income Women and their Households in Guayaquil, Ecuador." In *Invisible Adjustment*, 137-162. New York: UNICEF.
- Mundy, Martha. 1995. *Domestic Government: Kinship, Community and Polity in North Yemen*. London: I. B. Tauris.

- Murcott, Anne. 2000. "Is it Still a Pleasure to Cook for Him? Social Changes in the Household and the Family." *Journal of Consumer Studies & Home Economics* 24 (2): 78-84. doi:10.1046/j.1365-2737.2000.00148.x.
- Murray, Marjorie. 2015. "Back to Work? Childcare Negotiations and Intensive Mothering in Santiago De Chile." *Journal of Family Issues* 36 (9): 1171-1191. doi:10.1177/0192513X14533543.
- Musawah. 2018. "Who Provides? Who Cares? Changing Dynamics in Muslim Families." <[https://www.musawah.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/11/WhoProvidesWhoCares\\_En.pdf](https://www.musawah.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/11/WhoProvidesWhoCares_En.pdf)>.
- Naguib, Nefissa. 2015. *Nurturing Masculinities: Men, Food, and Family in Contemporary Egypt*. Austin, TX: University of Texas Press.
- Nash, June. 1995. "Latin American Women in the World Capitalist Crisis." In *Women in the Latin American Development Process*, edited by Christine Bose and Edna Acosta-Belen. Vol. Latin American Women in the World Capitalist Crisis, 151-166. Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press.
- Newcomb, Rachel. 2017. *Everyday Life in Global Morocco*. Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University Press.
- Newcomb, Rachel. 2013. "Modern Citizens, Modern Food: Taste and the Rise of the Moroccan Citizen-Consumer." In *Senses and Citizenships: Embodying Political Life*, edited by Susanna Trnka, Christine Dureau and Julie Park. New York, NY: Routledge.
- . 2009. *Women of Fes: Ambiguities of Urban Life in Morocco*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Nightingale, A.J., 2013. "Fishing for nature: The politics of subjectivity and emotion in Scottish inshore fisheries management." *Environ. Plan. A* 45 (10), 2362–2378. <https://doi.org/10.1068/a45340>.
- O'Dougherty, Maureen. 2002. *Consumption Intensified: The Politics of Middle Class Life in Brazil*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Ortner, Sherry. 1997. *Making Gender: The Politics of Erotics of Culture*. Boston, MA: Beacon Press.
- Ouzgane, Lahoucine. 2006. *Islamic Masculinities*. London; New York: Zed & Palgrave Macmillan.
- Peebles, Gustav. 2011. *The Euro and Its Rivals: Currency and the Construction of a Transnational City*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

- Peterson, Mark Allen. 2011. *Connected in Cairo: Growing up Cosmopolitan in the Modern Middle East*. Indiana University Press. Bloomington, IN.
- Pineda, Javier. 2000. "Partners in Women-Headed Households: Emerging Masculinities?" *The European Journal of Development Research* 12 (2): 72. doi:10.1080/09578810008426766.
- Pink, Sarah. 2009. *Doing Sensory Ethnography*. Los Angeles; London: Sage.
- Pittman, Joe F. and David Blanchard. 1996. "The Effects of Work History and Timing of Marriage on the Division of Household Labor: A Life-Course Perspective." *Journal of Marriage and the Family* 58 (1): 78-90. doi:10.2307/353378.
- Presser, Harriet. 1994. "Employment Schedules among Dual- Earner Spouses and the Division of Household Labor by Gender." *American Sociological Review* 59 (3): 348. doi:10.2307/2095938.
- Ranade, Nivedita. 2011. *Transition to Arranged Marriages among Asian-Indian Newly-Wed Couples in India and the U.S*, edited by Anita I. Garey ProQuest Dissertations Publishing.
- Reckwitz, A. 2002. "Toward a Theory of Social Practices: A Development in Culturalist Theorizing." *European Journal of Social Theory* 5 (2): 243-263.
- Resnick, S., & Wolff, R. (1987). *Knowledge and class: A Marxian critique of political economy*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Rouse, Roger. 1995. "Thinking about Transnationalism: Notes on the Cultural Politics of Class Relations in the Contemporary United States." *Public Culture* 7(2): 353-402.
- Rubin, Gayle. 1975. "The Traffic in Women: Notes on the 'Political Economy' of Sex", in Reiter, Rayna, ed. (1975). *Toward an Anthropology of Women*. New York: Monthly Review Press. ISBN 9780853453727.
- Sadiqi, Fatima. 2003. *Women, Gender and Language in Morocco*. Leiden, The Netherlands: Koninklijke Brill Academic Publishers.
- Sadiqi, Fatima and Moha Ennaji. 2006. "The Feminization of Public Space: Women's Activism, the Family Law, and Social Change in Morocco." *Journal of Middle East Women's Studies* 2 (2): 86-114. doi:10.2979/MEW.2006.2.2.86.
- Said, Edward 1979. *Orientalism*. New York: Random House.
- Salime, Zakia. 2012. "A New Feminism? Gender Dynamics in Morocco's February 20th Movement." *Journal of International Women's Studies* 13 (5): 101-114.



- Schatzki, Theodore. 1996. *Social Practices: A Wittgensteinian Approach to Human Activity and the Social*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Schielke, Samuli. 2015. *Egypt in the Future Tense: Hope, Frustration and Ambivalence before and after 2011*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.
- Schweid, Richard. 2021. *The Caring Class: Home Health Aides in Crisis*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
- Shakow, Miriam. 2014. *Along the Bolivian Highway: Social Mobility and Political Culture in a New Middle Class*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Sharma, Aradhana and Akhil Gupta. 2006. "Introduction: Rethinking, Theories of the State in the Age of Globalization." in *The Anthropology of the State: A Reader*, edited by Aradhana Sharma and Akhil Gupta. 1-41. Oxford, Blackwell.
- Sheth, Jagdish. 2009. "The Call Center Couple: India's New Middle Class." *Journal of Indian Business Research* 1 (1): 10-13. doi:10.1108/17554190910963163.
- Simmons, A. 1979. "Companionate Marriage and the Lesbian Threat." *Frontiers* 4(3): 54-59.
- Singerman, Diane. 1995. *Avenues of Participation: Family, Politics and Networks in Urban Quarters of Cairo*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Scott, Alison MacEwen. 1994. *Divisions and Solidarities: Gender, Class and Employment in Latin America*. London; New York: Routledge.
- Shove, Elizabeth, Mika Pantzar, and Matt Watson. 2012. *The Dynamics of Social Practice: Everyday Life and how it Changes*, edited by Mika Pantzar, Matt Watson. Los Angeles, Calif.; London: Sage.
- Singerman, Diane. 1995. *Avenues of Participation: Family, Politics and Networks in Urban Quarters of Cairo*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Skolnik, A. 1991. *Embattled Paradise: The American Family in an Age of Uncertainty*. New York: Basic Books.
- Slaughter, Anne-Marie. 2015. *Unfinished Business: Women, Men, Work, Family*. First ed. New York: Random House.
- Slimani, Leila. 2017. *Sexe et Mensonges: La Vie Sexuelle Au Maroc (Sex and Lies: Sexual Life in Morocco)*. France: Les Arenes.
- Smith, Vicki. 2013. *Sociology of Work: An Encyclopedia* SAGE Publications.

- Sobal, Jeffrey. 2005. "Men, Meat, and Marriage: Models of Masculinity." *Food and Foodways*, 3(1): 135-158. Web.
- Solomon, Robert C. 2005. "Subjectivity" in Honderich, Ted (ed.) *Oxford Companion to Philosophy*. Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- Spitze, Glenna and Russell Ward. 1995. "Household Labor in Intergenerational Households." *Journal of Marriage and the Family* 57 (2): 355. doi:10.2307/353689.
- Srivastava, Sanjay. 2012. "National Identity, Bedrooms, and Kitchens: Gated Communities and New narratives of Space in India," in *The Global Middle Classes: Theorizing Through Ethnography*, edited by Rachel Heiman, Carla Freeman, Mark Leichty. School for Advanced Research (SAR).
- Staunæs, D., 2003. "Where have all the subjects gone? Bringing together the concepts of intersectionality and subjectification." *Nora: Nordic J. Women's Stud.* 11 (2), 101–110. <https://doi.org/10.1080/08038740310002950>.
- Strasser, Susan. 1982. *Never done: A history of American housework*. New York: Pantheon Books.
- Swenson, Rebecca. 2009. "Domestic Divo? Televised Treatments of Masculinity, Femininity and Food." *Critical Studies in Media Communication* 26 (1): 36-53. doi:10.1080/15295030802684034.
- Thompson, E. P. 1978. "Eighteenth-Century English Society: Class Struggle without Class?" *Social History*. 3(2): 133-165.
- Tiano, Susan. 2001. "From Victims to Agents: A New Generation of Literature on Women in Latin America." *Latin American Research Review* 36 (3): 183-203.
- Townsend, Janet, Emma Zapata, Jo Rowlands, Pilar Alberti and Marta Mercado. 1999. *Women and Power: Fighting Patriarchies and Poverty*. London: Zed Books.
- Truitt, Allison. 2008. "On the back of a motorbike: Middle-Class mobility in Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam." *American Ethnologist*. 35(1): 3-19.
- Ulijaszek, S. 2007. "Obesity: A Disorder of Convenience." *Obesity Reviews* 8 (s1):183–187. doi: [10.1111/j.1467-789X.2007.00339.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-789X.2007.00339.x).
- Weller, Susan C. 2014. "Structured Interviews and Questionnaire Construction." In *Handbook of Methods in Cultural Anthropology*, edited by H. Russell Bernard and Clarence Gravlee, 343-390. New York: Rowman & Littlefield.

- Whitney, Shiloh (2017-12-14). "Byproductive labor". *Philosophy & Social Criticism*. 44 (6): 637–660. doi:[10.1177/0191453717741934](https://doi.org/10.1177/0191453717741934). ISSN 0191-4537.
- Yodanis, Carrie. 2005. "Divorce Culture and Marital Gender Equality: A Cross-National Study." *Gender & Society* 19 (5): 644-659. doi:10.1177/0891243205278166.
- Wangui, Elizabeth Edna. 2014. "Livelihood Shifts and Gender Performances: Space and the Negotiation for Labor among East Africa's Pastoralists." *Annals of the Association of American Geographers*: 1-14. doi:10.1080/00045608.2014.924734.
- Warde, Alan. 1999. "Convenience Food: Space and Timing." *British Food Journal* 101(7):518–27. doi: 10.1108/00070709910279018.
- Warin, Megan, Bridget Jay, and Tanya Zivkovic. 2019. "'Ready-made' Assumptions: Situating Convenience as Care in the Australian Obesity Debate." *Food and Foodways* 27(4): 273-95.
- World Bank. 2019. "Labor force participation rate, female and male, (% of population ages 15+) (modeled ILO estimate) – Morocco." International Labour Organization, ILOSTAT database. <<https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SL.TLF.CACT.FE.ZS?locations=MA>>.
- World Bank. 2021. "Labor force, female (% of total labor force) – Morocco." International Labour Organization, ILOSTAT database. <<https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SL.TLF.TOTL.FE.ZS?locations=MA>>.
- Zaloom, Caitlin. 2019. *Indebted: How Families Make College Work at Any Cost*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Zhang, Li. 2012. "Private Homes, Distinct Lifestyles: performing a New Middle Class in China," in *The Global Middle Classes: Theorizing Through Ethnography*, edited by Rachel Heiman, Carla Freeman, Mark Leichty. School for Advanced Research (SAR).
- Žvan-Elliot, Katja. 2015. *Modernizing Patriarchy: The Politics of Women's Rights in Morocco*. Austin: University of Texas Press.

## VITA

### EDUCATION

- 2018 M.A., Department of Anthropology, University of Kentucky
- 2014 M.L.A., Gastronomy Program, History and Culture Concentration, Boston University
- 2012 B.A., Department of Anthropology, *summa cum laude*, Phi Beta Kappa, University of Tennessee, Knoxville
- Thesis: *Exploring Identities: The Struggle between Traditional and Modern Moroccan Cuisine in an Urban Context*

### PROFESSIONAL POSITIONS

- 2021 Adjunct Online Instructor, Transylvania University  
Department of Anthropology
- 2017-2018 Adjunct Online Instructor, West Kentucky Community and Technical College  
Division of Humanities, Fine Arts, Business and Social Sciences

### AWARDS AND HONORS

- 2021 William Y. Adams Award for Excellence in Teaching by a Graduate Student, Department of Anthropology, University of Kentucky (\$300)
- 2019-2020 P.E.O. Scholar Award, International Chapter of the P.E.O. (\$15,000)
- 2018-2019 Fulbright-Hays Doctoral Dissertation Research Abroad Grant, United States Department of Education (\$36,976)
- 2020 Dissertation Writing Fellowship, College of Arts & Sciences, University of Kentucky (\$7,500)
- 2018 Lambda Alpha Dissertation Research Grant (\$2,000)
- 2018 Food Connection Student Opportunity Grant, University of Kentucky (\$3,500)
- 2018 Adelski Dissertation Research Award, Department of Anthropology, University of Kentucky (\$3,000)
- 2017 Academic Excellence Award for a Graduate Student, Student Government Association, University of Kentucky (\$1,000)

- 2016 Halperin Award for Pre-Dissertation Research, Society for Economic Anthropology (\$2,500)
- 2016 Susan Abbott-Jamieson Award for Pre-Dissertation Research, Department of Anthropology, University of Kentucky (\$2,000)
- 2015 Summer Arabic & North African Studies Program Scholarship, Al Akhawayn University (\$2,600)
- 2015 Study Abroad Grant, Foundation of Global Scholars (\$2,000)
- 2013 Sue Samuelson Foodways Essay Prize, 2<sup>nd</sup> Place “Exploring Moroccan Identities in the Diaspora,” American Folklore Society
- 2013 The Julia Child Award for Academic Excellence in Food Ethnography, Boston University (\$1,000)
- 2012 Outstanding Graduate: Honorable Mention, Department of Anthropology, University of Tennessee Knoxville

## **PUBLICATIONS**

### **Articles**

- 2021 ““The Machine Does It!”: Using Convenience Technologies to Analyze Care, Reproductive Labor, Gender and Class in Urban Morocco.” *Economic Anthropology* 8(2): 311-325.
- 2014 “Exploring Moroccan Identities in the Diaspora,” *Digest: A Journal of Foodways & Culture*, 3 (1). n. pg.

### **Book Review**

- 2016 Oil for Food: The Global Food Crisis and the Middle East by Eckart Woertz. *Graduate Journal of Food Studies*, 3(1): 71-72.

### **Encyclopedia Entries**

- 2015 “Moroccan American Food” in *Ethnic American Food Today*. Long, Lucy (Ed.) AltaMira Press.
- 2015 “Family Farms and Rural Depopulation” in *Food Issues*. Albala, Ken (Ed.) Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

M. Ruth Dike